

Appendix C: Jurisdictional Review of Economic Development and Culture Plans

Introduction

The purpose of this jurisdictional review is to learn from places around the world to better understand how Toronto's peer cities are addressing challenges and opportunities in their own communities through economic and cultural programs. This work was undertaken in spring 2017 to inform the development of a forthcoming City of Toronto Economic Development and Culture Divisional Strategy 2018 - 2022. The information gathered through this process confirmed that no other jurisdiction reviewed has an integrated economic development and culture plan, but it is still useful to study other places for best practices.

Process

The jurisdictional review analyzes the context, mission statements, objectives and programs of five cities: London UK; Singapore MY; Sydney AU; Los Angeles USA; and San José USA. The decision to focus on this group was a multi-staged process. The review started with developing two basic criteria: cities of similar size and profile to Toronto, and an established local policy context within the last 10 years. Next, the review gathered baseline data such as population, diversity, cost of living, quality of life and current strategies from 14 cities which included the five cities listed above plus: New York City USA; Melbourne AU; Chicago USA; Montreal CA; Austin USA; San Francisco USA; Vancouver CA; Boston USA; and Seattle USA. Several cities in the long-list were withdrawn for a variety of reasons such as population size, availability of information on the internet, familiarity with current work and an interest in finding new comparators.

The jurisdictional review then examined the remaining cities for examples of local government programs in economic development and culture. Every effort was made to capture program examples that would address the full range of Toronto's Economic Development and Culture Division service areas of Business Growth, Film and Entertainment Industries, Arts and Culture, and Museums and Heritage. The last step included a high-level assessment of economic development and culture policy objectives of the final five cities.

Situational Context

London, Singapore, Sydney, Los Angeles and San José have similar situational contexts despite their differences in geography. These are: global commerce regions; high-growth cities facing the associated challenges of income inequality, housing affordability and high cost of living; diverse populations; international creative capitals; and national hubs for arts, culture and entertainment.

Each city also operates in a different context. London has a complex local government system that includes the Greater London Authority (GLA), 32 Local Borough Councils and the City of London Corporation. The Mayor of London's strategic plans were developed under a previous Mayor and before "Brexit". Singapore operates as a City-State under a semi-authoritarian regime. The city also has a business-friendly economy that's competitive and growing. Sydney is a relatively young country (median age is 32 years old), and has a strong focus on climate protection and green infrastructure. Los Angeles is coming out of a recession, facing structural poverty and is a sprawling urban city. Because of this, in 2013 L.A.'s Economic and Workforce Development Departments were merged as a more effective way to support businesses, people and vibrant neighbourhoods. San José is the capital of Silicon Valley and is predominantly suburban. The cost of living in San José is one of the highest in the USA, challenging the viability of traditional businesses such as manufacturing. San José is the only city of the final five reviewed where the Office of Cultural Affairs is a division of the Office of Economic Development, making it an interesting operational comparator for Toronto.

Mission Statements

As stated in the introduction, none of the cities examined in the jurisdictional review have an integrated economic development and culture plan, or in other words all of the cities have separate plans. The various mission statements below are drawn from the existing plans, are shortened to their core elements and listed in the following order for straightforwardness: (1) economic development plan and (2) culture plan. The mission statements are as follows:

- London (1) Encourage the business, environmental and social conditions in which London's powerful economy can thrive; and (2) Maintain London's position as a world city for culture;
- Singapore (1) Create sustainable economic growth with vibrant business and good job opportunities; and (2) Aim to be a nation of cultured and gracious people, at home with heritage and proud of Singaporean identity;
- Sydney (1) A globally competitive and innovative city, the premier place in Australia to live, work and visit; and (2) An environment where ideas, imagination and creativity can flourish;
- Los Angeles (1) To develop, deliver and promote best-in-class economic and workforce development services to generate, sustain and grow individual, business and community prosperity in the City of Los Angeles; and (2) Support diverse arts and cultural community and embrace creativity as its signature industry; and
- San José (1) A cosmopolitan, international city for leading businesses and talent from around the world; (2) Where arts and culture connects people, provides rich opportunities for participation and fosters creativity.

Objectives

Moving from mission statements, the jurisdictional review analyzed the objectives of the economic development and culture plans from the final five cities. Where plans were not available, information was obtained from municipal website descriptions. The objectives were then sorted for similarity and are presented below.

Economic Development Plan Five City Summary of Objectives: London, Singapore, Sydney, Los Angeles and San José	Culture Plan Five City Summary of Objectives: London, Singapore, Sydney, Los Angeles and San José
Global Gateway / World Capital / Attracting Investment Businesses and Industry / Strengthen Competitiveness / Connections with Asia / National and Global links / Promote Local Businesses and Industries Internationally / Attract Talent	Access to Diverse Cultural Experiences / Support Resident's Personal, Active Participation in Arts and Culture / Free and Low Cost / Accessibility / Opportunities for Social Connection / Interest in Cultural Experiences / New Avenues for Participation
Place of Equal Opportunity / Full Participation in the Workplace / Prepare Residents through Training, Education and Career Support / Wrap-Around Support such as Early-Years Learning Programs for Children and Transportation	Embrace Inclusiveness / Take Pride in Aboriginal History, Culture and Contemporary Expression / Diversity is Prized and Promoted / Proud of Immigrant History and Heritage / Deep Appreciation of Shared Heritage / Add Meaning to Lives / Break Down Barriers
Competitive Business Environment / Eliminate Complexity of City Policies / Simplify Economic Development Process / Improve Speed and Predictability of Development Review Process / Expand Job Base in City / Increase City Revenues	Cultural Space / Number and Quality of Cultural Venues / Cooperative Housing for Creative Workers / Temporary and Long-Term Creative Workspace Program / Soundproof Music Practice-Rooms in High-Density Housing Developments / World-Renowned Cultural Institutions

Economic Development Plan Five City Summary of Objectives Continued	Culture Plan Five City Summary of Objectives Continued
<p>Dynamic Sector Clusters / Knowledge and Innovation / Vertical Industry Growth/ Manufacturing-related jobs / Local Small Business/ Entrepreneurship / Entrepreneurial Environment / Develop Retail to Full Potential / Transportation / Airport Development</p>	<p>Support Artists and Creative Industries / Promote Commercial Creative Sector and Arts-Related Businesses / Professional Training / Continual Upgrading of Skills to Strengthen Creative Workforce / Sustaining Excellence in the Arts</p>
<p>Neighbourhood Vitality / Position Downtown as a City Centre / Revitalize Communities / Walkable Mixed-Use Environments / Develop Distinctive Arts, Entertainment, and Sports Offerings Aligned with Diverse Population / Livability</p>	<p>Creativity in Everyday Experience and the Public Realm / Preserve and Expand Access to the city’s Historic Cultural Monuments / Integrate High Impact Public Art and Urban Design / Foster Destination Quality Events / Cultural Precinct Development / Neighbourhood Cultural Tourism / Animating Heritage</p>
<p>Prepare for the Future / Sustainable Development and Environmental Improvement / Climate Change Adaptation and Mitigation / Valued Contributor / Increase Influence / Partnership and Collaboration / Cross Sector and Regional and National Networks / Achieve Dreams</p>	<p>Welcome Bold Ideas / Innovation is Central to a Creative Community / New Visions and Unexpected Connections / Global Engagement / Creative Crossroads of the World / Expand Collaboration with City Departments / Stretch Imagination / Dream the Future</p>

Programs

Each city has developed local economic development and cultural services in response to their situational context. An assessment of municipal programs can inspire or reinforce implementation plans at the City of Toronto. It is important to note that this jurisdictional review did not assess each city’s funding or resources directed to economic development and culture. Rather, the purpose of this step was to give more information on how residents were directly served by their local government. The following examples highlight how other cities are addressing economic and cultural development opportunities in their own communities.



- London is vigorously promoting itself as a world capital of business, the world's top visitor destination and the world's leading international city of learning and creativity. One of London's key objectives is to make the city one of the world's leading low carbon capitals by 2023 and a global leader in carbon finance. The GLA is also working with boroughs, developers and other partners to direct investment into existing employment areas including the Central Activity Zone, town centres and the Strategic Outer London Development Centres. The Mayor of London chairs a Cultural Leadership Board that mixes representatives from commercial creative industries such as film, music, design, and the subsidized sector such as museums, theatres, dance, history and archeology.
- Singapore is highly invested in promoting established industries such as healthcare, professional services and engineering, and emerging industry clusters such as robotics, safety and security. Through the Economic Development Board the city promotes itself as a place for international investment and business development, and releases annual reports and research. In addition, the city is positioning Singapore as the international gateway to Asia by actively attracting international and Asian businesses in the arts, including galleries, auction houses, festivals and fairs and the music industry. Singapore's Heritage Festival presents the hidden and lesser-known stories about shared spaces and ways of life.
- As part of its Economic Development Strategy, Sydney has committed to reducing greenhouse gas emissions by 70 per cent compared to 2006 levels by 2030, to be internationally recognized as an environmental leader and to support new green industries. Sydney is also committed to long-term sustainability of the small business sector by delivering programs, seminars and forums to enhance business owner's skills, reduce unnecessary regulation, and respond to emerging trends such as 'collaborative consumption' or the sharing economy. To address business affordability of space, Sydney is also subsidizing commercial spaces and providing space for artists and creative organizations.
- Los Angeles operates citywide centres that provide business services such as access to capital, business plan development, tax incentives and credits, assist job seekers, and career training for disconnected youth ages 16 to 24 who are neither in school nor working. In addition, the City operates a Summer Youth Employment Program and a JobsLA.org online resources. Through the Department of Cultural Affairs the City recognizes that subsidized and commercial arts influence one another. The City is also improving old movie theatres as part of neighbourhood economic revitalization and creating space for inclusive artistic expression.
- San José is attracting new businesses into the city and protecting employment lands. The City has established a Food Strategy to promote healthy food options in vulnerable neighbourhoods, promoting local production, affordable retailers and food-related green jobs. As part of its economic development plan, San José is coordinating a downtown policy to achieve a stronger mix of evening

entertainment and live music. Through the Office of Cultural Affairs, San José has an established public art program that leads an active role in shaping the local visual environment.

Intersection of Economic Development and Culture

While no other city has an integrated economic development and culture plan, an analysis of these strategies for London, Singapore, Sydney, Los Angeles and San José found that economic development plans did mention how arts, culture and entertainment can benefit the economy. Similarly the cultural plans mentioned how the arts, culture and entertainment activities can support economic development goals. These intersection points are:

1. Global Position

World cities recognize that culture contributes to a city's cosmopolitan distinctiveness and expands the city brand as a creative capital. This is because the distinct cultural offer of a city is a key competitive asset that attracts business, residents and skilled workers and improves quality of life for residents.

2. Valuable Industry Sector

Creative industries are an important part of the local business mix and are a key industry sector. Cities can harness the competitive advantage of the culture sector's skilled labour and entrepreneurial energy by offering creative businesses specialized financial and human support at low or no cost. Remarkably, in the cities reviewed there was a recognition that people, ideas and resources frequently cross-over between for-profit and not-for-profit enterprises, and that film, music, fashion and design are allied with arts, culture and community, as well as considered key industry sectors.

3. Local Innovation Networks

A creative base in cities support a culture of innovation across tech, business and society and is a prerequisite for local innovation and economic strength. An active culture sector encourages opportunity for exchange between business executives, government, nonprofit leaders, academia and diverse groups. Cultural organizations are a platform for business networking through serving on boards or attending events which can create new alliances, partnerships and collaboration between businesses and with cultural organizations. Cultural activities can expand the public domain for innovation, openness, trust, tolerance, risks, research and experimentation in the city.

4. Spatial Economic Development

There is an acknowledgement that innovation has a spatial dimension and a city's cultural amenities can be a driver and consequence of economic success at the neighbourhood level. As well, cultural businesses bring day time and night time street level vibrancy. Cities are using culture as a regeneration tool by positioning their downtowns as global centres for business and culture, developing new precincts that include arts, culture and entertainment within commercial and

residential mixes in local neighbourhoods, and investing in high quality public spaces, good design and public art.

5. International Events, Tourism and Trade

Related to Global Position, but more focused on direct operations, many cities have developed cultural tourism strategies to reinforce the city as a cultural destination. Cities are leveraging the economic impact of events and looking to develop both major signature events and local neighbourhood events that can attract people. Examples include: taking advantage of signature event opportunities such as the Olympics; strengthening international business connections through cultural programs like Chinese New Year; and producing and attracting international cultural events aligned with diverse populations.

Analysis

Of the 14 peer cities reviewed through this process, no other city has an operating structure similar to the Economic Development and Culture (EDC) Division at the City of Toronto, and no other city has a fully integrated economic development and culture plan. These are key findings because while the City of Toronto EDC Division cannot easily point to other cities who have tested or implemented one plan, no other city has a compelling operational reason to implement one plan. All the same, the jurisdictional review of the 14 cities and in-depth study of London, Singapore, Sydney, Los Angeles and San José revealed that in big international cities there is a relationship between economic development and cultural development plans that ranges in scope and depth of connection.

Singapore and San José represent the two most different “relationship” types concerning economic development and culture. Singapore is a large city with a decidedly separated view of economic development and culture. Economic development is solely about business growth, while investment in culture underscores its intrinsic value and connection with civic pride. On the other hand, possibly because of San José’s smaller population size and the municipal operational structure, the economic development and culture plans while separate, are the most integrated of the final five cities analyzed. For example, one of the principles of the San José Economic Strategy is that the city is a “creative community” making the link between investment in signature events, galleries, performance venues and public art as enhancing the economic potential of the city. In the San José Culture Plan, there is a section that highlights the connection between creativity and economic development, and recommendations to enhance the commercial creative sector in the city. London, Sydney and Los Angeles all have some intersection between culture and economic development, which is discussed more at length below.

Focusing only on economic development plans as a group, prevalent themes of economic development planning today are the importance of offering a competitive local business environment, international business attraction and investing in local industry networks, collaboration and partnerships. The jurisdictional review also revealed new economic development plan trends. These are: equal economic opportunity,

environmental sustainability, and investment in neighbourhoods. These new trends highlight a shift in local economic development approaches to recognize the economy is influenced by a range of factors including livability and amenities. For example, the broadened scope of economic development strategies at this time stress the economic advantages of local government investments in public transportation, child care services, education opportunities and jobs skills training, and environmental sustainability. For example the London Economic Development Plan calls for an end to child poverty, and Sydney offers special programs for aboriginal employment and enterprise. Los Angeles has a special program to help reduce the number of day labourers who congregate on city streets and provides them with safe fixed sites where they can gain job skills. San José is exploring guaranteeing first-year community college tuition for high school graduates in the city. London, Los Angeles, Sydney and San José all have various business support programs for the green sector and targets to reduce carbon emissions, with Sydney and London being the most pronounced as part of their economic development strategies.

Shifting to cultural plans as a group, predominant themes at the heart of cultural plans continue to be access to diverse cultural experiences, affordable cultural space, and support for artists and the cultural sector. Most notably, all final five cities mentioned inclusiveness as a top priority within their culture plan recommendations. This includes taking pride in aboriginal history, culture and contemporary expression, being proud of a city's immigrant history and heritage, and promoting diversity. Another focus that may be of interest to the City of Toronto is the idea of bringing creativity into the everyday experience of the city and through the design of and activities in the public realm. For example, Singapore discussed the importance of preserving and expanding access to the city's historic cultural monuments, while Sydney, Los Angeles and San José support integrating high impact public art and urban design into the city. All five cities also saw the opportunity to leverage the cultural and economic impacts of destination quality events.

Unquestionably, a new trend of both economic development and culture plans in cities around the world, is the degree to which these two concepts are pointed to, mentioned, and leverage one another. The analysis of the final five cities found that the common areas of economic and cultural development intersection are where outcomes are perceived to be mutually beneficial. These once again are that: culture contributes to a city's global position; international cities are national hubs of skilled culture sector labour and innovative businesses; culture expands the public domain for innovation; cultural amenities can drive economic success at the neighbourhood level; and, if intentionally fostered, international events, tourism and trade can have significant economic and cultural impacts.

Gaps

One challenge of this jurisdictional review was finding direct operational comparators for the City of Toronto's Economic Development and Culture Division, especially as it relates to Museums and Heritage, and Film and Entertainment Services. For example, in London, The City of London Corporation leads heritage development for the local community, not the Greater London Authority. Los Angeles and San José do not have City-operated museums. LA MOCA is sometimes referred to as a city museum because it is on city-owned land with an affordable lease. Singapore noted the importance of museums as part of their national culture and pride and Sydney has a civic fine arts collection.

Regarding film, London, Singapore and Los Angeles issue permits through a partner organization. For example, London has a not-for-profit organization that coordinates location film production called Film London. In Singapore, the film industry is served through a Board called IDMA (Infocomm Development Authority) which is also home to the Singapore Film Commission. In Los Angeles the film industry is served through a not-for-profit organization called FilmL.A. Inc. that coordinates filming for the Greater Los Angeles Area. Sydney and San José issue film permits through the local government.

In terms of finding operational comparators it may have been advantageous for the jurisdictional review to analyze cities that are geographically proximate. For example, the City of Vaughan has a newly appointed Economic Development and Cultural Services Division. Brampton developed a Downtown Creative Economy Plan for 2011 – 2016. The City of Barrie has also created a Creative Economy Department in the last few years.

Lastly, in terms of the intersection between economic and cultural development, both economic development plans, and cultural plans talked about how the culture sector could enhance a city's economy. These were generally presented in the positive view point. What was not discussed are the ways a city's growing economy can positively contribute to the culture scene, and the challenges of developing a thriving economy and a thriving culture scene concurrently.

Conclusion

The results of the jurisdictional review found that while no other city has an integrated economic development and culture plan, other cities are adopting integrated approaches. More specifically, it revealed that integrated economic development and culture approaches are highly dependent on the local context, multifaceted and still evolving. That said, the study found five ways in which economic development and culture plans are finding common ground on how culture contributes to the economy. They are: enhancing a city's global position, being a robust and growing sector, expanding the public domain for innovation, driving economic success at the neighbourhood level, and leveraging economic and cultural impacts of international events, tourism and trade.

Most cities are moving towards economic development and cultural plans that embrace a wider scope. Economic development plans champion the idea that the economic benefits of growth such as access to good jobs should be felt by everyone in the city. Furthermore, there is an economic benefit of providing city services such as public transportation, child care, programs to reduce poverty, access to education, and environmental protection. These “wrap-around” services give all residents an equal opportunity to participate in the economy. Today, cultural plans are also broad in scope. Plans from global cities champion diverse community’s access to creation and consumption of cultural experiences and services, include and recognize the interconnections between subsidized culture sector businesses, and addressing creativity as part of the everyday experience of the city and the public realm.

Finally, the jurisdictional review also revealed that Toronto’s Economic Development and Culture Division operational structure is distinctive; it includes Business Growth, Film and Entertainment, Arts and Culture and Museums and Heritage Service areas under one management within the local government. Given the opportunity to develop an integrated Economic Development and Culture Division every effort is being made to find the connections between economic development and culture to address community challenges and opportunities. An integrated strategy will leverage knowledge from economic and cultural development, and broaden municipal strategies to address complex issues in the city.