

# **REPORT FOR ACTION**

# 309 Cherry Street - Notice of Intention to Designate a Property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act

Date: December 27, 2023
To: Planning and Housing Committee
From: Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning
Wards: Ward 14 - Toronto-Danforth

# SUMMARY

This report recommends that City Council state its intention to designate the property at 309 Cherry Street under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value according to the Statement of Significance and description of Heritage Attributes found in Attachment 3.

Located in the Port Lands at the southeast corner of Cherry Street and Villiers Street, the subject property at 309 Cherry Street is approximately bounded by Cherry Street to the east, Villiers Streets to the north, and Commissioners Street to the south.

The subject property contains two detached buildings: the first building was constructed in 1920 and the second was constructed in 1941. The first building on the property at 309 Cherry Street is a two-storey institutional building constructed in 1920 as a banking hall and offices for the Bank of Montreal; it was designed by the esteemed architectural firm Darling & Pearson in the Classical Revival style. Toronto Harbour Commissioners leased the property to the Bank of Montreal for a period of 21 years; however, few new industries had moved to the area by 1925 and by 1926 the Bank of Montreal ceased operations at this location.

Separated by a laneway to the south, the second building on the subject property is a two-to-four-storey industrial building constructed in 1941 as an oil storage warehouse for Canadian Oil Companies Ltd (formerly misidentified as the William McGill and Company building). It was designed by the architect N. A. Armstrong and represents a vernacular industrial building with noticeable features of the Art Moderne style. By 1942, the Canadian Oil Companies leased the former Bank of Montreal building for their offices and continued to use both buildings until the mid-1960s when the company was purchased by Shell Canada, a subsidiary of the British oil and gas company Shell.

The former Bank of Montreal building was added to the City's Inventory of Heritage Properties (now, Heritage Register) on August 18, 1976. The former Canadian Oil

Companies warehouse was added to the City's Heritage Register on February 11, 2003; however, it was misidentified as the William McGill and Company building.

Staff researched the subject property, and the two buildings were evaluated individually and collectively against the criteria prescribed in Ontario Regulation 9/06. A property may be designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, if it meets two or more of the nine criteria.

Staff have determined that the property at 309 Cherry Street meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the criteria prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act under design/physical, historical/associative, and contextual values, the attributes of which are reflected in the Statement of Significance (Attachment 3).

On March 16, 2023, the City received a consolidated revised Zoning By-law Amendment application for two previously submitted and appealed Zoning By-law Amendment applications (16 271912 STE 30 OZ and 12 131809 STE 30 OZ). The consolidated Zoning By-law application resubmission is related to the proposed redevelopment of the subject property for two building blocks comprised of two towers (39-storeys and 47-storeys) on individual U-shaped, multi-storey (8-11-storey) podiums with residential and commercial uses. The new development will be bound by Cherry Street, Villiers Street, Commissioners Street, and the proposed future Foundry Street (west of and parallel to Munition Street). The application proposes the retention of the three elevations and structural elements of the former Bank of Montreal and adaptive re-use of the former Canadian Oil Companies warehouse in situ for commercial use; however, the precise degree of retention of this structure has yet to be determined and is the subject of further discussions with the applicant. Additionally, on November 15, 2021, the City received a Draft Plan of Subdivision application (21 234718 STE 14 SB) related to the same proposed redevelopment as described above.

City Clerks issued a complete application notice for the Draft Plan of Subdivision application on March 4, 2022. On March 24, 2022, a waiver was provided extending the 90 days time period in which City Council must make a decision regarding Part IV designation in respect to the above noted applications under the Ontario Heritage Act until March 2023 which was further extended to March 31, 2024. In order to meet prescribed timelines under the Ontario Heritage Act, Council must make a decision at its March 20, 2024 meeting to provide sufficient time for the City Clerk to issue a notice of intention to designate before the waiver expires.

The Prescribed Event occurred on this property before January 1, 2023, therefore, Section 29(1.2)1 of the Ontario Heritage Act does not apply to require the property be included in the City's Heritage register prior to Council stating the notice of intention to designate on this property.

Designation enables City Council to review proposed alterations or demolitions to the property and enforce heritage property standards and maintenance.

# RECOMMENDATIONS

The Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning recommends that:

1. City Council state its intention to designate the property at 309 Cherry Street under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act in accordance with the Statement of Significance; 309 Cherry Street (Reasons for Designation) attached as Attachment 3, to the report, December 27, 2023, from the Chief Planner and Executive Director, City Planning.

2. If there are no objections to the designation, City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce the Bill in Council designating the property under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

#### FINANCIAL IMPACT

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of this report.

The Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer has reviewed this report and agrees with the information as presented in the Financial Impact Section.

#### **DECISION HISTORY**

The former Bank of Montreal building at 309 Cherry Street was added to the City's Inventory of Heritage Properties (now known as the Heritage Register) on August 18, 1976.

At its meeting of February 4, 5, and 6, 2003, City Council considered a report from the Commissioner of Economic Development, Culture and Tourism, "Inclusion on the City of Toronto Inventory of Heritage Properties - Central Waterfront (Port Lands Industrial Area)" and listed the warehouse structure at 309 Cherry Street on the City's Inventory of Heritage Properties. NOTE: the former Canadian Oil Companies warehouse was misidentified as the William McGill and Company building in the report. https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/2003/agendas/council/cc030204/to1rpt/cl015.pdf

Starting in 2015, City council adopted reports related to a Zoning Amendment application for the property located at 309 Cherry Street concerning the appeal process for the zoning amendment in relation to the on-going discussions for the Port Lands Planning Framework and Villiers Island Precinct Plan:

<u>TE4.12 - Request for Direction Report - 309 Cherry Street - Zoning Amendment</u> <u>Application</u> (March 31, 2015)

<u>TE23.65 - 309 Cherry Street - Zoning Amendment Application - Preliminary Report</u> (April 4, 2017) TE32.21 - 309 Cherry Street - Phase 1 and Phase 2 - Zoning Amendment Application -Request for Direction Report (May 22, 2018)

At its meeting on December 5, 2017, City Council adopted the report with amendments of September 27, 2017 from the Deputy City Manager, Cluster B titled "Port Lands Planning Initiatives - Final Report" and in so doing adopted the Port Lands Planning Framework (September 2017) and Villiers Island Precinct Plan (September 2017), prepared by Urban Strategies Inc. on behalf of Waterfront Toronto to guide rezoning within the Precinct.

https://secure.toronto.ca/council/agenda-item.do?item=2017.PG24.6

The Port Lands Official Plan Modification (OPM), as modified, was brought into full force and effect by OLT Decision on May 18, 2021, including land use, transportation, built form and public realm policies. The OLT Decision can be found at: <u>https://www.omb.gov.on.ca/e-decisions/pl030514-May-18-2021.pdf</u>

On March 9, 2022 City Council adopted the report "Port Lands Official Plan Modification Ontario Land tribunal Appeals (Phase 2) - Further Request for Direction" that endorsed the Proposed Modifications as set out in Confidential Appendix B to the report from the City Solicitor concerning the subject property at 309 Cherry Street. https://secure.toronto.ca/council/agenda-item.do?item=2022.CC41.8

A further Port Lands OPM Phase 2 Decision was issued on July 11, 2022 that resolved the majority of outstanding matters, specifically cultural heritage, views, inclusive communities, community infrastructure, built form, arts and culture, sustainability and biodiversity. The OLT Decision can be found at: https://www.omb.gov.on.ca/e-decisions/OLT-22-002109-JUL-11-2022.pdf

# POLICY AND REGULATION CONSIDERATIONS

# **Provincial Plans and Policies**

The conservation of cultural heritage resources is an integral component of good planning, contributing to a sense of place, economic prosperity, and healthy and equitable communities. Heritage conservation in Ontario is identified as a provincial interest under the Planning Act. <u>https://www.ontario.ca/laws/statute/90p13</u>

Further, the policies and definitions of the Provincial Policy Statement (2020) and A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (2020) identify the Ontario Heritage Act as the primary legislation through which heritage evaluation and heritage conservation will be implemented.

https://www.ontario.ca/page/provincial-policy-statement-2020 https://files.ontario.ca/mmah-place-to-grow-office-consolidation-en-2020-08-28.pdf

Ontario Regulation 9/06 sets out the criteria for evaluating properties to be designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. The criteria are based on an evaluation of design/physical value, historical and associative value and contextual value. A property may be designated under Section 29 of the Act if it meets two or more of the provincial criteria for determining whether it is of cultural heritage value or interest.

https://www.ontario.ca/laws/regulation/060009

# **Official Plan**

The City of Toronto's Official Plan implements the provincial policy regime and provides policies to guide decision making within the City. It contains a number of policies related to properties on the City's Heritage Register and properties adjacent to them, as well as the protection of areas of archaeological potential. The Official Plan should be read as a whole to understand its comprehensive and integrative intent as a policy framework for priority setting and decision making. The Official Plan can be found here: <a href="https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/planning-development/official-plan-guidelines/official-plan/">https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/planning-development/official-plan-guidelines/official-plan/</a>

# Central Waterfront Secondary Plan and Port Lands Area Specific Policy

The four key principles of the Central Waterfront Secondary Plan (CWSP) provide a framework for waterfront renewal over the long term and include: removing barriers and making connections; building a network of spectacular waterfront parks and public spaces; promoting a clean and green environment; and creating dynamic and diverse new communities.

City Council adopted the CWSP in 2003 and it was approved by the Ontario Land Tribunal for the Port Lands area on April 16, 2021, and July 11, 2022, with the exception of several site-specific policies that are still under appeal.

The Central Waterfront Secondary Plan and Port Lands Area Specific Policy (PLASP) include policies that provide guidance on addressing heritage resources during the revitalization of the Central Waterfront and Port Lands, as well as identifying heritage buildings, structures and landscapes. Section 6 of the PLASP provides policy guidance on cultural heritage resources and Maps '3D - Cultural Heritage Resources' and '3E - Cultural Heritage Buildings/Structures' identify key heritage buildings, structure and landscapes, including the heritage buildings located on 309 Cherry Street.

# COMMENTS

# **Prescribed Event Status**

As of July 1, 2021, Section 29(1.2) of the Ontario Heritage Act restricts City Council's ability to give notice of its intention to designate a property under the Act to within 90 days of a "Prescribed Event".

A Prescribed Event is a point of time when the application for an Official Plan Amendment, Zoning By-law Amendment and/or Draft Plan of Subdivision Application has been deemed complete and the City Clerk provides notice of that complete application to the public in accordance with the Planning Act. The Prescribed Event is not the date a development application is deemed complete or when an application is made to the City. A Prescribed Event, including any prescribed exceptions, are defined under O. Reg 385/21.

If a new or subsequent Official Plan Amendment, Zoning By-law Amendment and/or Draft Plan of Subdivision Application is submitted on the same property, the Prescribed Event date is reset to the new date the City Clerk issues notice to the public of the new or subsequent complete application.

On March 16, 2023, the City received a consolidated revised Zoning By-law Amendment application for two previously submitted and appealed Zoning By-law Amendment applications from 2012 and 2016 (12 131809 STE 30 OZ and 16 271912 STE 30 OZ respectively) related to the proposed redevelopment of the subject property for two building blocks comprised of two towers (39-storeys and 47-storeys) on individual U-shaped, multi-storey (8-11-storey) podiums with residential and commercial uses. In November 2021, the City received a Draft Plan of Subdivision application related to the same proposed redevelopment as described above (21 234718 STE 14 SB).

A Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) is required for all development applications that affect listed and designated properties and will be considered when determining how a heritage property is to be conserved. An HIA report completed by ERA Architects Inc. was submitted March 16, 2023 to support the application; it updated the content of three previous HIA reports for the property at 309 Cherry Street, further to a settlement proposal, and pursuant to Ontario Land Tribunal (OLT) appeals concerning the Port Lands Official Plan Modification (the Port Lands OPM) of the Central Waterfront Secondary Plan (CWSP).





The two buildings at 309 Cherry Street: the former Bank of Montreal at left and the former Canadian Oil Companies warehouse at right (Heritage Planning, 2023).

# **1. DESCRIPTION**

309 Cherry Street	
ADDRESS	309 Cherry Street
WARD	Ward 14 (Toronto-Danforth)
NEIGHBOURHOOD/COMMUNITY	South Riverdale
HISTORICAL NAME	See Section 2
CONSTRUCTION DATE	- 1920 and 1941
ORIGINAL OWNER	See Section 2
ORIGINAL USE	- Bank of Montreal: Institutional
	- Canadian Oil Companies warehouse:
	Industrial
CURRENT USE	N/A
ARCHITECT/BUILDER/DESIGNER	- Bank of Montreal: Darling & Pearson
	- Canadian Oil Companies warehouse:
	N. A. Armstrong
DESIGN/CONSTRUCTION/MATERIALS	See Section 2
ARCHITECTURAL STYLE	See Section 2
ADDITIONS/ALTERATIONS	See Section 2
CRITERIA	Design/Physical, Historical/Associative,
	Contextual
HERITAGE STATUS	- Bank of Montreal: Listed (1976)
	- Canadian Oil Companies warehouse:
	Listed (2003)
RECORDER	Heritage Planning: Emma Doedens
REPORT DATE	November 2023

# 2. BACKGROUND

This research and evaluation section of the report describes the history, architecture and context of the property at 309 Cherry Street, and applies evaluation criteria as set out in Ontario Regulation 9/06 to determine whether it merits designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Act. A property may be designated under Section 29 of the Act if it meets two or more of the provincial criteria for determining whether it is of cultural heritage value or interest. The application of the criteria is found in Section 3 (Evaluation Checklist). The conclusions of the research and evaluation are found in the Conclusion of the report. Maps and Photographs are located in Attachment 1. The archival and contemporary sources for the research are found in Attachment 2. The Statements of Significance are contained in Attachment 3.

Key Date	Historical Event
	The area now known as the City of Toronto is the traditional territory of many nations including the Mississaugas of the Credit, the Anishnabeg, the Chippewa, the Haudenosaunee and the Wendat peoples, and is now home to many diverse First Nations, Inuit and Métis peoples. Toronto is covered by Treaty 13 signed with the Mississaugas of the Credit (1805), and the Williams Treaties (1923) signed with multiple Mississaugas and Chippewa bands.
1793	At the time of the founding of the Town of York (present day Toronto), the marsh between the Toronto Harbour and Ashbridges Bay is the largest wetland on Lake Ontario.
1834	The City of Toronto is incorporated.
1858	The Toronto Islands are separated from the waterfront during a storm and the East Gap is created. The gap allows ships to navigate into the harbour more easily.
1890s	The lower Don River is straightened and contained by a concrete course to prevent flooding. Engineer E.H. Keating proposes terminating the river in a 300 foot east-west channel that runs north of and parallel to the Port Lands, later known as Keating Channel.
1911	The Toronto Harbour Commissioners (THC) are appointed to oversee the management of the City-owned lands along the waterfront.
1912	The Toronto Harbour Commission's 1912 Waterfront Development Eastern Section Plan sees the revitalisation of the Port Industrial District (today's Port Lands) to encourage future industrial and commercial development. A new street grid and rail lines are built, along with a Ship Channel and Turning Basin supported by upgraded shipping facilities.
1920	Bank of Montreal built at the corner of Cherry and Villiers streets (present day 309 Cherry Street) following a 21-year lease agreement between the THC and the Bank of Montreal.

# i. HISTORICAL TIMELINE

1914-1920s	The first modern phase of development in the area includes the Queen's City Foundry (1914), the Toronto Harbour Commissioners Buildings (1916), the Bank of Montreal (1920), the Dominion Bank (1920), the Toronto Dry Dock Company (1920), and the Fire Hall No. 30 (1928).
1926	The Bank of Montreal ceases operations at 309 Cherry Street
1941	The Canadian Oil Company's oil storage warehouse is built at 311 Cherry Street (present day 309 Cherry Street), following a 19-year lease agreement between the company and the THC (Canadian Oil Companies later purchases the subject property from THC in 1945).
1942-1980s	The Canadian Oil Company (later Shell Oil) operates offices out of the former Bank of Montreal building and continues using the warehouse for fuel storage. <sup>1</sup>
1976	The former Bank of Montreal Building is Listed on the Heritage Register.
2003	The former Canadian Oil Companies Ltd. warehouse is Listed on the Heritage Register.

# ii. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The following section outlines the history and facts related to the properties which are the basis for determining historical or associative value of Criteria 4, 5 or 6 according to O. Reg. 9/06 Criteria.

#### Ashbridges Bay and the Port Lands

At the time of the founding of the Town of York in 1793 (present day Toronto), the land comprising and surrounding the subject site was a marsh between the Toronto Harbour and Ashbridges Bay – it was the largest wetland on Lake Ontario (Figure 2).<sup>2</sup> Sediments outpouring from the mouth of the Don River had collected in the area by means of a sandbank to the south and this resulted in their formation.<sup>3</sup> At its southwest corner, the sandbank curved into a long peninsula that bounded the Toronto Harbour on its eastern and southern sides and thereby connected the Toronto Islands to the shore.<sup>4</sup>

The natural defence created by this landmass was the strategic rationale behind the positioning of (Old) Fort York at the west entrance of the harbour because the sandbar and peninsula protected the Fort from naval assault. To the east, the Town of York similarly developed as a waterfront town whose early 19th century prosperity within Ontario was interconnected with its proximity to the lake. York's port became the epicentre of its commerce because the transportation of goods was primarily conveyed

<sup>1</sup> The subject property is currently owned by 1337194 Ontario Inc. and 2034055 Ontario Ltd.

<sup>2</sup> Early colonial settlers named the area Ashbridges Bay, but the marshes had already been in use by Indigenous Peoples prior to colonial contact (likely as fishing grounds).

<sup>3 &</sup>quot;Heritage Impact Assessment: 309 Cherry Street, Toronto," ERA Architects Inc. (March 14, 2023). 4 Meaning that at this time the Toronto Islands were not, obviously, islands. In 1858 a series of storms washed away a portion of the sandbar and severed the Toronto Islands from the marshes to create the East Gap, which became a new entry point into the Toronto Harbour (Figure 3).

by water.<sup>5</sup> Initial harbourfront development to support this function saw the build out of municipal and commercial wharves, some of which were owned by the burgeoning railway companies that sought to integrate rail and lake shipping.<sup>6</sup>

However, the mid-19th century rise of the railways altered the relationship between the City of Toronto and the lakeshore. Railway transportation had significant advantages over the waterways because the former allowed for access to inland settlements and the year-round transportation of goods.<sup>7</sup> While waterborne transport methods never became obsolete, they were greatly outmatched by the efficiency and convenience of the railways and as such they were displaced as the primary means of travel and trade.<sup>8</sup> As if adding insult to injury, the placement of the railway tracks ran parallel to the shoreline and acted as a barrier between the City and the waterfront that discouraged use of the area, particularly the marshes and beaches of Ashbridges Bay.<sup>9</sup> By the late-19th century, the growth of Toronto exacerbated the area's conditions: the detritus of the mainland population overwhelmed the marshland, whose waters were polluted with the City's cast-off waste.<sup>10</sup>

In response, the City Council made reformations to the existing port authorities and the Toronto Harbour Commissioners (THC) was established in 1911.<sup>11</sup> The mandate of the THC was the management and improvement of the municipally owned lands along the waterfront.<sup>12</sup> The 1912 Toronto Harbour Commissioners' Plan presented strategies for the entirety of said lands, from the Humber River to Kew Beach, but the most ambitious part of the Plan addressed the Ashbridges Bay area that was to become the Toronto Harbour Industrial District (present day Port Lands).<sup>13</sup> The vision for the Industrial District progressed from earlier plans, such as the 1910 Toronto Board of Trade's proposal (Figure 4), and included a ship channel, port facilities, a new outlet for the Don River, public park spaces, and a marked attention on industrial land use.<sup>14</sup> To achieve this, the marshlands of Ashbridges Bay would be infilled through dredging (Figure 6).<sup>15</sup> However, several months after work started on the 1912 Plan,<sup>16</sup> Great Britain declared

16 Which references the date of the Plan's publication, not the implementation of it.

<sup>5</sup> Jeffery Stinson, *Heritage of the Port Industrial District: A report for the Toronto Harbour Commissioners*, Vol 1 (1990), 164.

<sup>6 &</sup>quot;Heritage Impact Assessment: 309 Cherry Street."

<sup>7</sup> Stinson, 7.

<sup>8</sup> Stinson, 7.

<sup>9</sup> In the mid-19th century, summer cottage communities were built along the sandbar to the south of Ashbridges Bay, similar in concept to those on Ward's Island and Hanlan's Point, although smaller. These cottagers continued to use the land (known as Fisherman's Island) and built boathouses and launches, and even refreshment stands; however, the overall character of the area became one of isolation and general disuse.

<sup>10 &</sup>quot;Heritage Impact Assessment: 309 Cherry Street."

<sup>11</sup> Forerunner to today's Toronto Port Authority, or PortsToronto.

<sup>12</sup> After appointment of the THC, all of the City's waterfront holdings were deeded to this public entity.

<sup>13</sup> Stinson, 22.

<sup>14</sup> Stinson, 22.

<sup>15</sup> The dredging and infill process of Ashbridge's Bay had already begun in the 1890s with the construction of the 300 foot, east-west Keating Channel that runs to the north of, and parallel to the Port Lands. The channel was named after the engineer E.H. Keating, whose proposal it was to terminate the Don River into a channel in order to address flooding and disperse water pollution.

war on Germany and initiated Canada's involvement in the First World War.<sup>17</sup> The priorities of the Plan shifted to focus on completing the infill to provide land for industries that would support the war effort (such as British Forgings Ltd., which turned scrap metal into shells).<sup>18</sup>

Near the end of the war, the bridge over Keating Channel was under construction; its completion connected the southern end of Cherry Street with the Port Lands and positioned Cherry Street as the main entrance into the district (although it was never formally recognised as such by the 1912 Plan).<sup>19</sup> Access to the area continued to improve with the extension of railway spurs, a street railway to bring in workers, and street paving (Figures 8-10).<sup>20</sup> Ongoing dredging operations in the Port Lands resulted in the reclamation of 512 acres over nine years; the infill work for the area continued well into the 1920s, while the land already created was leased or sold.<sup>21</sup>

#### Building 1: Bank of Montreal

In March of 1920, the Toronto Harbour Commissioners leased part of 'Block A', Plan 520E to the Bank of Montreal for a period of 21 years (backdated to commence on January 1st, 1920).<sup>22</sup> The land parcel included 55' on the east side of Cherry Street and 100' on the south side of Villiers Street, which corresponds with the site of the subject property. At first glance, the presence of a bank building at the entrance to an industrial district might seem incongruous with its surroundings;<sup>23</sup> however, it is precisely the building's typology and placement that contribute to an understanding of the post-war industrial development of the Port Lands.

In the aftermath of the First World War there was an economic upturn that saw the resumption of a competitiveness between chartered banks to expand and establish new branches.<sup>24</sup> In Ontario, the number of Bank of Montreal branches rose from 60 in 1907 to 241 by 1927.<sup>25</sup> Similarly, there was post-war expansion occurring in the Port Lands that centered around the operations of fuel companies, particularly coal and oil.<sup>26</sup> Coal (or coke) was integral to the heating of Toronto homes and businesses in the early 20th century and was colloquially referred to as "black diamonds" in reference to its worth.<sup>27</sup>

26 Stinson, 37.

<sup>17</sup> Stinson, 23.

<sup>18</sup> Stinson, 12.

<sup>19</sup> Stinson, 37.

<sup>20</sup> Stinson, 37.

<sup>21</sup> *Toronto Harbour: The Passing Years*, Toronto Harbour Commissioners (Toronto: Golla Graphics Inc., 1985), 20.

<sup>22</sup> At the same time, the THC leased the property at the corner of Cherry and Commissioner streets to the Dominion Bank for the same period of 21 years commencing on January 1st, 1920.

<sup>23</sup> Looking at the historical photos, there is a feeling to the structure that is almost Ozymandian in nature, as if there is a certain, "look on my works" statement imbued in its regal appearance that defies the largely vacant landscape that surrounds it.

<sup>24</sup> Merrill Denison, Canada's First Bank: A History of the Bank of Montreal Vol 2. (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart Ltd, 1967), 341.

<sup>25</sup> Although Denison notes that in many cases for the Bank of Montreal, these new branches were acquisitions of pre-existing banks rather than new builds.

<sup>27</sup> Toronto Harbour: The Passing Years, 54.

The product played a key role in the development of the Port of Toronto because the Port provided storage and handling facilities for more than a million tons of coal per year.<sup>28</sup> Historic photos of the Port Lands show large, dark dunes of coal whose heights rival those of the early buildings in the area (Figure 19).<sup>29</sup> It is likely that the association of the Port Lands with this product portrayed the area as a sensible location within which to build a new bank branch in order to capitalise on the business from these emerging industries and to provide financial services to the area.<sup>30</sup>

For the construction of the new Port Lands branch, the Bank of Montreal engaged the services of the architecture firm Darling & Pearson. Built in 1920, the Bank of Montreal was one of the earliest occupants of the Port Lands (Figures 10-11). Its location at the intersection of Cherry and Villiers streets places it at the foreground of the Port Land's post-WWI development both literally, because Cherry Street was the unofficial main entrance and street of the area, and figuratively because its construction represented a belief in the area's future industrial success.<sup>31</sup>

However, few new industries had moved to the area by 1925. Although the Port Lands had examples of manufacturing companies and port-related businesses operating in the district, the vast majority of land use remained devoted to coal and oil storage that required large, open lots that left less space for new industrial buildings (Figure 20).<sup>32</sup> The Great Depression of the 1930s resulted in economic stagnation and the commercial, recreational, and public park spaces envisioned by the 1912 THC Plan were still unrealized as the trend towards fuel storage continued through to the end of the Second World War. Both the Bank of Montreal and the Dominion Bank further south on Cherry Street had ceased banking operations by 1926. In his historic overview of the area, Stinson speculates that, "the sight of the vast, watery construction site probably dampened the enthusiasm of potential customers in the late 1920s when the vitality of the district could have been established."<sup>33</sup> In consequence, the former Bank of Montreal building stands as an historic remnant of the post-WWI ideals and ambitions for the Port Lands Industrial District.

# **Building 2: Canadian Oil Companies Warehouse**

In 1941, a 19-year lease option was negotiated between the Toronto Harbour Commissioners and the Canadian Oil Companies Ltd. for the same parcel of land that the Bank of Montreal had leased 22 years earlier. The Canadian Oil Companies Ltd. also entered into a lease for a large portion of 'Block A + KJ' in Plan 520E, whose approximate boundaries spanned north of Commissioners Street, west of Munition Street, and south of Villiers Street.<sup>34</sup> This would become the site of their new oil storage warehouse at 311 Cherry Street (present day 309 Cherry Street), designed by the

<sup>28</sup> Stinson, 37.

<sup>29</sup> Toronto Harbour, 54.

<sup>30</sup> Stinson, 115.

<sup>31</sup> Stinson, 115.

<sup>32</sup> Stinson, 37.

<sup>33</sup> Stinson, 5.

<sup>34</sup> By 1945, both of these land parcels were granted to Canadian Oil Companies Ltd. and the properties were consolidated. As the name suggests, Canadian Oil Companies was a gas and oil company that operated from 1908 until 1963 when they were purchased by Shell Canada.

architect N. A. Armstrong and completed in 1941. The former Bank of Montreal building was converted into the oil company's offices.

The 1941 permit and plans for the warehouse illustrate its proposed placement on the subject site to the south of the Bank of Montreal. The new warehouse footprint is superimposed over two small, square buildings annotated as, "frame [buildings] to be removed" (Figure 30). To the south of the warehouse, these square buildings reappear as, "new location of coal co. offices". City Directories from the period suggest that these were the dock offices of William McGill & Company, a coal and coke business. The listing of this company within the Directories has led to the incorrect assumption that the subject property warehouse was built for William McGill and Company around 1935. However, the warehouse building does not appear in the 1939 aerial photo of the subject site (Figure 24), nor does the name William McGill appear in any of the building permits or land registry records related to the subject property. The name of Canadian Oil Companies Ltd, however, appears frequently in both.

Apart from helping to confirm ownership, the 1941 site plan provides an illustration of the historic trends in the Port Lands at the end of the Second World War: the new oil storage warehouse physically pushes the old coal offices out of the way, an interaction that signifies how the advancements in the automotive industry and fuel use meant that oil began to displace coal.<sup>35</sup> Across the Port Lands, the coal piles that once dominated the landscape were steadily replaced with tank farms throughout the 1930s and 40s (Figures 24-26).<sup>36</sup>

# Architects: Darling & Pearson

# Building 1: Bank of Montreal

Officially formed in 1892, Darling & Pearson is considered one of the pre-eminent architectural partnerships of early 20th century Toronto. Frank Darling (1850-1923) and John Andrew Pearson (1867-1940) worked together in a variety of firm configurations from 1889 until Darling's death in 1923.<sup>37</sup> The prolific list of works produced during this period contributed many fine buildings to Toronto's cityscape, and their quality designs distinguish and indeed define several of the City's well-known landmarks.

Darling & Pearson were involved in a number of prominent institutional projects, including the Toronto General Hospital (1909-1919, now the MaRS Centre), the first Royal Ontario Museum (1914) and the Museum of Toronto (1918, now the Art Gallery of Ontario). Some of their finest landmarks are within the University of Toronto precinct, including the Convocation Hall (1906), Flavelle House (1902, now the Faculty of Law), Sanford Fleming Building (1907), Trinity College (1914), the Electrical Building (1920, now the Rosebrugh Building), Thermodynamics Building (1909, now the Mechanical Engineering Building), Simcoe Hall (1922-23), the Anatomy Building (1925, now the McMurrich Building), Forestry Building (1925, now the Physical Geography Building), and the Pathology Building (1928). With the commission to supervise the reconstruction

<sup>35</sup> Stinson, 37.

<sup>36</sup> Stinson, 37.

<sup>37</sup> Darling, Curry, Sproatt & Pearson, (1892-3), Darling, Sproatt & Pearson, (1893-6), and Darling & Pearson (1897-1923).

of the Ottawa Parliament Building Centre Block and Peace Tower (1919-1926),<sup>38</sup> the firm received national recognition and it became the project with which Pearson was best associated.<sup>39</sup>

Individually, Frank Darling was the first Canadian (and only the second North American) to receive a Gold Medal from the Royal Institute of British Architects in 1916. Darling's body of work is lauded for both the versatility of typologies represented, where there are examples of residential, institutional, and commercial buildings, and the variety of designs that are executed with a high degree of proficiency.<sup>40</sup> Darling frequently undertook commissions for the Bank of Montreal and the Bank of Commerce; for instance, the first important project he executed was the design for the Bank of Montreal at Yonge and Front Street (1885-86, now the Hockey Hall of Fame).<sup>41</sup> In the span of his career, Darling designed over 100 bank buildings across Canada, from small local branches to monumental city offices.<sup>42</sup> His contributions sought to define the bank typology in Canada and cultivate a national corporate style.<sup>43</sup> The former Bank of Montreal at 309 Cherry Street represents another contribution to this architectural lexicon.

Both Darling and Pearson are listed on the Ontario Association of Architects' Honour Roll, which recognizes architects who have made a significant contribution to the province's architectural heritage, either through their body of work or their influence in the wider community of design, education, and/or publication.

#### Architect: N.A. Armstrong

#### **Building 2: Canadian Oil Companies Warehouse**

Norman Alexander Armstrong, commonly written as N.A. Armstrong, was born in 1882 in Queenston, Ontario. Armstrong's training in architecture began under the tutelage of the Toronto architect J.W. Siddal in 1902 and developed through a series of different influences on both sides of the North American border. In 1904, Armstrong relocated to San Francisco for a few years to work alongside the engineering staff on the Southern Pacific Railway. After a brief stint in the offices of the architect Albert Pissis, who specialized in the classical styles,<sup>44</sup> Armstrong went to Pittsburgh and worked as a draftsman for Bernard H. Pack. Armstrong remained there for 10 years. When he finally returned to Canada in 1919, Armstrong opened his own offices in Toronto, called N. A. Armstrong Company, Ltd., where he took on architectural and engineering projects – such as suited his experience.<sup>45</sup>

Armstrong's list of recorded projects include residential, commercial, and industrial buildings; they reveal a willingness to design according to the popular tastes of the time,

44 Robert Hill, entry for N. A. Armstrong.

<sup>38</sup> In partnership with the architect Jean O. Marchand.

<sup>39 &</sup>quot;Pearson, John Andrew (1867-1940)," Ontario Association of Architects, accessed 16 October 2023.

<sup>40 &</sup>quot;Darling, Frank (1850-1923," Ontario Association of Architects, accessed 16 October 2023.

<sup>41 &</sup>quot;Darling, Frank (1850-1923)."

<sup>42 &</sup>quot;Darling, Frank."

<sup>43 &</sup>quot;Darling, Frank."

<sup>45</sup> Hill, entry for N. A. Armstrong.

with touches of eclecticism applied to various examples of Colonial Revival styles.<sup>46</sup> Contrary to the popular movements in Toronto architecture, Armstrong is noted by Robert Hill as being, "one of the few Toronto architects daring enough to introduce a vocabulary of sweeping curves and rounded forms to his works" as a response to the Modern styles that were developing in Europe and the United States after the First and Second World Wars.<sup>47</sup> One example of Armstrong's foray into Modernism was the International Harvester Co. Showroom at 51 Bathurst Street (1939-1940).<sup>48</sup> It represents a less common architectural style in Toronto, Art Moderne, as identified by its horizontal emphasis and rounded corners (Figure 27). The former Canadian Oil Company warehouse at 309 Cherry Street stands as another example of Armstrong's Art Moderne designs, in this case applied to an industrial building. Since Armstrong passed away in 1957,<sup>49</sup> it also represents one of his later projects completed in Toronto.

# iii. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

The following section provides an architectural description and analysis related to the property which will establish the basis for determining design or physical value of Criteria 1, 2 or 3 according to O. Reg. 9/06 Criteria.

# **Building 1: Bank of Montreal**

The property at 309 Cherry Street contains two buildings: the first is a two-storey, detached bank building on a squared plan with basement, flat roof, and sandstone parapet (Figure 13). The chamfered main entrance at its northwest corner addresses the Cherry and Villiers intersection in a manner typical of bank buildings from this era.<sup>50</sup> The building was constructed of buff Indiana Limestone, sandstone, and buff brick in 1920 to the Classical Revival designs of the architecture firm Darling & Pearson; it has additional iron, copper, and wood detailing.

All four of the building's elevations are visible from the public realm. The principal elevations (north and west) flanking Villiers and Cherry streets are symmetrical in design and flank the corner entrance (Figure 12). Both are faced in limestone ashlar masonry set in courses of alternating widths. They are organized into two bays, where each bay has a pair of centered and vertically arranged windows: a flat-headed window opening with shouldered architrave surround and stone sill, and, at the raised basement level, a plain, flat-headed window opening with metal grill.

The chamfered corner entrance is emphasized by a sandstone staircase up to the Greek Order portico of the raised front porch that features traditional Doric elements of classical design and is quintessentially representative of the Classical Revival style

<sup>46</sup> Hill, entry for N. A. Armstrong.

<sup>47</sup> Hill, entry for N. A. Armstrong.

<sup>48 51</sup> Bathurst Street was designated Part IV in 2006, but it was demolished during the site's redevelopment. Its main façade and part of the rounded corers were reconstructed and incorporated into the new building on site, but with changes to the original materiality.

<sup>49</sup> Hill, entry for N. A. Armstrong.

<sup>50</sup> Attachment 2 of the 'Danforth Avenue (Segment 2) Cultural Heritage Resource Assessment' (<u>https://secure.toronto.ca/council/agenda-item.do?item=2022.PB35.8</u>) goes into detail on the bank building type and its established, common features.

(Figure 14). A triangular pediment sits atop the entablature, which is supported by two outer, engaged square piers and two inner Doric columns with the standard capitals and fluted shafts (Figures 15-16). The pediment has copper flashing along its upper edges and a lone anthemion-style acroterion at its apex (two more anthemia were placed at each lower point of the pediment, but these have since been lost). The tympanum is left plain. Underneath the cornice there are mutules with guttae, and the cornice line breaks beyond the portico and runs across the length of both the north and west elevations; the copper flashing continues atop this extended cornice as well. Alternating triglyphs and metopes pattern the frieze, while guttae beneath the triglyphs break into the otherwise plain architrave.<sup>51</sup> Like the cornice, the bottom line of the frieze extends outside the entablature to create a stringcourse along the north and west elevations. The main door opening has a stone architrave surround and cornice. Tying together the main entrance and the entablature, the frieze design in the entablature is repeated on a larger scale in wood carving over the door: two triglyphs and a metope with a clock inset. A pair of rectangular, vertical sidelights with iron grilles in a geometric pattern flank the door; smaller versions are inset to the door panels (Figure 16). The metal door handles, likely brass, are a simple and elegant curving design.

The three bays of the east elevation are comprised of buff brick set in an English Garden Wall bond. It originally had three segmental arch windows with stone sills and irregularly placed basement windows (Figure 17). Building permit elevations from 1980 illustrate how one of these windows has undergone several layers of alterations, from initial infill, a large rectangular opening, to its present small metal door and stairwell with landing; the basement windows have also been repositioned several times.<sup>52</sup> A simple, rectangular chimney stack devoid of ornamentation projects from the southeast corner. The south elevation has the same brick and bond as the east, but the façade is plain and without windows or decoration (Figure 18). Overall, the building retains a high degree of integrity in both its form and exterior decorative details, such that the original 1920 Darling & Pearson design is quite legible.

The Second Classical Revival (also referred to as Neo-Classical Revival, or Beaux-Arts Classicism) in Toronto was popular at the turn of the century, from around 1890 to 1930. The return to classical forms was influenced by the respected Ecole des Beaux-Arts in France, which taught and championed the classical principles to a generation of architects, and the seminal event of the 1892 World's Columbian Exposition in Chicago that became an international advertising platform for classically styled buildings, which featured heavily at the site.<sup>53</sup> Post offices, libraries, and banks were typologies to which this style was frequently applied. Their façades typically emphasized a main, central entrance, while those who followed the Greek influence had plain surfaces with less adornment (in contrast to the Roman influence that favoured more layers of ornamentation).<sup>54</sup>

<sup>51</sup> However, the architrave does bear evidence of removed signage from previous occupants. 52 Shell Canada Ltd. is listed as the property owner; they submitted a permit for alterations to build a basement entrance and a platform at the east elevation entrance. It was likely at this time (or even earlier) that the original window glazing, mullions, and transoms were replaced.

<sup>53</sup> Blumenson, 123.

<sup>54</sup> Blumenson, 123.

The design elements of classical architecture projected certain stereotypes within the minds of the public that banking institutions in particular wanted to associate with their business, such as endurance, integrity, and even wealth.<sup>55</sup> Banks designed in the Classical Revival styles appeared like 'Temples of Finance' with their Greek or Roman orders, or even emulated strongboxes through the stone material of their exteriors and compact, balanced layouts.<sup>56</sup> These features encouraged trust from potential clients and subtly communicated that this was a secure and reliable place to invest one's finances.<sup>57</sup>

# **Building 2: Canadian Oil Companies Warehouse**

The second building on the subject property of 309 Cherry Street is the two-to-fourstorey, detached industrial building on a rectangular plan with basement and a flat roof (Figure 28). The building was constructed in brown brick (with stone, cement, and metal accents) in 1941 as an oil storage warehouse and offices for Canadian Oil Companies Ltd. and is an example of a vernacular industrial building that displays elements identified with the Art Moderne style.

Art Moderne architecture (also known as Streamlined Modern, Style Modern, or Depression Modern) was most prevalent in Toronto around the 1930s and 40s; it is defined by its lower heights, horizontality, and rounded corners - all of which are evidenced on the two-storey wing of the warehouse that has eight bays on its east and west elevations and five bays on its north elevation (Figure 31). The rounded corners of the north elevation are accentuated by the wraparound horizontal fenestration with bands of brick panels under their concrete sills; the buff stone coping at the roofline; and a second buff stone course that runs in an uninterrupted line above the flat-headed window openings, parallel to the coping (Figure 34). The stone course is supported by piers capped with three red brickwork bands; the piers delineate each bay on all three elevations, but they do not break the stone course above the fenestration (Figure 33). Vertical flat-headed windows are inset between the piers, but their mullions and transoms are divided into horizontal segments. The basement level is defined by a concrete band.

The industrial vernacular of the four-storey, squared portion of the building at the south end deviates from the horizontal emphasis established in the two-storey portion (Figure 32); nonetheless, many of the above design elements are carried over into the five bays on its north and south elevations and three bays on its east and west elevations: the stone coping and stone course, flat-headed fenestration, stone lintels above brick panels, horizontal mullion and transom patterns, and the brick piers are all repeated. However, the arrangement of the fenestration is centered on the façade rather than spreading across, and the panels beneath the sills are red brick. A plain, rectangular chimney rises from its northeast corner. The height differences were likely a requirement of function; large oil tanks were stored inside the four-storey tower, while

<sup>55</sup> Sharon Vattay, and Harold D. Kalman, "Bank Architecture," The Canadian Encyclopedia, 2015, accessed 20 October 2023.

<sup>56</sup> Howard Shubert, "Cumberland & Storm and Mies Van Der Rohe: The Problem of the Banking Hall in Canadian Architecture," *Journal of Canadian Art History* 12, no. 1 (1989), 16. 57 Shubert, "Banking Hall", 7.

the northernmost section of the building was reserved for offices and lunchrooms. The design response distinguishes the office area from the industrial area and makes these separate functions legible from the exterior, such that the form indicates function and division of space. The resulting visual impact is one of overall design cohesion of two distinct but complementary segments. The two-storey wing is indicative of the mid-20th century era of its design, while the four-storey section is indicative of its industrial function and context. Both portions are required in order to understand the history of the building.

Interior alterations were undertaken in the early 1960s. The wording of the permit application to, "make interior alterations to oil and grease marine terminal warehouse building for same purpose" might indicate that the alterations were for the purposes of routine updates. In any case, the changes to the exterior of the building since its construction in 1941 have been limited and are rather due to the deterioration of the stonework and damage to the glazing than to any planned alterations. Patchwork to the bricks on the south elevation, including a large piece of plywood, indicate where there was a previous addition that has since been removed (Figure 33).

The Modern architecture movement was slow to start in Toronto. The modern styles that were emerging in Europe and the USA in the 1920s and early 1930s faced initial criticism from practicing Canadian architects and publications, and the economic state of the depression-era meant that there was a general reluctance to experiment with these new designs.<sup>58</sup> In consequence, the popular Revival styles still held dominance following the First World War. It was not until the mid-1930s that attitudes started to change, and examples of Modern architecture began to appear in Toronto amid a growing acceptance of its stylistic validity.<sup>59</sup> The mid- to late-1940s saw a wider use of the Modern styles applied to institutional buildings as the movement continued to gain popularity after the Second World War;<sup>60</sup> however, advocates of the Modern movement from the period bemoaned its general lack of representation in Toronto when compared to the more prevalent Victorian, Romanesque, and Gothic Revival styles.<sup>61</sup>

#### iv. CONTEXT

The following section provides contextual information and analysis related to the property which is the basis for determining contextual value of Criteria 7, 8 or 9 according to O. Reg. 9/06 Criteria.

The location of the subject property at 309 Cherry Street encompasses a large, lowdensity lot shown on the map included as Figure 1 in Attachment 1 (Maps and Photographs) below. There are two detached buildings on the property that both use the municipal address of 309 Cherry Street: the former Bank of Montreal building located at the southeast corner of Cherry and Villiers streets, and the former Canadian Oil

<sup>58</sup> Christopher Armstrong, *Making Toronto Modern: Architecture and Design, 1895-1975* (McGill-Queen's University Press, 2014), 101-107.

<sup>59</sup> Armstrong, 113.

<sup>60</sup> Armstrong, 156.

<sup>61</sup> Armstrong, 159.

Companies Ltd warehouse located on the east side of Cherry Street, immediately to the south of the bank building.

As discussed in Section 2.ii, the land upon which the subject property sits was once a marshland that was turned into a stable landmass through a sequence of dredging and infill work in the late 19th and early 20th centuries. Under the direction of the Toronto Harbour Commissioners (THC) and their 1912 Plan for the Toronto waterfront, the ambition of this infill work was twofold: to rectify the poor lakefront conditions that had arisen as a result of city pollution and general disuse; and to revitalise the area into a multi-faceted industrial district. Yet in lieu of a dense industrial zone, the Port Lands' primary function became material storage for coal and oil, such that the character of the district was defined by its "low density with much passive and uninhabited space".<sup>62</sup> Changes in the methods of fuel storage after the 1960s resulted in the decreased use of fuel tanks and they began to disappear from the Port Lands; this affected the appearance of the landscape and further opened up large lots that leave noticeable gaps in the streetscape even today (Figure 41).<sup>63</sup>

The subject property and its two buildings occupy a prominent location in the northwest corner of the Port Lands. While never formally labelled as such by the THC plans, the wide boulevards of Cherry and Villiers streets acted as the main thoroughfares into the area - a position that was reinforced when the railway spurs extended into the Port Lands and followed the course of Villiers Street and curved onto Cherry Street (Figures 19 and 21).<sup>64</sup> Since the streets were in place and paved by 1920, it is likely that their layout influenced the placement of the former Bank of Montreal building and the design of its chamfered corner that addresses both boulevards as if facing out to greet people entering the district (Figure 11). In anticipation of the Port Lands' growth, this would have been a prestigious location that complemented the idea of banking as a prestigious function. Historic aerial photos also give a sense of how the railways related to the streets. The sweeping curve of the railway spur north of the subject property partially encircles the bank building and may have further influenced the orientation of its principal façade (Figure 25). By contrast, the former Dominion Bank to the south does not have a chamfered corner despite also being on a corner lot (Figure 40).

The northwest block attracted many of the earliest buildings in the Port Lands, such as the Lindsay Factories Ltd built in 1912 that is no longer extant (Figure 8), the Queen City Foundry at 16 Munitions Street built in 1914 (Listed 2003), the Toronto Harbour Commissioners storage buildings at 62 Villiers Street built in 1916 (Listed 2004) and the Canadian Ice Machine Company building at 65 Villiers Street built ca.1920.<sup>65</sup> Those that survive now form a concentrated collection of industrial and institutional buildings that represent the history and character of the Port Lands and demonstrate how (despite not going exactly according to plan) the general direction of the 1912 Plan still influenced the industrial and shipping functions that have characterized the Port Industrial District, or Port Lands, for over 100 years.

<sup>62</sup> Stinson, 12.

<sup>63</sup> Stinson, 37.

<sup>64</sup> These tracks were still partially intact by the 1980s.

<sup>65</sup> Current condition unconfirmed. Historic aerial photos suggest that it is possible that portions of the Canadian Ice Machine Co. building are still extant underneath the overcladding.

To the northwest of the subject property are the Century Coal Company silos at 312 Cherry Street (Listed 2004) that dwarf their immediate surroundings yet act as effective markers into the Port Lands; further south down Cherry Street are the Toronto Hydro Substation at 281 Cherry Street (Part IV 2012) and the former Dominion Bank at 275 Cherry Street (Listed 2003), currently operating as a restaurant. To the southeast (and not visible from the subject property) is the Fire Hall No.30 at 39 Commissioners Street (Part IV 2019). The remainder of the immediate surroundings consist of unassuming, low-rise buildings that maintain an historical scale in response to the nearby Keating Channel, which traditionally has had low, detached, and relatively small buildings in its adjacency (Figure 23).<sup>66</sup> Other than the silos, the skyline is occasionally punctuated by construction cranes and the distant chimney stacks that signal additional pieces of industrial history further afield (Figure 41).

Even though the former Canadian Oil Companies warehouse was built more than two decades after the Bank of Montreal, its placement and design indicate a responsiveness to its surroundings, perhaps influenced by the large size of the lot that may have granted some flexibility in this regard (Figure 37). There is considerable space left between the bank's south elevation and the warehouse's north elevation (Figure 38), the warehouse has a slightly deeper setback than the bank, and the buff colour of its stone details complements the material of the bank and unifies the two buildings despite their different architectural styles. Most significantly, the four-storey portion of the warehouse is stepped back away from the bank; its two-storey section creates a long, visual transition between the height differences (Figure 35). Each of these features appear to be conscious decisions to not overwhelm the three-dimensional integrity and design of the bank. Furthermore, the warehouse's low-rise scale and brick material with stone details complemented the pre-existing early to mid-20th century character of Cherry Street between Keating Channel and Commissioners Street.<sup>67</sup>

# 3. EVALUATION AND APPLICATION OF O.REG 9/06 CRITERIA

The following evaluation applies Ontario Regulation 9/06 made under the Act: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. The criteria are prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Act, and the City of Toronto is also required to use these criteria when assessing properties for inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register. There are a total of nine criteria under O. Reg 9/06. A property may be designated under Section 29 of the Act if it meets two or more of the provincial criteria for determining whether it is of cultural heritage value or interest.

Two evaluation checklists are completed below, one for each of the two subject buildings on the property at 309 Cherry Street (Building 1: Bank of Montreal and Building 2: Canadian Oil Companies Warehouse). The evaluation tables are marked "N/A" if the criterion is "not applicable" to the property or " $\checkmark$ " if it is applicable to the property, with explanatory text below.

<sup>66</sup> Stinson, 127.

<sup>67</sup> Excepting, of course, the aforementioned wood frame offices that it displaced.

# **Bank of Montreal**

# DESIGN OR PHYSICAL VALUE

The property has design value or physical value because it	
1. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type,	$\checkmark$
expression, material or construction method.	
2. displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit	N/A
3. demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement	N/A

#### Representative example of a style and type

Constructed in 1920, the former Bank of Montreal at 309 Cherry Street has design and physical value as a representative example of a Second Classical Revival (or Neo-Classical Revival) style bank typology. The resurgence of Classical Revival architecture in Toronto occurred from the late-19th century until the 1930s, during which time the style was frequently applied to institutional buildings like post offices, libraries, and banks. Banks in particular were drawn to the symbolism of classical architecture because it projected ideals like stability, integrity, security, and even wealth - ideals which these institutions likewise wanted the public to associate with their business.

The Classical Revival style is reflected in many of the building's extant features, including but not limited to its stone and brick construction with iron, copper, and wood details; flat roof with parapet and cornice; symmetrical façades; architrave surrounds; and its detailed Greek Order portico with triangular pediment, entablature, and Doric columns.

# HISTORICAL OR ASSOCIATIVE VALUE

The property has historical value or associative value because it	
4. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity,	N/A
organization or institution that is significant to a community	
5. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an	$\checkmark$
understanding of a community or culture	
6. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder,	$\checkmark$
designer or theorist who is significant to a community	

#### Yields information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture

The construction date, typology, and placement of the bank building at 309 Cherry Street yields information that contributes to an understanding of the post-WWI industrial culture of the Port Lands. In the aftermath of the First World War there was an economic upturn that saw the resumption of a competitiveness between chartered banks to expand and establish new branches. Similarly, there was expansion occurring in the Port Lands that centered around the operations of fuel companies, particularly coal and oil. Taking advantage of a prime location on the main thoroughfare, the Bank of Montreal was one of the first new structures built in the area after the war ended. The timing of its construction was a speculative investment based on the prospect of the continued growth of the Port Lands that would require financial services. However, by 1925 few new industries had moved to the area and fuel storage remained the primary land use. The Bank of Montreal branch ceased operations by 1926. Despite its initial appearance of incongruity with its surroundings, the former Bank of Montreal is more than an anachronism of Port Lands architecture; it stands as an historic marker of the post-war attitudes concerning the area's potential.

# Demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community

The Classical Revival style of the bank building is a demonstration of the work of the esteemed architects Frank Darling and John Pearson, of the firm Darling & Pearson (1892-1923), known for their quality contributions to the architecture in Toronto, in Ontario, and across Canada. As a firm they worked on a number of institutional projects including the first Royal Ontario Museum (1914), several landmark buildings within the University of Toronto precinct, and the supervision of the reconstruction of the Ottawa Parliament Building Centre Block and Peace Tower (1919-1926). Darling & Pearson frequently undertook commissions for the Bank of Montreal and the Bank of Commerce and over the span of his career, Darling designed over 100 bank buildings across Canada. His contributions sought to define the bank typology in Canada and to cultivate a national corporate style. Both Darling and Pearson are listed on the Ontario Association of Architects' Honour Roll.

# CONTEXTUAL VALUE

The property has contextual value because it is	
7. important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area.	N/A
8. physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings.	$\checkmark$
9. a landmark.	N/A

#### Physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings

The former Bank of Montreal, together with the former Canadian Oil Co. warehouse, are physically, visually, and historically linked to their surroundings where they were built to capitalize on the financial potential of the area's growth, and the functional operations of the Port Lands as a shipping and fuel storage centre, respectively.

The subject property is located at the intersection of Cherry and Villiers streets (on the east side of the former) that act as the main thoroughfares into the area and also maintain proximity to the shipping docks and the waterfront. The northwest block attracted many of the earliest buildings in the Port Lands, such as the Queen City Foundry at 16 Munitions Street built in 1914 (Listed 2003), and the Toronto Harbour Commissioners storage buildings at 62 Villiers Street built in 1916 (Listed 2004).

Built in 1920, the Bank of Montreal building was one of the first new builds in the area after the First World War. Its design, placement, and orientation react to its prominent location at the main entrance into the Port Lands through its chamfered corner, which may also have related to the layout of the railway spurs that curved around Cherry Street at the time.

The subject property contributes to the intact, concentrated collection of industrial and institutional buildings in the northwest area of the Port Lands, including: the Toronto

Hydro Substation at 281 Cherry Street (Part IV 2012), the former Dominion Bank at 275 Cherry Street (Listed 2003), the Fire Hall No.30 at 39 Commissioners Street (Part IV 2019), and the Century Coal Company silos at 312 Cherry Street (Listed 2004).

#### Canadian Oil Companies Warehouse

#### **DESIGN OR PHYSICAL VALUE**

The property has design value or physical value because it	
1. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type,	$\checkmark$
expression, material or construction method.	
2. displays high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit	N/A
3. demonstrates high degree of scientific or technical achievement	N/A

#### Representative example of a style

The former Canadian Oil Companies warehouse at 309 Cherry Street has design and physical value as a representative example of a vernacular industrial building with key features of the Art Moderne (or Streamlined Modern) style. Modern styles like Art Deco and Stripped Classical were already emerging in Europe and the US in the 1920s and early 1930s, but due to early criticism and poor economic conditions that hampered experiments in design, the Modern architecture movement was slow to establish in Toronto. As a result, Art Moderne architecture was more prevalent in Toronto closer to the mid-20th century, which corresponds with the construction date of the warehouse in 1941.

The former Canadian Oil Co. warehouse design incorporates many of the main characteristics of the Art Moderne style, most notably in its low-height, flat roof, lack of ornamentation, rounded corners on the north elevation, and an emphasis on horizontality achieved through its wraparound and flat-headed fenestration, uninterrupted stone coping and courses, and the mullion patterns. The height differences between the two-storey and four-storey portions were likely a requirement of function. The design response distinguishes the office area from the industrial area and makes these different functions legible from the exterior, such that the form indicates function and division of space. The resulting visual impact is one of overall design cohesion of the industrial vernacular and Art Moderne.

#### HISTORICAL OR ASSOCIATIVE VALUE

The property has historical value or associative value because it	
4. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity,	N/A
organization or institution that is significant to a community	
5. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an	N/A
understanding of a community or culture	
6. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder,	N/A
designer or theorist who is significant to a community	

#### CONTEXTUAL VALUE

The property has contextual value because it is	
7. important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area.	$\checkmark$
8. physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings.	$\checkmark$
9. a landmark.	N/A

#### Important in defining, maintaining, or supporting the character of an area

The former Canadian Oil Co. warehouse has contextual value because it is important in defining, supporting, and maintaining the character of the Port Lands District as an industrial port that developed in connection with the operations of fuel storage. The character of the district was defined by its "low density with much passive and uninhabited space" that was often used for coal heaps, and later tank farms. The low- to mid-rise buildings of the early to mid-20th centuries maintained an historic scale in response to the nearby Keating Channel and shipping docks.

The warehouse was purpose-built for the Canadian Oil Companies Ltd as their offices and oil storage operations, a function which was typical of the industrial uses intended for the Port Lands. While the building no longer actively functions as such, its industrial typology represents the character for which the Port Lands is known. Furthermore, the warehouse's low-rise scale and brick material with stone details complemented the preexisting early to mid-20th century character of Cherry Street between Keating Channel and Commissioners Street.

#### Physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings

The former Canadian Oil Co. warehouse, together with the former Bank of Montreal, is physically, visually, and historically linked to its surroundings where they were built to capitalize on the financial potential of the area's growth, and the functional operations of the Port Lands as a shipping and fuel storage centre. They are located at the intersection of Cherry and Villiers streets (on the east side of the former) that act as the main thoroughfares into the area and also maintain proximity to the shipping docks and the waterfront. The northwest block attracted many of the earliest buildings in the Port Lands, such as the Queen City Foundry at 16 Munitions Street built in 1914 (Listed 2003), and the Toronto Harbour Commissioners storage buildings at 62 Villiers Street built in 1916 (Listed 2004).

The subject property contributes to the intact, concentrated collection of industrial and institutional buildings in the northwest area of the Port Lands, including: the Toronto Hydro Substation at 281 Cherry Street (Part IV 2012), the former Dominion Bank at 275 Cherry Street (Listed 2003), the Fire Hall No.30 at 39 Commissioners Street (Part IV 2019), and the Century Coal Company silos at 312 Cherry Street (Listed 2004).

# CONCLUSION

The subject property at 309 Cherry Street contains two detached buildings built more than twenty years apart. The former Bank of Montreal building was designed by the preeminent architectural firm of Darling & Pearson in the Classical Revival style and was built in 1920; it ceased banking operations by 1926. The former Canadian Oil Co. warehouse was designed in the Art Moderne style by the architect N.A. Armstrong in 1941. The warehouse function in oil storage continued for over forty years into the 1980s, when Canadian Oil Companies (later Shell Oil) ceased operating at 309 Cherry Street.

The historic evolution of the property resulted in the juxtaposition of the design, typology, and function of the two buildings. The close setting of the two buildings within the property (where the bank building takes the prominent corner location) forces a dialogue out of their juxtaposing features that assists in understanding how the property fits within the overall Port Lands development from the early to the mid-20th century: from the initial land dredging to early industrial development, to interwar financial prospects, and to the area's focused efforts in fuel storage post-WWII. Their individual and collective heritage values each contributes to the history of the Port Lands.

Staff have completed the Research and Evaluation Report for the property at 309 Cherry Street and determined that the property meets 5 out of 9 criteria in Ontario Regulation 9/06, the criteria prescribed for municipal designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Act. As such, the property should be designated.

The Statement of Significance (Attachment 3) for 309 Cherry Street comprises the Reasons for Designation, which is the Public Notice of Intention to Designate.

# CONTACT

Mary L. MacDonald, MA, CAHP Senior Manager, Heritage Planning Urban Design, City Planning Tel: 416-338-1079 Fax: 416-392-1973 E-mail: <u>Mary.MacDonald@toronto.ca</u>

#### SIGNATURE

Gregg Lintern, MCIP, RPP Chief Planner and Executive Director City Planning Attachment 1 – Maps and Photographs

Attachment 2 – List of Research Sources

Attachment 3 – Statement of Significance (Reasons for Designation)

MAPS AND PHOTOGRAPHS: 309 CHERRY STREET

**ATTACHMENT 1** 



Figure 1. The approximate location of the subject property at 309 Cherry Street (City of Toronto iView Mapping, annotated by Heritage Planning).



Figure 2. "Plan of York Harbour." Joseph Bouchette (cartographer), J. Walker (engraver) and W. Faden at Charing Cross (publisher). 1815 (Toronto Library Archives).



Figure 3. 'Plan of the City of Toronto', City Engineers Office, 1894 (University of Toronto) https://maps.library.utoronto.ca/dvhmp/Scans/NMC97370.jpg



Figure 4. "A plan suggested by the Toronto Board of Trade for the development of Ashbridge Bay showing provisions for the entry of all railways under city control", Toronto Board of Trade, 1910 (Toronto Library Archives).



Figure 5. "Waterfront Conditions," E.L. Cousins, Chief Engineer & manager; Toronto Harbour Commissioners, 1912 (University of Toronto).

https://maps.library.utoronto.ca/dvhmp/Scans/G 3524 T621 24 1912.jpg



Figure 6. "Keating Channel, looking east during construction." 1914 (Toronto Library Archives).



Figure 7. Keating Channel, present day (Heritage Planning, 2023).



Figure 8. "View looking southeast, showing Keating channel at left." 1914 (Toronto Library Archives).



Figure 9. "Looking southeast from the intersection of Cherry Street and Keating's Channel" 1917 from Stinson's *Heritage of the Port Industrial District: A report for the Toronto Harbour Commissioners*. Vol 1. 1990.



Figure 10. Panorama of Cherry and Villiers Street in 1918, from Stinson's *Heritage of the Port Industrial District: A report for the Toronto Harbour Commissioners.* Vol 1. 1990.



Figure 11. Bank of Montreal under construction in 1920, from "Heritage Impact Assessment: 309 Cherry Street, Toronto." ERA Architects, Inc. 2023.



Figure 12. Building Records, Toronto Department of Buildings, Permit No.30992 (1919), showing the extended northwest elevation on Cherry and Villiers streets (City of Toronto Archives).



BANK OF MONTREAL, CORNER CHERRY AND VILLIER STREETS, TORONTO Figure 13. "Bank of Montreal." *Construction* 14, no. 12 (Toronto: H. Gagnier, Ltd, 1921): 371-372.



Figure 14. Northwest corner of former Bank of Montreal (Heritage Planning, 2023).



Figure 15. Pediment and entablature detail (Heritage Planning, 2023).



Figure 16. Main entrance details (Heritage Planning, 2023).



Figure 17. At top: Building Records, Toronto Department of Buildings, Permit No.30992 (1919), showing the east elevation (City of Toronto Archives). At bottom: Building Records File No.150425 (1980), showing alterations to east elevation.



Figure 18. At top: east elevation and at bottom: south elevation of the former Bank of Montreal (Heritage Planning, 2023).



Figure 19. "Cherry St., looking south from Keating Channel bridge." c.1929 (Toronto Library Archives).



Figure 20. "Oil and coal refineries and ship channel, Cherry Street" c.1930 (City of Toronto Archives).


Figure 21. "View looking southeast from approx. Cherry & Villiers St." 1930 (Toronto Library Archives).



Figure 22. "East on Villiers Street from railroad spur to Munition Street," 1932 (City of Toronto Archives).



Figure 23. Looking east down Villiers Street (Heritage Planning 2023).



Figure 24. Aerial photo of 309 Cherry Street, 1939 (City of Toronto Mapping).



Figure 25. Aerial photo of 309 Cherry Street from 1947 (City of Toronto Archives).



Figure 26. Aerial photo of 309 Cherry Street, 1954 (City of Toronto Mapping).



Figure 27. N. A. Armstrong's International Harvest Co. of Canada Ltd., 1940 (City of Toronto Archives).



Figure 28. Northwest elevation of former Canadian Oil Companies warehouse (Heritage Planning, 2023).



Figure 29. Northeast elevation (Heritage Planning, 2023).



Figure 30. Building Records, Toronto and East York, Building Records Files No. 70968 (1941).



Figure 31. Building Records, Toronto and East York, Building Records Files No. 70968 (1941) showing all elevations of N. A. Armstrong's designs for the Canadian Oil Companies warehouse.



Figure 32. Northwest and south elevations of four-storey section (Heritage Planning, 2023).



Figure 33. South elevation alteration detail and window mullion transom details (Heritage Planning, 2023).



Figure 34. Rounded corner on north elevation (Heritage Planning, 2023).

309 Cherry Street - Notice of Intention to Designate



Figure 35. Intersection of Cherry and Villiers streets, facing southeast (Heritage Planning, 2023).



Figure 36. "Cherry Street, looking south to Villiers Street" circa 1980-1998 (City of Toronto Archives).



Figure 37. Building Records, Toronto and East York, Building Records File No.150425 (1980), showing buildings along east side of Cherry Street.



Figure 38. West elevation of the former Bank of Montreal showing space between the two subject buildings (Heritage Planning, 2023).



Figure 39. Context looking southwest from Villers Street (Heritage Planning, 2023).



Figure 40. Toronto Hydro Station and former Dominion Bank at the corner of Cherry and Commissioners streets (Heritage Planning, 2023).



Figure 41. Looking east down Villiers Street (Heritage Planning, 2023).

# **RESEARCH SOURCES**

#### **Archival Sources**

- Bouchette, Joseph, J. Walker, and W. Faden, "Plan of York Harbour," 1815.
- Building Records, Toronto and East York, Building Records Files No. 75608 (1942), 93320 (1947), 93275 (1947), 94521 (1947), 63871 (1961), 150425 (1980), 154048 (1980), 70968 (1941), 93251 (1946).
- Building Records, Toronto Department of Buildings, Permit No.30992 (1919) [CTA].
- City Engineers Office, "Plan of the City of Toronto," 1894. <u>https://maps.library.utoronto.ca/dvhmp/Scans/NMC97370.jpg</u>
- City of Toronto Archives [CTA], Photographic Collection.
- E.L. Cousins, "Waterfront Conditions," 1912 (University of Toronto) https://maps.library.utoronto.ca/dvhmp/Scans/G 3524 T621 24 1912.jpg
- Land Registry Office Records, Metro Toronto, Book 520E, Part of Blocks A, K, and J.
- Might's Greater Toronto City Directories, 1919-1985.
- "Plan of York Harbour." Joseph Bouchette (cartographer), J. Walker (engraver) and W. Faden at Charing Cross (publisher), 1815.
- Toronto Board of Trade, "A plan suggested by the Toronto Board of Trade for the development of Ashbridge Bay showing provisions for the entry of all railways under city control", 1910 (Toronto Library Archives).
- Toronto Public Library [TPL], Photographic Collection.

# Secondary Sources

- "Alterations to a Heritage Property, Intention to Designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act – 39 Commissioners Street." City Planning, City of Toronto 2019. https://secure.toronto.ca/council/agenda-item.do?item=2019.TE8.19
- Armstrong, Christopher. *Making Toronto Modern: Architecture and Design, 1895-1975.* McGill-Queen's University Press, 2014.
- "Armstrong, Norman Alexander." Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada 1800-1950. <u>http://dictionaryofarchitectsincanada.org/node/58</u>
- "Bank of Montreal." Construction 14, no. 12 (Toronto: H. Gagnier, Ltd, 1921): 371-372. <u>https://archive.org/details/constructionjour14macduoft/page/370/mode/2up</u>
- Blumenson, John. Ontario Architecture: A Guide to Styles and Building Terms, 1784 to the Present. Fitzhenry & Whiteside, 1990.
- "Darling, Frank (1850-1923)." Ontario Association of Architects. <u>https://oaa.on.ca/Assets/Common/Shared\_Documents/Awards/Honour%20Roll/DAR\_LING,%20Frank.pdf</u>
- Denison, Merrill. Canada's First Bank: A History of the Bank of Montreal Vol 1. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart Ltd., 1966. https://www.bmo.com/ci/files/A History of the Bank of Montreal Volume 1.pdf
- Denison, Merrill. Canada's First Bank: A History of the Bank of Montreal Vol 2. Toronto: McClelland & Steward Ltd., 1967. https://www.bmo.com/ci/files/A History of the Bank of Montreal Volume 2.pdf
- "Heritage Impact Assessment: 309 Cherry Street, Toronto." ERA Architects Inc. March 14, 2023.

- Hill, Robert, editor. *Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada, 1800-1950,* entry for Frank Darling, <u>http://www.dictionaryofarchitectsincanada.org/node/1638</u>
- Hill, Robert, editor. *Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada, 1800-1950,* entry for John Andrew Pearson, http://www.dictionaryofarchitectsincanada.org/node/2028
- Hill, Robert, editor. *Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada, 1800-1950*, entry for Norman Alexander Armstrong, http://dictionaryofarchitectsincanada.org/node/58
- "Inclusion on the City of Toronto's Heritage Register and Intention to Designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act - 100 College Street." City Planning, City of Toronto 2020. <u>https://secure.toronto.ca/council/agendaitem.do?item=2020.TE18.16</u>
- "Intention to Designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act and Authority for a Heritage Easement Agreement – 281 Cherry Street." City Planning, City of Toronto 2012. <u>https://secure.toronto.ca/council/agendaitem.do?item=2012.TE18.20</u>
- "Intention to Designate Under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act 351 Lake Shore Boulevard East." City Planning, City of Toronto, 2016. <u>https://secure.toronto.ca/council/agenda-item.do?item=2016.TE14.12</u>
- "Intention to Designate under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act 440 Unwin Avenue." City Planning, City of Toronto, 2019. <u>https://secure.toronto.ca/council/agenda-item.do?item=2019.TE4.16</u>
- McHugh, Patricia, ND Bozikovic, Alex. Toronto Architecture: A City Guide, 2nd ed., 2017.
- "Pearson, John Andrew (1867-1940)." Ontario Association of Architects. <u>https://oaa.on.ca/Assets/Common/Shared\_Documents/Awards/Honour%20Roll/PEA</u> <u>RSON,%20John%20Andrew.pdf</u>
- Morawetz, Tim. Art Deco Architecture in Toronto: A guide to the city's buildings from the roaring twenties and the depression. Toronto: Glue Inc., 2009.
- Shubert, Howard. "Cumberland & Storm and Mies Van Der Rohe: The Problem of the Banking Hall in Canadian Architecture." Journal of Canadian Art History 12, no. 1 (1989): 7-21. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/42615862</u>
- Stinson, Jeffery. Heritage of the Port Industrial District: A report for the Toronto Harbour Commissioners. Vol 1. 1990.
- *Toronto Harbour: The Passing Years*. Toronto Harbour Commissioners. Toronto: Golla Graphics Inc., 1985.
- Vattay, Sharon and Harold D. Kalman. "Bank Architecture." The Canadian Encyclopedia. 2015. <u>https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/bank-architecture</u>

# 309 CHERRY STREET BANK OF MONTREAL CANADIAN OIL COMPANIES LTD WAREHOUSE

# STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

# (REASONS FOR DESIGNATION)

The property at 309 Cherry Street is worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act for its cultural heritage value, and meets Ontario Regulation 9/06, the provincial criteria for municipal designation, under the categories of design/physical, historical/associative, and contextual value.

# Description

The property at 309 Cherry Street is located at the southeast corner of Cherry Street and Villiers Street in the Port Lands; it is a large, low-density lot whose approximate boundaries are defined by Villers Street to the north, Cherry Street to the west, and Commissioners Street to the south. In 1911, the ownership of the property transferred to the Toronto Harbour Commissioners, or THC, upon their formation. The subject property contains two detached buildings with the same municipal address situated at the northwest corner of the property. The first is a two-storey institutional building constructed in 1920 as a banking hall and offices for the Bank of Montreal, designed by the esteemed architectural firm Darling & Pearson. In 1920, the Bank of Montreal leased a portion of the current subject property from the THC for a term of 21 years. By 1926, it was no longer an operational bank branch. The second building, located to the immediate south, is a two-to-four-storey industrial building constructed in 1941 as an oil storage warehouse for Canadian Oil Companies Ltd., designed by the architect N. A. Armstrong. In the same year, Canadian Oil Companies Ltd. entered into a lease agreement with the THC for two parcels of land that approximately correspond with the boundaries of the current subject property, at which point they converted the former Bank of Montreal into their offices. By 1945 they assumed ownership of both lots, which is around the time when the two properties were consolidated. Canadian Oil Companies was purchased by Shell Oil in the mid 1960s, and Shell continued using the property until 1987 when they ceased operations at 309 Cherry Street.

# Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

# **Design or Physical Value: Bank of Montreal**

Constructed in 1920, the former Bank of Montreal at 309 Cherry Street has design and physical value as a representative example of a Second- or Neo- Classical Revival style bank typology. The resurgence of Classical Revival architecture in Toronto occurred from the late-19th century until the 1930s, during which time the style was frequently applied to institutional buildings like post offices, libraries, and banks. Banks in particular were drawn to the symbolism of classical architecture because it projected ideals like stability, integrity, security, and even wealth - ideals which these institutions likewise wanted the public to associate with their business.

The Classical Revival style is reflected in many of the building's extant features, including but not limited to its stone and brick construction with iron, copper, and wood details; flat roof with parapet and cornice; symmetrical façades; architrave surrounds; and its detailed Greek Order portico with triangular pediment, entablature, and Doric columns.

#### **Design or Physical Value: Canadian Oil Companies Warehouse**

The former Canadian Oil Companies warehouse at 309 Cherry Street has design and physical value as a representative example of a vernacular industrial building with key features of the Art Moderne (or Streamlined Modern) style. Modern styles like Art Deco and Stripped Classical were already emerging in Europe and the US in the 1920s and early 1930s, but due to early criticism and poor economic conditions that hampered experiments in design, the Modern architecture movement was slow to establish in Toronto. As a result, Art Moderne architecture was more prevalent in Toronto closer to the mid-20th century, which corresponds with the construction date of the warehouse in 1941.

The former Canadian Oil Co. warehouse design incorporates many of the main characteristics of the Art Moderne style, most notably in its low-height, flat roof, lack of ornamentation, rounded corners on the north elevation, and an emphasis on horizontality achieved through its wraparound and flat-headed fenestration, uninterrupted stone coping and courses, and the mullion patterns. The height differences between the two-storey and four-storey portions were likely a requirement of function. The design response distinguishes the office area from the industrial area and makes these different functions legible from the exterior, such that the form indicates function and division of space. The resulting visual impact is one of overall design cohesion of the industrial vernacular and Art Moderne.

# **Historical or Associative Value**

The construction date, typology, and placement of the bank building at 309 Cherry Street yields information that contributes to an understanding of the post-WWI industrial culture of the Port Lands. In the aftermath of the First World War there was an economic upturn that saw the resumption of a competitiveness between chartered banks to expand and establish new branches. Similarly, there was expansion occurring in the Port Lands that centered around the operations of fuel companies, particularly coal and oil. Taking advantage of a prime location on the main thoroughfare, the Bank of Montreal was one of the first new structures built in the area after the war ended. The timing of its construction was a speculative investment based on the prospect of the continued growth of the Port Lands that would require financial services. However, by 1925 few new industries had moved to the area and fuel storage remained the primary land use. The Bank of Montreal branch ceased operations by 1926. Despite its initial appearance of incongruity with its surroundings, the former Bank of Montreal is more than an anachronism of Port Lands architecture; it stands as an historic marker of the post-war attitudes concerning the area's potential.

The Classical Revival style of the bank building is valued as a demonstration of the work of the esteemed architects Frank Darling and John Pearson, of the firm Darling &

Pearson (1892-1923), known for their quality contributions to the architecture in Toronto, in Ontario, and across Canada. As a firm they worked on a number of institutional projects including the first Royal Ontario Museum (1914), several landmark buildings within the University of Toronto precinct, and the supervision of the reconstruction of the Ottawa Parliament Building Centre Block and Peace Tower (1919-1926). Darling & Pearson frequently undertook commissions for the Bank of Montreal and the Bank of Commerce and over the span of his career, Darling designed over 100 bank buildings across Canada. His contributions sought to define the bank typology in Canada and to cultivate a national corporate style. Both Darling and Pearson are listed on the Ontario Association of Architects' Honour Roll.

#### **Contextual Value**

The former Canadian Oil Co. warehouse has contextual value because it is important in defining, supporting, and maintaining the character of the Port Lands District as an industrial port that developed in connection with the operations of fuel storage. The character of the district was defined by its "low density with much passive and uninhabited space" that was often used for coal heaps, and later tank farms. The low- to mid-rise buildings of the early to mid-20th centuries maintained an historic scale in response to the nearby Keating Channel and shipping docks. The warehouse was purpose-built for the Canadian Oil Companies Ltd as their offices and oil storage operations, a function which was typical of the industrial uses intended for the Port Lands. While the building no longer actively functions as such, its industrial typology represents the character for which the Port Lands is known. Furthermore, the warehouse's low-rise scale and brick material with stone details complemented the pre-existing early to mid-20th century character of Cherry Street between Keating Channel and Commissioners Street.

The former Bank of Montreal, together with the former Canadian Oil Co. warehouse, are physically, visually, and historically linked to their surroundings where they were built to capitalize on the financial potential of the area's growth, and the functional operations of the Port Lands as a shipping and fuel storage centre, respectively.

The subject property is located at the intersection of Cherry and Villiers streets (on the east side of the former) that act as the main thoroughfares into the area and also maintain proximity to the shipping docks and the waterfront. The northwest block attracted many of the earliest buildings in the Port Lands, such as the Queen City Foundry at 16 Munitions Street built in 1914 (Listed 2003), and the Toronto Harbour Commissioners storage buildings at 62 Villiers Street built in 1916 (Listed 2004). Built in 1920, the Bank of Montreal building was one of the first new builds in the area after the First World War. Its design, placement, and orientation react to its prominent location at the main entrance into the Port Lands through its chamfered corner, which may also have related to the layout of the railway spurs that curved around Cherry Street at the time.

The subject property contributes to the intact, concentrated collection of industrial and institutional buildings in the northwest area of the Port Lands, including: the Toronto Hydro Substation at 281 Cherry Street (Part IV 2012), the former Dominion Bank at 275

Cherry Street (Listed 2003), the Fire Hall No.30 at 39 Commissioners Street (Part IV 2019), and the Century Coal Company silos at 312 Cherry Street (Listed 2004).

#### Heritage Attributes

#### **Design or Physical Value**

The following heritage attributes contribute to the cultural heritage value of the former Bank of Montreal on the property at 309 Cherry Street as representative example of a Classical Revival bank building:

- The scale, form, and massing of the two-storey building on a squared plan with basement level
- The materials, with limestone masonry construction on its principal elevations (north and west) and buff brick masonry construction on its secondary elevations (south and east), featuring sandstone, iron, copper, and wood detailing
- The ashlar masonry of the principal elevations set in courses of alternating widths
- The brick bond pattern of the secondary elevations (south and east)
- The symmetrical design of the principal elevations: two bays on each of the north and west elevations arranged around the central bay main entrance
- The building's angled orientation with a chamfered main entrance at its northwest corner and sandstone staircase
- The flat roofline with parapet, and cornice with copper flashing
- The Greek Order portico at the main entrance that includes the following details: triangular pediment with copper flashing, an acroterion at its apex, and plain tympanum; an entablature with cornice and underside mutules with guttae; frieze with alternating triglyphs and metopes; architrave with guttae that align with the triglyphs above; and the two outer engaged square piers and two inner Doric columns with capitals and fluted shafts that support the entablature
- The stringcourse on the principal elevations that extends from the frieze
- The existing position and proportions of all original door and window openings
- The architrave surround of the main entrance door opening, with cornice above
- The carved panels of the wood door, including the repeated frieze motif above the door with space for a clock face
- Decorative, geometric iron grilles on the rectangular sidelight openings, which are repeated in smaller versions within the door's upper panels
- The shouldered architraves and stone sills of the flat-headed principal elevation window openings
- The segmental brick arches and stone sills of the east elevation window openings
- Flat-headed basement level window openings on principal elevations with iron grilles

The following heritage attributes contribute to the cultural heritage value of the former Canadian Oil Co. warehouse on the property at 309 Cherry Street as representative example of an Art Moderne industrial building:

- The scale, form, and massing of the two-storey building with four-storey adjoined tower at its south elevation on a rectangular plan with basement level
- The materials, with brown brick masonry construction featuring stone, red brick, concrete, and metal detailing
- The flat roofline emphasised with stone coping

- The existing position and proportions of all original window and door openings
- Flat-headed fenestration across all elevations with concrete sills and plain brick panels underneath
- Existing horizontal mullion patterns in the vertically arranged windows
- The continuous stone course above the fenestration that runs parallel with the stone coping at the roofline
- The brick piers in between window openings capped with red brick bands, and their relationship with the stone course above and concrete course of the basement below, such that they do not break either boundary
- The rounded corners of the north elevation that curve into the west and east elevations, further emphasised by the wraparound horizontal fenestration, and the uninterrupted stone coping and stone course lines

#### **Historical or Associative Value**

The following heritage attributes contribute to the cultural value of the former Bank of Montreal building at 309 Cherry Street as an example of the work of the architects Darling and Pearson, as well as the building's association with the Bank of Montreal as a speculative investment of financial business revenue based on anticipation of the Port Land's industrial development:

- The design elements that are characteristic of the Classical Revival style (Greek Order), such as the portico with pediment and entablature supported by Doric columns, that were commonly used for bank typology buildings
- The quality of the materials used, including Indiana Limestone, sandstone, and copper
- The building's cohesive design accomplished through the consistent buff colour palette of the stone and brick masonry; the extension of the entablature decoration into the principal elevations; and, the repeated triglyph and metope design in the wood panel above the door
- The northwest-facing orientation of the main entrance with chamfered corner that addresses the Cherry Street bascule bridge, the historic main entrance into the Port Lands
- The relationship between the principal elevations of the building and the street layout at the intersection of Cherry and Villiers streets, such that the elevations front onto the historic main streets of the northwest area of the Port Lands

#### **Contextual Value**

Attributes that contribute to the former Bank of Montreal at 309 Cherry Street being historically, visually, and physically linked to its setting:

- The zero lot line setback, placement, and orientation of the building prominently anchoring the southeast corner of Cherry Street and Villiers Street
- The building's setting within the northwest area of the Port Lands district, where it contributes to a collection of early to mid-20th century institutional and industrial buildings

Attributes that contribute to the cultural heritage value of the former Canadian Oil Co. warehouse at 309 Cherry Street as defining, supporting, and maintaining the historic character of the Port Lands and being historically, visually, and physically linked to its setting:

- The setback, placement, and orientation of the building on the east side of Cherry Street, south of Villiers Street and Keating Channel and east of the shipping docks
- The building's transition from a northern two-storey wing to a southern four-storey tower that indicates a deferential awareness of and reaction to the nearby Bank of Montreal to the north, which pre-dates the warehouse
- The building's setting within the northwest area of the Port Lands district, where it contributes to a collection of early to mid-20th century institutional and industrial buildings