

## **KPMG Management Letter Recommendations - Update on Action Plans**

**Date:** October 22, 2025  
**To:** Audit Committee  
**From:** Director, Internal Audit  
**Wards:** All

### **SUMMARY**

---

This report responds to the direction from Council and Audit Committee arising from Item AU13.2 and AU1.8.

AU 13.2 - The City of Toronto Audit Findings Report for the Year Ended December 31, 2021, as adopted by City Council at its meeting on July 19, 20, 21 and 22, 2022, for the Chief Financial Officer & Treasurer to report to Council on the status of the 55 recommendations in the Management Letter (December 15, 2021) from KPMG LLP.

AU 1.8 - Update from the Controller on Action Plans and implementation of recommendations arising from the KPMG Audit for the Year 2020, as adopted at Audit Committee at its meeting on Feb 13, 2023, for the Controller to provide an update on each of outstanding KPMG letters recommendations.

### **RECOMMENDATIONS**

---

The CFO and the Internal Audit Division recommend that Audit Committee receive this report for information.

### **FINANCIAL IMPACT**

---

There are no financial implications resulting from the adoption of the recommendations in this report. However, the implementation of recommendations referred to in this report may result in financial implications which will be included in future years' budget submissions of the relevant divisions for consideration and approval.

The Chief Financial Officer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial implications as identified in the Financial Impact section.

## **DECISION HISTORY**

---

City Council on July 19, 20, 21 and 22, 2022, in considering report AU13.2 - The City of Toronto Audit Findings Report for the Year Ended December 31, 2021, adopted the following:

1. City Council request the Auditor General to direct the City's external auditor to promptly report to the Audit Committee any identified control deficiencies determined to be of significant importance to merit the attention of management or those charged with governance.
2. City Council direct the City Manager to implement the 55 recommendations in the Management letter (December 15, 2021) from KPMG LLP (for the year 2020), in alignment with implementation timelines.
3. City Council request the Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer to track the progress, in consultation with the responsible divisional leaders, on addressing the 55 recommendations in the Management letter (December 15, 2021) from KPMG LLP (for the year 2020), and any subsequent recommendations, and to report at least twice annually to the Audit Committee until such time as implementation is complete.

Decision Document Link:

[Agenda Item History - 2022.AU13.2 \(toronto.ca\)](#)

Audit Committee on Feb 13, 2023, in considering report AU 1.8 - Update from the Controller on Action Plans and implementation of recommendations arising from the KPMG Audit for the Year 2020, adopted the following:

1. Audit Committee requested the Controller to provide an update on implementing each of outstanding KPMG management letters recommendations, including any interim measures or controls.

Decision Document Link:

[Agenda Item History - 2023.AU1.8 \(toronto.ca\)](#)

## COMMENTS

---

### Background:

The City's external auditor, KPMG issued their first management letter pertaining to the results of their audit of the consolidated financial statements of the City of Toronto for the year ended December 31, 2020. While KPMG did not identify any significant deficiencies in internal control over financial reporting, they did identify 55 recommendations for process improvements. Below is a chart of the number recommendations identified by year by KPMG:

| <i><b>December 31<sup>st</sup> Year End</b></i> | <i><b>Number of Recommendations</b></i> |
|-------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------|
| 2020                                            | 55                                      |
| 2021                                            | 5                                       |
| 2022                                            | 5                                       |
| 2023                                            | 9                                       |
| <b>Total</b>                                    | <b>74</b>                               |

For the purposes of this report, these 74 recommendations are in scope for validation and analysis.

Recently, the City received a management letter from KPMG for the year ended December 31, 2024, which identified 10 additional recommendations. The Internal Audit Division worked with the divisions to verify the accuracy of the findings and developed action plans accordingly. The 2024 management letter will be tabled separately by KPMG. These recommendations are excluded from the status update below and will be reviewed in the next reporting cycle.

### General Themes:

The following is a summary of the general themes noted in the management letter relating to the City's general control environment:

- Need to enhance financial acumen
- Centralization of transaction processing & streamlining labour intensive and inefficient manual processes
- Improved financial policies and procedures
- Clear roles & responsibilities for the recording of financial transactions

## Tracking/Monitoring Process:

A database of all outstanding management letter recommendations has been developed and updates have been solicited from management on the implementation status of the recommendations.

The responses provided are management's assessment of progress, and the accuracy of those responses are validated by Internal Audit.

To enable effective monitoring, this report (*Appendix A*) provides an update on the status of each recommendation with action plans for all recommendations that are open and in progress.

A chronological listing of all recommendations can be found in *Appendix B*.

## KPMG Recommendations – Status Update as of October 2025

|                      |                                           |
|----------------------|-------------------------------------------|
| <b>October 2025</b>  | 55 out of 74 (74%) recommendations closed |
| <b>November 2024</b> | 41 out of 65 (63%) recommendations closed |
| <b>December 2023</b> | 10 out of 65 (15%) recommendations closed |

## Financial Statement Transformation Project - FSTP

**11** of the **19** remaining open recommendations have action plans that are directly linked to the Financial Systems Transformation project (FSTP).

FSTP is an enterprise endeavor to undergo a financial transformation, enabled by modern technologies that will meet current and future business needs. This includes standardizing finance processes, modernizing the finance operating model, and streamlining the underlying financial technology platform to ensure consistent access to timely financial information in an efficient and effective system.

The current system, SAP ECC, is reaching end of life in 2027 and through FSTP the new SAP S/4 HANA system will be implemented and there are 6 key areas of business processes:

1. Acquire to Retire - The process group for recognizing capital assets and managing assets through their financial lifecycle including depreciation, impairment and retirement.
2. Record to Report - The process group for recording financial transactions, financial statement preparation, consolidations and management and statutory reporting.
3. Treasury - The process group for planning, organizing and managing the City's operating, capital and reserve funds.

4. Service to Cash - The process group for recognizing and collecting revenue from the delivery of City services.
5. Procure to Pay - The process group for buying services and goods, including procurement strategy definition and execution, service/goods receipt, invoice payment and analysis.
6. Integration with ARIBA Buying & Invoicing

Phase 1 Design (Imagine) was completed in June 2022. FSTP is currently Phase 2 Build to Deploy

Go-Live of the new financial system is targeted to go live in Q4 2025.

### **Next Steps:**

The Internal Audit Division will continue to monitor management's progress on the implementation of outstanding recommendations. Senior Leadership and Division heads will be required to report on progress in each reporting cycle and results will be provided to regularly scheduled Audit Committee meetings, approximately 2 times a year.

### **CONTACT**

---

Gifford Chu, Manager, Internal Audit, Telephone:416-397-0301, [Gifford.chu@toronto.ca](mailto:Gifford.chu@toronto.ca)

Stuart Campbell, Director, Internal Audit, Telephone:416-392-8034, [Stuart.Campbell@toronto.ca](mailto:Stuart.Campbell@toronto.ca)

### **SIGNATURE**

---

Stuart Campbell  
Director, Internal Audit

### **ATTACHMENTS**

---

Appendix A – Detailed Status of Outstanding Recommendations  
Appendix B – List of KPMG Observations in chronological order

## Appendix A – Detailed Status of Outstanding Recommendations

Open – 19 recommendations:

### Need to enhance financial acumen

| No.                  | Recommendation                                    | Current Status                                                                                                                                                | Action Plan Going Forward                                                                      |
|----------------------|---------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>#4<br/>(2020)</b> | Need to strengthen the financial reporting acumen | Accounting Services released a security deposits policy and training which included year end procedures for divisions to follow to support year end balances. | Revenue recognition policy is expected to be delivered late 2025 in time for the new standard. |

### Centralization of transaction processing & streamlining labour intensive and inefficient manual processes

| No.                   | Recommendation                                                                               | Current Status/ Interim Measures                                                                                                                                                          | Plan going forward                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|-----------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>#58<br/>(2021)</b> | Need of a streamlined process for preparation of Long-Term Care Annual Reconciliation Report | Long Term Care continues to work with Accounting Services to streamline the process. Controls are in place whereby SDFA and SSLTC work to ensure financial data is accurate and complete. | FSTP will look to standardize and possible efficiencies for processes and data fields. Finalized fields and system controls will be implemented in S/4 HANA once processes are refined by the business and deployed as part of FSTP launch in Q4 2025. |

### Improved financial policies and procedures

| No.                   | Recommendation                                                                 | Current Status/ Interim Measures                                                                                             | Plan going forward                                                                    |
|-----------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>#10<br/>(2020)</b> | Consistent processes for procurement, payroll & governance at all Agencies and | The City provides A&C best practices, guidelines and templates, to support consistent transactional processes across the A&C | The City is working with A&C to develop an overall strategy for consistent processes. |

|                       |                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|-----------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                       | Corporations required                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| <b>#13<br/>(2020)</b> | Procurement process needs to be consistent                                                            | The Purchasing Bylaw has been revised and updated following a thorough examination and will bolster the consistency of procurement process.                                                                                                                   | Streamlined processes are part of the P2P stream, working with FSTP and PMMD to review and assess where standardization and efficiencies can be put in place. Anticipated implementation of P2P and Ariba Buying and Invoicing will be aligned with the S/4HANA launch in Q4 2025 based on integrations design between S/4HANA and ARIBA system. |
| <b>#14<br/>(2020)</b> | In-depth assessment of current procurement process should be undertaken                               | The Purchasing Bylaw has been revised and updated following a thorough examination and will bolster the consistency of procurement process.                                                                                                                   | Streamlined processes are part of the P2P stream, working with FSTP and PMMD to review and assess where standardization and efficiencies can be put in place. Anticipated implementation of P2P and Ariba Buying and Invoicing will be aligned with the S/4HANA launch in Q4 2025 based on integrations design between S/4HANA and ARIBA system. |
| <b>#15<br/>(2020)</b> | Reduce the risk of misappropriation by ensuring supplier invoice is received before payment is issued | A process innovation project (PIP) to streamline the City's Accounts Payable function has been started. The combination of FSTP, as well as the PIP are predicted to standardize the process for how invoices are processed and paid across the organization. | Streamlined processes are part of the P2P stream, working with FSTP and PMMD to review and assess where standardization and efficiencies can be put in place. Anticipated implementation of P2P and Ariba Buying and Invoicing will be aligned with the S/4HANA launch in Q4 2025 based on integrations design between S/4HANA and ARIBA system. |
| <b>#36<br/>(2020)</b> | Current bank accounts should be reviewed and assessed                                                 | The project team is working through the G/L and Electronic banking process.                                                                                                                                                                                   | Once FSTP system capabilities are known, the rationalization of bank accounts can begin. Expected completion is Q4 2025.<br><br>ASD will review bank accounts and related processes to                                                                                                                                                           |

|                       |                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|-----------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                       |                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | determine potential enhancement opportunities.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| <b>#49<br/>(2020)</b> | TCA policy needs to be revised and updated                                                   | Several year-end process changes were developed and implemented to streamline how information regarding capital transactions could be disclosed to Accounting Services.                                                                                                                                                                                          | TCA policy update will be developed based on the final system design of the Acquire to Retire process stream. Updates to TCA policy will be significant in nature and may span over more than one fiscal year. Accounting Services anticipates starting work on TCA policy in 2025. |
| <b>#50<br/>(2020)</b> | Appropriate process to determine completion of TCA Assets Under Construction items is needed | Accounting Services developed and provided TCA - related training which focused on the City's TCA policy and related processes to City employees.                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Will continue on the end-to-end process changes as part of the FSTP project to modernize how project statuses are ultimately tracked and leveraged to support accounting treatment decisions.                                                                                       |
| <b>#52<br/>(2020)</b> | All known assets should be booked into the SAP system                                        | Accounting Services has enhanced review of GL transactions not reported by divisions                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Accounting Services will continue to work with divisions to ensure that TCA subledger is reflective of accurate and complete asset records and that TCA related entries are completed properly.                                                                                     |
| <b>#53<br/>(2020)</b> | Need for TCA related transactions to be integrated with TCA reporting                        | Accounting Services enhanced its TCA training for City employees to allow City employees to identify and account for disposals and impairment. The TCA accounting process was updated to incorporate additional engagement requirements to ensure that City divisions could disclose potential and/or confirmed disposals and impairments to Accounting Services | Recognizing the gain or loss on sale of TCA will be included within the overarching TCA policy. Updates to TCA policy will be significant in nature and may span over more than one fiscal year. Accounting Services anticipates starting work on TCA policy in 2025.               |

|                       |                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|-----------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>#66<br/>(2023)</b> | Implement a formal policy for transfer of completed assets detailing how WBS codes should be used to track a project. | The City has implemented changes in fiscal 2024, including the introduction of a mid-year project status validation process, and enhancements to existing training materials and resources. | As part of the Financial Systems Transformation Program, the City will be developing a master data governance policy and related procedures for coding blocks, including WBS elements, to ensure that City divisions account for and report on their expenditures in a consistent manner. |
| <b>#69<br/>(2023)</b> | Revoke access to systems in a timely manner.                                                                          | Communication issued to all leaders at the City of Toronto with respect to the importance of revoking employee access to City systems in a timely manner.                                   | Mandating the formal creation of tickets within the IT service management tool by Q4 2025                                                                                                                                                                                                 |

### Clear roles & responsibilities for the recording of financial transactions

| No.                   | Recommendation                                                                      | Current Status/ Interim Measures                                                                                                                                            | Plan going forward                                                                                                                                               |
|-----------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>#5<br/>(2020)</b>  | Need to establish formal process to validate and update indirect tax coding         | Accounting Services is working on training materials for divisional finance staff to understand the proper use of tax codes and when commodity tax advice should be sought. | Commodity tax requirements have been developed and provided to FSTP in order to maximize rebates.<br><br>Training materials to be published before 2025-year end |
| <b>#8<br/>(2020)</b>  | Need to centralize oversight of land management from an operational perspective.    | The City provides A&C best practices, guidelines and templates, to support consistent oversight across the A&C                                                              | The City is working with A&C to develop an overall strategy for oversight and governance.                                                                        |
| <b>#12<br/>(2020)</b> | Financial information reported and level of detail disclosed needs to be consistent | The City provides A&C best practices, guidelines and templates, to support consistent financial reporting across the A&C                                                    | The City is working with A&C to develop an overall strategy for consistent financial reporting.                                                                  |
| <b>#16<br/>(2020)</b> | Need to reduce rework and have                                                      | The Purchasing Bylaw has been revised and updated following a thorough                                                                                                      | Streamlined processes are part of the P2P stream, working with FSTP and PMMD to review and                                                                       |

|                       |                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
|-----------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                       | appropriate controls in place                                                                            | examination and will bolster the consistency of procurement process.                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | assess where standardization and efficiencies can be put in place. Anticipated implementation of P2P and Ariba Buying and Invoicing will be aligned with the S/4HANA launch in Q4 2025 based on integrations design between S/4HANA and ARIBA system.                                                                                                                                                       |
| <b>#51<br/>(2020)</b> | Useful lives used for amortization should be consistent with TCA accounting policy                       | Accounting Services continues to work closely with City divisions to inquire about significant changes to useful life estimates. Changes to useful life estimates which were considered to be significant in nature were also reflected in the City's consolidated financial statements. | Further work on the TCA policy will be completed in subsequent years to ensure that the changes are aligned with industry best practices and stakeholder requirements, as well as the City's consultations with the external auditors. Updates to TCA policy will be significant in nature and may span over more than one fiscal year. Accounting Services anticipates starting work on TCA policy in 2025 |
| <b>#67<br/>(2023)</b> | Implement a robust document retention policy that clearly defines the types of documents to be retained. | Reviewing existing processes, and developing / updating where necessary, to ensure source documentation is retained.                                                                                                                                                                     | Document and communicate updated processes to all relevant staff and assigning clear responsibilities related to document retention by November 2025.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |

## Closed – 55 recommendations

| No.                  | Recommendation                                                                                              | Action Plan                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Validated by Internal Audit |
|----------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| <b>#1<br/>(2020)</b> | Need to invest in creating awareness of roles & responsibilities related to financial reporting activities  | Accounting Services Division has taken a proactive approach to realign and restructure the roles and responsibilities associated with financial reporting. This restructure aims to implement best practices by updating policies and providing targeted training to staff across various levels to ensure they understand the updated processes and their accountability. | ✓                           |
| <b>#2<br/>(2020)</b> | Appropriate level of accounting & finance knowledge and understanding required                              | Accounting Services Division has: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Developed comprehensive ELI trainings covering financial acumen, principles, SAP</li> <li>- Updated and communicated new policies for key financial reporting matters</li> <li>- Provided targeted training to ensure specialized staff understand the new policies/standards.</li> </ul>       | ✓                           |
| <b>#3<br/>(2020)</b> | Process to consolidate the books & records is outdated                                                      | An updated process and improvements to consolidation workbook and consolidated entity reporting packages has been developed to ensure the timeliness and completeness of the consolidation activities at the divisional and at the A&Cs levels.                                                                                                                            | ✓                           |
| <b>#6<br/>(2020)</b> | Internally inconsistent assumptions impairing the usefulness of information                                 | Monthly updates on core inflation rate, borrowing rates and expected ROI on internal website. The intranet web page can be found at <a href="http://insideto.toronto.ca/capital-markets/proxy-rates.htm">http://insideto.toronto.ca/capital-markets/proxy-rates.htm</a>                                                                                                    | ✓                           |
| <b>#7<br/>(2020)</b> | Need a formalized process to harmonize financial information reported under different accounting standards. | Updated consolidation process implemented that identifies framework-related differences and ensures that they are addressed as part of the consolidation processes; effectively harmonizing the accounting practices.                                                                                                                                                      | ✓                           |

|                       |                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |   |
|-----------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---|
| <b>#9<br/>(2020)</b>  | Appropriate and accurate reporting related to Tangible Capital Assets (TCA) and non-monetary transactions at Agencies and Corporations level required | An A&C-specific reporting package was created to facilitate accurate reporting and disclosures                                                                                                                                                                                   | ✓ |
| <b>#11<br/>(2020)</b> | Appropriate reconciliation of related party balances required                                                                                         | An updated consolidation process was implemented that includes schedules to account for A&Cs' transactions with the City and its other entities, so that complex issues are addressed in a timely manner rather than year-end only.                                              | ✓ |
| <b>#17<br/>(2020)</b> | Incorporate cross training and have clear record of job responsibilities.                                                                             | CPA training has been developed and launched. Assessment of city employee financial acumen and required training will be an ongoing process.                                                                                                                                     | ✓ |
| <b>#18<br/>(2020)</b> | Existing talent needs to be better utilized                                                                                                           | CPA training has been developed and launched. Assessment of city employee financial acumen and ensuring employees are hired on required skill and expertise will be an ongoing exercise.                                                                                         | ✓ |
| <b>#19<br/>(2020)</b> | Preferred amortization practices should be shared with the actuary                                                                                    | The City shared its preferred amortization practices and principles with the actuary to ensure amortization amount booked each year is accurate. Lifeworks has compiled the historic Amortization Schedules for the period 2003 to 2021 and will update them on an annual basis. | ✓ |
| <b>#20<br/>(2020)</b> | Need for entity specific discount rates                                                                                                               | Appropriate discount rates applied. Effective December 31, 2021, the discount rate method was changed to reflect different discount rates for the various entities under the City of Toronto (for each of the benefits).                                                         | ✓ |
| <b>#21<br/>(2020)</b> | E-time module needs to be used consistently                                                                                                           | Implementation of the O365 platform.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | ✓ |

|                       |                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |   |
|-----------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---|
| <b>#22<br/>(2020)</b> | Standardization of architecture is required                                                        | In order to support standardization of architecture, Service Intake process and Enterprise Architecture Review Board which is a governing body with Office of CISO members have been launched City-wide.                                                  | ✓ |
| <b>#23<br/>(2020)</b> | Closer alignment required between IT strategic Plans and Business Area Plans                       | TSD refreshed Vision, Mission, Strategic Pillars, and Priorities. In-flight programs/ projects and new business cases are mapped to the strategic priorities.                                                                                             | ✓ |
| <b>#24<br/>(2020)</b> | Internal Audit involvement in IT projects limited to post-implementation reviews                   | Internal Audit to hire an IT Manager to increase audit involvement and advice for key IT projects.                                                                                                                                                        | ✓ |
| <b>#25<br/>(2020)</b> | Terminated users need to be removed from active directory and at SAP level on a timely basis       | Business requirements have been refined and processes have been defined, documented, and automated where applicable.                                                                                                                                      | ✓ |
| <b>#26<br/>(2020)</b> | Periodic user re-certification of the SAP ECC application is needed                                | To ensure access commensurate with job responsibilities, an annual SAP User Access Review process and access certification across city divisions including Toronto Police Services (TPS) has been launched. Annual checks are being conducted on SAP ECC. | ✓ |
| <b>#27<br/>(2020)</b> | Super User accounts require to be monitored                                                        | In order to enhance monitoring, a process has been implemented for managing super user accounts.                                                                                                                                                          | ✓ |
| <b>#28<br/>(2020)</b> | Segregation of duties required between development and deployment functions within SAP application | Segregation of duty was completed. At the City, Segregations of Duties is controlled and monitored through a manual process. SOD process is provided to KPMG as part of the audit evidence.                                                               | ✓ |
| <b>#29<br/>(2020)</b> | All IT incidents should get timely resolution                                                      | A source system is being used to monitor the response/resolution time as per SLA.                                                                                                                                                                         | ✓ |
| <b>#30<br/>(2020)</b> | Formal process to communicate accounting policies and procedures                                   | New policies are being published on Accounting Services website and training on ELI with distribution to CLT and finance teams via email. Each new policy announcement is supplemented with training resources to                                         | ✓ |

|                       |                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |   |
|-----------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---|
|                       | should be established                                                                      | ensure staff understand their roles and responsibilities in implementing policies.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |   |
| <b>#31<br/>(2020)</b> | Need to set a mandate for treasury functions                                               | New roles have been introduced, some roles have been re-aligned, staffing increased, and policies have been created/updated to reflect the future state of financial reporting within the City. ELI materials to further ensure staff understand the standards behind their roles/responsibilities have been introduced | ✓ |
| <b>#32<br/>(2020)</b> | Timely completion of bank reconciliations                                                  | Banking Governance policy has been finalized which includes monthly bank reconciliation process.                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | ✓ |
| <b>#33<br/>(2020)</b> | Appropriate implementation of \$ threshold for bank reconciliations                        | Banking Governance policy has been finalized, and all bank accounts must be reconciled ( no threshold).                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | ✓ |
| <b>#34<br/>(2020)</b> | Timely review of bank reconciliations                                                      | Banking Governance policy has been finalized which includes monthly bank reconciliation process.                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | ✓ |
| <b>#35<br/>(2020)</b> | Complete list of all bank accounts should be developed                                     | An inventory of bank accounts has been created.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | ✓ |
| <b>#37<br/>(2020)</b> | Appropriate oversight over petty cash accounts required to manage risk of misappropriation | Review of petty cash has been completed. It identified the need for policy and procedure updates to ensure timely reporting and monitoring of petty cash balances.                                                                                                                                                      | ✓ |
| <b>#38<br/>(2020)</b> | Complete record of all bank accounts required                                              | Review of bank accounts was completed. The city now has a complete listing of all active bank accounts.                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | ✓ |
| <b>#39<br/>(2020)</b> | Petty Cash Policy should be updated                                                        | Petty Cash Policy updated to include timely reporting and monitoring of petty cash balances.                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | ✓ |
| <b>#40<br/>(2020)</b> | Clearly defined roles and appropriate training and knowledge for bank accounts             | Review of bank accounts was completed, and Banking Governance policy has been finalized.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | ✓ |
| <b>#41<br/>(2020)</b> | Cash flow forecasting processes require improvement                                        | The cash flow forecast is updated twice a day to ensure prior day actuals and intraday bank records are accurately captured in the forecast. If any significant variances or unanticipated                                                                                                                              | ✓ |

|                       |                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |   |
|-----------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---|
|                       |                                                                                                                                         | cash flows are identified, an incident is logged and investigated through the banking team to ensure no future re-occurrences.                                                                                                                         |   |
| <b>#42<br/>(2020)</b> | Designated resources required to manage the accounting and reporting of investments                                                     | Accounting Services has assigned staff with a fuller understanding of investment accounting. This individual will be responsible for the investment portion of the City's consolidated financial statements.                                           | ✓ |
| <b>#43<br/>(2020)</b> | Unreconciled differences in the investment cost base reported by the Custodian and Investment manager needs to be tackled               | Unreconciled differences due to implementing of new standard PSAB 3450 and amortization are investigated and resolved. Investment balances are reconciled per SAP, G/L and third-party reports and there were no outstanding unreconciled differences. | ✓ |
| <b>#44<br/>(2020)</b> | Need for better reconciliation of Claims database and SAP                                                                               | New RMIS (ClearRisk) has been implemented. Business process document has been completed; including steps to track SAP doc number in RMIS to reconcile financial transactions with SAP.                                                                 | ✓ |
| <b>#45<br/>(2020)</b> | Records of the Claims database should be reconciled on a regular basis to ensure accuracy and consistency of records                    | New position approved and hired in May 2023 to manage data quality for the Claims database.                                                                                                                                                            | ✓ |
| <b>#46<br/>(2020)</b> | Ensure risks incorporated in estimating Property and Liability Claims liability are comprehensive and reflective of current environment | The class action certification motion against the city was dismissed. IRM is monitoring all class actions and currently has adequate reserves for potential plaintiffs recommending action.                                                            | ✓ |
| <b>#47<br/>(2020)</b> | Ensure discount rate consistent with the industry                                                                                       | Discount rate used is the City's rate of return estimate for long term funds and KMPG concurred with this discount rate.                                                                                                                               | ✓ |
| <b>#48<br/>(2020)</b> | Appropriate oversight and planning related to future funding needs is required                                                          | Changes to the full cost allocation of insurance program cost has been implemented since the 2022 budget.                                                                                                                                              | ✓ |

|                       |                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |   |
|-----------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---|
| <b>#54<br/>(2020)</b> | Complete listing/<br>central repository of<br>all leases required                                                           | Updated Reporting Package introduced to<br>enhances the collection of financial information<br>pertaining to all leases. TCA template and<br>training also provided to ensure staff<br>understands the reporting requirements.<br>Corporate Real Estate Management maintains<br>all capital leases repository. | ✓ |
| <b>#55<br/>(2020)</b> | Need for all financial<br>information be<br>recorded in SAP<br>financial reporting<br>system                                | All financial records and adjustments related to<br>sinking funds and trust funds have been<br>booked into SAP ECC financial system for year<br>end 2023. Sinking and Trust fund accounts are<br>complete and reconciled prior to entry on SAP<br>ECC system.                                                  | ✓ |
| <b>#56<br/>(2021)</b> | Improve financial<br>policies and<br>procedures for<br>tracking and<br>recognizing revenue<br>from government<br>transfers  | Process for tracking and recognizing revenue<br>from government transfers includes a new<br>centralized template with comprehensive<br>instructions is provided to divisions to compile<br>and investigate any variances to ensure<br>accurate and timely reconciliations.                                     | ✓ |
| <b>#57<br/>(2021)</b> | City should assess<br>and mitigate the<br>potential risk of<br>incomplete and<br>inaccurate data.                           | IRM has implemented extensive quality<br>processes and procedures to mitigate any<br>potential risk arising from incomplete or<br>inaccurate data.                                                                                                                                                             | ✓ |
| <b>#59<br/>(2021)</b> | Improve financial<br>policies and<br>procedures to<br>reduce delays in<br>recording legal<br>expenses                       | The current process for legal invoices meets<br>industry practices. IRM has implemented<br>extensive quality processes and procedures to<br>mitigate any potential risk arising from<br>incomplete or inaccurate data. The Data<br>Quality Work Group ensures that the data is<br>reconciled.                  | ✓ |
| <b>#60<br/>(2021)</b> | Consistency<br>regarding inclusion<br>of indirect tax on the<br>future commitments<br>note disclosure<br>required           | Year-end reporting templates have been<br>updated to incorporate further instructions<br>regarding the disclosure of indirect taxes.                                                                                                                                                                           | ✓ |
| <b>#61<br/>(2022)</b> | Divisional staff<br>should develop<br>better<br>understanding<br>relating to the<br>appropriate timing of<br>recognition of | Introduced training at the divisional level to<br>enhance staff's knowledge of the appropriate<br>accounting treatment and timing of tangible<br>capital assets recognitions as mandated by<br>PSAS 3150. Furthermore, introduced TCA<br>templates to streamline the process.                                  | ✓ |

|                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |   |
|-----------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---|
|                       | tangible capital assets.                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |   |
| <b>#62<br/>(2022)</b> | Ensure staff understands the criteria for capitalizing assets, including land acquisitions                                                                                                                | Developed comprehensive training for TCA contacts. This training walked staff through the complete product life cycle of capital assets including amortization, retirement obligations, and how to assess if an expenditure is to be expensed or capitalized. | ✓ |
| <b>#63<br/>(2022)</b> | Ensure access of terminated employees is revoked in a timely manner                                                                                                                                       | Replaced the existing Novell solution with a new tool to improve this process.                                                                                                                                                                                | ✓ |
| <b>#64<br/>(2022)</b> | Ensure appropriate level of segregation of duties between development and deployment functions within the SAP application                                                                                 | A semi-annual process has been developed to review and identify for any breaches of Segregation of Duties. In cases where the developer and importer are the same user, we will follow up to ensure appropriate rationale is documented.                      | ✓ |
| <b>#65<br/>(2022)</b> | Ensure that the inflation factor applied to future claims payments is reflective of the current economic environment, is in line with the overall borrowing rate of the City and is applied consistently. | Benchmark rate discussed with KPMG and confirmation from KPMG that the Inflation factor used by the City's actuary is appropriate and to be used consistently in determining any liability.                                                                   | ✓ |
| <b>#68<br/>(2023)</b> | Actuary or the City of Toronto should enhance the procedures about data sufficiency and reliability.                                                                                                      | Data quality and reconciliation procedures have been enhanced.                                                                                                                                                                                                | ✓ |
| <b>#70<br/>(2023)</b> | Implement procedures to retain evidence of user access list                                                                                                                                               | UAR reports are published, and Managers review them by filling out relevant columns as per instructions.                                                                                                                                                      | ✓ |
| <b>#71<br/>(2023)</b> | Implement segregation of duties between                                                                                                                                                                   | A new configuration has been implemented to ensure segregation of duties.                                                                                                                                                                                     | ✓ |

|                   |                                                             |                                                                                        |   |
|-------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---|
|                   | development and deployment within the SAP application       |                                                                                        |   |
| <b>#72 (2023)</b> | Frequently review of user access                            | Account Monitoring Process performed semi-annually.                                    | ✓ |
| <b>#73 (2023)</b> | Implement monitoring process for open/outstanding incidents | Incident Management Dashboard within ServiceNow to monitor open/outstanding incidents. | ✓ |
| <b>#74 (2023)</b> | Retain evidence of ServiceNow's SOC report review.          | Process in place to retain evidence of ServiceNow's SOC report review.                 | ✓ |

## Appendix B – KPMG Recommendations In Chronological Order

| Year        | No. | Title                                                        | Audit Findings                                                                                             |
|-------------|-----|--------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>2020</b> | 1   | City's Books and records                                     | Need to invest in creating awareness of roles & responsibilities related to financial reporting activities |
| <b>2020</b> | 2   | City's financial and treasury function - Technical Expertise | Appropriate level of accounting & finance knowledge and understanding required                             |
| <b>2020</b> | 3   | Accounting Services - Consolidation Process                  | Process to consolidate the books & records is outdated                                                     |
| <b>2020</b> | 4   | Revenue Recognition                                          | Need to strengthen the financial reporting acumen                                                          |
| <b>2020</b> | 5   | Indirect Tax                                                 | Need to establish formal process to validate and update indirect tax coding                                |
| <b>2020</b> | 6   | Forecasting - Use of Consistent Assumptions                  | Internally inconsistent assumptions impairing the usefulness of information                                |
| <b>2020</b> | 7   | Agencies & Corporations - Reporting                          | Need a formalized process to harmonize financial information reported under different accounting standards |
| <b>2020</b> | 8   | Agencies & Corporations - Land Mgmt. Strategy                | Need to centralize oversight of land management from an operational perspective                            |

|             |    |                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|-------------|----|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>2020</b> | 9  | Agencies & Corporations - Tangible Capital Assets & Non-Monetary Transactions | Appropriate and accurate reporting related to TCA and non-monetary transactions at A&C level required                                                                                                                                                    |
| <b>2020</b> | 10 | Agencies & Corporations – Processes                                           | Consistent processes for procurement, payroll & governance at different A&Cs required                                                                                                                                                                    |
| <b>2020</b> | 11 | Agencies & Corporations - Related Party Balances                              | Appropriate reconciliation of related party balances required                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| <b>2020</b> | 12 | Agencies & Corporations - Financial Reporting                                 | Financial information reported and level of detail disclosed needs to be consistent                                                                                                                                                                      |
| <b>2020</b> | 13 | Purchasing Process Control Observations – Inconsistency                       | Procurement process needs to be consistent                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| <b>2020</b> | 14 | Procurement Process - Delay in Processing                                     | In-depth assessment of current procurement process should be undertaken                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| <b>2020</b> | 15 | Procurement Process - Lack of Supplier Invoice                                | Reduce the risk of misappropriation by ensuring supplier invoice is received before payment is issued                                                                                                                                                    |
| <b>2020</b> | 16 | Procurement Process - Rework                                                  | Need to reduce rework and have appropriate controls in place                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| <b>2020</b> | 17 | Human Resource Mgmt. - Employee Cross Training                                | Incorporate cross training and have clear record of job responsibilities                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| <b>2020</b> | 18 | Human Resource Mgmt. - Employee Skill Inventory                               | Existing talent needs to be better utilized                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| <b>2020</b> | 19 | Employee Benefit Obligations - Amortization Schedules                         | Current process of tracking amortization schedules separately by the City increases risk of error. The City should share its preferred amortization practices and principles with the actuary to ensure amortization amount booked each year is accurate |
| <b>2020</b> | 20 | Employee Benefit Obligation - Discount Rate                                   | Lack of entity specific discount rates                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| <b>2020</b> | 21 | Payroll Records - eTime                                                       | E-time module needs to be used consistently                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| <b>2020</b> | 22 | IT Governance - System Architecture                                           | Diverse architecture systems being used which make it difficult to implement enterprise solutions                                                                                                                                                        |
| <b>2020</b> | 23 | IT Governance - IT Strategy                                                   | Closer alignment required between IT strategic Plans and Business Area Plans                                                                                                                                                                             |

|             |    |                                                               |                                                                                                              |
|-------------|----|---------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>2020</b> | 24 | IT Governance - Internal Audit                                | Internal Audit involvement in IT projects limited to post-implementation reviews                             |
| <b>2020</b> | 25 | IT Security - Terminated Employees                            | Terminated users need to be removed from active directory and at SAP level on a timely basis                 |
| <b>2020</b> | 26 | IT Security - User Access                                     | Excessive access or segregation of duties conflict                                                           |
| <b>2020</b> | 27 | IT Security - Super User Access                               | No monitoring performed over the usage of shared generic accounts                                            |
| <b>2020</b> | 28 | IT Security - Program Changes                                 | Segregation of duties required between development and deployment functions within SAP application           |
| <b>2020</b> | 29 | IT Support - Incident Resolution                              | No policy requirement for SLA related to incident response/ resolution for service requests raised on Solman |
| <b>2020</b> | 30 | Corporate Reporting - Accounting Policy Communication Process | Formal process to communicate accounting policies and procedures should be established                       |
| <b>2020</b> | 31 | Treasury Function                                             | Need to set a mandate for treasury functions                                                                 |
| <b>2020</b> | 32 | Bank Reconciliation                                           | Timely completion of bank reconciliation required                                                            |
| <b>2020</b> | 33 | Bank Reconciliation - Threshold                               | Appropriate implementation of \$ threshold required                                                          |
| <b>2020</b> | 34 | Bank Reconciliation - Review Process                          | Timely review of bank reconciliations is needed                                                              |
| <b>2020</b> | 35 | Inventory of Bank Accounts                                    | Complete list of all bank accounts should be developed                                                       |
| <b>2020</b> | 36 | Extraneous Bank Accounts                                      | Current bank accounts should be reviewed and assessed                                                        |
| <b>2020</b> | 37 | Petty Cash Accounts                                           | Appropriate oversight over petty cash accounts required to manage risk of misappropriation                   |
| <b>2020</b> | 38 | Bank Confirmation                                             | Complete record of all bank accounts required                                                                |
| <b>2020</b> | 39 | Petty Cash Accounts - Policy                                  | Petty Cash Policy should be updated                                                                          |
| <b>2020</b> | 40 | Trust Bank Reconciliation                                     | Need for clearly defined roles and appropriate training and knowledge                                        |

|             |    |                                                                     |                                                                                                                                          |
|-------------|----|---------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>2020</b> | 41 | Cash Flow Forecasting - Short term Vs Long Term investments         | Cash flow forecasting processes require improvement                                                                                      |
| <b>2020</b> | 42 | Investments - Accountability                                        | Designated resources required to manage the accounting and reporting of investments                                                      |
| <b>2020</b> | 43 | Investments - Reconciliation between custodian & investment manager | Unreconciled differences in the investment cost base reported by the Custodian and Investment manager needs to be tackled                |
| <b>2020</b> | 44 | Property & Liability Claims - Systems                               | Need for better reconciliation of Claims database and SAP                                                                                |
| <b>2020</b> | 45 | Property & Liability Claims - Data Reliability & Accuracy           | Records of the Claims database should be reconciled on a regular basis to ensure accuracy and consistency of records                     |
| <b>2020</b> | 46 | Property & Liability Claims - COVID -19                             | Ensure risks incorporated in estimating Property and Liability Claims liability are comprehensive and reflective of current environment  |
| <b>2020</b> | 47 | Property & Liability Claims - Discount Rate                         | Lack of oversight for the assumptions used by the Actuary and lack of inconsistency in discount rate used to estimate future liabilities |
| <b>2020</b> | 48 | Property & Liability Claims - Funded Liability                      | Appropriate oversight and planning related to future funding needs is required                                                           |
| <b>2020</b> | 49 | Tangible Capital Assets - Accounting Policy                         | TCA policy needs to be revised and updated                                                                                               |
| <b>2020</b> | 50 | Tangible Capital Assets - Assets Under Construction (AUC)           | Appropriate process to determine completion of AUC items is needed                                                                       |
| <b>2020</b> | 51 | Tangible Capital Assets - Amortization                              | Useful lives used for amortization should be consistent with TCA accounting policy                                                       |
| <b>2020</b> | 52 | Tangible Capital Assets - Completeness of Tangible Capital Assets   | All known assets should be booked into the SAP system                                                                                    |
| <b>2020</b> | 53 | Tangible Capital Assets - Gain and Loss                             | Need for TCA related transactions to be integrated with TCA reporting                                                                    |
| <b>2020</b> | 54 | Commitments                                                         | Complete listing/ central repository of all operating leases required                                                                    |
| <b>2020</b> | 55 | Sinking Fund and Trust Fund                                         | Need for all financial information be recorded in SAP financial reporting system                                                         |
| <b>2021</b> | 1  | Government Transfers                                                | Improve financial policies and procedures for tracking and recognizing revenue from government transfers                                 |

|                   |   |                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
|-------------------|---|------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>2021</b>       | 2 | Legal Claims Liability                                     | City should assess and mitigate the potential risk of incomplete and inaccurate data                                                                                                                        |
| <b>2021</b>       | 3 | Long Term Care Homes                                       | Need of a streamlined process for preparation of Long-Term Care Annual Reconciliation Report                                                                                                                |
| <b>2021</b>       | 4 | Liabilities Claims – legal expenses                        | Improve financial policies and procedures to reduce delays in recording legal expenses                                                                                                                      |
| <b>2021</b>       | 5 | Commitments - Indirect Tax                                 | Consistency regarding inclusion of indirect tax on the future commitments note disclosure required                                                                                                          |
| <b>2022</b>       | 1 | Tangible Capital Assets - Disposals                        | Divisional staff should develop better understanding relating to the appropriate timing of recognition of tangible capital assets                                                                           |
| <b>2022<br/>1</b> | 2 | Tangible Capital Assets - Land Acquisition Costs           | Ensure staff understands the criteria for capitalizing assets, including land acquisitions                                                                                                                  |
| <b>2022</b>       | 3 | IT Security – Access Deprovisioning                        | Implement a system/ workflow to ensure access of terminated employees is revoked in a timely manner                                                                                                         |
| <b>2022</b>       | 4 | IT Security - Segregation of duties in change management   | Ensure appropriate level of segregation of duties between development and deployment functions within the SAP application                                                                                   |
| <b>2022</b>       | 5 | Property and Liability Claims – Estimates                  | Ensure that the inflation factor applied to future claims payments is reflective of the current economic environment and is in line with the overall borrowing rate of the City and is applied consistently |
| <b>2023</b>       | 1 | Assets Under Constructions – Transfers                     | Provide training to ensure staff understand the indicators for transfer to completed assets.                                                                                                                |
| <b>2023</b>       | 2 | Asset retirement Obligation Testing – Source documentation | Implement a robust document retention policy                                                                                                                                                                |
| <b>2023</b>       | 3 | Property and Liability Claims – Estimates                  | Enhance the procedures around data sufficiency and reliability                                                                                                                                              |
| <b>2023</b>       | 4 | IT Security – Access Deprovisioning                        | Implement a formal monitoring process over automated workflow to revoke access                                                                                                                              |

|             |   |                                                          |                                                                                                            |
|-------------|---|----------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>2023</b> | 5 | IT Security – User Access                                | Modify procedures to retain evidence of completeness and accuracy of user access                           |
| <b>2023</b> | 6 | IT Security – Segregation of Duties in Change Management | Design and implement appropriate segregation of duties between change development and deployment functions |
| <b>2023</b> | 7 | IT Security – Super User Access                          | Identify and rectify any inappropriate access                                                              |
| <b>2023</b> | 8 | IT Security – Incident Resolution                        | Implement a monitoring process for open/long outstanding incidents                                         |
| <b>2023</b> | 9 | IT Support – ServiceNow SOC Report                       | Implement a process to review the SOC report                                                               |