Chapter 3

ACCOUNTABILITY OFFICERS

ARTICLE I General

§ 3-1. Definitions.

- § 3-2. Independence and accountability.
- § 3-3. Appointment, removal and resignation.
- § 3-4. Selection process.
- § 3-5. Reserved
- § 3-6. Remuneration.
- § 3-7. Reports.
- § 3-8. External audit.
- § 3-9. Mandate review.
- § 3-10. Office.
- § 3-11. Office staff.
- § 3-12. Two-thirds vote required for changes.

ARTICLE I.1

Conflict of Interest; Political Activity; Disclosure of Wrongdoing and Reprisal Protection

- § 3-12.1. Definitions.
- § 3-12.2. Conflict of interest.
- § 3-12.3. Political activity.
- § 3-12.4. Disclosure of wrongdoing and reprisal protection.

ARTICLE II Auditor General

§ 3-13. Term.

- § 3-14. Powers, duties and limitations under Part V.
- § 3-15. Responsibilities.
- § 3-16. Annual audit plan.
- § 3-17. Additional powers, duties and responsibilities.

§ 3-18. Peer review.

§ 3-19. Office budget.

ARTICLE III Integrity Commissioner

§ 3-20. Term.

§ 3-21. Powers, duties and limitations under Part V.

§ 3-22. Responsibilities.

§ 3-23. Additional powers, duties and responsibilities.

ARTICLE IV Lobbyist Registrar

§ 3-24. Term.

§ 3-25. Powers, duties and limitations under Part V.

§ 3-26. Responsibilities.

§ 3-27. Additional powers, duties and responsibilities.

ARTICLE V Ombudsman

§ 3-28. Term.

§ 3-29. Powers, duties and limitations under Part V.

§ 3-30. Responsibilities.

§ 3-31. Additional powers, duties and responsibilities.

§ 3-32. Jurisdiction; limitation.

§ 3-33. Complaint initiation.

§ 3-34. Right to refuse.

§ 3-35. Notification of complaint.

§ 3-36. Investigation criteria.

§ 3-37. Procedures after an investigation.

[History: Adopted by the Council of the City of Toronto October 27, 2009 by By-law No. 1098-2009.¹ Amendments noted where applicable.]

General References

Council procedures - See Ch. 27. Financial control - See Ch. 71. Lobbying - See Ch. 140. City officials - See Ch. 169. Purchasing - See Ch. 195. Corporate records (City) - See Ch. 217. Signing Authority - See Ch. 257. *City of Toronto Act, 2006* - See S.O. 2006, c. 11. *Municipal Conflict of Interest Act* - See R.S.O. 1990, c. M.50.

ARTICLE I General

§ 3-1. Definitions.

As used in this chapter, the following terms shall have the meanings indicated:

ACCOUNTABILITY OFFICER - The Auditor General, Integrity Commissioner, Lobbyist Registrar or Ombudsman appointed by Council under Part V, Accountability and Transparency, of the *City of Toronto Act, 2006*.

ACT - The City of Toronto Act, 2006.

CITY CONTROLLED CORPORATION - The same meaning as in section 156 of the Act.

¹ Editor's Note: This by-law was passed under the authority of Part V of the *City of Toronto Act, 2006*, S.O. 2006, c. 11. This by-law also provided that in the event of a conflict between a provision of Chapter 3 respecting an accountability officer's fixed-term appointment, renewal of appointment, removal from office, termination or remuneration and a provision in a contract with an accountability officer appointed before April 30, 2009, the provision in the contract prevails to the extent of the conflict.

CODE OF CONDUCT:

- A. The Code of Conduct for Members of Council.
- B. The Code of Conduct for Members of Local Boards (Restricted Definition).
- C. The Code of Conduct for Members of Adjudicative Boards.

COMPLAINT PROTOCOL:

- A. The Code of Conduct Complaint Protocol for Members of Council.
- B. The Code of Conduct Complaint Protocol for Members of Local Boards (Restricted Definition) including Adjudicative Boards.

LOCAL BOARD (RESTRICTED DEFINITION) - The same meaning as in section 156 of the Act.

§ 3-2. Independence and accountability.

- A. An accountability officer carries out in an independent manner the duties and responsibilities of his or her office as set out in Part V of the Act, this chapter and, in the case of the Lobbyist Registrar, Chapter 140, Lobbying.
- B. An accountability officer is accountable to Council.

§ 3-3. Appointment, removal and resignation.

- A. A two-thirds vote of all Council members (30 members) is required for the appointment, reappointment, extension of term, removal from office or termination for cause of an accountability officer.
- B. An accountability officer shall be appointed for a fixed term of office.
- C. The term of office for an accountability officer may be extended by Council in exceptional circumstances.
- D. An accountability officer may be removed from office or terminated for cause, before the expiry of the term of office, in accordance with the procedures established by the City.
- E. An accountability officer may resign from office at any time by giving 90 days' written notice to the Mayor, unless the notice requirement is waived by both parties.

§ 3-4. Selection process.

- A. The selection process for an accountability officer shall be conducted by an external recruitment firm.
- B. Appointment of an accountability officer shall be recommended to Council by a selection panel, appointed by the Mayor and chaired by the Mayor or the Mayor's designate.
 [Amended 2013-11-15 by By-law No. 1435-2013²]

§ 3-5. Reserved³.

§ 3-6. Remuneration.

- A. An accountability officer shall not receive performance progression increases but shall receive the cost-of-living escalators approved by Council for senior managers.
- B. The remuneration for accountability officers shall be reviewed periodically.
- C. Remuneration for an accountability officer will be recommended to the City through an independent external review.

§ 3-7. Reports.

- A. An accountability officer shall report annually to Council on the activities of his or her office and the discharge of his or her duties.
- B. An accountability officer reports directly to Council on investigations and inquiries conducted by the accountability officer.
- C. Despite Subsection B, the Integrity Commissioner may report directly to a local board (restricted definition) on investigations and inquiries respecting a member of the local board (restricted definition) and, if applicable, as provided in the complaint protocol.
- D. An accountability officer shall submit policy-related reports to Council through the Executive Committee.
- E. Subject to § 3-15D the Auditor General shall submit all audit-related reports to Council through the Audit Committee, including the annual report required under Subsection A that shall also include the savings achieved. [Amended 2012-11-01 by By-law No. 1412-2012]

² By-law No. 1435-2013, deleted references to the "Mayor" and substituted "Deputy Mayor" for the balance of the Council term that ended on November 30, 2014. Section 3-4B as it read prior to the amendment has now been reinstated.

³ Editor's Note: By-law No. 740-2015, enacted July 9, 2015, deleted § 3-5. Reappointment. By-law No. 740-2015 does not apply to the term or an extension of the term of the Lobbyist Registrar appointed by By-law No. 652-2008 and the Ombudsman appointed by By-law No. 1034-2008.

§ 3-8. External audit.

- A. The operations of the office of an accountability officer shall be included in the scope of the annual attest audit of the City, which is conducted by an external auditor appointed by and reporting to Council.
- B. An accountability officer's office shall undergo an annual compliance audit by an external auditor appointed by and reporting to Council.

§ 3-9. Mandate review.

- A. Council may periodically review the mandate of an accountability officer to adjust the mandate to changing circumstances.
- B. A periodic review of a mandate shall include consultation with the incumbent appointee to the accountability office, in order to reflect the accountability officer's experience, advice and input.

§ 3-10. Office.

- A. An accountability officer is independent of the City administration, subject to the requirements of this chapter.
- B. An accountability officer has full carriage and control of, and is fully responsible for, the conduct and accountability of his or her office and shall manage his or her office in compliance with applicable laws.
- C. An accountability officer is responsible for submitting an annual budget request to the Budget Committee for consideration and recommendation to Council.
- D. An accountability officer's budget request shall generally follow the corporate budget submission process as it relates to the level of information provided, and the formats used.
- E. An accountability officer is not required to submit his or her budget request to the City Manager or Deputy City Manager and Chief Financial Officer for review, approval or recommendation.
- F. An accountability officer is responsible for the application to his or her office of:
 - (1) Chapter 71, Financial Control;
 - (2) Chapter 195, Purchasing;
 - (3) Chapter 217, Records, Corporate (City);

- (4) Other City by-laws and policies related to material and financial resources; and
- (5) Other City by-laws and policies as specified by Council, as this section and § 3-11 do not exempt an accountability officer or the accountability officer's staff from complying with City policies of general application that do not interfere with the accountability officer's performing, in an independent manner, the functions assigned by the Act or Council.

§ 3-11. Office staff.

- A. An accountability officer is responsible for the application of the City's employmentrelated policies to his or her staff with necessary modifications to reflect the independent nature of these functions.
- B. An accountability officer shall work with the City Manager, Human Resources staff and the City Solicitor in areas where there is a staffing issue involving corporate responsibility or liability.
- C. An accountability officer may appoint, promote, demote, suspend and dismiss all employees of his or her office, subject to the provisions of any City employment-related policies applicable to employees of the City.
- D. Subject to Subsections A and B, an accountability officer may authorize the creation of positions and compensation levels in his or her office, within the office's approved budget and generally within the City's salary structure, having regard for comparable compensation levels across the Toronto Public Service for purposes of internal equity.

§ 3-12. Two-thirds vote required for changes.

[Amended 2010-08-27 by By-law No. 1016-2010]

To pass a motion to amend or repeal this chapter requires a two-thirds vote of all Council members (30 members).

ARTICLE I.1

Conflict of Interest; Political Activity; Disclosure of Wrongdoing and Reprisal Protection [Added 2014-08-28 by By-law No. 970-2014⁴]

§ 3-12.1. Definitions.

A. The definitions contained in Chapter 192, Public Service, are applicable to the terms as used in this article.

⁴ Editor's Note: By-law No. 970-2014, enacted August 28, 2014, adds new Art. I.1. effective December 31, 2015.

B. As set out in this Article I.1, Articles IV, V and § 192-47 of Chapter 192, Public Service, apply to Accountability Officers and their staff except insofar as any provision of Chapter 192 is inconsistent with the intent or object of this chapter.

§ 3-12.2. Conflict of interest.

The Accountability Officers and their staff shall comply with Article IV, Conflict of Interest, of Chapter 192, Public Service.

§ 3-12.3. Political activity.

The Accountability Officers and their staff shall comply with the rules for Designated Employees under Article V, Political Activity, of Chapter 192, Public Service, with the same restrictions as the City Manager.

§ 3-12.4. Disclosure of wrongdoing and reprisal protection.

- A. Section 192-47 of Article VII, Reprisal Protection, of Chapter 192, Public Service, shall apply to the Accountability Officer's staff but not the Accountability Officers.
- B. Where it is alleged that an Accountability Officer or their staff has committed wrongdoing as defined in Chapter 192, improperly breached confidentiality or committed a reprisal as defined in Chapter 192, a third party investigator will be used and their findings will be reported to City Council.

ARTICLE II Auditor General

§ 3-13. Term.

The Auditor General shall be appointed for a seven-year non-renewable term of office.

§ 3-14. Powers, duties and limitations under Part V.

When carrying out his or her duties under Part V of the Act, the Auditor General has the general powers and duties and is subject to the limitations set out in sections 178 to 182 of the Act.

§ 3-15. Responsibilities.

A. The Auditor General is responsible for carrying out financial (excluding attest), compliance and performance audits of all programs, activities and functions of all City departments, the offices of the Mayor and members of Council, local boards (restricted definition) and City-controlled corporations.

- B. Despite Subsection A, the Auditor General may undertake financial (excluding attest), compliance and performance audits and provide recommendations to the board, upon request by the following boards:
 - (1) Toronto Police Services Board.
 - (2) Toronto Public Library Board.
 - (3) Toronto Board of Health.
- C. The Auditor General shall only undertake an audit of the Toronto Hydro Corporation and its subsidiaries upon specific direction from Council in relation to: [Amended 2013-06-13 by By-law No. 774-2013]
 - (1) A perceived breach by Toronto Hydro Corporation of the shareholder direction; or
 - (2) A specific purpose or project where the Auditor General has not been able to obtain the necessary information either:
 - (a) Through the shareholder direction reporting mechanisms; or
 - (b) Through inquiries to senior management of the Toronto Hydro Corporation; or
 - (c) Through a request from Council to the Chair of the Toronto Hydro Corporation.
- All reports by the Auditor General on City controlled agencies and City corporations shall be submitted first to the agency or corporation's board of directors. [Amended 2012-11-01 by By-law No. 1412-2012]

§ 3-16. Annual audit plan.

- A. The Auditor General shall submit an annual audit plan to Council.
- B. No deletions or amendments to the annual audit plan shall be made except by the Auditor General.
- C. Despite Subsection B, Council may add to the annual audit plan by a two-thirds vote of all Council members (30 members).

§ 3-17. Additional powers, duties and responsibilities.

A. The Auditor General shall perform such other duties respecting audit matters as assigned by Council.

- B. The Auditor General shall disclose to Council any attempts at interference with the work of the Auditor General's office.
- C. (Reserved)⁵

§ 3-18. Peer review.

- A. The Auditor General shall undergo an external peer review once every three years to ensure compliance with government auditing standards.
- B. The results of the external peer review shall be reported to Council through the Audit Committee.

§ 3-19. Office budget.

The Auditor General shall submit his or her annual budget request to the Audit Committee for consideration and recommendation to Council.

ARTICLE III Integrity Commissioner

§ 3-20. Term.

The Integrity Commissioner shall be appointed for a five-year non-renewable term of office.

§ 3-21. Powers, duties and limitations under Part V.

When carrying out his or her duties as assigned by Council under Part V of the Act, the Integrity Commissioner has the general powers and duties and is subject to the limitations set out in sections 159 to 164 of the Act.

§ 3-22. Responsibilities.

The duties of the Integrity Commissioner are as follows:

- A. To provide advice on the application of a code of conduct and other City or local board by-laws, policies, and protocols to a member's conduct, and general advice with respect to a member's obligations under the *Municipal Conflict of Interest Act* to:
 - (1) Council and local boards (restricted definition).

⁵ Editor's Note: Former § 3-17C, which assigned responsibilities to the Auditor General under the Whistle Blower Protection Policy was passed June 15, 2011 by By-law No. 818-2011, under the authority of section 212(1) of the *City of Toronto Act, 2006*, S.O. 2006. Section 3-17C was repealed July 14, 2011 by By-law No. 974-2011 to permit consultations with the City's Accountability Officers.

- (2) A member of Council or a local board (restricted definition) subject to a code of conduct on his or her own situation, and includes a member of Council's staff when he or she is acting as the member's agent.
- B. To conduct inquiries under the Act on whether a member of Council or a local board (restricted definition) has contravened a code of conduct.
- C. To provide opinions on policy matters and make other reports to Council or a local board (restricted definition) on issues of ethics and integrity.
- D. To provide educational programs to members of Council, local boards (restricted definition), and their staff on issues of ethics and integrity.

§ 3-23. Additional powers, duties and responsibilities.

The Integrity Commissioner shall perform such other duties respecting ethical matters as assigned by Council.

ARTICLE IV Lobbyist Registrar

§ 3-24. Term.

The Lobbyist Registrar shall be appointed for a seven-year non-renewable term of office.⁶ [Amended 2015-07-09 by By-law No. 740-2015]

§ 3-25. Powers, duties and limitations under Part V.

When carrying out his or her duties as assigned by Council under Part V of the Act, the Lobbyist Registrar has the general powers and duties and is subject to the limitations set out in sections 168 and 169 of the Act.

§ 3-26. Responsibilities.

The Lobbyist Registrar has the powers and duties with respect to the lobbyist registry and registration system as set out in Chapter 140, Lobbying and sections 168 and 169 of the Act.

§ 3-27. Additional powers, duties and responsibilities.

The Lobbyist Registrar shall perform such other duties respecting the lobbyist registry and registration system as may be assigned by Council.

⁶ Editor's Note: By-law No. 771-2016, enacted July 15, 2016, appoints the current Lobbyist Registrar for a term ending on September 6, 2019.

ARTICLE V Ombudsman

§ 3-28. Term.

The Ombudsman shall be appointed for a seven-year non-renewable term of office. [Amended 2015-07-09 by By-law No. 740-2015]

§ 3-29. Powers, duties and limitations under Part V.

When carrying out his or her duties under Part V of the Act, the Ombudsman has the general powers and duties and is subject to the limitations set out in sections 171 to 176 of the Act.

§ 3-30. Responsibilities.

The Ombudsman is responsible for:

- A. Determining procedures related to the function.
- B. Investigating public complaints about decisions, actions or recommendations made or omitted in the course of implementing City policies and administering City services.
- C. (Reserved)⁷

§ 3-31. Additional powers, duties and responsibilities.

The Ombudsman shall perform such other duties respecting the Ombudsman's function as assigned by Council.

§ 3-32. Jurisdiction; limitation.

- A. The Ombudsman may investigate any matter where the Ombudsman believes on reasonable grounds that a person or body of persons has been adversely affected in his, her or its personal capacity by a decision, recommendation, act or omission made in the course of implementing City policies and administering City services by:
 - (1) A City division.
 - (2) A contracted service provider.
 - (3) A local board (restricted definition).
 - (4) A City-controlled corporation. [Amended 2014-05-08 by By-law No. 433-2014]

⁷ Editor's Note: Former § 3-30C, which assigned responsibilities to the Ombudsman under the Whistle Blower Protection Policy was passed June 15, 2011 by By-law No. 818-2011, under the authority of section 212(1) of the *City of Toronto Act, 2006*, S.O. 2006. Section 3-30C was repealed July 14, 2011 by By-law No. 974-2011 to permit consultations with the City's Accountability Officers.

B. Despite Subsection A, the Ombudsman's jurisdiction does not include Council and Council Committees, as defined in Chapter 27, Council Procedures.

§ 3-33. Complaint initiation.

The Ombudsman may investigate:

- A. In accordance with this article.
- B. At the request of Council.
- C. On the Ombudsman's initiative.

§ 3-34. Right to refuse.

- A. The Ombudsman may refuse to investigate a complaint or to continue an investigation of a complaint when the Ombudsman believes on reasonable grounds that:
 - (1) The complainant has not availed himself or herself of other adequate remedies under the law or existing administrative practices.
 - (2) The subject matter of the complaint is trivial.
 - (3) The complaint is frivolous, vexatious or not made in good faith.
 - (4) The complainant cannot demonstrate sufficient personal interest in the subject matter of the complaint.
 - (5) Having regard to all of the circumstances of the case, no further investigation is necessary.
 - (6) More than one year has elapsed since the complainant learned of the facts on which the complaint is based, unless the complainant establishes exceptional circumstances that justify the delay to the satisfaction of the Ombudsman.
- B. If the Ombudsman determines not to investigate, or to discontinue an investigation, the Ombudsman shall inform the complainant in writing of the decision and the reasons for the decision.

§ 3-35. Notification of complaint.

Before commencing an investigation the Ombudsman shall:

- A. Notify the affected parties.
- B. Allow the affected parties to be heard.

C. Provide the affected parties with an opportunity to rectify.

§ 3-36. Investigation criteria.

In undertaking an investigation, the Ombudsman shall have regard to whether the decision, recommendation, act or omission in question may have been:

- A. Contrary to law;
- B. Unreasonable, unjust, oppressive or improperly discriminatory;
- C. Based wholly or partly on a mistake of law or fact;
- D. Based on the improper exercise of a discretionary power; or
- E. Wrong.

§ 3-37. Procedures after an investigation.

Upon completion of an investigation the Ombudsman shall:

- A. Inform the complainant in writing of the results of the investigation.
- B. Inform the other affected parties in writing of the results of the investigation.
- C. Recommend any measures the Ombudsman deems necessary to rectify the matter.