

Evaluation and Scoring of the Negotiated Request for Proposals for the Provision of Winter Maintenance Services

Date: July 23, 2025

To: City Council

From: General Manager, Transportation Services and Chief Procurement Officer,
Purchasing & Materials Management

Wards: All

REASON FOR CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION

The confidential attachments to this report are about litigation or potential litigation that affects the City of Toronto.

The confidential attachments to this report also contain trade secrets or secret technical, commercial, financial or labour relations information, supplied in confidence to the City of Toronto, which, if disclosed, could reasonably be expected to prejudice significantly the competitive position or interfere significantly with the contractual or other negotiations of a person, group of persons, or organization.

SUMMARY

Further to the July 11, 2025, Motion at Audit Committee the General Manager, Transportation Services, in consultation with the Chief Procurement Officer, provide the following information:

- a. Documents showing the detailed review of scoring and evaluation of the Negotiated Request for Proposals for Winter Maintenance contracted services;
- b. Technical requirements that staff used in the Negotiated Request for Proposals; and,
- c. Documents related to how vendors scored.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The General Manager, Transportation Services, and the Chief Procurement Officer, Purchasing & Materials Management, recommend that:

1. City Council direct that the confidential information contained in Confidential Attachments 1 and 2 remain confidential in their entirety as they contain information provided to the City in confidence and/or may be subject to potential litigation.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

There is no financial impact resulting from the adoption of the recommendation.

The Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer has reviewed this report and agrees with the financial impact information.

DECISION HISTORY

On July 11, 2025, the Audit Committee requested that the General Manager, Transportation Services, report directly to the July 23, 24, and 25, 2025 meeting of City Council with documents showing the detailed review of scoring and evaluation of the Negotiated Request for Proposals for Winter Maintenance contracted services, along with technical requirements used in the Negotiated Request for Proposals, and documents related to how vendors scored.

<https://secure.toronto.ca/council/agenda-item.do?item=2025.AU9.6>

On July 19 and 20, 2023, City Council considered a report from the Auditor General with the findings and recommendations related to the review of the procurement and award of the Winter Maintenance performance-based contracts.

<https://secure.toronto.ca/council/agenda-item.do?item=2023.AU2.5>

On December 15, 16, and 17, 2021, City Council authorized the General Manager, Transportation Services to negotiate, enter into, and execute agreements for Winter Maintenance services, based on the terms and conditions set out in the Negotiated Requests for Proposals Doc2970598171 and Doc3136860258, and on such other terms and conditions satisfactory to the General Manager. Council also authorized the negotiation and execution of a non-competitive agreement under Doc313860258. In addition, City Council directed that a review of the Negotiated Request for Proposal process be included in the Auditor General's 2022 Work Plan.

<https://secure.toronto.ca/council/agenda-item.do?item=2021.IE26.4>

COMMENTS

Negotiated Request for Proposal: Doc2970598171 (nRFP-1)

On May 7, 2021, the City issued a Negotiated Request for Proposal Doc2970598171 (nRFP-1) for the provision of winter maintenance services across eleven (11) separate geographical Contract Areas, with a closing date for submissions of June 16, 2021. Suppliers were invited to submit a single proposal demonstrating operational capabilities and experience for delivering winter maintenance services for any of the eleven Contract Areas they wished to be considered for. At the time of closing, 10 Suppliers submitted proposals in response to nRFP-1.

Supplier proposals were extensively evaluated against criteria outlined in the nRFP. The mandatory submission, mandatory technical and mandatory financial requirements along with the technical evaluation criteria included in nRFP-1 have been provided as Attachment 1. The pricing evaluation criteria are provided as Attachment 2.

As part of the evaluation process, a formal Evaluation Committee was established to assess the proposals submitted in response to nRFP-1. The evaluation followed a six-stage process:

Stage 1: Compliance Review of Mandatory Technical and Submission Requirements

Stage 2: Compliance Review of Mandatory Financial Requirements

Stage 3: Technical Proposal Evaluation

- Operational Capabilities
- Technology & Risk/Quality Management
- Fleet Management
- Past Experience
- Value Added Services
- Diversity Profile
- Delivery Approach

Stage 4: Pricing Evaluation

Stage 5: Ranking

Stage 6: Contract Negotiations

The evaluation process for nRFP-1 ultimately identified qualified suppliers for five (5) of the eleven contract areas. The final evaluation results for all stages along with scoring and corresponding evaluator notes for nRFP-1 have been provided as Confidential Attachment 1.

Negotiated Request for Proposal: Doc3136860258 (nRFP-2)

The City issued a second Negotiated Request for Proposal Doc3136860258 (nRFP-2) to procure winter maintenance services for the remaining six (6) contract areas. nRFP-2 was issued on September 2, 2021, and closed on September 28, 2021. The evaluation process and criteria mirrored the approach used in nRFP-1.

The mandatory submission, mandatory technical and mandatory financial requirements along with the technical evaluation criteria included in nRFP-2 have been provided as Attachment 3. The pricing evaluation criteria are provided as Attachment 4.

The evaluation process for nRFP-2 ultimately identified qualified suppliers for four (4) of the remaining six (6) contract areas. The final evaluation results for all stages along with scoring and corresponding evaluator notes for nRFP-2 have been provided as Confidential Attachment 2.

Final Technical Scoring Process (Consensus-Based):

As part of Stage 3: Technical Proposal Evaluation, the City employed a consensus-based evaluation process, a standard approach for competitive procurements designed to ensure fairness, consistency, and transparency. Each evaluation team member first conducted an independent review of all eligible proposals, assigning scores and providing rationale in accordance with the scoring criteria disclosed in the nRFPs (1 and 2). After the initial technical evaluations, a consensus meeting was held under the supervision of PMMD to review and reconcile the individual scores and rationales. Evaluators were required to demonstrate how they arrived at their score, providing page numbers and citations from each proposal, which PMMD utilized to facilitate the discussion and gain consensus. During this structured meeting, evaluators discussed differences in their individual scores to arrive at a single, agreed-upon consensus score and rationale for each criterion. If all evaluators independently assigned the same score for a given criterion, that score was adopted without further discussion, unless an evaluator specifically requested a review.

Non-Competitive Procurement (Contract Areas TOA2-1 and TOA2-5)

The City was unable to award two (2) contract areas (TOA2-1 and TOA2-5) through the two Negotiated Request for Proposals due to insufficient compliant submissions. As such, the provision of winter maintenance services for these areas were procured through a Non-Competitive Procurement (NCP), in accordance with 195-7.1 of Toronto Municipal Code Chapter 195, Purchasing. The highest-ranked proponent identified in the evaluation of nRFP-2 was invited to submit a proposal for these two (2) contract areas.

Award of Winter Maintenance Services Contracts

At the conclusion of the procurement process, in December 2021, City Council approved the award of the contracts for Winter Maintenance Services as follows:

Procurement Method	Contractor	Contract Areas Awarded
<i>Negotiated RFP – nRFP-1</i>	Infrastructure Maintenance Ltd.	TOA1-1
	A & F Di Carlo Construction Inc.	TOA1-4, TOA1-5
	Maple Crete Inc.	TOA2-2
	Emcon Services Inc.	Don Valley / Gardiner Expressway
<i>Negotiated RFP – nRFP-2</i>	2868415 Ontario Inc. (Joint Venture)	TOA1-2, TOA1-3, TOA2-3, TOA2-4
<i>Non-Competitive Procurement</i>	2868415 Ontario Inc. (Joint Venture)	TOA2-1, TOA2-5

CONTACT

Barbara Gray
General Manager, Transportation Services
Tel: (416) 392-8431
Email: Barbara.Gray@toronto.ca

Geneviève Sharkey
Chief Procurement Officer, Purchasing & Materials Management Division
Tel: (416) 397-5191
Email: Genevieve.Sharkey@toronto.ca

SIGNATURE

Barbara Gray
General Manager, Transportation Services

Geneviève Sharkey
Chief Procurement Officer, Purchasing & Materials Management

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1: nRFP Doc2970598171 – Part 4 – Mandatory Requirements and Evaluation Criteria

Attachment 2: nRFP Doc2970598171 – Part 5 – Pricing Evaluation Criteria and Pricing Proposal Form

Attachment 3: nRFP Doc3136860258 – Part 4 – Mandatory Requirements and Evaluation Criteria

Attachment 4: nRFP Doc3136860258 – Part 5 – Pricing Evaluation Criteria and Pricing Proposal Form

Confidential Attachment 1: nRFP Doc2970598171 Evaluations

Confidential Attachment 2: nRFP Doc3136860258 Evaluations