Circular Economy Working Group: Meeting 1 Friday March 22, 2019 1:00pm-4:00pm St. Pauls Bloor Street 227 Bloor Street East

The meeting was called to order at 1:03 pm

Welcome, Agenda, Full Room Introductions

Robyn Shyllit, Public Consultation, welcomed the group and invited all members to participate in roundtable introductions. All attendees stated their name and affiliation.

Robyn Shyllit outlined housekeeping items. There were several observers present. The public can attend and listen to the meetings, but they cannot participate in table conversations. The facilitator reviewed the meeting agenda, indicating that there will be a significant amount of time devoted to going over the terms of reference at the first meeting.

Robyn Shyllit invited questions from the group and advised members that photos would be taken during the meeting that may be used in SWMS materials and information, and that members can advise staff if they do not want their photos to be taken.

Activity 1: Round Table Introductions

Robyn Shyllit introduced Activity 1. The point of the activity was for members to provide some information on the following:

- What do you hope to get out of this group?
- From other members?
- From the City?

Robyn Shyllit explained that the activity format is called the 1-2-table method. She stated that one minute would be used to outline one's own thoughts, then members would connect with a partner, and then discuss main ideas amongst their table to be recorded on the paper for a group report back.

Robyn Shyllit discussed the position of the note taker, indicating that notes would be taken throughout the meeting, specifying that names of individuals will not be affiliated with questions and concerns, but would be listed in meeting minutes. Report backs were conducted group by group (table by table). Below is a summary of each.

Activity 1 - Record of notes received

What do you hope to get out of this group?

- Develop an understanding of how we can bring about/work towards a circular economy in textiles
- Develop a circular economy policy for the City of Toronto
- Create inventory of circular economy businesses
- Get some specific and practical recommendations on how both public and private sectors can move towards a circular economy
- Learn about circularity in other sectors and what challenges and opportunities they face
- Have an opportunity to be part of making the City a "circular economy" city
- Become climatized to public consultation

- Gain knowledge base of circular economy and best practices and opportunities
- See where Toronto is going, to help lead other Canadian cities
- Gain big and small ideas for our company
- Make business as a force for good
- Keep materials out of the landfill and at their highest possible value
- Learn about the circular economy
- Learn how design figures into a circular economy Individual, household, community, City and regional scale
- Make connections to help projects happen
- Gain ideas, information, knowledge to move forward and apply
- Create regional coordination for material collection and redistribution
- Advocate to the province for the right to repair legislation and extended producer responsibility legislation
- Gain insight on how to navigate the process for developing end-of-life market for materials with municipalities
- Promote zero waste initiatives
- Learn more about what others are doing about sustainability
- Gain insight into broad local strategies and forecast on initiatives
- Promote urban farming
- Address food security and food sustainability in our urban environment
- Support creative process of handling organics from use, repurpose, soil enhancements
- Learn how to explain circular economy to the general public leading to promotion and education
- Create a more sustainable Toronto for all
- Develop industry around the circular economy and not just recycling
- Create plan of action to reduce waste
- Goals are a conservative minimum
- Have space for more action-based goals in the meantime
- Take inventory of assets and current circular economy landscapes and evaluate gaps, needs, and road blocks
- Support increased access to sustainable and affordable products and services for tenants
- Create employment opportunities for tenants
- Promote healthier food options and solutions
- Create options for fixtures, and furniture

What do you hope to get from other members?

- Resource efficiency that recognizes life-cycle approaches and sustainable material management
- Framework for circular economy context in Toronto
- Networking opportunities
- Partnership opportunities to find common linkages, resources, outputs, inputs
- Entrepreneurship and innovation opportunities
- Community of practice
- Connections, ideas, information
- Good examples of circular programming from industry partners
- Using my audience insight to help with circular economy messaging
- Look for opportunities to help each other with sustainability via partnerships or collaborations or sharing
- Opportunity to collaborate

- Share experience
- Instill new values in consumers
- Get insights to think about policy from different shareholders
- Gap analysis
- Find potential partners to work toward making fashion circular
- Collaboration across the sectors
- Inspiration from success stories
- Making connections to broaden the scope of our small non-profit
- Sharing resources, opportunities for collaboration
- Network and find potential partners
- Learn about areas outside curbside recycling
- Deeper knowledge of opportunities that exist but maybe haven't been tapped
- Learn about areas outside of curbside recycling

What do you hope to get from the City?

- Build circular economy elements, policies that include e.g. recycle contact, using CE/SMM to achieve zero waste
- Equitable green employment
- Information, case studies, regulatory possibilities
- Support, but let us do the innovations and work as a community, business, or not for profit
- Resources to think about the future of the circular economy in Toronto
- Recommendations on closing the gap (e.g. textile remanufacturing)
- Realistic assessment of where we are now
- Getting input on how we can improve efficiency
- Acknowledgement for what I'm working on and possible pilot project/test engagement
- Understand where the City is directing circular economy initiatives
- Firm grasp on how exactly it will reach its zero waste goals and focus on reduce, reuse and sharing economy
- New policy to reduce waste

Activity 1 - Report Back

A CEWG member reported back on behalf of each table.

- A diverse set of interests stemmed from their table because of the diversity of experiences.
- They discussed the removal of disincentives, looking at CE principle and enablers and trying to build more collaborations to get over the disincentives.
- They discussed partnerships to drive reuse and supplier development that might support longer term circular objectives.
- They discussed having a better understanding of the circular economy in the City, what is being done and how to amplify the issue.
- They discussed transparency and opportunities for youth and students, trying to make this simpler and clearer for everyone.
- They want to learn what others are doing outside their own scope of work and to facilitate the reuse of available resources within the City.
- They want to see a clear action plan towards new policy to reduce waste, and to share best practices for reuse and waste reduction.

- Expressed interest in collaborating and looking at what it looks like to develop end of life market for materials and how municipalities can support or rather get out of the way.
- Discussed entrepreneurship versus mainstream bureaucracy; how can we message circular economy so that it makes sense to the regular citizen and how they can engage in it.
- Different business opportunities for how individual data can be shared to produce a picture of what is going on across the board.
- Increasing public awareness around the concept of the circular economy;
- Doing a gap analysis of what circular economy activities are already taking place including the fractional logistics analysis;
- Finding ways that people and residents of Toronto are engaged with the circular economy rather than just business to business discussions;
- Opportunities for new regulations like what can the City do to actually pass these ideas, and ensuring that the circular economy in Toronto is equitable so that it provides affordable access to materials and goods and opportunities.
- Collaboration across sectors.
- Learning from other models and sharing success stories because success is very important when you are talking about it in a positive way.
- A desire for driving the Toronto-based recycling industry and discovering models that reduce resources and greenhouse gases and infrastructure models that support resistance.
- A desire to help shape a framework for the circular economy so that not just waste related issues are talked about in this way but every decision made in Toronto, regardless of the sector, is talking about the circular economy from the very root of the decision.
- A better understanding of how to work with the circular economy in regards to textiles, with a deeper knowledge of the players and systems currently in place to process waste, and which could potentially be in place.
- To know best practices and opportunities that exist in the circular economy.
- To interact with other members through networking opportunities, some idea sharing and a discussion of the roles that businesses play.
- To understand how the City works to build circular economy policies, and how and when they put them in place.

Robyn Shyllit indicated that ideas brought forward will be reviewed and incorporated into future meetings. **Robyn Shyllit** stated that if ideas from anyone were not captured, they should be written down so they can be incorporated into the meeting minutes.

Terms of Reference & Meeting Overview

Robyn Shyllit presented on the Terms of Reference.

The presentation content for this section is in Slides 6-15 in Appendix I. The following discussion surrounds the presentation. Slide titles are underlined.

Robyn indicated that some of the activities that are being worked on at the meeting might revolve around providing feedback to other members on the challenges that they are experiencing in their own organization or with their own personal goals, and those conversations will just be one-on-one with other members. Robyn indicated that members who have not signed their member's agreement can do so at the meeting or email her a copy. Robyn further stated that the City has a website called Public Appointments and groups like CEWG are listed there, including names of the members. Robyn stated they would like to publish this group as well. Robyn stated that if a member does not want their name posted on the City's website to contact with her.

Meeting Activities

Robyn Shyllit presented on meeting activities.

The presentation content for this section is in slide 16 in Appendix I. The following is a summary and captures discussion surrounding the presentation. Slide titles are underlined.

The theme for year one is convene and explore. There will be four meetings throughout the year. This meeting focuses on circular economy 101 and getting feedback on some of the case studies that SWMS is preparing. Meeting 2 is expected to focus on the vendor engagement strategy. Meeting 3 is expected to focus on circular economy baseline mapping, and meeting 4 is expected to focus on guiding development of the circular economy roadmap and reflecting on the year together.

Annette Synowiec indicated that this meeting schedule is a preliminary plan. The plan may change as the year progresses. Meeting 2 Vendor Engagement Strategy relates back to work being done on the City's circular economy procurement framework. As part of that framework, the City is looking at potentially engaging with vendors on how they can provide services and goods to the City in a circular way. This work is in progress and the group could be asked to provide comments.

Robyn Shyllit discussed the meeting format and indicated that one of the central ideas of the working group is that there is a focus both on member-to-member connections as well as the more typical consultation and feedback opportunities. There is time set aside in the meeting for goal setting, brainstorming and problem solving with other members. Meetings are meant to be dynamic.

Member-to-Member activities

Robyn Shyllit presented on member-to-member activities.

The presentation content for this section is in slide 17 in Appendix I. The following is a summary and captures discussion surrounding the presentation. Slide titles are underlined.

Robyn discussed the member's workbook that was provided when members signed-in. It explained some of the member-to-member activities that would be done at this meeting as well as future meetings.

<u>Grow Goals</u>: The idea is that members of the group set their own goals related to circular economy initiatives in one's own work and research, or organization, or related to one's own personal life.

<u>Solution circles</u>: Solution circles will be introduced at meeting 2, and this is a way to get feedback from a few other working group members, so members will be talking in groups of three or even their whole table if they are experiencing a challenge they would like feedback on. It is an informal exercise where the idea is that there are people who may be able to support each other with various expertise at different points of their career.

<u>100 Mentors</u>: There are approximately 40 to 50 people in this working group, and the goal of this activity is for members to engage with each other outside of these meetings, whether it is through mentorship or to learn more about different aspects of the circular economy, there is a sign up list. Robyn indicated that the City has confidentiality restrictions, so if a member is not signed up, their contact information will not be shared. If members miss the opportunity to sign up at the meeting, they may contact Robyn to be included.

Long Term Waste Management Strategy Overview

Robyn Shyllit introduced Annette Synowiec.

The presentation content for this section are in Slides 18-25 in Appendix I. The following captures discussion surrounding the presentation.

Member Comment: A member indicated that various projects are open to public and private partnerships like market development. The member wants further information on what is being done.

Annette Synowiec stated that the Division is focused on the projects already underway and would need a business case and evaluation of resources for new projects before taking them on at this time. **Annette Synowiec** indicated that, in 2017, the City conducted a pilot test to densify expanded polystyrene, which made it easier to transport so that more end markets could be sought. To date, the City has very limited ability to market this material and, if densification was adopted, markets would continue to be difficult to find and the labour required for such operations might make it cost prohibitive.

Member Comment: A CEWG member wondered if the elimination or reduction of technologies that add to waste is being looked at. The member provided the example of coffee pods - an invention to get people to buy a piece of machinery so that people can use other things to create more waste. The member wondered if that would be part of the mandate, and whether organizations would say they prefer not to encourage technologies that would add to waste.

Annette Synowiec stated that they would not have the span of control to influence those types of products and materials from being created, but stated that the single-use packaging consultations are underway, with a report coming out in a couple of months.

Member Comment: A CEWG member indicated that one of the objectives of the Long Term Waste Management Strategy is to make Toronto the first municipality in Ontario with a circular economy, and asks if there are other municipalities in Canada that are already.

Annette Synowiec stated that there are many leading municipalities that are doing great things, for example Vancouver and the City of Guelph. **Annette Synowiec** stated that she does not know of other municipalities in which Council has adopted CE as an aspirational goal and in which a specific unit is dedicated to implementing it.

Member Comment: A member asked how SWMS's work might influence or shape other levels of government.

Annette Synowiec stated that SWMS was a participant on a webinar on plastic waste on February 21, 2019 that was part of a series hosted by the Federation of Canadian Municipalities and the National Zero Waste Council. **Annette Synowiec** stated that they can bring together cities to learn from each other, and to share approaches. SWMS will comment on the Discussion Paper: Reducing Litter and Waste in our Communities released March 6, 2019 by the Province. Annette stated there is some dialogue with the Federal Government, which does have a circular economy business unit, and they have been interested with the work on procurement.

Robyn Shyllit prompted the group to move into the next activity. The goal of this activity is defining the circular economy for one's own audience, work or organization. The City does have a definition being used in its work. Robyn indicated that ideas should be written down individually, then exchanged with a partner, then reviewed with the table before a report back.

Activity 2: Understanding the Circular Economy

Individual Work Ideas – The Circular Economy is...

- A system/process where items that reach the end of life becomes the supply for someone else's/own needs.
- A holistic system based approach to understanding metabolic relationships between production, consumption and disposal.
- Materials or products are returned to use in some fashion either the same way or repurposed resulting in zero waste
- Metabolism of physical resources, energy, and wastes are cycled through a system taking a full lifecycle approach to their extraction processing, use, re-use and when they reach their end of life, materials can be disassembled and properly managed
- Finding markets for hard to recycle materials versus eliminating those materials all together
- The circular economy prioritizes the whole life and interrelated systems of a product/service
- A circular economy moves away from the linear economy approach of extraction & disposal
- The circular economy recognizes that all materials go somewhere & that resources are finite
- A systematic and innovative approach to changing behaviour, consumption and production for all members of society in order to reduce wasted resources and prevent more environmental damage.
- Redefining economy or economics
- New way for things to be produced or exchanged in the market
- Slow growth or no growth economy
- Is a process to use a product from production to disintegration without taking it to the landfill
- Effectively and efficiently extending the life of a product, which eventually can be made into a new product with less strain on resources
- Extend the life of the resources used in products and services
- Keep products and packaging and materials at their highest value by applying life cycle and sustainable material management approaches along with the principles of the circular economy. Circular economy and SMM are complimentary approaches to achieve zero waste
- A system that prioritizes reduction of resource extraction, re-use of materials, sharing things and preventing stuff from going to landfill
- An opportunity to turn scrap into gold
- Extending the life of product, and assuming responsibility for waste into the community
- An economy that takes the full life cycle into consideration of a product, system, or service at every stage of creation and production
- Placing responsibility on producers for end of life decisions of products
- Eliminating use of materials that can't be remanufactured/disassembled
- CE is an economy that relies on reusable products and service with single use as the exception rather than the rule.
- A contained set of value exchanges between people and objects and the materials they are created from

- Creating zero waste during the manufacturing of goods and following nature where everything has a use
- Being more productive with resources per GDP output. Creates local jobs, lowers GHG emissions, and less resources are used
- A way of operating as a society where all resources are used as many times as possible
- Continued re-use of resources in the economy as approved to end use in disposal/destruction
- Captures the monetized savings derived from minimizing, avoiding, redirecting, or reproducing goods that won't otherwise form waste in order to self-fund

Group Report Back – The circular economy is...

A CEWG member reported back on behalf of each table.

The members defined circular economy as:

- less resource use while increasing GDP
- retaining value in the system and regeneration of resources
- a lifecycle approach to design with an intention to increase the lifespans of products
- local, collaborative, creates local jobs
- reduces GHG emissions and reduces the need for resources and reduces pollution
- decoupling growth from resource consumption and considering the why, what, and how
- not always waste and disposal: it is the embedded value and using to fullest potential.
- a systematic and innovative approach to changing behaviour, consumption, and production for all members of society in order to reduce wasted resources and to prevent environmental damage
- a system process approach or methodology that conceptualizes existing materials as resources for the future
- spoke a lot about the re-use and repair and upcycling of things
- maintaining the value of resources and a cradle to cradle approach to everything.
- zero waste or hopefully zero waste, on a local economy basis
- social equity so that all income levels in society could be included and have access
- full costs: to benefit both society and the environment and include low carbon preferably with emission reductions rather than increases
- inclusion of products, waste, and services
- a form of urban planning

Presentation 2: Circular Economy: Developing our Shared Definition

Annette Synowiec and Kathy Raddon presented on the Circular Economy: Developing our Shared Definition.

The presentation content for this section are in Slides 26-37 in Appendix I.

Member Question: Has Toronto benchmarked itself against where we stand compared to other cities, or is that on the roadmap to benchmark?

Annette Synowiec explained that benchmarking a landscape analysis of CE readiness is in the plan for the upcoming roadmap development. Once the circular economy roadmap is at the foundational level, opportunities, gaps, and ambitions will be looked at, as well as what similarities other cities have to Toronto conditions.

Member Question: Is there is a plan to look at best practices internationally or within North America?

Annette Synowiec indicated that SWMS's membership in the Ellen MacArthur Foundation (an international organization) is part of that. SWMS has dialogue with London, UK, Scandinavian countries, and the US, in the cities network. Annette indicated that bi-monthly by the Ellen MacArthur Foundation convenes a Government and Cities call for sharing best practices.

Year 1-3 Objectives

Annette Synowiec presented Year one to three Objectives.

The presentation content for this section is in Slide 39 in Appendix I.

Activity 3: CEWG Objectives

Robyn Shyllit introduced the activity and advised that groups make notes directly on the handed out scrap papers, or on the larger chart paper. The goal of this activity is for group members to provide feedback on if Year 1, 2, and 3 objectives make sense, do they meet member expectations, and if there is anything missing or that should be included.

Activity 3: CEWG Objectives - Individual Notes Do the year 1-3 objectives make sense? Do they meet your expectations? Is anything missing? What else could be included?

- Would like clarification on how to engage as a group
- GAP analysis to identify project need
- Need specific end goals
- Need ways of engaging (support clusters) with government to deliver circular economy projects or case studies
- Policies fees on wastes?
- Market incentives already happening (e.g. bottle deposits)
- Clear communication plan
- Sector focus?
- Need tangible end goals and saving goals
- Increased awareness
- Tangible outcomes
- Education? Policy? Industry?
- Plan integration at every step
- Action or a benchmark which is measured throughout
- Establish metrics
- Pilot projects
- Bans?
- Educational initiatives
- Harmonization efforts with other municipalities, companies and countries
- Too slow
- Year 3 should happen at every stage
- Expectations for what to expect, outcomes and participation
- Subgroups: develop industry specific working groups to focus knowledge then can cross pollinate with others
- Year 1 and Year 2 should both include action
- How can we speed up the process?

- Like the cross pollination but wonder if there should be sector specific meetings to move forward
- Need to have a discussion about challenges to overcome
- Give us/let's develop some low hanging fruit to start moving
- Needs to be resource recovery
- Theory of change

Activity 3: CEWG Objectives - Group Report Back Do the year 1-3 make sense? Do they meet your expectations? Is anything missing? What else could be included?

A CEWG member reported back on behalf of each table.

- The most important idea of their discussion was how the group could speed up the process.
- There are kids on the streets discussing their future, and that three years is a long time to find a way towards a solution.
- The group likes cross pollination, as it is exciting, but highlights that moving forward in a more efficient way may mean sitting sector by sector, or working groups within working groups.
- The group is also interested in having ministry representatives at meetings at it will be helpful to have Ontario and Canada wide representatives present who can make policy changes.
- Thought it was all good stuff, but not enough focus on tangible end goals, and indicated that there should be something towards the end that can be pointed to, to indicate what will be achieved.
- Thought that there was no indication of education and no focus on policy either. The member stated that the comment made about the desire for the Ministry's presence at the meetings were good and indicated that they are the ones who are really going to make the change.
- Recommends more focus on communication, and a focus on a bottom-up and top-down approaches: policy focus on the top-down and education on the bottom-up.
- That the process is too slow, and that sector specific subgroups would be helpful but also bringing those groups
- Mixing members up to share ideas and get a full picture would also be helpful.
- That year 3 can be integrated within the other two years and are not sure why it is on its own.
- The group had the same sense of urgency that other groups had, with anything to do to set interim goals.
- The group thought there was an opportunity to focus on taking inventory or benchmarking current assets in the group and identifying the shared challenges to identify faster solutions.
- Also discussed urgency and how taking a full year to convene and explore is not concrete enough.
- Discussed the need to have more benchmarking on the City's side, to get more specifics on what the City is doing and how they are measuring what they currently have.
- Would like to have more clarity about what the City wants from this group overall and how specifically members can individually and collectively help with what is underway as well as City goals
- Would like to know whether there are limitations or drawbacks to the circular economy as a concept, and that if there is anything that has already been studied or something we should know about downsides and negatives to the economy.

- The key is to engage, but it is unclear how to engage with the process.
- The group would also like the gap analysis' to start to see what projects would be most impactful and useful in the current landscape.
- The group would also like to understand the supports available for the group as part of the process.

In response to the comments above:

Robyn Shyllit stated if there are ideas for the sub-committees structure, that members can provide feedback on the wall during the meeting or to send an email with ideas.

Annette Synowiec asked for clarification on what the group meant by current inventories, meaning materials that are in process now and can be better used or inventory of collective knowledge or services. The member indicated that there are any areas that are not being addressed, like how much material is being kept circular.

Annette Synowiec stated that the context of the timing was not well articulated in the presentation and that the reason for the three years plan was that it coincides with the five year review of the Long Term Waste Management Strategy. **Annette Synowiec** stated that they are hoping by the end of year 3 there will be a new mandate developed with clear actions and tangible benefits.

Annette Synowiec stated that it may not be possible to speed up some of the timelines. However, she indicated that she can report back to the Senior Leadership Team, and members of the Circular Economy Cross-Divisional Working Group, that there is energy and enthusiasm at CEWG, and that group wants to move on things. Annette added that the report back to the team and group will assist in making action happen faster.

Presentation 3: Circular Economy Case Studies

Robyn Shyllit introduces Kathy Raddon

The presentation content for this section are in Slides 43-47 in Appendix I. The following captures discussion surrounding the presentation.

Annette Synowiec commented that the case studies were chosen through looking for local examples that provided circular economy examples or activations around the value chains -- whether that be different business model transformations and reduction of reuse or repairs, there was at least one example of each. **Annette Synowiec** added that they wanted to highlight local examples and said there are others that exist in Toronto. For example, Toronto Tool Library has been case studied by National Zero Waste Council, which is actively promoted; as well as Rent Frock Repeat, which is a clothing-based rental. **Annette Synowiec** adds that input from the meeting will inform some of the case studies to be created.

Robyn Shyllit indicated that the goal is to use these case studies as an educational tool.

Activity 4: Case Study Discussion

Robyn Shyllit indicated that the goal of the activity is to indicate what is missing from the list of case studies, as well as for groups to provide input in other organizations or groups that they would like to see featured. Robyn added that groups can provide ideas on how to share and promote the case studies.

Kathy Raddon indicated that what is being looked at is the feedback on how case studies and activities are advancing the circular economy.

Activity 4: Case Study Discussion – Written Comments

Is anything missing from the draft list of case studies?

- What the City is doing? Should have similar case studies
- Highlight efforts of commercial enterprises
- Missing new ways of growing food in City centres (Not Far From the Tree) and other studies that highlight more than one organization (i.e. "furniture rescue", Furniture Bank, Habitat for Humanity
- Second Harvest, Greenest City Environment, Not Far from the Tree, Industry, Bike Pirates, Architecture, East Harbour Eco-District Certification, Evergreen Brickworks
- Fashion upcycling
- Ikea Canada Sell Back Program
- Procurement vs. Service Case Study

How can we promote and share the case studies?

- Website? Social media?
- Online platforms
- Data bases
- OpEds

Activity 4: Case Study Discussion – Report Back

Member Comment: the case studies are narrow and small.

Annette Synowiec stated, based on feedback the remaining case studies could be examples of larger business activation in the City. The member indicated that it is enterprise scale that is going to move.

Member Comment: There could be of civil, public, and private sectors working together

Member Comment: Want to be able to scale it up and learn as much as they can and apply it to the national model. The member adds that Second Hand Sundays has templates and media tool kits, and with that it would be easier to scale up the community based aspect.

Member Comment: Case studies should not be restricted to Toronto as there are international activities that are important, for example, IBM has a very successful program for recycling computer parts.

Member Comment: provided example of the Ikea Sell Back service.

Activity 5: GROW Goal Setting

Robyn Shyllit stated that they will work on member's goal setting, checking in with each other, and the progress and goals.

Members worked on their own and with peers on their GROW Goals for 15 minutes.

Next Steps and Announcements

Robyn Shyllit stated that the meeting will end with announcements.

Announcements were presented by Annette Synowiec.

The presentation content for this section is in slide 50 in Appendix I. The following captures discussion surrounding the presentation.

Other member announcements include:

A member from Sustainable Media Production Canada suggested looking on the sustainablemediacan.ca website for material exchange information. The member indicated there is a Green Vendor Directory where they can apply.

Another member stated that Second Harvest in the last year has released a platform called FoodRescue.ca, an opportunity for food businesses to post good food donations through the system. It fosters local partnerships and is free to use.

Robyn Shyllit wrapped up the meeting, reminded individuals to use the wall sign-ups, and stated that members will receive a meeting evaluation in the next week.

Robyn Shyllit indicated the next meeting will be either June 19, June 20, or June 21 based on availability.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:00pm.

Attendees

Alison Creba, Consultant Annalee Sawiak, Furniture Link Caroline Brooks, SecondHand Sunday Eadaoin Quinn, EFS Plastics Emilia Hurd, University of Toronto Emily Alfred, Toronto Environmental Alliance Frances Schagen, Business Owners Success Club Gary Diamond, Shift Recycling Inc. Hazel Sutton, BOMA Helen Melbourne, Creative Reuse Toronto Helene St. Jacques, Consulting Ivan Renco, Container Pros Ivan Wadgymar, Maizal Jay Thakkar, ERM John Ashbee, Green Science John Muller, Tetratech Joseph P. Hruska, Canadian Plastics Industry Association Katie Motta, Shift Circular Keir Brownstone, Toronto Community Housing Kelly Drennan, Fashion Takes Action Leah Barrett, George Brown College Lisa Sloan. Celestica Lori Andrews, Dillon Consulting Kiera Toffelmire, Second Harvest (rep. for Lori Nikkel)

Melissa Mirowski, IKEA Canada Michael Scott, MG Scott and Associates Michael Zabaneh, Canada Fibres Ltd. Nicolas Vergara, University of Chile Panagiotis Panagiotakopolous, University of Toronto Paul Chan, BUNZ Gordon Day, Emterra Group (rep. for Paulina Leung) Rabi Gautam, Defence Construction Canada Rodney Yip, Consultant Ryan Fukunaga, Free Geek Safa Jinje, Journalist Sarah Lazarovic, Action Design Network Sarah Margolius, Sustainable Media Production Canada Shirin Karoubi, Trade Council North America Sophi Robertson, Toronto Tool Library Steven Bourne, Ripple Farms Todd Kostal, Atlantic Packaging Vanessa Farquharson, Earth Day Canada Victoria Ho, OCAD University Wai Chu Cheng, Repair Café Toronto

Staff

Annette Synowiec, Manager Business Operations and Change Management, Solid Waste Management Services Joshua Wise, Toronto Urban Fellow Kathy Raddon, Project Lead, Solid Waste Management Services Robyn Shyllit, Senior Public Consultation Coordinator, Public Consultation Unit Tamara Staranchuck, Senior Communications Coordinator, Strategic Communications

Circular Economy Working Group





Agenda & Introductions



Time	Activity		
1:00	Welcome, Agenda, Full Room Introductions		
1:05	Activity 1: Roundtable Introductions		
1:15	Terms of Reference, and meeting activity overview		
1:25	Presentation 1: Long Term Waste Management Strategy overview		
1:45	Activity 2: The Circular Economy is		
2:00	Presentation 2: Circular Economy 101, Unit for Research Innovation and Circular Economy, CEWG objectives		
2:30	Activity 3: CEWG Objectives		
2:45	BREAK		
3:00	Presentation 3: Circular Economy Case Studies		
3:10	Activity 4: Case Study brainstorm		
3:25	Activity 5: GROW member goal setting		
3:45	Next steps & announcements		
4:00	Meeting Adjourns		
In TORONTO 3 Solid Waste Management Services			

Full room (5 minutes)

- 1. Name
- 2. Affiliation



What do you hope to get out of this group? From other members? From the City?

 ✓ Individual work Think and write down a few ideas (1 minute) 	Find a partner at your table and talk about your ideas (2 minutes)	Discuss ideas with your table and choose the top 3 (5 minutes)	Report back & place notes on wall. (1 minute/ group)
---	--	---	---

In Toronto

Terms of Reference & Meeting Overview



Terms of Reference 1.0

1.0 Introduction/Background

In July 2016, City Council adopted the Long Term Waste Management Strategy, including the recommendation that:

A Circular Economy Waste Reduction Advisory Group will be established to provide input into ongoing waste reduction planning processes, specifically those identified in the Waste Strategy. This Advisory Group will support the City's efforts to reduce waste and support innovation, with a specific focus on the development and implementation of efforts that support a circular economy.



Terms of Reference 2.0

2.0 Mandate

Members of the committee are expected to:

- Share their experience and knowledge in achieving circularity within their organizations and commit to continuous learning, promotion of circular practices and opportunities, and capacity building within Toronto
- Participate in group activities, and provide honest and constructive feedback to peers
- Provide expertise-based input into the City of Toronto's circular economy program, planning, and research documents when requested
- Represent their sector or organization's perspective at key program planning stages as Toronto moves towards becoming the Province's first circular city
- Liaise with City Staff in Solid Waste Management Services and potentially other City divisions, on the development of initiatives and programs that support a Circular Economy and the adoption of circular practices
- Consider matters relevant to the delivery of Solid Waste Management programs when requested

- Promote and share information on relevant Solid Waste Management programs and issues when requested
- Comply with this Terms of Reference document

CEWG members will not:

- Be provided with a forum to solicit products or services
- Receive commercial or employment opportunities from the City of Toronto as a result of the Group's discussions or activities
- Provide unsolicited submissions or recommendations for consideration by City staff



Terms of Reference 3.0

3.0 Term & Attendance

- The membership term of the Group is from 2019 2021, and will meet approximately four (4) times a year. Members may be expected to participate in smaller working groups and workshops as necessary, with variable time commitments up to 10 hours per month.
- Each meeting is expected to last approximately three (3) hours, held during the day, at a central venue accessible by public transit.
- Group members are expected to commit to making time to participate in all meetings. If necessary they can send an alternate delegate from the organization they represent (notifying City Staff of the change), and liaise with the delegate before/after the meeting to share necessary information in preparation and follow up.
- If a member misses two (2) consecutive meetings their membership will be evaluated and may be revoked.



Terms of Reference 4.0

4.0 Roles and Responsibilities

Group members will:

- 1. Agree to this Terms of Reference (TOR)
- 2. Attend Group meetings (and send a delegate when not able to attend) for the duration of membership
- Review any information provided in advance of meetings, sometimes within a limited time frame (City staff will always aim to provide materials at least two (2) weeks in advance of Group meetings)
- 4. Provide feedback on information presented, and bring the perspective they represent to discussion
- 5. Participate fully in activities including peerbased case studies, solution circles, goal setting, and mentoring
- 6. Review and provide written comments on draft documents as required
- 7. Work cooperatively with City Staff and other members
- 8. Continuously learn through information presented

- 9. Liaise within the organization they represent and disseminate information where appropriate
- 10. Participate in subcommittees or any other activities if required
- 11. Refrain from participating in any sales-like activity, such as the promotion of a product or service to which a member has a commercial tie

City staff will:

- 1. Coordinate and facilitate all meetings
- 2. Circulate information to members in advance of meetings via email
- 3. Provide timely responses to questions and comments
- 4. Record meeting minutes and share drafts for member review
- 5. Listen and consider feedback from the Group to help set meeting agendas and programming
- 6. Consider all feedback received, and report back to members on action items



Terms of Reference 5.0 to 7.0

5.0 Decision Making

Working Group members are encouraged to bring varied perspectives to the meetings for discussion. Final decisions will be made by City Staff.

6.0 Membership

Any changes to membership will be decided by City staff. Non-Group members may attend meetings as observers, if space permits. Observers are generally expected to listen and priority will be given to members.

7.0 Operating Procedure

Membership is voluntary and a public service. Members will not be remunerated or receive an honorarium.

All Group members will work to identify common ground, as well as areas where opinions may differ. All feedback will be documented in the meeting minutes, along any action items and measures to be taken in response to discussions or recommendations.



Terms of Reference 8.0 – 9.0

8.0 Facilitation

Meetings will be chaired or facilitated by the City's Public Consultation Unit. The role of the Facilitator is to ensure that meeting agendas are adhered to, and that all CEWG members have the opportunity to be heard and participate in the development of feedback, advice, and recommendations; participate in activities; and learn from each other.

Guest speakers and member presentations may be included in meeting agendas.

9.0 Agendas, Notes & Materials

A draft agenda for each meeting will be circulated a minimum of 2 weeks in advance along with any information or materials for the meeting. Minutes of meetings will be recorded by City staff and circulated to members for review prior to finalization. Members will also receive meeting support information as required.



Terms of Reference 10.0

10.0 Principles of Working Together

The following sets some principles on how the Group will work together and conduct itself at meetings:

- 1. Everybody will be given the opportunity to participate
- 2. Meetings will start on time and end on time
- 3. All viewpoints will be listened to and respected
- 4. Everyone can ask for clarification if they don't understand
- 5. Everybody will listen and be heard
- 6. Participants shall not request that items outside of the mandate of the Group be discussed at meetings.
- 7. Only respectful language will be used
- 8. Everyone will come to meetings prepared
- 9. Members will actively participate in meetings, provide feedback, and bring forward ideas including any impacts or opportunities related to the work of their organization
- 10. Private discussions and personal calls shall be held outside of the meeting room while the meeting is in progress



Terms of Reference 12.0

12.0 Member's Agreement

Section 1: Commitment

I agree to join the City of Toronto's Circular Economy Working Group (CEWG). I will make every effort to attend each meeting of the CEWG, and I will email the group facilitator in advance if I am unable to attend a meeting. It is understood that if I miss meetings my membership is in jeopardy.

Section 2: Participation

I will do my best to participate in meetings and make myself available to offer support to other CEWG members when needed. I will do my best to stay on track with goals and will reach out to other members when I need peer support.

Section 3: Confidentiality

I understand that some discussions held at meetings through member-led solution circles, goal setting, or 1-on-1 mentorship are private and confidential.



Terms of Reference

12.0 Members Agreement

Sign-off required

Public Appointments Website

Posting of CEWG members on Toronto.ca public appointments webpage.

Contact

Robyn Shyllit, Senior Public Consultation Coordinator

Robyn.Shyllit@toronto.ca

416-392-3358



Year 1: Convene and explore





Member-to-Member Activities





City of Toronto Circular Economy Backgrounder

Unit for Research, Innovation, & a Circular Economy March 22, 2019





Waste Strategy

Approved by City Council in July 2016

16 Recommendations adopted

Zero Waste Goal

70% Diversion by 2026

3Rs Policy & Program Focus, includes enhanced P&E and enforcement

70% Diversion of waste collected from commercial customers

Mixed Waste Processing w/ Organics Processing

Testing in first 5 years Business case in 2021



Long Term Waste Management Strategy

- One of the adopted recommendations of the Waste Strategy was for the creation of a Unit for Research, Innovation, & a Circular Economy (UFRICE)
- UFRICE is involved in research and planning as well as incorporating Circular Economy principles into new programs, policies, procurement and processes.



MToronto

UFRICE: Unit for Research, Innovation & a Circular Economy



<u>Origin</u>

Business Unit created out of a Long-Term Waste Management Strategy recommendation

Mandate

Conduct research, proof of concept pilots, and incorporate Circular Economy principles into new City programs and processes

<u>Goal</u>

Make Toronto the first municipality in Ontario with a Circular Economy

M TORONTO

Work to date: UFRICE



M Toronto
Cross-City Working Group Collaboration



- Solid Waste Management Services
- Purchasing and Materials Management
- Toronto Water
- Toronto Public Health
- Transportation Services

- Parks, Forestry, and Recreation
- Environment and Energy
- City Planning
- Economic Development and Culture
- Facilities Management

D Toronto

2018 Circular Economy Charrette

- Solid Waste Management Services convened a group of 42 stakeholders representing 12+ economic sectors.
- Collectively the group produced a list of 6 action areas and over 100 unique activities for potential future adoption by the CEWG.
- 3 Action Areas for potential focus:
 - 1. Offering education and promotion programs to enhance public awareness
 - 2. Developing incentives to drive behaviour change for consumers and businesses
 - **3.** Supporting development of collaborative spaces and programs





DA TORONTO

2019 Outlook: UFRICE



- First meeting of Circular Economy Working Group
 - 3 more meetings in 2019
- Developing a Circular Economy Baseline and Roadmap
 - Scope of work elements drafted: Target Q3 2019
- Mixed Waste Processing with Organics Recovery project
- Events:
 - Recycling Council of Ontario: Circular Procurement Forum
 - June, 2019
- Continue to implement CE procurement framework 2019-2020



Understanding the Circular Economy



Understanding the Circular Economy

The circular economy is...

 ✓ Individual work
 Think about or jot down some ideas
 (1 minute) Find a partner at your table and exchange ideas
(3 minutes) Discuss ideas with your table, and choose your top ideas.

(6 minutes)

Note your top ideas and report back (1 minute/ group)



Circular Economy: Developing our shared definition





Solid Waste Management Services

Existing examples of Circularity

Urban Wood Local Business Development

Salvaging downed urban trees as resource for local business development

Curbside Bins

Contracts specifying durability and allowing for bin repair

Waste Collection Fleet

Capital Investment of Purchase of Natural Gas vehicles & CNG/RNG fuelling stations







Principles of a Circular Economy 1





Principles of a Circular Economy 2





Principles of a Circular Economy 3





Circular Economy in Cities

New resources from the Ellen MacArthur Foundation for urban policymakers:

- Vision: what will the implementation of CE principles in cities look like?
- Factsheets: what benefits can CE transition in key urban system bring to cities?
- **Policy levers**: what can urban policymakers do to accelerate this transition?
- Case studies: what examples are there of urban policymakers already putting this in to action?
- Networks and resources: what are other organizations doing on the topic of circular economy and cities?





CE in Cities: Factsheets

Focus on three inter-related urban systems:

- Buildings (residential and commercial)
- Mobility (transport, freight, vehicles and infrastructure)
- Products (includes Toronto's nine key sectors)

Each system has five associated factsheets focusing on a different phase in CE cycle: planning, designing, making, accessing, and operating & maintaining





CE in Cities: Urban Policy Levers





Circular Economy: a shared definition





Applying the Circular Economy approach to city services

A Circular Economy approach to service delivery challenges the City to rethink how it can provide services to residents based on three core principles:

- 1) We can find new ways to deliver our services, purchase materials that we need to do our work, and enter into contracts with service providers in a way that reduces our reliance on non-renewable resources and minimizes our carbon footprint.
- 2) Once any resource is in use, we can find ways to collaborate with others or ask the marketplace and industry to work on opportunities to extend resource lifecycles to ensure maximum useful potential (think reduce, share, repair, reuse, recycle and energy recovery from organics).
- 3) We can continue looking for ways to redesign our systems and service delivery in order to reduce any waste or inefficiency through a combination of research, collaboration, innovation, prototyping and pilot projects



Year 1-3 Objectives



Group Objectives

Year 1 Convene & Explore	Year 2 Comment & Collaborate	Year 3 Reflect & Plan
Create, convene, and connect a new Toronto CE network to:	Consult members and receive feedback on:	Consult members and receive feedback on:
 Learn together and build CE capacity through knowledge sharing, learning, and peer support activities Explore how CE is evolving in member organizations and develop actions for members to take back to their own initiatives Gain understanding of tools needed by Group members to support CE initiatives Inform and engage members 	 Relevant CE related SWMS programs Waste Strategy implementation activities Where City support is required to convene stakeholders Draft CE roadmap, including relevant collaboration opportunities 	 CE roadmap implementation activities Reflect on working group activities, plans, and structure Identify next steps and actions for the Group
on relevant CE related SWMS programs	Continue year 1 activities as required.	Continue year 1 & 2 activities as required.

M TORONTO

Group Objectives Questions

Do the year 1-3 make sense? Do they meet your expectations? Is anything missing? What else could be included?

 Individual work Jot down some ideas on your own (1 minute) 	Find a partner at your table and exchange your ideas (3 minutes)	Come together with your table and discuss ideas *record notes on the chart at your table	Yote your top ideas and report back (1 minute/ group)
		(6 minutes)	



Break!



Time	Activity	
1:00	Welcome & Agenda Review	
1:05	Activity 1: Roundtable Introductions	
1:15	Terms of Reference, and meeting activity overview	
1:25	Presentation 1: Long Term Waste Management Strategy overview	
1:45	Activity 2: The Circular Economy is	
2:00	Presentation 2: Circular Economy 101, Unit for Research Innovation and Circular Economy, CEWG objectives	
2:30	Activity 3: CEWG Objectives	
2:45	BREAK	
3:00	Presentation 3: Circular Economy Case Studies	
3:10	Activity 4: Case Study brainstorm	
3:25	Activity 5: GROW member goal setting	
3:45	Next steps & announcements	
4:00	Meeting Adjourns	
	Nute Solid Waste Management Services	

ITORONTO

Case Studies



Case Studies Objectives

Objectives:

- Develop a publication with examples of initiatives that demonstrate a range of local actions that contribute to making Toronto's economy more circular
- Showcase local examples of how businesses and non-profits are advancing the circular economy, through the distribution of these case studies.
- Promote the replication and/or scaling up the circular economy initiatives and activities demonstrated, through sharing the case study package.



M TORONTO

Case Studies - Examples

Organization	Advances the Circular Economy by
Feed it Forward pay-what-you-can Grocery Store, Bakery & Coffee Shop	 Seeing value in wasted food Providing food at a flexible price to increase access
Free Geek Toronto Computer Refurbishment	 Refurbishing and repairing before recycling Increasing access to technology (computers and the internet) Skills training, leading towards employment
Bare Market Package-Free Goods pop-up store	 Using a business model (pop-up store) to provide greater access to natural products Promoting zero-waste
Second-hand Sundays Community reuse events	Organizing to promote sharing and reuseValuing used household items



Case Studies – Examples

Organization	Advances the Circular Economy by
Bunz Trading Platform	Valuing used items to extend their lifeIncreasing local circulation of used goods
Furniture Bank Collecting and distributing furnishings	 Providing access to used durable goods Prolonging the use/ lifespan of durable goods
Tiny Toy Co. Repurposes toys/ toy parts	Promoting creative reuseProlonging the use/ lifespan of durable goods
Material Exchange Program Partners in Project Green initiative	 Connecting companies to keep materials in circulation
Spent Goods Co. Connects breweries and bakeries	 Seeing nutritional value in spent grain
Other case studies?	To be determined
	46 Solid Wasto Managomont Sorvices



Organization	Advances the Circular Economy by
Feed it Forward	Seeing value in wasted foodProviding food at a flexible price to increase access
Free Geek Toronto	 Refurbishing and repairing before recycling Increasing access to technology Skills training, leading towards employment
Bare Market	 Using a business model (pop-up) to increase access to natural products Promote zero-waste
Second-hand Sundays	Organizing to promote sharing and reuseValuing used household items
Bunz	Valuing used items to extend their lifeIncreasing local circulation of used goods
Furniture Bank	Providing access to used durable goodsProlonging the use/lifespan of durable goods
Tiny Toy Co.	Promoting creative reuseProlonging the use/lifespan of durable goods
Material Exchange Program	 Connecting companies to keep materials in circulation
Spent Goods Co.	Seeing nutritional value in spent grain
DI TORONTO	47 Solid Waste Management Services

Case Study Discussion

- 1. Is anything missing from the draft list of Case Studies?
- 2. How can we promote and share the case studies?
- 3. Are the circular economy principles clear in each case study? If not, how you would you make them more clear?





What do you want to focus on during your time in the CEWG?

- Individual work

Use your workbook to jot down ideas on your own

(10 minutes)

 Find a partner at your table and exchange your ideas
 Fill in your first steps together
 (10 minutes total, 5 minutes/person)

M TORONTO

Announcements

- New consultation: Toronto Green Industries. Economic Development is seeking input on the development of a green industry roadmap. Participate via: <u>Checkmarket</u> Survey closes April 30, 2019
- Request for Footage: Environment & Climate Change Canada Circular Economy to be incorporated into a video that will showcase circular economy activities currently underway across Canada. The video would be used to promote interest in the 2020 World Circular Economy Forum and launch it at the 2019 World Circular Economy Forum in Helsinki, Finland (June 3-5). Send any footage along with a signed copy of the copyright license form by April 3rd, 2019. Contact: Leah Canning Senior Policy Advisor, Strategic Policy Directorate, Environment and Climate Change Canada / Government of Canada. leah.canning@canada.ca
- Event: Textile Diversion & Recycling Symposium (April 11, 2019) Hosted by the Ontario Textile Diversion Collaborative. This Symposium will delve into various textile diversion strategies, provide the opportunity to learn from global leaders who are making fashion circular, find meaningful ways to collaborate, and together change a system that is clearly broken. Eventbrite



Next



- Meeting evaluation
 - Meeting 2: date TBD, June 19, 20, or 21, 2019.
 - Provide your availability for Meeting 2 in the post meeting evaluation.





Group

Activities

Guest

Speakers

100

Mentors