# **DA** TORONTO

# **REPORT FOR ACTION**

# 119 Church Street, 127 Church Street, and 89 Queen Street East - Notice of Intention to Designate a Property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act

Date: November 14, 2023
To: Planning and Housing Committee
From: Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning
Wards: Ward 13 - Toronto Centre

# SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council state its intention to designate the properties at 119 Church Street, 127 Church Street (including entrance addresses 121 and 123 Church Street), and 89 Queen Street East (including entrance address 85 Queen Street East) under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for their cultural heritage value.

The subject properties at 119 Church Street, 127 Church Street, and 89 Queen Street East are located on the east side of Church Street and along the south side of Queen Street East, diagonally across from the Metropolitan United Church (1870-71) and share the same block along Queen Street as the historic Robertson Brothers Confectioners industrial complex (99-123 Queen Street East). Constructed between c.1887 and c.1910, the largely intact collection of late-Victorian and Edwardian Classicist buildings reflect the evolution of the area's development, comprising a mix of residential, commercial, and industrial building typologies that are characterized by their consistent materiality, low-rise scale, massing, setback, and range of architectural styles that support and maintain the historic fine-grained, main street character of both Church Street and Queen Street East in the Garden District neighbourhood to the north. For almost 50 years, Henry's Camera operated at 119 Church Street, expanding its growing business into 127 Church Street and the storefronts at 89 Queen Street East.

The property at 89 Queen Street East, known as the Metropolitan Flats (1909), has design value as a representative example of the apartment building typology that emerged in Canada in the early-20th century and is associated with Toronto architect Frederick Henry Herbert (1866-1942).

The property at 119 Church was designed in 1909 by a leading Toronto architect, J. Francis Brown (1866-1942), and noting the 4th-storey addition by J. Francis Brown & Son Architects.

Staff have completed the Research and Evaluation Report for the properties at 119 Church Street, 127 Church Street (including entrance addresses 121 and 123 Church Street), and 89 Queen Street East (including entrance address 85 Queen Street East) and determined that the subject properties meet Ontario Regulation 9/06, the criteria prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act under the criteria categories of design/physical, historical/associative, and contextual values. A property may be designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, if it meets two or more of the nine criteria.

On August 4, 2022, the City received Zoning By-law Amendment and Site Plan Control applications related to the proposed redevelopment of the subject properties. On June 30, 2023, the City received a resubmission for a 61-storey mixed-use building with 691 dwelling units and 464 square metres of retail/commercial space at grade. The proposal includes the integration of the front elevation at the base podium of the buildings at 89 Queen Street East, entrance addresses 121 Church Street and 123 Church Street at 127 Church Street, along with the panelization and reconstruction of 119 Church Street and a portion of its return wall. The building located at entrance address 125 Church Street is proposed to be demolished.

The City Clerk issued a complete application notice on September 9, 2022. The property owner has provided a waiver to extend the 90-day timeline to December 31, 2023. Council must make a decision at its December 13, 2023 meeting to provide sufficient time for the City Clerk to issue a notice of intention to designate before the waiver expires.

As of January 1, 2023, should a property be subject to an Official Plan Amendment, Zoning By-law Amendment and/or Draft Plan of Subdivision Application, the property must be listed on the heritage register prior to the Prescribed Event occurring in order for the City to designate the property under Section 29(1.2)1 of the Ontario Heritage Act. This requirement does not apply to a Prescribed Event that has occurred prior to January 1, 2023.

Designation enables City Council to review proposed alterations or demolitions to the property and enforce heritage property standards and maintenance.

# RECOMMENDATIONS

The Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning recommends that:

1. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 119 Church Street under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act in accordance with the Statement of Significance; 119 Church Street (Reasons for Designation) attached as Attachment 3 to the report, November 14, 2023, from the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning. 2. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 127 Church Street (including entrance addresses 121 and 123 Church Street, but excluding 125 Church Street) (Reasons for Designation) attached as Attachment 4 to the report, November 14, 2023, from the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning.

3. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 89 Queen Street East (including entrance address 85 Queen Street East) (Reasons for Designation) attached as Attachment 5 to the report, November 14, 2023, from the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning.

4. If there are no objections to the designations, City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce the Bill in Council designating the property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

# **FINANCIAL IMPACT**

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

The Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer has reviewed this report and agrees with the information as presented in the Financial Impact Section.

# POLICY AND REGULATION CONSIDERATIONS

# **Provincial Plans and Policies**

The conservation of cultural heritage resources is an integral component of good planning, contributing to a sense of place, economic prosperity, and healthy and equitable communities. Heritage conservation in Ontario is identified as a provincial interest under the Planning Act. <u>https://www.ontario.ca/laws/statute/90p13</u>

Further, the policies and definitions of the Provincial Policy Statement (2020) and A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (2020) identify the Ontario Heritage Act as the primary legislation through which heritage evaluation and heritage conservation will be implemented.

https://www.ontario.ca/page/provincial-policy-statement-2020 https://files.ontario.ca/mmah-place-to-grow-office-consolidation-en-2020-08-28.pdf

Ontario Regulation 9/06 sets out the criteria for evaluating properties to be designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. The criteria are based on an evaluation of design/physical value, historical and associative value and contextual value. A property may be designated under Section 29 of the Act if it meets two or more of the provincial criteria for determining whether it is of cultural heritage value or interest.

https://www.ontario.ca/laws/regulation/060009

# **Official Plan**

The City of Toronto's Official Plan implements the provincial policy regime and provides policies to guide decision making within the City. It contains a number of policies related to properties on the City's Heritage Register and properties adjacent to them, as well as the protection of areas of archaeological potential. The Official Plan should be read as a whole to understand its comprehensive and integrative intent as a policy framework for priority setting and decision making. The Official Plan can be found here: <a href="https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/planning-development/official-plan-guidelines/official-plan/">https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/planning-development/official-plan-guidelines/official-plan/</a>

# COMMENTS

# **Prescribed Event Status**

As of July 1, 2021, Section 29(1.2) of the Ontario Heritage Act restricts City Council's ability to give notice of its intention to designate a property under the Act to within 90 days of a "Prescribed Event".

A Prescribed Event is a point of time when the application for an Official Plan Amendment, Zoning By-law Amendment and/or Draft Plan of Subdivision Application has been deemed complete and the City Clerk provides notice of that complete application to the public in accordance with the Planning Act. The Prescribed Event is not the date a development application is deemed complete or when an application is made to the City. A Prescribed Event, including any prescribed exceptions, are defined under O. Reg 385/21.

If a new or subsequent Official Plan Amendment, Zoning By-law Amendment and/or Draft Plan of Subdivision Application is submitted on the same property, the Prescribed Event date is reset to the new date the City Clerk issues notice to the public of the new or subsequent complete application.

On August 4, 2022, the City received Zoning By-law Amendment and Site Plan Control applications related to the proposed redevelopment of the subject properties with a 61-storey mixed-use building with 691 dwelling units and 464 square metres of retail/commercial space at grade.

A Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) is required for all development applications that affect listed and designated properties and will be considered when determining how a heritage property is to be conserved. An HIA completed by Goldsmith Borgal & Company Ltd. Architects (GBCA) and dated July 25, 2022 was submitted to support the planning application. On June 27, 2023 a revised Heritage Impact Assessment prepared by GBCA was submitted and is currently under review. The proposal includes the integration of the front elevation at the base podium of the buildings at 89 Queen Street East, entrance addresses 121 Church Street and 123 Church Street at 127 Church Street, along with the panelization and reconstruction of 119 Church Street and a portion of its return wall.

The building at entrance address 125 Church Street is proposed to be demolished and replaced with new massing. In December 2022, investigative testing was performed on the structure at 125 Church Street in response to City comments dated September 22, 2022. The heritage consultant has provided sufficient evidence to indicate that the masonry is in poor condition and that replacements would be more substantial than repairs to restore the structure. Beyond the results of the investigative testing, the property has been significantly altered resulting in the loss of its architectural integrity. City staff will work with the heritage consultant on a commemoration plan for the property's historical significance to the area.

The property at 119 Church Street is known for Henry's Camera, which operated their business at this location from 1974 to 2022 and recently relocated to 185 Church Street. Henry's Camera eventually expanded into the adjacent storefronts at 127 Church Street and at 89 Queen Street East as its business grew.

# 119 Church Street, 127 Church Street, and 89 Queen Street East

# **Research and Evaluation according to Ontario Regulation 9/06**

While the research and evaluation of the property referenced above is, in staff's determination, sufficient to support the designation of the properties at 119 Church Street, and 127 Church Street (including entrance addresses 121 and 123 Church Street) and at 89 Queen Street East (including entrance address 85 Queen Street East), it should be noted that new and additional relevant information on the subject property further expanding on its cultural heritage value following community input and additional access to archival records may be incorporated in the final version of a designation by-law.



Figure 1: 127 Church Street (including entrance addresses 125, 123 and 121 Church Street) and 119 Church Street. NOTE: The structure (125 Church Street) shown on the left and located on the corner property at 127 Church Street is not a heritage attribute (Heritage Planning, 2023)



Figure 1b: 89 Queen Street East (including entrance address 85 Queen Street East) (Heritage Planning, 2023)

# **1. DESCRIPTION**

89 Queen Street East, 119 and 127 Church Street	
ADDRESS	89 Queen Street East (including entrance
	address 85 Queen Street East)
	119 Church Street
	127 Church Street (including entrance
	addresses 121 and 123 Church Street)
WARD	Ward 13 (Toronto Centre)
LEGAL DESCRIPTION	89 Queen Street East (85 Queen Street
	East): CON 3A FB LOTS 12 & 13
	119 Church Street: Con 3A PT LOTS 10 &
	11
	127 Church Street (121 and 123 Church
	Street): PLAN 3A PT LTS 10 & 11
NEIGHBOURHOOD/COMMUNITY	Downtown Yonge East
HISTORICAL NAME	See Section 2
CONSTRUCTION DATE	See Section 2
ORIGINAL OWNER	See Section 2
ORIGINAL USE	See Section 2
CURRENT USE*	89 Queen Street East (entrance address
	85 Queen Street East) - residential; 119
	Church Street - vacant; 127 Church Street:
	entrance addresses 121 and 123 Church
	Street - vacant
	*This does not refer to permitted use(s) as
	defined by the Zoning By-law

ARCHITECT/BUILDER/DESIGNER	See Section 2
DESIGN/CONSTRUCTION/MATERIALS	See Section 2
ARCHITECTURAL STYLE	See Section 2
ADDITIONS/ALTERATIONS	See Section 2
CRITERIA	See Section 3
HERITAGE STATUS	Cultural Heritage Evaluation
RECORDER	Heritage Planning: Ana Martins
REPORT DATE	August 2023

# 2. BACKGROUND

This research and evaluation section of the report describes the history, architecture and context of the property at 89 Queen Street East (including entrance address 85 Queen Street East), 119 Church Street, and 127 Church Street (including entrance addresses 121 and 123 Church Street), and applies evaluation criteria as set out in Ontario Regulation 9/06 to determine whether it merits designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Act. A property may be designated under Section 29 of the Act if it meets two or more of the provincial criteria for determining whether it is of cultural heritage value or interest. The application of the criteria is found in Section 3 (Evaluation Checklist). The conclusions of the research and evaluation are found in the Conclusion of the report. Maps and Photographs are located in Attachment 1. The archival and contemporary sources for the research are found in Attachment 2. The Statements of Significance are contained in Attachments 3, 4, and 5.

Key Date	Historical Event
	The area now known as the City of Toronto is the traditional territory of many nations including the Mississaugas of the Credit, the Anishnabeg, the Chippewa, the Haudenosaunee and the Wendat peoples, and is now home to many diverse First Nations, Inuit and Métis peoples. Toronto is covered by Treaty 13 signed with the Mississaugas of the Credit (1805), and the Williams Treaties (1923) signed with multiple Mississaugas and Chippewa bands.
1793	The Town of York (Toronto) is founded as a ten-block town site on the north shore of Lake Ontario, bound by present-day George, Adelaide, Berkeley, and Front Streets.
1797	Administrator Peter Russell first extends the Town of York's boundary west toward York Street and north to Lot (present-day Queen. The block containing the subject properties is divided in three and marked for Master Usher, directly northeast of a block reserved for a hospital.
1842	By this period of time, an east-west lane has been laid out across the western two-thirds of the block, known today as Ditty Lane.
1850s	The city block containing the subject properties quickly develops through Registered Plan 3A, which laid out individual building

# i. HISTORICAL TIMELINE

	lots. The subject properties correspond to lots 10, 11, 12, and 13 of Registered Plan 3A.
1880s	The properties at 119 Church Street and 125 Church Street (previous address for 127 Church Street) are severed off with increased development interest in the area.
1887	A new three-storey brick commercial building is constructed at 123 Church Street. Its first occupant is James A. and Dennis Sadlier, Irish-American brothers who founded the publishing and bookselling company D. & J. Sadlier & Company in New York City.
1888	A new three-storey brick commercial structure is under construction. According to the 1889 City Directory, the initial occupants of the building were James Authors and John Cox, manufacturers of artificial limbs and prosthetics.
1909	George Sparrow purchases 119 Church Street and commissions architect Francis Brown to design a new manufacturing building with storefront. The mid-19th brick structure where Dr. Emily Stowe and Dr. William Caniff, pioneers in the city's medical profession resided and practised was demolished to make way for George Sparrow & Co.
1909	Young Russian émigré by the name of Harry Himelstein (shortened to Stein), first opens as a watch and jewelry business on Yonge Street. The business will later become known as Henry's (camera store).
1909	George Rathbone, a lumber industrialist, commissions architect F.H. Herbert in 1909 to design both his place of residence in Parkdale and the apartment building with commercial storefronts at 89 Queen Street East.
1928	Architectural plans indicate that a fourth level addition is added to 119 Church Street, designed by the architect Francis Brown & Son Architects.
1948	Building permits reveal that 121 Church Street is altered to accommodate apartments in the upper floor.
1974	The iconic Henry's camera store, a popular photographic retailer, relocates to 119 Church Street and remains there until 2022. With the move to this location, the company is rebranded, focusing only on the photographic market.
1994	Henry's acquires a large street level retail space at 89-85 Queen Street East as the company expanded into new digital imagining technologies, and the storefront is known as Henry's Electronics.
2000	Henry's expands into the adjoining properties at 121 and 123 Church Street.
2022	Henry's relocates its flagship location to 185 Church St., ending its 47-year run at the southeast corner of Church and Queen.

# ii. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The following section outlines the history and facts related to the properties which are the basis for determining historical or associative value of Criteria 4, 5 or 6 according to O. Reg. 9/06 Criteria.

# Early Development of City Block

The properties at 119 Church Street, 127 Church Street, and 89 Queen Street East are located on the south side of Queen Street East and on east side of Church Street, diagonally across from the Metropolitan United Church (1870-71) in the Garden District neighbourhood of Toronto. Located east of Yonge Street, the properties are situated on a city block bound by Queen Street East, Church Street, Richmond Street East, and Jarvis Street.

The origins of this block date to the westward expansion of the Town of York (Toronto) (founded in 1793) from its original ten-block townsite - bound by present-day George, Adelaide, Berkeley, and Front Streets (Front Street being the north shore of Lake Ontario). In 1797, a new ambitious administrator, Peter Russell recognizing the town's need for future public institutions, first extended the Town of York's boundary west toward York Street and north to Lot (present-day Queen) Street.<sup>1</sup> As indicated in the 1797 Plan for the Enlargement of York, a number of lots were set aside for the development of a hospital, school, jail, church, and courthouse while smaller lots were assigned to prominent settlers. The block containing the subject properties was divided in three and marked for Master Usher, directly northeast of a block reserved for a hospital (Image 2).

By the end of 1797, the western boundary was extended further until Peter Street. This westward expansion known as "New Town" eventually developed to become a prominent area with buildings serving Upper Canada's provincial government. King Street remained the main commercial street and the new north/south streets including Church Street, named for its location adjoining St. James' Church at King and Church Streets (forerunner to St. James' Cathedral) were surveyed. The subject properties are located within the boundaries of this "New Town", just northwest of the original ten-block townsite and immediately south of McGill's estate on 100-acres of land surveyed as Park Lot 7.<sup>2</sup>

Through the early 1800s, the development of York was still primarily concentrated to the south of this city block. The 1842 Cane Topographical Plan of the City and Liberties of

<sup>1</sup> William Dendy and William Kilbourn, *Toronto Observed*, Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1986, p. 8 2 The area to the north between present-day Queen and Bloor Streets were surveyed into 100-acre socalled "park lots", which were granted to associates of the government and military. John McGill, a former soldier and commissioner of stores was granted Park Lot 7, and soon afterward added adjoining land to his holdings. McGill commissioned "McGill Cottage" on the south part of his tract where Metropolitan United Church (56 Queen Street East) is now located. In 1868 upon the death of Peter McGill's brother (the last occupant of the McGill Cottage), the Wesleyan Methodist Congregation purchased the cottage and two acres of land surrounding the house for the construction of the aforementioned church. Designed by architect Henry Langley, the church opened in 1872 and it stands on the corner diagonally across from the subject properties.

Toronto indicates that as early as this date, an east-west lane had been laid out across the western two-thirds of the block, which remains and is known today as Ditty Lane.<sup>3</sup>

With the rapid expansion and prosperity of the city, the block containing the subject properties was quickly developed through Registered Plan 3A, which laid out individual building lots. The subject properties correspond to lots 10, 11, 12, and 13 of Registered Plan 3A.<sup>4</sup> Given the proximity to the expanding New Town, the first portion of the block to be developed in the 1840s was along the Richmond Street frontage with primarily modest wood-frame structures (Image 3). The 1858 Boulton Atlas map indicates that initial construction along Queen Street East, which marked the edge of town, was also primarily wood-framed houses. The exception to this predominant wood-framed construction was on the lots facing onto Richmond Street East at Church Street and on Church Street, which were developed early on with brick structures including one still extant at 125-127 Church Street (corner building at Queen Street East) and the other at 119 Church Street, adjacent to the alleyway, which was demolished and replaced in the early 20th century with the current brick structure.

By the 1880s, the block was almost completely developed with a mix of building typologies and land uses in which residential and commercial buildings were adjacent to industrial buildings such as the Robertson Brothers Confectioners established along Queen Street East in the 1870s, mid-way between Church and Jarvis Streets (Image 4). The Eastern Carriage Manufacturer faced onto Queen Street East but spanned through the block to Richmond Street East. The 1880 Goads Map indicates that Church Street, spanning Queen Street East to Richmond Street East had a largely consistent street wall condition comprising of brick structures serving commercial and industrial uses such as the Newcombe Octavius & Co., a piano manufacturing company at Church Street and Richmond Street East. By the early twentieth century, the Robertson Brothers manufacturing company had taken over a large portion of the centre of the block, commissioning local architects Mark Hall and H.G. Salisbury to design the various expansions along both Queen and Richmond Streets and many of the original wood-frame houses were demolished to accommodate this industrial development (Image 5).<sup>5</sup> However, the early-nineteenth century wood frame houses at 85-97 Queen Street East, located on Lots 12 and 13, still stood, but would be demolished in 1910 to make way for the "Metropolitan Flats" at 85-89 Queen Street East (Image 6).

<sup>3</sup> In 2012, the City of Toronto commemorated the historic 19th-century Ditty's Hotel also known as Ditty's Saloon, formerly located at the southwest corner of Church and Richmond Streets, by the naming of this public laneway. Ditty Lane commemorates Ann Ditty, the proprietor of Ditty's Hotel or Ditty's Saloon, a business which operated between 1862 and 1865 at the southwest corner of Church Street and Richmond Street East and then from 1866 to 1867 when it moved approximately one block north to 124 Church Street. Ann Ditty (c.1813-1902) also operated a cab and cart service and is thought to be the City of Toronto's first female cab operator. Information courtesy of Adam Wynne, nomination report for 124 Church Street.

<sup>4</sup> Land Registry Office Records, Metro Toronto, Book 225, p.45 to 71.

<sup>5</sup> The property at 99 Queen St. E. (including 107, 109, 111, 115, 123 Queen Street East and Warehouse) was designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the OHA in 1983. The 1903-1906 additions were completed by Mark Hall; addition completed in 1913 by H.G. Salisbury. https://www.heritagetrust.on.ca/oha/details/file?id=3368

# 119 Church Street - Early History of Site

The built history of 119 Church Street dates to the mid-19th century as the 1851 topographical plan of the City of Toronto shows an early brick structure on Church Street at the corner of the alley way (today known as Ditty Lane) (previously numbered at 111 Church Street and later 115 Church Street). By 1858, the property also contained rear outbuildings and a substantial side lot or garden (the latter the location for 123 Queen Street East). City Directories indicate that as early as 1855 and onwards, the two and a half storey brick structure was occupied by a succession of medical professionals, starting with Dr. John T. Small, who resided here until the 1860s.

Amongst the pioneers of the medical profession to reside at this location were Dr. William Canniff (1830-1910), Toronto's first permanent Medical Officer of Health and Dr. Emily Stowe (1831-1903), considered to be the first female physician to publicly practise medicine in Ontario and co-founder as well as leader of Canada's suffrage movement (Canadian Women's Suffrage Association and the Dominion Women's Enfranchisement Association).<sup>6</sup> Stowe is known for her advocacy work in promoting higher education for women including changing the admission policies of University of Toronto's medical school to accept female students. In 1883, Stowe's daughter Anne Augusta Stowe-Gullen was the first female to graduate from a Canadian medical school. It was also the opening year for the Woman's Medical College - a medical school for women initiated by Dr. Stowe. From the mid-1870s through to 1891, the property was occupied by Dr. Emily Stowe and her husband John Stowe, a dentist, and it is likely that both operated their practice from the property while residing here with their family. Dr. Emily Stowe's achievements were recognized in 1995 under the Government of Canada's National Program of Historical Commemoration.<sup>7</sup>

The intersection at Queen Street East and Church Street was historically an area associated with prominent members of Toronto's medical profession including 125-127 Church Street owned by Dr. Abner Mulholland Rosebrugh and the site for the Toronto Eye and Ear Dispensary. At the northeastern corner of Queen Street East and Church Street, the property at 60 Queen Street East, designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, was occupied for over 70 years by various medical doctors including Dr. George Herrick, Dr. James Thornburn, and Dr. James J. Cassidy.<sup>8</sup>

# George Sparrow & Company

Architectural plans indicate that the present-day structure at 119 Church Street was designed in 1909 by the Toronto-based architect J. Francis Brown for George Sparrow (Image 7 and 8). Under Sparrow's ownership, the mid-19th structure was demolished in 1910 for a new three-storey brick commercial building to house the manufacturing company, George Sparrow & Company, designers and manufacturers of appliances and equipment for hotel and industrial kitchens and businesses. City Directories indicate that the business was formerly located at 118 King Street East, adjacent to St. James Cathedral at King and Church Streets. The increase in building value between the 1910

<sup>6</sup> Emily Stowe | The Canadian Encyclopedia

<sup>7</sup> https://parks.canada.ca/culture/designation/personnage-person/emily-stowe

<sup>8</sup> The property at 60 Queen Street East has been designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the OHA (Designation By-law 182-2021)

and 1911 Assessment Rolls confirms the date of construction. Architectural plans also indicate that a fourth floor was added to the building in 1928, which was designed by Francis Brown & Son Architects, and adopted the architectural vocabulary of the 1909 design (Image 9 and 10).

Between 1934 and 1947, the building was occupied by the Hobart Manufacturing Company, which also manufactured kitchen appliances and equipment. A survey of City Directories indicate that the building then housed a variety of commercial businesses from the post-war period until 1974, including Adam's Trade-In, a pawn shop in the early 1950s; Mitchell Houghton Ltd, a retailer of office furniture and supplies in the 1950s to the mid-1960s; and in 1972, the McBrien Office Furniture Store (Image 11). In 1974, the iconic Henry's camera store, a popular photographic retailer, relocated to 119 Church Street and remained there until 2022.

# Henry's (Retailer)

Henry's is a Canadian retailer specializing in photography and video-related technology products with its headquarters in Toronto. The popular company first opened its doors in 1909 as a watch and jewelry business on Yonge Street by a young Russian émigré by the name of Harry Himelstein (shortened to Stein on his arrival to Toronto). Between 1916 and 1958, Stein moved the business to various locations along Queen Street West, purchasing its first building at 113 Queen Street West in the early 1940s and renaming it Henry & Company to reflect Gerald Stein (Henry's son) as co-owner of the business.<sup>9</sup> In the late 1950s, the Steins added photographic equipment and supplies to their business when the Japanese consumer electronics emerged, opening up the market to smaller retail stores.<sup>10</sup> The business then turned from selling jewelry to focus on the photography market. In 1974, Henry & Company became Henry's, branded by a new orange logo, and the company purchased 119 Church Street (Image 12). Over the years, the company introduced products geared to professional photographers, hobbyists, and students, sold a range of used equipment, and kept pace with digital innovations in photography. Its business success led to a company expansion in 1994 with Henry's acquiring a large street level retail space at 85-89 Queen Street East as the company expanded into new digital imagining technologies, and the storefront was known as Henry's Electronics. The main building at 119 Church Street, along with its expansion across several of the buildings including 121-123 Church Street and the new spaces on Queen Street East created 7000 square feet of retail space, prominently occupying a large portion of the southeastern intersection of Queen and Church. As one of Canada's oldest camera retailers, Henry's operated out of this location for 47 years when it then relocated to 185 Church Street in 2022.

# 127 Church Street: Entrance Address 121 Church Street

With the intensification of the block in the 1880s, the undeveloped portions (side yards/gardens) of the properties of 119 and 125 Church Street were severed off for development. Assessment Rolls indicate that the owner of the house at the corner of

<sup>9</sup> The Photographic Historical Society of Canada has a detailed history and evolution of the retailer. <u>https://phsc.ca/henrys-history.html</u>

<sup>10</sup> https://phsc.ca/henrys-history.html

the lane, John Stowe, severed his property by retaining the portion on which the original brick building stood (at the corner of Ditty Lane) and developing the vacant/garden portion to the north of the house (on a new lot that measured approximately 20 by 90 feet).

According to the annotation on the Goad Map for 1889, the new three-storey brick commercial structure (now known as 121 Church Street) was under construction (Image 4). According to the 1889 City Directory (with data gathered the previous year), the initial occupants of the building were James Authors and John Cox, manufacturers of artificial limbs, prosthetics, and medical trusses. By 1901, the City Directory indicates that the building was occupied by Griffiths & Macpherson Company, offering "proprietary medicine". By 1909, the building was under the ownership of George W. Guest of Guest & Company, identified as plumbers in the City Directories, while the upper portions of the building were occupied by other businesses (e.g., veterinary surgery, tailor etc.). Building records show that George W. Guest expanded the building in 1918 (with the addition of a rear portion) to the designs of architect W.C. Hunt. Building records also indicate that in 1948 the building was altered to accommodate apartments on the upper floor and the storefront was modernized, according to the designs of architect Irving M. Saunders. In the second half of the twentieth century, its commercial/residential uses continued with, for example, the Central Drug Store operating at this location in the 1950s and the All-Typewriter Co. in the 1970s, with residential units on the upper floors. By 2022, the building at 121 Church Street had joined 119 Church to house the expanded flagship location of Henry's.

# 127 Church Street: Entrance Address 123 Church Street

Similarly, with the intensification of the block in the 1880s, the undeveloped portion of the property of 125 Church Street was severed off for development. Between 1886-1887, a new three-storey brick commercial building was erected at 115 Church Street (now known as 123 Church Street) as the 1887 City Directory identifies the property as "unfinished". The 1888 City Directory records that the property was first occupied by James A. and Dennis Sadlier, Irish-American brothers who founded the publishing and bookselling company D. & J. Sadlier & Company in New York City in the 1830s. The successful company was particularly well-known for its Catholic publications, with operations in Montreal and across the United States. From 1887/1888 to 1909, their company branch in Toronto was based at this location.<sup>11</sup>

In 1909, Assessment Rolls record that the building was then owned by William E. Blake & Son, who owned and operated a similar business producing and distributing church supplies at this location until 1924. City Directories indicate that from 1925 to 1930, 123 Church Street housed Lip Yen's Chinese restaurant, and in the subsequent decades, housed a rotating range of businesses including Wilcox Engineering, specialists in chrome materials and the Frankel Clothing Exchange on the ground floor with Canadian Theatre School on the second in the 1950s, but by 1960 Pegasus Films had replaced the Theatre School. The Frankel Clothing Exchange remained until the

<sup>11</sup> For more information on D. & J. Sadlier & Co., please visit <u>https://xroads.virginia.edu/~Hyper/SADLIER/Husband.htm;</u> https://www.jstor.org/stable/41604765

early 2000s. By 2022, the building at 123 Church Street had joined 119 Church to house the expanded flagship location of Henry's.

# 127 Church Street (including entrance address 125 Church Street)

The property at 127 Church Street (previously numbered at 117 Church Street) was first developed with a two-storey brick house with rear additions that stretched along the Queen Street frontage to the far eastern end of the long, narrow lot. The building postdates the 1842 Cane Map of Toronto but appears in the 1851 Fleming Map, and as such dates it to the mid-to-late 1840s. The 1858 Boulton Map reveals that the house, fronting Church Street, was two stories, as was the rear tail that ran along Queen Street East (Image of 1858).

As with the building at 119 Church Street, while built for a residential purpose, the building would come to also serve other uses over time. City Directories from the 1850s to the 1870s, indicate that the property was used by various medical professionals, including Dr. Abner Mulholland Rosebrugh who operated the Toronto Eye and Ear Infirmary from the rear portion of the building along Queen Street from 1868/9 to 1877. Dr. Rosebrugh's Infirmary developed into one of the city's most specialized medical care institutions, with Dr. Rosebrugh performing a range of surgeries and offering these procedures at no cost to those who could not afford it.<sup>12</sup> However, the 1880s signaled a shift from its medical associations to commercial uses: the building was then used by grocers and by 1890s H. J. La Force, a shoe/boot maker operated here and did so for many years. Its commercial uses continued throughout the 20th century with the longrunning tobacconist United Cigar Store, while building records from 1981 also indicate that the upper floors of the building had had residential uses since 1938: the second floor used as a rooming house and the third floor with two self-contained dwelling units. Archival images from the 1970s indicate that a number of small commercial shops were established along Queen Street East with their storefronts at grade (Image 11). In the 1980s, the two dormer windows on the west (principal) elevation were consolidated into one. The current façades date to the early 2000s when City Building Records indicate that extensive alterations including new stucco cladding and the reconfiguration of door and window openings along Queen Street East were undertaken, the mansard roof was modified, and the two dormer windows on the west (principal) elevation were consolidated into one. Moreover, building records from the early 2000s also indicate that the second floor was significantly altered to accommodate a change in use from residential to office space.

# 89 Queen Street East

# Apartment buildings: a new housing type in Toronto

In the early twentieth century, several demographic and economic factors enabled purpose-built apartment buildings to become viable commercial propositions in Toronto, triggering the construction of this new housing type. Alongside a significant doubling of Toronto's population in the first two decades was a dramatic speculative boom as land

119 Church St., 127 Church St. and 89 Queen St. E. - Notice of Intention to Designate Page 14 of 51

<sup>12</sup> http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/rosebrugh abner mulholland 14E.html

values and housing rents increased rapidly.<sup>13</sup> While the city was experiencing a housing shortage with an influx of new immigrants and migration from rural communities, these early purpose-built apartment buildings initially targeted the more affluent class whose ability to pay higher rents would provide the greatest return on investment for this new housing model.<sup>14</sup> As housing historian Richard Dennis (1994) notes, apartment houses built at the turn of the century, were not only indicative of the modernization of capital but also viewed as icons of modernity as they offered a new urban lifestyle, particularly for the emerging professionals as well as those who worked in downtown offices and department stores such as Simpsons at Queen and Yonge Streets.

The decade up to 1913 was characterized by a surge of land values, rising rents, and a speculative boom. It also coincided with the uptake of development of Toronto's first apartment housing. By 1914, City Council had granted 249 permits for the construction of new apartment buildings.<sup>15</sup> City Directories first start listing apartment houses in 1907 with eight appearing in the directory. When architect F. H. Herbert was commissioned in 1909 to design an apartment building at 89 Queen Street East, the City Directory indicates that the entire city contained just over 20 apartment buildings, located primarily to the north and west and on the edge of the city's downtown core. By 1910, the building at 89 Queen Street East appears as the Rathbone Apartments in the City's Directory along with a listing for 35 other apartment buildings. However, almost 100 apartment buildings would be constructed in Toronto by 1912. In that year, the City fearing more opposition and lengthy battles with neighbours passed a by-law placing restrictions on their construction.

Toronto's significant population growth instigated changes to the block's building typologies, particularly to the stretch of wood frame house-form buildings formerly known as 85-97 Queen Street East (previously 69-73 Queen Street East), constituting Lots 12 and 13 of the original block layout. In 1910, two semi-detached double houses and a row of three houses were demolished by the property owner George Rathbone, a lumber industrialist<sup>16</sup> who had commissioned F.H. Herbert in 1909 to design both his place of residence in Parkdale and the subject property.<sup>17</sup> The Assessment Rolls for 1910 record an unfinished building on the lot that was now (with the merging of several of the smaller building lots) 80 by 100 feet, and by 1911 Assessment Rolls show that the three-storey plus basement building was complete and fully occupied.<sup>18</sup> The building, now numbered as 85-89 Queen Street East, was known as the Metropolitan Flats. *Construction Magazine* reported that the construction of the building was estimated at \$50,000 and was anticipated to include an elevator, which was never

<sup>13</sup> Richard Dennis, "Interpreting the apartment house: modernity and metropolitanism in Toronto, 1900-1930. Journal of Historical Geography, vol 20, no 3, 1994, p. 306.

<sup>14</sup> For a discussion of early Toronto apartments and the opposition to them see Dennis and Abramowicz as noted in the sources.

<sup>15</sup> Dennis, 1994.

<sup>16</sup> City Directory for 1910 records that George Rathbone owned a planing mill specializing in doors, sashes, mouldings, kiln-dried hardwood lumber, amongst other lumber products used in building construction. The lumber business was located on Queen Street West at Northcote Avenue 17 Construction, vol. 2, no.6, April 1909, p. 79.

<sup>18</sup> GBCA, "HIA for 119 Church Street including 121 to 127 Church Street & 85-89 Queen Street East", dated June 27, 2023.

constructed.<sup>19</sup> Designed as a mixed-use building, it contained commercial storefronts at grade and residential units on the second and third floors. The Goodyear Tire & Rubber Company of Canada was one of the earliest commercial tenants. In the first year of occupancy, the Metropolitan Flats filled a gap in the housing market providing rental accommodation designed for a variety of household types.

The design of the apartment layout provided flexibility in terms of household accommodation with units comprising two to three bedrooms with living rooms, dens, and kitchens. City Directories for 1911 to 1914 indicate that the tenants represented Toronto's emerging middle class of managers, agents, and clerks, such as H. Duffy, H. Reynolds, and G. Faulker, and women, such as bookkeeper Helen Kuhn and Minnie Colburn who worked in sales at Simpsons, the department store located just west at Queen and Yonge Streets.

# Architects

# J. Francis Brown (1866-1942)

J. Francis Brown designed 119 Church Street.

Architect J. (John) Francis Brown (1866-1942) was a leading and prolific architect practising from Toronto, Ontario for more than fifty years, and the patriarch of three generations of the Brown family of architects.<sup>20</sup> He trained in the Toronto offices of the architectural partnership of Edwards and Webster before establishing his own practice in 1892. In 1899, he was the supervisor of construction for the Board of Trade Building, Yonge and Front Streets, working for the firm James & James of New York. In 1929, he collaborated with William Lyon Somerville on the design for McMaster University (Hamilton, ON). He was a member of the Architectural Draughtsmen's Club (1886-1892), a member of the Toronto Architectural Eighteen Club (1899-1902), and a member of the Ontario Association of Architects (1892).

Over the course of his long career, Brown executed hundreds of commissions for all types of buildings in Toronto and elsewhere in Southern Ontario. However, his architectural specialty was churches, designing approximately 25 churches primarily for Baptist but also Anglican congregations in Toronto and across Ontario. His first commissions were residential dating from 1892 and were primarily located in the Annex, Rosedale and Cabbagetown areas. He also designed dozens of commercial, warehouse and factory buildings such as 469 King Street West for the Dominion Paper Box Co. (1907), listed on the City's Heritage Register. In 1926, his son, Francis Bruce Brown joined the firm (forming J.F. Brown & Son). To date over 140 works have been credited to Brown's practises.<sup>21</sup>

<sup>19</sup> Construction, vol. 2, no.6, April 1909, p. 79.

<sup>20</sup> Robert Hill, "Brown, John Francis", <u>http://dictionaryofarchitectsincanada.org/node/1673</u> 21 OAA, "Brown, J Francis",

https://oaa.on.ca/Assets/Common/Shared\_Documents/Awards/Honour%20Roll/BROWN,%20John%20Fr ancis.pdf

# Frederick Henry Herbert (1865-1914)

Frederick Henry Herbert designed the apartment building at 85-89 Queen Street East.

Frederick Henry Herbert was a prolific Toronto-based nineteenth and early-twentieth century architect who specialized in the design of residential projects for clients throughout the city but particularly in the Rosedale, Annex, and Parkdale neighbourhoods. Born and trained in Bath, England, little is known about his early education or training there. In the early days of 1887, Herbert immigrated to Toronto and soon afterward apprenticed with Richard Ough (1841-1920).

In January 1889, Herbert established his own architectural practice, and within five years, he emerged as one of Toronto's versatile and adept supporters of the Queen Anne Revival style. Similar to his competitor E.J. Lennox, Herbert established a new standard for residential architecture in Toronto after the turn of the century.<sup>22</sup> One of his residential commissions was for a substantial house in Parkdale for George Rathbone who also retained him to design 85-89 Queen Street East. Although his work is often recognized by the picturesque, asymmetrical free-style plan, and elevations with his characteristic circular corner tower and steep roofs, his versatility and skill also resulted in outstanding work in the Richardsonian Romanesque style including the Dineen Building at 4 Temperance Street (designated under Part IV of the OHA).

While he specialized in residential architecture and designed nearly 100 residential buildings throughout the city, he also designed multi-unit apartment blocks including the Metropolitan Flats at 85-89 Queen Street East, the Metropolitan Apartments on Lansdowne Avenue and Queen Street West (1910); an Edwardian style apartment block for Harry Wineberg on Agnes Street at Elizabeth Street (1907; demolished 1960); the Macfarlane's Hotel at 99 Jarvis Street (1898), a three-storey multi-unit residential building; the Somerset House Hotel (1895) on Church Street at Carlton Street; and the Palace Hotel (later known as the Palace Arms Hotel) on King Street West at Strachan Avenue (1897). Herbert died in 1914 and his practice was taken over by Frank S. Mallory Sr (1860-1932) who had worked for him for several years.

# iii. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

The following section provides an architectural description and analysis related to the property which will establish the basis for determining design or physical value of Criteria 1, 2 or 3 according to O. Reg. 9/06 Criteria.

# **119 Church Street**

The property at 119 Church Street is comprised of a commercial combined with factory type building with Edwardian Classical detailing (Image 13). Identified by its brick cladding with stone detailing, symmetrical and rhythmic placement of door and window openings, and the selective application of classicist architectural elements, the Edwardian-Classical style was popularized during the early-20th century for a range of building types in Toronto.

<sup>22</sup> Robert Hill, "Herbert, Frederick Henry," Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada.

Determined by function and its location adjacent to a public laneway, the form of the four-storey red-brick structure is a long rectangular block, topped with a flat roof, with a narrow principal façade fronting Church Street and a long southern elevation along the adjacent laneway, known as Ditty Lane. Factories relied on a post-and-beam structure to allow maximum open space and flexibility, unencumbered by internal walls, to accommodate machinery and the movement of materials and goods. The narrow floor plan with windows on the long façade allowed for maximum entry of daylight to the shallow interior. This type of factory frequently had an adjacent laneway parallel to their long façades which facilitated deliveries and guaranteed access to light (Image 14 and 15). The interiors were typically planned with little more than a staircase at either end, washrooms, and a goods elevator. The uniformity of the interior and the structural grid is expressed in the regular grid patterning of windows on the exterior façades. The structure at 119 Church Street displays the characteristics indicative of a factory type building.

Original architectural plans designed in 1909 by architect J. Francis Brown indicate that the original structure was three-storeys in height with the fourth storey added in 1928 and designed by J.F Brown's successor firm, Francis Brown & Son Architects. The building is clad in multi-wythe red-brick masonry throughout with very minimal stone detailing executed using tooled Indiana limestone, primarily confined to the stringcourses across the principal elevation, as well as lintels with jamb stones, and sills. The principal or west elevation is organized into three bays organized by brick pilasters - the pilasters are continued along the south elevation providing an organizational structural for the fenestration. In its original configuration, the building had a shopfront with a centrally located recessed entrance at street level, flanked by large shopfront windows topped with a band of transom windows, and two stories of large windows on the second and third floors, set between the brick pilasters.

A denticulated, galvanized moulded iron shop cornice ran between the ground and second floors and a heavy denticulated galvanized moulded iron cornice ran at the roof level, below a high parapet wall. The cornice wrapped around to the sides of the building. The brick-clad rooftop parapet was removed in 1928, and a fourth storey addition continued the architectural vocabulary from below with large, equally spaced window openings and minimal stone details, limited to the sills, on a red-clad brick exterior. As indicated in the 1928 architectural plans for the fourth storey addition, the original windows on the fourth storey were multi-pane steel frame windows which differed from the wood framed windows on the second and third storey.

On the south elevation, along Ditty Lane, large window openings with rock faced stone sills and slightly arched window heads with red-brick voussoirs are set between the brick pilasters. Along this elevation, a number of original wood windows consisting of 4-over-1 double units remain.

The interior of the building is of mill construction comprised of post-and-beam structure, with an elevator shaft located at the eastern end of the building and accessible via Ditty Lane. Building Records indicate that various interior alterations have been made to the subject property since 1950. Various illuminated fascia signs were installed on the west and south elevations in the late 1980s as was the storefront at grade.

# 127 Church Street: Entrance address 121 Church Street

The structure at 121 Church Street comprises of a three-storey brick-clad main street commercial building designed in the late-Victorian style (Image 16). Constructed in 1888/1889 of multi-wythe brick masonry construction, the building features a rectangular plan with a flat roof. The principal or west elevation fronts onto Church Street and aligns with the streetwall created by the adjacent properties at 123 and119 Church Street. In 1918, a rear addition designed by architect W.C. Hunt, was constructed for Guest and Co.

As a commercial main street building type, the principal elevation of the structure is composed of a ground floor shopfront with office or residential spaces on the second and third floors. Characteristic of the late-Victorian style for commercial buildings, the building features restrained classicist stylistic elements on the principal elevation. The two upper storeys are framed by pilasters at the end walls and organized horizontally into two bays with symmetrically placed, flat-headed window openings with rusticated stone lintels and sills. Decorative brick detailing is evident in the red brick stringcourses with rosettes between the second and third storey and a triple-straight braided bond directly below the cornice. Similar to the adjacent properties at 119 and 123 Church Street, the original denticulated galvanized metal cornice at the top of the parapet remains. The cornice overhang is supported by metal brackets.

Building records indicate that in 1948, architect Irving M. Saunders prepared plans for the upper floors and modernized the store front at 121 Church Street. The drawings from 1948 indicate that the original storefront had cast iron columns, which were removed and replaced with modern plate glass and stainless-steel composition with an off-set display window and an angled, recessed entrance. On the north end of the front façade, the addition of a door provided access to the staircase to the upper levels. This storefront was subsequently replaced with the current composition which was designed to visually tie the building at 121 Church Street with those at 123 and 119 Church Street during the occupancy of Henry's, which ran from 2000 to 2022.

# 127 Church Street: Entrance address 123 Church Street

Similarly, 123 Church Street comprises of a three-storey brick-clad main street commercial building designed in the late-Victorian style (Image 17). Constructed in 1886/1887 of multi-wythe brick masonry construction, the building features a rectangular plan with a flat roof. The principal or west elevation fronts onto Church Street and aligns with the streetwall created by the adjacent properties at 121 and119 Church Street (Image 18).

As a commercial main street building type, the principal elevation of the structure is composed of a ground floor shopfront with office or residential spaces on the second and third floors. Characteristic of the late-Victorian style for commercial buildings, the building features restrained classicist stylistic elements on the principal elevation. It features a tripartite organization accentuated by pilasters, symmetrical arrangement of flat-headed window openings, stone banding across the tops of the window openings at both the second and third storeys with floral decorative motifs where the banding intersects with the pilasters, stone sills, and similar to the adjacent properties, a large overhanging metal cornice supported by four large brackets.

Building records indicate that in 1910, interior alterations were undertaken, and a rear addition designed by Toronto architect James Patrick Hynes, was constructed for W. E. Blake and Son. Further interior alterations were completed between 1948 and 1950 when under the ownership of Lewis and Reuben Frankel. Building permits indicate that the architect was Irving M. Saunders. The storefront has also been altered but alterations dates are not conclusive but likely during Henry's occupancy from 2000 to 2022.

# 85-89 Queen Street East

The Metropolitan Flats at 89 Queen Street East was designed in 1909 and reflected the style of the new century in its application of Edwardian Classicism. The style was featured in Toronto's earlier apartment buildings, echoing the Beaux Arts style of the American and French precedents. Following the influential 1892-3 Chicago World Fair, classicism was interpreted as a more appropriate urban style and suitable for the new types of buildings, such as apartment buildings, that arose in response to the changing social climate and a newly emerging middle class.

The property at 89 Queen Street East is a three-storey building with a flat roof and has a relatively long frontage along Queen Street East, which was designed to accommodate two storefronts flanking a single central entrance (Image 19). The entrance leads to a common stairwell that provides access to the four apartment units on each level, organized using an interior cross-axial plan. The building followed a T-shape plan with four light shafts providing light into the interior of each unit and balconies on the north (principal) elevation, on the second and third floors, providing light and air into the stairwell (Images 22 and 23). This contrasts with the earliest apartment buildings that often featured a higher number of units and required a courtyard to allow each unit access to light and air.

Evidence of the Edwardian style is noted in the symmetrical design of the north (principal) elevation with a centrally located entrance delineated by a three-storey arch with ashlar masonry surround (Image 24). The piers on the ground floor had ionic capitals, and decorative stone mouldings surrounded the entrance door and adorned the lintel. A stone cartouche was placed at the apex of the arch at the third floor. Iron balconies fronted the small, centralized balconies on both the second and third floors (Image 26).

The windows of the second and third floors are rectangular openings (either single or paired) with splayed stone keystones for headers (Image 25). Tooled blue Berea or Bedford stone sills were used on both the front, rear, and side elevations. Four carved stone panels with lion's heads are located between the window openings at the third-floor level and the corner quoins are also of stone. Aligned with Edwardian compositions, a heavy, overhanging galvanized iron cornice with wrought iron brackets topped the building, originally with a robust stone balustrade extending across the top of the building with a central flagpole.<sup>23</sup>

<sup>23</sup> Herbert, "Apartment and Store Building on Queen Street East for George Rathbone Esq. According to Plans and under the Superintendence of F. H. Herbert, Architect," City of Toronto Archives.

Herbert's specifications continue the careful craftsmanship of the design.<sup>24</sup> Don Valley buff brick laid using a light red or chocolate joint and set in American bond. Grey Bedford stone was to be used in all exposed elevations. The front window sills were to be weathered and throated and set hollow. The building was of steel and concrete construction and clad in pressed buff brick and cut stone.

The plan of the building was organized with the retail at grade while the second and third floors contained the residential units – partially lit by light shafts. Additional access to the apartments was provided by the three-storey wooden veranda that spanned across the rear elevation (Images 20 and 21). In its original design, two ground floor store fronts flanked the centrally located entrance vestibule to the apartments above. The stone piers on either end of this principal elevation, and those flanking the vestibule door have ionic capitals. The vestibule contains tiled mosaic flooring with floral motifs, as a nod to antiquity, with a coffered ceiling and fluted pilasters. The main front step was originally hard granite with rounded nosing. The interior lobby has grey marble dado panels lining the lower portion of the walls and the use of marble continues around the doorway as trim and as the treads and risers of the stairs. The lobby floor is terrazzo; the balustrade is iron.

While plans were prepared to dramatically alter the existing ground floor façade in 1955 when the Royal Furniture Company took over the space, it appears that the modernization never took place. The plans show a recessed, angled façade using materials such as aluminite, vitrolite, and terrazzo, which would have removed most of the original stone detailing.<sup>25</sup> The alteration to the ground floor, removing the recessed doors, is fairly recent.

# iv. CONTEXT

The following section provides contextual information and analysis related to the property which is the basis for determining contextual value of Criteria 7, 8 or 9 according to O. Reg. 9/06 Criteria.

The location of the adjoining properties at 119 Church Street, 127 Church Street, and 89 Queen Street East is shown on the map included as Figure 1 in Attachment 1 (Maps & Photographs). Beginning at the southeast corner of Queen Street East and Church Street, they form part of a block characterized by a fine-grained streetscape comprised of low-to-midrise buildings on the south side of Queen Street East that continues east toward to Jarvis Street and on the east side of Church Street to Richmond Street East. The block represents one of the few remaining intact collections of mixed-use residential/commercial and industrial typologies employing a variety of architectural styles in the neighbourhood. The buildings at 119 Church Street including entrance addresses 121 and 123 Church Street that were originally developed in the late-19th and early 20th centuries as commercial and manufacturing buildings sharing the same city block as the Robertson Brothers Confectioners, a manufacturing and warehouse complex with fine-grained frontages at 99 to 123 Queen Street East (Image 27). The

<sup>24</sup> Herbert, "Apartment and Store Building", City of Toronto Archives 25 GBCA, "HIA", June 2023

Robertson Brothers complex extended from Queen Street East to Richmond Street East, with fine-grained architectural detailing on both elevations.

The structures at 119 Church Street and 85 Queen Street East are serviced by a mid-19th century, mid-block laneway known as Ditty Lane. The southeastern corner property at entrance address 125 Church Street, one of the block's early mid-19th century brick structures, has been altered over time and its brick façades have been damaged through the application of stucco cladding.

Surrounding properties on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register include the Part IV Designated Metropolitan United Church (1872, partially rebuilt in 1929) and its parklike grounds at 56 Queen Street East. On the southwest corner at 79 Queen Street East is the Bank of Nova Scotia (1913) listed on the City's Heritage Register. Directly to the east along Queen Street East, the properties at 99 to 123 Queen Street (along with 94 to 114 Richmond Street East for the Robertson Brothers Confectioners complex; 1903-06 and 1913). In addition, 60 Queen Street East, the northeastern property at Queen Street East and Church Street and to the west at 90 to 104 Queen Street East, a collection of low-rise commercial main street buildings, are Part IV designated properties (Images 27 and 28). The property at 119 Church Street is adjacent to a public laneway, named by City Council in 2012 as "Ditty Lane" to commemorate the 19th-century Ditty Hotel, formerly located at Church and Richmond Street East, and named after Ann Ditty, the proprietor.

# 3. EVALUATION AND APPLICATION OF O.REG 9/06 CRITERIA

The following evaluation applies Ontario Regulation 9/06 made under the Act: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. The criteria are prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Act, and the City of Toronto is also required to use these criteria when assessing properties for inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register. There are a total of nine criteria under O. Reg 9/06. A property may be designated under Section 29 of the Act if it meets two or more of the provincial criteria for determining whether it is of cultural heritage value or interest.

The evaluation table is marked "N/A" if the criterion is "not applicable" to the property or " $\checkmark$ " if it is applicable to the property, with explanatory text below.

# DESIGN OR PHYSICAL VALUE

# **119 Church Street**

The property has design value or physical value because it	
1. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type,	$\checkmark$
expression, material or construction method.	
2. displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit	N/A
3. demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement	N/A

#### *Representative example of a style and type*

The property at 119 Church Street has design and physical value as a representative example of an early-20th-century commercial/factory type building with Edwardian Classicist detailing. Characteristic features of this building type include its narrow, rectangular massing, four-storey volume, flat roofline, brick cladding, as well as window openings arranged in a grid pattern expressive of the internal post and beam structure and manufacturing function evident along the long southern elevation. The Edwardian Classicist style can be seen on its principal or west elevation in the tripartite organization, symmetrical arrangement of flat-headed openings, including the storefront window openings flanking a centrally placed entrance, the Indiana limestone detailing, pilasters, as well as a heavy denticulated metal cornice and a more subdued denticulated shop metal cornice that wraps around the southwest corner. The style is further evident on the south elevation in the rhythmic arrangement of the segmental-arched openings, the stone sills and triple-layered arched brick detailing above and the pilasters providing an organizational structure to the window openings.

# HISTORICAL OR ASSOCIATIVE VALUE

The property has historical value or associative value because it	
4. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity,	$\checkmark$
organization or institution that is significant to a community	
5. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an	N/A
understanding of a community or culture	
6. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder,	$\checkmark$
designer or theorist who is significant to a community	

The property has value for its association with George Sparrow, who, in 1909, commissioned the architect John Francis Brown to design a new manufacturing and commercial building for his company George Sparrow & Company, designers and manufacturers of appliances and equipment for hotel and industrial kitchens. Formerly located on King Street East, adjacent to St. James Cathedral at King and Church Streets, the company remained at 119 Church Street for almost 25 years.

The property is valued for its association with Henry's, a business in the Canadian photographic industry established in Toronto in 1909 by Harry Himelstein, initially as a watch and jewelry business on Yonge Street and evolving into Canada's largest independent photographic and digital retailer. Henry & Company purchased 119 Church Street in 1974 to focus exclusively on the photographic market and rebranded the company as Henry's with its signature orange logo. As one of Canada's oldest and successful independent camera retailers, Henry's operated out of this location for 47 years.

# Demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community

The property has further associative value as it reflects the work of the Torontobased architect John Francis Brown (1866-1942), a leading and prolific architect who practiced for over 50 years and was the principal figure of three generations of the Brown family of architects. While 140 works have been credited to Brown's practises, he made a particular contribution to the design of commercial, warehouse and factory buildings across the City of Toronto such as 469 King Street West for the Dominion Paper Box Co. (1907), listed on the City's Heritage Register.

# CONTEXTUAL VALUE

The property has contextual value because it is	
7. important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area.	$\checkmark$
8. physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings.	$\checkmark$
9. a landmark.	N/A

# Important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area

Situated on the east side of Church Street, immediately south of Queen Street East and adjacent to the historic alleyway known today as Ditty Lane, the building at 119 Church Street, together with its adjacent properties at 121 and 123 Church Street, is important in maintaining and supporting the late 19th and early 20th century commercial character of the Garden District neighbourhood through its scale, setback, material qualities, and design features of Edwardian Classical architectural elements which contribute to a low-rise, fine-grained, streetwall condition found along this portion of Church Street.

# Physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings

For over 110 years, the structure at 119 Church Street has been physically, functionally, visually and historically linked to its surroundings and the commercial character of Church Street as a mixed-use building associated with the evolution of the area and its association with prominent local businesses.

# DESIGN OR PHYSICAL VALUE

# 127 Church Street (entrance address 121 Church Street)

The property has design value or physical value because it	
1. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type,	$\checkmark$
expression, material or construction method.	
2. displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit	N/A
3. demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement	N/A

The property at 127 Church with the entrance address at 121 Church Street is a representative example of the late-Victorian style, which is evident in its extant original features including symmetrical arrangement of flat-headed window openings with rough-hewn stone lintels and sills, the upper storeys framed by pilasters, the prominent denticulated metal cornice bookended with large brackets, the restrained decorative red brick stringcourses with rosettes between the second and third storey and a triple-straight braided bond below the cornice. Designed in c.1888, the property retains its original scale, form, and massing as a 3-storey commercial building and has physical value as a surviving example of a fine-grained commercial building typology that emerged along Church Street during the late 19th century.

# HISTORICAL OR ASSOCIATIVE VALUE

The property has historical value or associative value because it	
4. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity,	N/A
organization or institution that is significant to a community	
5. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an	N/A
understanding of a community or culture	
6. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder,	N/A
designer or theorist who is significant to a community	

# CONTEXTUAL VALUE

The property has contextual value because it is	
7. important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area.	$\checkmark$
8. physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings.	$\checkmark$
9. a landmark.	N/A

# Important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area

Situated on the east side of Church Street in the block between Queen Street East and Richmond Street East, the subject property, together with its adjacent properties at 119 and 123 Church Street, maintains and supports the historic commercial main street character along this portion of Church Street, which is characterized by a low-scale continuous streetwall condition. While the original storefront has been altered, the building's west elevation retains architectural features in the late-Victorian style, one of several predominant architectural styles in the area.

# Physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings

For close to 135 years, the structure at 121 Church Street has been physically, functionally, visually and historically linked to its surroundings and the commercial character of Church Street as a mixed-use building associated with the evolution of the area and its association with prominent local businesses.

# DESIGN OR PHYSICAL VALUE

# 127 Church Street (entrance address 123 Church Street)

The property has design value or physical value because it	
1. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type,	$\checkmark$
expression, material or construction method.	
2. displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit	N/A
3. demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement	N/A

The property at 127 Church with an entrance address at 123 Church Street is a representative example of the late-Victorian style, which is evident in its extant original features including restrained classicist stylistic elements on the principal elevation. It features a tripartite organization accentuated by pilasters, symmetrical arrangement of

flat-headed window openings, stone banding across the tops of the window openings at both the second and third storeys with floral decorative motifs where the banding intersects with the pilasters, stone sills, and similar to the adjacent properties, a large overhanging metal cornice supported by four large brackets.

Designed in c.1887, the property retains its original scale, form, and massing as a 3storey commercial building and has physical value as a surviving example of a finegrained commercial building typology that emerged along Church Street during the late 19th century.

# HISTORICAL OR ASSOCIATIVE VALUE

The property has historical value or associative value because it	
4. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity,	N/A
organization or institution that is significant to a community	
5. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an	$\checkmark$
understanding of a community or culture	
6. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder,	N/A
designer or theorist who is significant to a community	

The property also has cultural heritage value for its association with the New York publishing company and booksellers D & J Sadlier & Company, known for its Catholic publications. The successful company had operations across the United States, Montreal, and Toronto. Between 1887 and 1909, their company branch in Toronto was based at this location, in close proximity to three notable religious institutions - the Metropolitan United Church and Grounds (1870) at 56 Queen Street East and St. Michael's Cathedral (1845-1848) at 57 Bond Street and St. James' Cathedral and Grounds (1853) at 106 King Street East, all of which are adjacent to Church Street.

# CONTEXTUAL VALUE

The property has contextual value because it is	
7. important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area.	$\checkmark$
8. physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings.	$\checkmark$
9. a landmark.	N/A

Situated on the east side of Church Street in the block between Queen Street East and Richmond Street East, the subject property, together with its adjacent properties at 121 and 119 Church Street, maintains and supports the historic commercial main street character along this portion of Church Street, which is characterized by a low-scale continuous streetwall condition. While the original storefront has been altered, the building's west elevation retains architectural features in the late-Victorian style, one of several predominant architectural styles in the area.

# Physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings

For approximately 135 years, the structure at entrance address 123 Church Street has been physically, functionally, visually and historically linked to its surroundings and the commercial and industrial character of Church Street as a mixed-use building

associated with the evolution of the area and its association with the religious institutions located adjacent to Church Street.

# 89 Queen Street

#### **DESIGN OR PHYSICAL VALUE**

The property has design value or physical value because it	
1. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type,	$\checkmark$
expression, material or construction method.	
2. displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit	$\checkmark$
3. demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement	N/A

Originally designed in 1909, the property at 89 Queen Street East, known as the Metropolitan Flats, has design value as a representative example of the apartment building typology that emerged in Canada in the early 20th century following precedents from Europe and the United States. The building is a surviving example of an early purpose-built apartment building type constructed in the initial period of their development in the city and is one of the first mixed-use commercial and apartment building typologies. It retains its original intended form and construction, with variations from the initial permit drawings limited to the commercial storefronts and the rear of the structure.

The Metropolitan Flats has further design and physical value as a fine example of Edwardian Classicism, an architectural style that came to define apartment buildings in the early 20th century in Toronto, echoing the Beaux Arts style of the American and French precedents found in urban environments. The style is represented in many of its extant original features including the symmetrical design of the plans and north (principal) elevation featuring a centrally located entrance delineated by a three-storey arch, centralized balconies on the both the second and third floors, piers with ionic capitals, and aligned with Edwardian compositions, a heavy, overhanging metal cornice topped the building, originally with a robust balustrade extending across the top of the building.

A high degree of craftsmanship is evident in its materiality and architectural execution, including Don Valley buff brick laid using a light red or chocolate joint and set in American bond with architectural detailing in grey Bedford stone carvings such as the stone lintels, the central upper storey archway with elaborate carved cartouche, the rusticated pilasters topped with ionic capitals and richly carved entrance. The ground vestibule entrance contains an intricate mosaic floor area which displays high artistic merit.

The property retains its original scale, form, and massing as a 3-storey apartment building with no significant alterations to the exterior, save for alterations to the commercial storefronts at street level, since its construction over a century ago.

# HISTORICAL OR ASSOCIATIVE VALUE

The property has historical value or associative value because it	
4. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity,	N/A
organization or institution that is significant to a community	
5. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an	N/A
understanding of a community or culture	
6. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder,	$\checkmark$
designer or theorist who is significant to a community	

The property also has historical value for its association with Frederick Henry Herbert (1865-1914), a highly successful Toronto architect who specialized and excelled in the design of residential projects for clients, particularly in the Rosedale, Annex, and Parkdale neighbourhoods.

Designed in 1909 and reflecting the style of the new century in its application of Edwardian Classicism, the Metropolitan Flats demonstrates Herbert's versatility and transference of exceptional residential design skills to an apartment building typology with a skillful integration of atypical commercial storefronts.

Herbert began his practice in Toronto in 1889 and was one of the earliest local architects to design apartment buildings, a new residential building typology in the city. His portfolio of outstanding work such as the Dineen Building at 4 Temperance Street (1897), the Macfarlane's Hotel at 99 Jarvis Street (1898) are designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, and the Somerset House Hotel at 436 Church Street (1895) is included on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.

# CONTEXTUAL VALUE

The property has contextual value because it is	
7. important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area.	$\checkmark$
8. physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings.	$\checkmark$
9. a landmark.	N/A

Located on the south side of Queen Street East and reflecting an early 20th century scale, setback, and Edwardian Classicism style, the commercial/residential building at 89 Queen Street East is visually and physically linked to its location fronting Queen and is important in maintaining and supporting the early 20th century mixed residential and commercial character of Queen Street.

# CONCLUSION

The site is anchored by two historically and visually prominent properties: the property at 119 Church Street, designed in 1909 by Toronto architect J. Francis Brown (1866-1942) and is associated with the iconic Henry's Camera shop, which operated at this location for almost 50 years, and the property at 89 Queen Street East, known as the Metropolitan Flats, designed in 1909 by Frederick Henry Herbert (1865-1914) and is a surviving example of an early purpose-built apartment building type constructed in the

initial period of their development in the city. Moreover, the late-Victorian commercial main street structures at 127 Church Street contribute to the historic main street character and streetscape of this portion of Church Street.

Staff have completed the Research and Evaluation Report for the properties at 119 Church Street, 127 Church Street (including entrance addresses 121 Church Street and 123 Church Street) and 89 Queen Street East (including entrance address at 85 Queen Street East) and determined that the properties meet at least 2 out of 9 criteria in Ontario Regulation 9/06, the criteria prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Act. As such, the properties should be designated.

The Statements of Significance (Attachments 3-5) for 119 Church Street, 127 Church Street, and 89 Queen Street East comprise the Reasons for Designation, which is the Public Notice of Intention to Designate.

# CONTACT

Mary L. MacDonald, MA, CAHP Senior Manager, Heritage Planning Urban Design, City Planning Tel: 416-338-1079 Fax: 416-392-1973 E-mail: <u>Mary.MacDonald@toronto.ca</u>

# SIGNATURE

Gregg Lintern, MCIP, RPP Chief Planner and Executive Director City Planning

# ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 – Maps and Photographs Attachment 2 – List of Research Sources Attachment 3 – Statement of Significance (Reasons for Designation) 119 Church Street Attachment 4 – Statement of Significance (Reasons for Designation) 127 Church Street Attachment 5 – Statement of Significance (Reasons for Designation) 89 Queen Street East

# **MAPS AND PHOTOGRAPHS:**

# 119 Church Street, 127 Church Street, and 89 Queen Street East



1. The approximate location of the subject properties at 119 Church Street, 127 Church Street, and 89 Queen Street East (City of Toronto iView Mapping, annotated by Heritage Planning)



2. 1797 Smith Plan for the enlargement of York. The arrow marks the block containing the subject properties. The original Town of York are the blocks shaded in red. (University of Toronto Map and Data Library)



3. The 1858 Goad's map showing the early development of the block. The public laneway now known as Ditty Lane appears surveyed (indicated by arrow). The property at 119 Church Street and the corner property at Queen Street East and Church Street both contain brick structures. (City of Toronto Archives)



4. 1889 Goad's map showing the structures at 121 Church Street (under construction) and 123 Church Street (entrance addresses for 127 Church Street). (City of Toronto Archives)



5. 1913 Goads Map showing the development of the subject site including the rear addition at 123 Church Street and the completion of the Metropolitan Flats at 89 Queen Street East (City of Toronto Archives)



6. 1918 Fire Insurance Plan showing the subject site outlined in red: Metropolitan Apartments at 89 Queen Street East, George Sparrow & Co. at 119 Church Street, and 121 Church and 123 Church. (University of Toronto Map and Data Library)



7. 119 Church Street architectural design by J. Francis Brown for "Store Building No. 119 Church Street" (1909), commissioned by George Sparrow. This building is adjacent to a public laneway known today as Ditty Lane (Building Records, City of Toronto)



8. South elevation of 119 Church Street, adjacent to the public laneway known as Ditty Lane, designed by Francis Brown (1909) showing the original 3 storey building (Building Records, City of Toronto)



9. Fourth storey addition to "Store and Workshop 119 Church Street" for George Sparrow, dated 1928 and designed by J. Francis Brown & Son Architects (Building Records, City of Toronto)



10. South elevation of fourthstorey addition to 119 Church Street, 1928, adjacent to Ditty Lane (Building Records, City of Toronto)



City of Toronto Archives, Fonds 2032, Series 841, File 51, Item 8

11. Southeast corner of Church Street and Queen Street East in 1972 showing the fine-grained streetscape with commercial uses at grade. The property at 119 Church Street is the 4-storey structure with Mc Brien's signage on the far right, immediately to the north are the 127 Church Street buildings with painted masonry, and the Metropolitan Flats are to the far left of the image (City of Toronto Archives)



12. In 1974, Henry's Camera relocates to 119 Church Street and focuses solely on the photographic market (HIA, 2023)



13. West (principal) elevation of 119 Church Street, adjacent to Ditty Lane, a public laneway (Heritage Planning, 2023)



14. South elevation of 119 Church Street facing Ditty Lane (Heritage Planning, 2023)



15. South elevation showing the architectural details of west (principal) elevation including the cornice continue/return to the first bay (Heritage Planning, 2023)


16. West (principal) elevation of entrance address 121 Church Street showing a late-Victorian architectural style (Heritage Planning, 2023)

17. West (principal) elevation of entrance address 123 Church Street showing a late-Victorian architectural style (Heritage Planning, 2023)



18. Grouping of late 19th century and early 20th century commercial buildings at 119 Church Street (far right), 121 Church Street (centre) and 123 Church Street (far left)



19. Architectural plans (1909) prepared by F. H. Herbert for the Metropolitan Flats at 89 Queen Street East (City of Toronto Archives)



20. (left) and 21. (right) Rear elevation of the Metropolitan Flats, designed in 1909 by Francis Herbert. (City of Toronto Archives)



22. Interior unit layout of the Metropolitan Flats



23. Roof plan showing the four skylight window wells designed for natural light to enter each unit (City of Toronto Archives)



24. Front elevation of 89 Queen Street East showing Edwardian Classicism architectural elements (Heritage Planning, 2023)



25. (left) and 26. (right) Architectural details in stone, buff-brick cladding in Don Valley brick, prominent metal cornice painted in black (Heritage Planning, 2023)



27. Robertson Brothers industrial complex at 99 - 123 Queen Street East, designated under Part IV of the OHA (Heritage Planning, 2023)



28. Northeast corner of Church Street and Queen Street East: 60 Queen Street, 131-135 Church Street were designated under Part IV of the OHA (Heritage Planning, 2023)

# **RESEARCH SOURCES**

### ARCHIVAL SOURCES

- City of Toronto Archives, Tax Assessment Rolls.
- City of Toronto Archives Photographs
- City of Toronto Building Records
- Goad's Atlas of the City of Toronto, 1858, 1889, 1903, 1913, 1918.
- Land Registry Office, Metro Toronto, Book 225 (Plan 3A).
- Might's Greater Toronto City Directories, 1871-2001.
- University of Toronto Map and Data Library

# SECONDARY SOURCES:

- Abramowicz, Emma. "The Spadina Gardens: A Fight over Sixteen Units in 1905" in House Divided: How the Missing Middle Can Solve Toronto's Affordability Crisis., Editors: Alex Bozikovic, Cheryll Case, John Lorinc and Annabel Vaughan, 2019.
- Blumenson, John. Ontario Architecture: A Guide to Styles and Building Terms 1784 to the present. Fitzhenry & Whiteside, 1990.
- Construction, vol. 2, no.6, April 1909, p. 79.
- "D. & J. Sadlier & Co". https://xroads.virginia.edu/~Hyper/SADLIER/Husband.htm;
- Dendy, William and William Kilbourn. *Toronto Observed*. Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1986
- Dennis, Richard. "Interpreting the apartment house: modernity and metropolitanism in Toronto, 1900-1930. Journal of Historical Geography, vol 20, no 3, 1994.
- "Dr. Rosebrugh"
  <u>http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/rosebrugh\_abner\_mulholland\_14E.html</u>
- "Emily Stowe". Emily Stowe | The Canadian Encyclopedia
- "Emily Stowe". <u>https://parks.canada.ca/culture/designation/personnage-person/emily-stowe</u>
- Goldsmith, Borgal & Company Architects. *Heritage Impact Assessment for 119 Church Street including 121 to 127 Church Street and 85-89 Queen Street East, 2nd Issue.* June 27, 2023
- "Henry's". https://phsc.ca/henrys-history.html
- "Herbert, Frederick Henry". http://dictionaryofarchitectsincanada.org/node/241
- Herbert, Frederick Henry. "Apartment and Store Building on Queen Street East for George Rathbone Esq. According to Plans and under the Superintendence of F. H. Herbert, Architect," City of Toronto Archives.
- "J. Francis Brown." <u>Brown, John Francis | Biographical Dictionary of Architects in</u> <u>Canada</u>
- "J. Francis Brown." BROWN, John Francis.pdf (oaa.on.ca)
- McHugh, Patricia. Toronto Architecture: A City Guide, 2nd Ed., 1989
- Toronto Public Library, Toronto Star Historical Newspaper Archives and the Globe and Mail Newspaper Archives

# **119 CHURCH STREET**

# STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE (REASONS FOR DESIGNATION)

The property at 119 Church Street is worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value, and meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the provincial criteria prescribed for municipal designation, under the categories of design/physical, historical/associative, and contextual value

#### Description

The property at 119 Church Street is located on the east side of Church Street and adjacent to a public laneway, between Queen Street East and Richmond Street East. Rising 4-storeys, the Edwardian Classicist commercial/factory building was completed in c.1910 for George Sparrow & Co., a Toronto-based company specializing in the design and manufacturing of appliances and equipment for hotel and industrial kitchens.

#### **Statement of Cultural Heritage Value**

#### **Design or Physical Value**

The property at 119 Church Street has design and physical value as a representative example of an early-20th-century commercial/factory type building with Edwardian Classicist detailing. Characteristic features of this building type include its narrow, rectangular massing, four-storey volume, flat roofline, brick cladding, as well as window openings arranged in a grid pattern expressive of the internal post and beam structure and manufacturing function evident along the long southern elevation. The Edwardian Classicist style can be seen on its principal or west elevation in the tripartite organization, symmetrical arrangement of flat-headed openings, the Indiana limestone detailing, pilasters, as well as a heavy denticulated metal cornice and a more subdued denticulated shop metal cornice that wraps around the southwest corner. The original storefront entrance was recessed and flanked by large storefront windows. The original design also included a band of transom windows, four windowpanes above the storefront windows with three above entrance doorway, and the pilasters continued to the base of the building. The style is further evident on the south elevation in the rhythmic arrangement of the segmental-arched openings, the stone sills and triplelayered arched brick detailing above and the pilasters providing an organizational structure to the window openings.

#### **Historical or Associative Value**

The property has value for its association with George Sparrow who, in 1909, commissioned the architect John Francis Brown to design a new manufacturing and commercial building for his company George Sparrow & Company, designers and manufacturers of appliances and equipment for hotel and industrial kitchens. Formerly located on King Street East, adjacent to St. James Cathedral at King and Church Streets, the company remained at 119 Church Street for almost 25 years.

The property is also valued for its association with Henry's Camera, a business in the Canadian photographic industry established in Toronto in 1909 by Harry Himelstein, initially as a watch and jewelry business on Yonge Street and evolving into Canada's largest independent photographic and digital retailer. Henry & Company purchased 119 Church Street in 1974 to focus exclusively on the photographic market and rebranded the company as Henry's with its signature orange logo. As one of Canada's oldest and successful independent camera retailers, Henry's operated out of this location for 47 years.

The property has further associative value as it reflects the work of the Torontobased architect John Francis Brown (1866-1942), a leading and prolific architect who practiced for over 50 years and was the principal figure of three generations of the Brown family of architects. While 140 works have been credited to Brown's practises, he made a particular contribution to the design of commercial, warehouse and factory buildings across the City of Toronto such as 469 King Street West for the Dominion Paper Box Co. (1907), listed on the City's Heritage Register.

#### **Contextual Value**

Situated on the east side of Church Street, immediately south of Queen Street east and adjacent to the historic alleyway known today as Ditty Lane, the building at 119 Church Street, together with its adjacent properties at 121 and 123 Church Street, is important in maintaining and supporting the late 19th and early 20th century commercial character of the Garden District neighbourhood through its scale, setback, material qualities, and design features of Edwardian Classical architectural elements which contribute to a low-rise, fine-grained, streetwall condition found along this portion of Church Street.

For over 110 years, the Edwardian Classicist commercial/factory building at 119 Church Street has been physically, functionally, visually and historically linked to its surroundings and the commercial, industrial, and institutional character of Church Street, sharing the same block with the Robertson Brothers manufacturing complex, designated under Part IV of the OHA and the Metropolitan United Church at the northwest corner of Church and Queen Streets, also designated under the OHA.

# **Heritage Attributes**

#### **Design or Physical Value**

The following heritage attributes contribute to the cultural heritage value of the property at 119 Church Street as a representative example of an early 20th century commercial/factory type building with Edwardian Classicist detailing:

- The setback, placement and orientation of the building on its lot on the east side of Church Street with a laneway on the south side of the building
- The four-storey scale, rectangular form and massing, and flat roof
- The materials including red brick cladding with stone detailing and metal cornices
- On the principal (west) elevation:

- The tripartite organization and symmetrical arrangement of window openings and the central entrance flanked by storefront window openings
- The flat-headed window openings with stone sills and lintels with jambs
- The heavy denticulated metal cornice above the third storey window openings and the denticulated shop metal cornice below the second storey window openings, and their return on the southwest corner
- The stone string courses
- On the south elevation, the first bay on the southwest corner with the return of the heavy denticulated metal cornice above the third storey window opening and the denticulated shop metal cornice below the second storey window opening and the flat-headed window openings with stone sills and lintels with jambs

The following heritage attributes contribute to the contextual value of the property at 119 Church Street as it supports the late-19th and early-20th-century commercial and industrial streetscape of Church Street:

- The scale, placement, setback and orientation of the building on the east side of Church Street and adjacent to the historic laneway
- The Edwardian Classicist detailing as outlined above and materials including brick cladding and stone detailing
- Its location fronting Church Street with the return of the detailing on the west elevation continued onto the first bay of the south elevation

# **127 CHURCH STREET**

(Entrance addresses 121 Church Street and 123 Church Street)

# STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE (REASONS FOR DESIGNATION)

The property at 127 Church Street (entrance addresses 121 Church Street and 123 Church Street) is worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value, and meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the provincial criteria prescribed for municipal designation, under the categories of design/physical and contextual value.

#### Description

The property at 127 Church Street (entrance addresses 121 and 123 Church Street) is located on the east side of Church Street, on the block between Queen Street East and Richmond Street East. Designed in a late-Victorian architectural style, the two three-storey commercial buildings form part of a grouping of commercial structures that were originally completed between 1887 and 1910, and together contribute to the late 19th and early 20th century fine-grained, commercial character of Church Street.

#### **Statement of Cultural Heritage Value**

#### **Design Value**

The property at 127 Church with an entrance address at 121 Church Street is a representative example of the late-Victorian style, which is evident in its many extant original features including symmetrical arrangement of flat-headed window openings with rusticated stone lintels and sills, the upper storeys framed by pilasters, the prominent denticulated metal cornice bookended with large brackets, restrained decorative red brick stringcourses with rosettes between the second and third storey and a triple-straight braided bond below the cornice. Designed in c.1888, the property retains its original scale, form, and massing as a 3-storey commercial building and has physical value as a surviving example of a fine-grained commercial building typology that emerged along Church Street during the late 19th century.

The property at 127 Church with an entrance address at 123 Church Street is also a representative example of the late-Victorian style, which is evident in its extant original features including classicist stylistic elements on the principal elevation. It features a tripartite organization accentuated by pilasters, symmetrical arrangement of flat-headed window openings, stone banding across the tops of the window openings at both the second and third storeys with floral decorative motifs where the banding intersects with the pilasters, stone sills, and similar to the adjacent properties, a prominent overhanging metal cornice supported by four large brackets. Designed in c.1887, the property retains its original scale, form, and massing as a 3-storey commercial building and has physical value as a surviving example of a fine-grained commercial building typology that emerged along Church Street during the late 19th century.

Situated on the east side of Church Street in the block between Queen Street East and Richmond Street East, the buildings at entrance addresses 121 Church Street and 123 Church Street, together with the adjacent property at 119 Church Street, maintain and supports the historic fine-grained, commercial main street character along this portion of Church Street, which is characterized by a low-scale continuous streetwall condition. While the original storefronts have been altered, the buildings' west elevations retain architectural features in the late-Victorian style, one of several predominant architectural styles in the area.

For close to 135 years, the structures at 121 Church Street and 123 Church Street have been physically, functionally, visually and historically linked to its surroundings and the commercial character of Church Street as mixed-use buildings associated with the evolution of the area and the area's early association with Toronto's medical community, including nearby 60 Queen Street East, designated under Part IV of the OHA.

#### **Heritage Attributes**

#### **Design or Physical Value**

The following heritage attributes contribute to the cultural heritage value of the property at entrance addresses 121 Church Street and 123 Church Street as representative examples of late 19th century commercial type buildings designed in a late-Victorian style:

- The setback, placement and orientation of the buildings on the east side of Church Street
- The three-storey scale, rectangular form and massing, and flat roof
- The materials including red brick cladding with stone detailing and metal cornices
- On the principal (west) elevation of the structure at entrance address 121 Church Street:
  - The two-bay horizontal organization and symmetrical arrangement of window openings
  - The flat-headed window openings with rusticated stone sills and lintels
  - The heavy denticulated metal cornice bookended with large brackets
  - The decorative brick courses including the restrained decorative red brick stringcourses with rosettes between the second and third storey and a triple-straight braided bond below the cornice
  - Brick pilasters framing the ends of the upper storeys

- On the principal (west) elevation of the structure at entrance address 123 Church Street:
  - The three-bay organization and symmetrical arrangement of openings
  - The flat-headed window openings with stone sills and lintels which run as a single course
  - The prominent metal cornice with dentil patterning and four large brackets
  - The four brick pilasters accentuating the façade's tripartite organization with stone floral motifs at juncture with stone lintels

The following heritage attributes contribute to the contextual value of 127 Church Street (entrance addresses 121 Church Street and 123 Church Street) as it supports the late-19th and early-20th-century commercial streetscape of Church Street:

- The scale, placement, setback and orientation of the buildings on the east side of Church Street
- The late-Victorian architectural detailing as outlined above and materials including brick cladding, stone detailing, and metal cornices
- Their location fronting Church Street

**NO**TE: The structure with the entrance address of 125 Church Street on the property is not a heritage attribute.

# 89 QUEEN STREET EAST STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE (REASONS FOR DESIGNATION)

The property at 89 Queen Street East (entrance address 85 Queen Street East) is worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value, and meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the provincial criteria prescribed for municipal designation, under the categories of design/physical, historical/associative, and contextual value.

# Description

The property at 89 Queen Street East contains the Metropolitan Flats, located on the south side of Queen Street East, immediately east of Church Street. Designed in 1909 by Toronto architect Frederick Henry Herbert, the Don Valley buff-brick building is a fine example of the Edwardian Classicism style. Constructed by 1910, the property is an early 3-storey purpose-built apartment building type constructed in the initial period of their development in Toronto and is a unique example of a mixed-use commercial and apartment building typology.

#### **Statement of Cultural Heritage Value**

#### **Design or Physical Value**

Originally designed in 1909, the property at 89 Queen Street East, known as the Metropolitan Flats, has design value as a representative example of the apartment building typology that emerged in Canada in the early 20th century following precedents from Europe and the United States. The building is a surviving example of an early purpose-built apartment building type constructed in the initial period of their development in the city and is an early mixed-use commercial and apartment building typology.

The Metropolitan Flats has further design and physical value as a fine example of Edwardian Classicism, an architectural style that came to define apartment buildings in the early 20th century in Toronto, echoing the Beaux Arts style of the American and French precedents found in urban settings. The style is represented in many of its extant original features including the symmetrical design of the plans and north (principal) elevation featuring a centrally located entrance delineated by a three-storey arch, centralized balconies with iron railing, and symmetrical arrangement of window openings, stone quoins and piers, lonic capitals with egg-and-dart patterns, as well as splayed lintels with layered keystones and intricately carved stone lions' heads evenly placed between the window openings at the third storey. Aligned with Edwardian compositions, a prominent, overhanging galvanized iron cornice with large wrought iron brackets extends across the top of the building. Originally, a robust stone balustrade topped the cornice. A high degree of craftsmanship is evident in its materiality and architectural execution, including Don Valley buff brick laid using a light red or chocolate joint and set in American bond with architectural detailing in grey Bedford stone carvings such as the stone lintels, the central upper storey archway with elaborate carved cartouche, the pilasters topped with ionic capitals and richly carved entrance. The vestibule contains a well-crafted mosaic flooring with floral motifs.

The property retains its original scale, form, and massing as a 3-storey apartment building with no significant alterations to the exterior, save for alterations to the commercial storefronts at street level, since its construction over a century ago. The original central entrance had an elaborative stone surround with classicist stylistic decorative elements.

# **Historical or Associative Value**

The property also has historical value for its association with Frederick Henry Herbert (1865-1914), a highly successful Toronto architect who specialized and excelled in the design of residential projects for clients, particularly in the Rosedale, Annex, and Parkdale neighbourhoods. He began his practice in Toronto in 1889 and was one of the earliest local architects to design apartment buildings, a new residential building typology in the city. Designed in 1909 and reflecting the style of the new century in its application of Edwardian Classicism, the Metropolitan Flats demonstrates his versatility and transference of exceptional residential design skills to an apartment building typology with a skillful integration of atypical commercial storefronts. His portfolio of outstanding work such as the Dineen Building at 4 Temperance Street (1897), the Macfarlane's Hotel at 99 Jarvis Street (1898) are designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, and the Somerset House Hotel at 436 Church Street (1895) is recognized on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register.

#### **Contextual Value**

Located on the south side of Queen Street East and reflecting an early 20th century scale, setback, materiality, and Edwardian Classicism style, the commercial/residential building at 89 Queen Street East is visually and physically linked to its location fronting Queen and is important in maintaining and supporting the early 20th century mixed residential and commercial character of Queen Street East.

#### Heritage Attributes

#### **Design and Physical Value**

The following heritage attributes contribute to the cultural heritage value of the property at 89 Queen Street East as a representative example of an Edwardian Classicism apartment form building typology from the early-20th century:

- The setback, placement, and orientation of the apartment building on the south side of Queen Street East
- The scale, form and massing of the three-storey building with a flat roof
- The materials including buff-brick cladding and stone detailing

- The composition of the principal (north) elevation fronting Queen Street East, which features:
  - A recessed central entrance with decorative stone surround and delineated by a double, three-storey stone arch topped with a stone cartouche
  - The symmetrical arrangement of window openings and central balconies at second and third storeys with iron railing
  - Edwardian Classicist detailings executed in stone including splayed lintels with double keystones, sills, quoining enhancing both the corners of the building and the three-storey double central arch, carved lion heads at the third storey, lonic capitals with egg-and-dart pattern on stone pilasters composed of horizontal banding
  - The prominent overhanging ornamented galvanized iron cornice with wrought iron brackets
- The floral motif, mosaic floor tiling in the vestibule

The following heritage attribute contributes to the cultural heritage value of the property at 89 Queen Street East as part of the early 20th-century development of the area:

- The placement, setback and orientation of the three-storey building on the south side of Queen Street East, between Church Street and Jarvis Street
- The low-rise, three-storey walk up apartment typology
- The Edwardian style composition and architectural features and buff-brick cladding with stone detailing