

Appendix F-3
Long-Term Alternatives Evaluation Matrix

Factors	Measures	Do Nothing	Option 1: Widen St. Clair Ave at Underpass					
			1A(i) Replace Existing Underpass with Longer Bridge: Widen on both sides	1A(ii) Replace Existing Underpass with Longer Bridge: Widen to the South	1A(iii) Replace Existing Underpass with Longer Bridge: Widen to the North	1B(i) Maintain Existing St. Clair Underpass and Construct Additional Underpass on South	1B(ii) Maintain Existing St. Clair Underpass and Construct Additional Overpass on South	1C(i) Replace Existing Underpass with Flyover Structure on South Side
Property Impact	Private Property Impact	● No impact on private properties	● Minor impact on properties to the north south ● Full taking of 1926 St. Clair Avenue West	● Limited impact on properties to the north south ● Considerable impact on properties to the south ● Full taking of 1926 St. Clair Avenue West	Significant property and building impacts to existing townhouse developments located at northeast corner of Weston & St. Clair. Screened Out after TAC#2. Not Carried Forward	● Major impact on properties to the south ● Full taking of 1926 St. Clair Avenue West	● Major impact on properties to the south ● Full taking of 1926 St. Clair Avenue West.	Significant grading problems. Feasibility Constraints with the TTC. Do Not Carry Forward.
	Public Property Impact	● No impact on public properties	● Minor impact on properties to the north and south (1 lane on either side)	● Minor impact on properties to the south (2 lanes)		● Considerable impact to properties to the south	● Considerable impact to properties to the south	
Transportation Planning	Eastbound Travel Time Across Rail Corridor via St. Clair Ave. W (seconds)	○ 380	● 306	● 304		● 306	● 306	
	Ability to accommodate future widening and other facilities	○ Not possible to incorporate bicycle lanes	● Possible to incorporate bicycle lanes	● Possible to incorporate bicycle lanes		○ Not possible to incorporate bicycle lanes	● Possible to incorporate bicycle lanes	
	Potential Road Alignment Shift	● No change in road alignment	● Minimal change road alignment.	● Minimal change in road alignment		○ Considerable shift (15-20m) of eastbound traffic lane alignment	○ Considerable shift (15-20m) of eastbound traffic lane alignment	
Archaeology/Built Heritage	Potential impact on archaeological features	● Study Area already disturbed. ● No further disturbances	● No Impact	● No Impact		● No Impact	● No Impact	
	Potential impact on heritage properties	● No impacts	● 1 listed and 1 unlisted heritage property affected, HIA would be required	● 1 listed heritage property affected, HIA would be required				
Natural Environment	Potential impacts on existing trees/vegetation	● No significant impacts	● No significant impacts	● No significant impacts		● No significant impacts	● No significant impacts	
Transportation Operations / Engineering / Constructability	Complexity of tie-in to existing network	● No change	● Requires re-grading	● Requires re-grading	● Medium level difficulty	● Medium level difficulty		
	Potential impact on stormwater management and drainage	● No change in drainage or stormwater management	● Requires added drainage features to reduce ponding and/or flooding	● Requires added drainage features to reduce ponding and/or flooding	● Requires added drainage features to reduce ponding and/or flooding	● Requires added drainage features to reduce ponding and/or flooding		
	Potential impact on existing transportation operations during construction (rail, road & transit)	● No impact on transportation operations	● Track protection staged construction to maintain full train operation ● Staged closure of St. Clair Ave. W between Weston Rd. and Old Weston Rd.	● Track protection, staged construction to maintain full train operation ● Staged closure of St. Clair Ave. W between Weston Rd. and Old Weston Rd.	○ Temporary closure for underpinning of existing footings	○ Temporary closure for underpinning of existing footings		
			● Temporary transit interruption	● Temporary transit interruption	● Temporary closures of eastbound lanes during final tie-in to existing alignment at both Weston Rd and Old Weston Rd intersections	● Temporary closures of eastbound lanes during final tie-in to existing alignment at both Weston Rd and Old Weston Rd intersections		
Estimated Construction Cost**	Structural Cost	● No cost	○ \$40M	○ \$40M	● \$20M	● \$15M		
	Roadwork Cost	● No Cost	○ \$680,000	○ \$680,000	● \$430,000	● \$640,000		
	Total Construction Cost***	● No Cost	○ \$47M	○ \$47M	● \$24.6M	● \$18.1M		

*Old Weston (short) - segment of Old Weston from Rockwell to Davenport

**Cost not including land acquisition, existing structure rehabilitation, or improvements to existing roadways

***Accounting for contingency allowance, storm sewers, street lighting, earth excavation

Factors	Measures	Option 3: Construct Additional Rail Crossing South of St. Clair Avenue West						Option 4: Extend Keele Street to the South		Option 4: Extend Keele Street to a Gunn's Road Extension Only	Option 5: Extend Keele Street to a Gunn's Road Extension and Union Street crossing over St. Clair Avenue West to connect with Davenport Road
		2A(i) Extend Gunns Road to Union Street with Underpass: To Union Street	2A(ii) Extend Gunns Road to Union Street with Underpass: To Turnberry Avenue	2B Extend Gunns Road to Union Street with Overpass	3A(i) Davenport Extension with Overpass: To Lloyd Avenue	3A(ii) Davenport Extension with Overpass: To Lloyd Avenue	3B Davenport Extension with Underpass	4A To Union Street or Turnberry Avenue North of St. Clair Avenue West	4B To Davenport Road South of St. Clair Avenue West		
Property Impact	Private Property Impact Public Property Impact		Considerable impact on industrial. Partial taking of properties Townhomes in southeast quadrant of Gunns Road extension and Weston Road affected due to proximity of new extension to properties Minor public property affected		Significant impact on residential properties east of the rail corridor Full taking of multiple residential properties east of the rail corridor Full taking of unused property east of the rail corridor Minor public property affected					Major impact on industrial properties east of the rail corridor. Partial taking of properties Townhomes in southeast quadrant of Gunns Road extension and Weston Road affected due to proximity of new extension to properties Minor public property affected	Major impact on residential and industrial properties east of the rail corridor. Partial taking of properties Townhomes in southeast quadrant of Gunns Road extension and Weston Road affected due to proximity of new extension to properties Full taking of multiple residential properties east of the rail corridor Full taking of unused property east of the rail corridor Impact on CP rail property Partial taking of CP rail property Significant public property affected
Transportation Planning	Eastbound Travel Time Across Rail Corridor via St. Clair Ave. W (seconds) Ability to accommodate future widening and other facilities Potential Road Alignment Shift		381 Possible to incorporate bicycle lanes Not applicable		317 Possible to incorporate bicycle lanes Realignment of Lloyd Avenue likely required					441 Possible to incorporate bicycle lanes Not applicable	372 Possible to incorporate bicycle lanes Townsley Street sectioned off to create cul-de-sac
Archaeology/Built Heritage	Potential impact on archaeological features Potential impact on heritage properties	Screened out due to limited benefit as a result of no direct connection to Old Weston. Do Not Carry Forward.	Archaeological potential possible, Stage 2 archaeological assessment required. No Impact	Requires existing grades at Weston & Gunns intersection to be raised approx. 3 metres. Impact on surrounding road network and land uses. Not Carried Forward	Archaeological potential possible, Stage 2 archaeological assessment required. 1 property with heritage potential value or interest affected, HIA would be required	Significant private property impacts in area west of rail corridor, affecting residential homes. Agreed to be removed from discussion at TAC#3	Requires reconstruction of newly installed caisson wall structures along Metrolinx/GO corridor. Not Carried Forward	Modified into Option 4.	Modified into Option 5	Archaeological potential possible, Stage 2 archaeological assessment required. No Impact	Archaeological potential possible, Stage 2 archaeological assessment required. 1 listed heritage property affected, HIA would be required
Natural Environment	Potential impacts on existing trees/vegetation		Minor impact to vegetation adjacent to the rail corridor Permit for removal of trees required from City of Toronto Urban Forestry		Minor impact to vegetation adjacent to the rail corridor					Minor impacts to vegetation adjacent to the rail corridor and at the base of Keele Street Permit for removal of trees required from City of Toronto Urban Forestry	Minor impacts to vegetation adjacent to the rail corridor and at the base of Keele Street Permit for removal of trees required from City of Toronto Urban Forestry
Transportation Operations / Engineering / Constructability	Complexity of tie-in to existing network Potential impact on stormwater management and drainage Potential impact on existing transportation operations during construction (rail, road & transit)		Grading consideration to be given to Gunns/Keele extension intersection if integrated with Option 4 and 5 Requires added drainage features to reduce ponding and/or flooding Minor disruption of rail operation during construction of underpass No existing road No existing transit network in the area		Significant grading issues west of rail corridor Requires added drainage features to reduce ponding and/or flooding Requires track protection and staged construction to maintain full rail corridor operation No existing road No existing transit network in the area					Requires lowering of Keele St. to level of Gunns Rd. underpass or realignment of Keele St. further east Requires added drainage features to reduce ponding and/or flooding Minor disruption of rail operation during construction of underpass No existing road No existing transit network in the area	Requires lowering of Keele St. to level of Gunns Rd. underpass or realignment of Keele St. further east Requires added drainage features to reduce ponding and/or flooding Minor disruption of rail operation during construction of underpass Little to no interruption on St. Clair Avenue West during construction Possible disruption to transit service via Davenport Road
Estimated Construction Cost**	Structural Cost Roadwork Cost Total Construction Cost***		\$25M \$430,000 \$29.3M		\$25M \$670,000 \$29.6M					\$25M \$1.2M \$30.4M	\$32M \$2M \$39M

*Old Weston (short) - segment of Old Weston from Rockwell to Davenport

**Cost not including land acquisition, existing structure rehabilitation, or improvements to existing roadways

***Accounting for contingency allowance, storm sewers, street lighting, earth excavation