

Toronto Preservation Board

Meeting No.	22	Contact	Tanya Spinello, Committee Administrator
Meeting Date	Friday, September 20, 2024	Phone	416-397-4592
Start Time	9:30 AM	E-mail	hertpb@toronto.ca
Location	Video Conference	Chair	Julia Rady

PB22.2	ACTION	Amended		Ward: 13
---------------	---------------	---------	--	----------

214-230 Sherbourne Street - Alterations to Heritage Properties Designated Under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act and Authority to Enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement

Board Decision

The Toronto Preservation Board recommends that:

1. City Council consent to the application to alter the heritage properties at 214-230 Sherbourne Street, with conditions, under Part V, Section 42 of the Ontario Heritage Act, to allow for the construction of a 46-storey (plus mechanical penthouse) mixed-use building, with such alterations to the designated properties being substantially in accordance with the plans and drawings dated January 26, 2024, revised May 15, 2024, prepared by Hariri Pontarini Architects Inc., and on file with the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning, and the Heritage Impact Assessment prepared by ERA Architects Inc., dated September 13, 2022, revised February 26, 2024, and on file with the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, all subject to and in accordance with the approved Conservation Plan satisfactory to the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning.

2. City Council direct that its consent to the application to alter the designated properties at 214-230 Sherbourne Street under Part V, Section 42 of the Ontario Heritage Act is also subject to the following conditions:

a. the related Official Plan Amendment and Zoning By-law Amendment requiring the proposed alterations have been enacted by the City Council and have come into full force and effect.

b. prior to the introduction of the Official Plan and Zoning By-law Amendment Bills to City Council, the owner shall:

1. provide a detailed Conservation Plan, prepared by a qualified heritage consultant that is consistent with the conservation strategy set out in the Heritage Impact Assessment for 214-230 Sherbourne Street, prepared by ERA Architects Inc., dated September 13, 2022, revised February 26, 2024, to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning; and

2. enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement with the City for the property at 230 Sherbourne Street substantially in accordance with the plans and drawings dated January 26, 2024, revised May 15, 2024, prepared by Hariri Pontarini Architects Inc., and on file with the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning, and the Heritage Impact Assessment prepared by ERA Architects Inc., dated September 13, 2022, revised February 26, 2024, subject to and in accordance with the Conservation Plan required in Recommendation 2.b.1 to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning, including execution of such agreement to the satisfaction of the City Solicitor;

c. prior to the issuance of any permit for all or any part of the properties at 214-230 Sherbourne Street, including a heritage permit or a building permit, but excluding permits for repairs and maintenance and usual and minor works for the existing heritage building, as are acceptable to the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning, the owner shall:

1. have entered into a Heritage Easement Agreement with the City required in Condition 2.b.2 above for the property at 230 Sherbourne Street including registration on title of such agreement, to the satisfaction of the City Solicitor;

2. have obtained final approval for the necessary Official Plan Amendment and Zoning By-law Amendment, and such Amendments have come into full force and effect;

3. provide building permit drawings, including notes and specifications for the conservation and protective measures keyed to the approved Conservation Plan required in Recommendation 2.b.1 above including a description of materials and finishes, to be prepared by the project architect and a qualified heritage consultant to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning;

4. provide a Heritage Lighting Plan that describes how the exterior of the heritage property at 230 Sherbourne Street will be sensitively illuminated to enhance its heritage character to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning and thereafter shall implement such Plan to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning;

5. provide an Interpretation Plan for the subject property at 230 Sherbourne Street, to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning and thereafter shall implement such Plan to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning; and

6. provide a Letter of Credit, including provision for upwards indexing, in a form and amount and from a bank satisfactory to the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning to secure all work included in the approved Conservation Plan and Interpretation Plan; and

d. that prior to the release of the Letter of Credit required in Recommendation 2.c.6 above the owner shall:

1. provide a letter of substantial completion prepared and signed by a qualified heritage consultant confirming that the required conservation work and the required interpretive work has been completed in accordance with the Conservation Plan and Interpretation Plan and that an appropriate standard of conservation has been maintained, all to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning; and

2. provide replacement Heritage Easement Agreement photographs to the satisfaction of the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning.

3. City Council authorize the City Solicitor to introduce the necessary Bill in City Council authorizing the entering into of a Heritage Easement Agreement for the property at 230 Sherbourne Street.

4. City Council authorize the City Solicitor and City staff to take all necessary actions to implement City Council's decision.

Decision Advice and Other Information

The Toronto Preservation Board:

1. Requested that the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning to consider the following when reviewing the Conservation Plan:

a. the existing porch structure be restored based on documentary evidence or, where such evidence does not exist, be replaced by a historically appropriate design organized around a central staircase;

b. the paint be removed from exterior masonry and terra cotta elements of the building;

c. the existing interior elements such as the marble and ornate fireplaces, grand central staircase, woodworking, interior door and window arrays, and plaster details be retained, where possible; and

d. alternate designs be explored for the at-grade arches of the contemporary addition to the south of the heritage building to minimize visual impacts.

2. Requested the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning to consider exploring the following themes when reviewing the Interpretation Plan:

a. the history of 213-230 Sherbourne Street, including notable early occupants, the architectural redesign;

b. its use as a rooming house; and

c. the importance and legacy of the Dineen family in Toronto and the history of affordable housing activism at this site.

Neil MacKay, Heritage Planner, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning gave a presentation on 214-230 Sherbourne Street - Alterations to Heritage Properties Designated Under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act and Authority to Enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement.

Origin

(September 13, 2024) Report from the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning

Summary

At its meeting on September 20, 2024 the Toronto Preservation Board considered Item [PB22.2](#) and made recommendations to City Council.

Summary from the revised report (September 13, 2024) from the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning:

This report recommends that City Council approve the alterations proposed for the designated heritage properties municipally known as 214, 218, 220, 222, 224, 226 and 230 Sherbourne Street under Section 42 of the Ontario Heritage Act, in connection with the proposed development of the subject property. The Official Plan Amendment, Zoning By-law Amendment, and Site Plan Control applications for 214-230 Sherbourne Street are subject to a Heritage Permit application under the Ontario Heritage Act.

The subject site is designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act as part of the Garden District Heritage Conservation District. A portion of the subject site, 230 Sherbourne Street (William Dineen House), is designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act by Designation By-law 496-2012.

On June 10, 2022, an Official Plan and Zoning By-law Amendment application was made for 214-230 Sherbourne Street. A Heritage Impact Assessment was prepared by ERA Architects Inc., dated September 13, 2022, and revised February 26, 2024, to assess the impact of the proposed development on the on-site heritage resource. A Heritage Impact Assessment Addendum was prepared by ERA Architects Inc., dated June 7, 2023, that considers the impact of a revised proposal.

The proposed development application contemplates a 46-storey residential tower (including mechanical penthouse) set atop a four-storey podium that incorporates 230 Sherbourne Street. The proposed alterations conserve the onsite and adjacent heritage buildings and are consistent with the policy framework. The heritage impacts of the development proposal are appropriately mitigated through the overall conservation strategy.

Background Information

(September 13, 2024) Revised Report and Attachments 1 to 4 from the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning on 214-230 Sherbourne Street - Alterations to Heritage Properties Designated Under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act and Authority to Enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement

(<https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2024/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-248683.pdf>)

(August 28, 2024) Report and Attachments 1 to 4 from the Senior Manager, Heritage Planning, Urban Design, City Planning on 214-230 Sherbourne Street - Alterations to Heritage Properties Designated Under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act and Authority to Enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement

(<https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2024/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-248503.pdf>)

Staff Presentation on 214-230 Sherbourne Street - Alterations to Heritage Properties Designated Under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act and Authority to Enter into a Heritage Easement Agreement

(<https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2024/pb/bgrd/backgroundfile-248898.pdf>)

Communications

(September 18, 2024) Presentation from Clara Shipman, Project Manager, ERA Architects Inc. (PB.Supp)

(<https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2024/pb/comm/communicationfile-182815.pdf>)

Speakers

Clara Shipman, Project Manager, ERA Architects Inc.

Declared Interests

The following member(s) declared an interest:

Adam Wynne - Adam has contact with the business named in the application through his profession outside of the Toronto Preservation Board. The application is for a business operating under another number company.