

Community Benefits Advisory Group

Meeting Minutes- February 25 2021

1:00- 3:00pm

Virtual Meeting, Held on WebEx

Attendees	
<i>City of Toronto</i>	<i>Name</i>
Economic Development & Culture (EDC)	Dan Rosen (Policy)
	Larissa Deneau (Policy)
	Marilyn Nickel
	Rebecca Condon (IMIT)
Toronto Employment & Social Services (TESS)	Anna Cain
	Christine Carrasco
	Colleen Dignam
Indigenous Affairs Office (IAO)	Selina Young
Purchasing and Materials Management Division (PMMD)	Alexandra Mutinelli-Djukic
	Josefina Lopez
	Kiruba Sankar
	Mike Pacholok
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Alison Stanley (Rexdale CBA)
	April Lim (CBF)
	Chris Phibbs (Chair)
	Clara Ganemtoire (CBF)
	Hanifa Kassam (AnchorTO)
	Layla Jabbour (Student)
CreateTO	Wayne Chu (Poverty Reduction)
Toronto Community Housing	Salima Rawji
	William Mendes
	Sundus Balata (Don Summerville)
<i>Strategic Partner</i>	<i>Name</i>
AECON	Stephanie Chow
Building Up (Social Enterprise)	Marc Soberano
Carpenters District Council of Ontario and Co-Chair TCBN	Chris Campbell
Carpenters Union Local 27	Mike Yorke
Dream Maker Legacy Foundation	Isaac Olowolafe
General Contractors Section	Jim Vlahos
Gillian Mason Consultancy	Gillian Mason
Hammer Heads (Central Ontario Building Trades)	Quoc Truong
Heat and Frost Insulators Local 95	Adam Melnick
Humber College	Geraldine Babcock
Ironworkers Council of Ontario	Marc Arsenault
Jane Finch Family Resource Centre	Clara Stewart Robertson
Labour Education Centre	Steve Shallhorn
LIUNA Local 183	Jason Ottey
LIUNA Local 506 Training Centre	Merissa Preston
Mount Dennis Community Association	Mike Mattos
Ontario Construction Secretariat	Katherine Jacobs
Ontario Sewer and Watermain Contractors Association	Patrick McManus
Out of the Box Social Enterprise	Ameen Binwalee

Parkdale Community Economic Development	Ana Teresa Portillo
TDSB, STEP to Construction Program	Ian Da Silva
Toronto and York Region Labour Council	John Cartwright
Toronto Community Benefits Network	Rosemarie Powell
United Way Greater Toronto	Alex Dow

Regrets	
<i>City of Toronto</i>	<i>Name</i>
Housing Secretariat	Erik Hunter
Indigenous Affairs Office (IAO)	Jeff D'Hondt
Purchasing and Materials Management Division (PMMD)	Jacque Breen
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Anthony Morgan (Confronting Anti-Black Racism)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Sarah Blackstock (Social Policy)
<i>Strategic Partner</i>	<i>Name</i>
AECON	Niall Kerins
Black Business Professionals Association	Pauline Christian
Centre for Connected Communities	Anne Gloger
Metrolinx	Judy Brooks
Ministry of Labour, Training and Skills Development	Dal Swackhammer
Miziwe Biik	Nancy Martin

Community Benefits Advisory Group

Meeting Minutes - February 25 2021

1:00- 3:00pm

Virtual Meeting, Held on WebEx

Item	Discussion/ Comments / Actions
Welcome & Introductions	<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ Welcome and Land Acknowledgement was delivered.▪ City of Toronto and Strategic Partner introductions.<ul style="list-style-type: none">○ What excites you/your organization about Community Benefits?○ What is one problem that you/your organization thinks needs▪ Chris Phibbs, Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA) stated, excited to pull together City strategies to create jobs for residents and stimulate local and economic development.▪ Alex Dow, United Way, is happy to be present in today's Advisory Group and excited to see Community Benefits build and evolve together with strategic partners on the call.▪ Adam Melnick, Insulators95 is enthusiastic as some of community benefits work is breaking barriers into entering the trades. Exciting to be able to create pathways and opportunities for jobs.▪ Ameen Binwalee, Out of the Box Social Enterprise stated, community benefits is a new way of doing business and community development for the future. A problem is addressing strong language and hitting targets.▪ Anna Cain, Toronto Employment & Social Services (TESS) stated, TESS provides financial assistance and employment supports to individuals on Ontario Works. Community benefits will provide boundless opportunities to equity seeking groups in our city.▪ Dan Rosen, Economic Development & Culture (EDC) stated, he is excited for community benefits as an important theme of something to work on in terms of inclusive community economic development.▪ Geraldine Babcock, Humber College stated, the college's mandate is to provide access programs tailored for the community focusing on providing educational opportunities. Developing a social benefits purchasing policy at the college and excited to use it for issues of development and diversity. Developed pre-apprenticeship program for these target groups and want to be able to access those public jobs and better mechanisms to get those opportunities to young folks, women, and disadvantaged groups to get into the trades.

- Gillian Mason, Gillian Mason Consultancy, attending on behalf of the Centre for Connected Communities (C3), stated she is excited about human potential in whatever we are trying to achieve. Community benefits hold the promise of win win scenario where all players along employment pathways choose to work together, every player gets what they're seeking. Community benefits will address poverty reduction and dignity restoration initiative for an equitable post COVID recovery.
- Ian Da Silva, TDSB, STEP to Construction Program. The STEP program provides opportunities for grade 11 and 12 students with a semester long experience in a high-rise construction site in the city. Most excited about the inclusive economic development of young folks and everybody, who are graduating into an amazing future in the future of our city.
- Isaac Olowolafe, Dream Maker Inc., stated Dream Maker Inc. develops and build condos and houses. Dream Maker Legacy Foundation bridging gaps when it comes to home ownership, skilled trades, and access to affordable housing. Excited to be a part of Community Benefits Advisory Group and finding diversity and inclusivity in the field.
- Jason Ottey, Local 183 is looking forward to putting substance and finding solutions. Bringing folks into careers in construction and bringing economic security.
- Jim Vlahos, General Contractors' Association of Toronto is excited about being a part of Community Benefits Advisory Group and contributing to programs that can change people.
- John Cartwright, Toronto & York Region Labour Council – was formed in 1871, and in 1947 they started focusing on racial justice. The Labour Council has been doing work in human rights and anti-racism for decades. Responded to the event of the nooses. Excited about thanking the staff for all the great work they have done. There are community activists especially the Black community who are pushing for more of this work. In the industry, there were challenges forty years ago when we were trying to implement safety and health standards. But now they are saying we should have done it from before. This is a similar case.
- Kiruba Sankar, Purchasing and Materials Management Division (PMMD) is looking forward to the alignment with other programs and policies at the City of Toronto to create a more diverse and underrepresented communities in the city.

- Marc Arsenault, Ironworkers Council of Ontario, stated the City of Toronto has a reputation with progressive initiatives and the expertise to problem solve challenges. Enthusiastic about additional levers that have been demonstrated to work. In the past, the Iron Workers have used threshold indicators, among other measures and targets to advance community benefits.
- Marc Soberano, Building Up (Social Enterprise) stated, given that all the partners in the Community Benefits Advisory Group, we can make it happen. Community benefits can be often over complicated. Building Up is ready to make it happen and fighting for the same thing.
- Mike Mattos, Mount Dennis Community Association stated, he has two concerns: (1) Community benefits need to be community based involved in the community where the action is happening. Not something that disappears in the region and we have no idea of anyone who was been helped. (2) Funds for this group are coming out of the capital works budget leading to the operational budget reduction. Funds that pay for our meeting today and all this work. Community benefits money goes 100% to the community and not just a way to fund things from the capital budget instead of the operational budgets.
- Mike Yorke, Carpenters Union, joined with Chris Campbell. Yorke is excited to be a part of the Community Benefits Advisory Group and partnering with the City of Toronto again. Carpenters Union had a couple of innovative training programs. Excited about turning this into a model and see how we can use it in cities across Ontario and Canada.
- Merissa Preston, LiUNA 506 Training Center, has been involved with community benefits since its beginning and been responsible for training and partnership development. Happy to be on the Community Benefits Advisory Group, but it's important that it has to be partnership between community, unions, training centres, construction employers and contractors. Merissa stated, if we don't work together, things don't move. It will be important that we work together and with the unions. We need to invite other unions if we want to make this successful.
- Patrick McManus, Ontario Sewer and Watermain Construction Association looks forward to closing the skills gap particularly in the trades that people haven't heard of like sewer. Issues hoping to address are difference sectors of construction function differently and figuring out what is required in terms of Community benefits. The Community Benefits Advisory Group will need to figure out the type of trades, apprenticeships and training needed for future community benefits. Looking at those nuances between the different construction sectors and working with those nuances within those for hiring, employment, and training.

- Quoc Truong, Hammerheads (Central Ontario Building Trades) stated, he adores that we are sitting here at the same table and that we have great opportunity to make change in our community. The Community Benefits Advisory Group need to have accountability and ask how we can implement it into our structure.
- Rosemarie Powell, Toronto Community Benefits Network (TCBN), stated she is looking forward that Council stepped up and take 10 % universal hard target. That's the problem TCBN wants to address is to see the rich diversity of the city reflected on our construction sites. Rosemarie stated she knows that's TCBN's collective goal and to develop a seamless pathways for those who have been historically excluded from the industry. TCBN will be back in 2022 Q2 stronger as a result of the partnership that the City of Toronto has made.
- Selina Young, Indigenous Affairs Office (IAO), stated she is excited to ensure Indigenous communities have the support. One of the functions I support is to work with the bureaucratic lever that is the City of Toronto and also working with Indigenous communities. One problem I'd like to ask us is how to ensure Indigenous rights, especially self-determination are respected through the work that the City does with Indigenous communities.
- Stephanie Chow, Aecon Group is looking forward to seeing how we will be able to maximize the impact of community benefits.
- Steve Shallhorn, Labour Education Centre stated he is most looking forward is putting all the pieces together, so it's a smooth journey for people to get them a good career in the industry.
- Sundus Balata, Toronto Community Housing Cooperation (TCHC) - Don Summerville - joined with William Mendes. Sundus explained that revitalizations impact a large number of housing projects. TCHC includes physical and social revitalizations for tenant to profit from redevelopment process. It targets a variety of jobs and sectors throughout the process. TCHC owns the piece of work of community benefits. The priority is to design and implement benefits that are tenant driven. Throughout revitalization, TCHC created over 50 million dollars in community benefits, scholarships jobs, etc. An issue TCHC are working on is the creation of tenant business as they could service the communities for over 20 years.
- Ana Teresa Portillo, Parkdale Community Economic Development stated she is motivated to impend participatory community planning and monitoring mechanism.
- Chris Campbell, Carpenters Union and Co-chair of TCBN, stated he is very proud of TCBN, because on the projects such as Woodbine and water treatment project. He sees people working that reflect him. Chris shared, when I

	<p>started out as an 18-19 years old in apprenticeship in the trades, people were teaching me. It's a great thing to pay it forward and bring some of these young people in the grades and give them the same opportunity. We're not where we want to be in terms of getting the agreement with the City of Toronto, but we are moving forward.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Clara Stewart-Robertson, Jane and Finch Community and Family Center. A question coming up in community over the last week is how the Community Benefits Advisory Group can work with resources, and support initiatives generated already in the community around recruitment, system coordination, etc. There's lots of language on the ground, how do we utilize that?
Community Benefits Framework	Presentation by April Lim and Clara Ganemtoire - No questions (PowerPoint attachment)
Overview of Community Benefits Advisory Group Terms of Reference	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Presentation by April Lim (PowerPoint attachment) ▪ Discussion questions (please choose one) <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. What are you/your organization most excited to contribute to the Community Benefits Advisory Group? 2. What are you looking forward to gaining through your participation in the Community Benefits Advisory Group? 3. How would you/your organization define success for the Community Benefits Advisory Group in 2021? ▪ Rosemarie Powell (TCBN) shared she is happy to contribute strength in community labour partnerships. TCBN is looking forward to restart committee of labour representatives to support the work of the City of Toronto. The industry is doing work to address anti-Black racism and TCBN can work with them in tandem. ▪ Gillian Mason, Gillian Mason Consultancy is currently working on behalf of C3 with local anchor institutions, which Community Benefits Advisory Group should consider bringing to the table, to understand the demands of labour in advance to outreach to community and create the needed training. Gillian has line up the pathways from essential skills, skill upgrading and feedback loop from employers to learn about community benefits. Happy to share what Gillian Mason Consultancy and C3 have learned about the system approach of community benefits. ▪ Ian Da Silva, TDSB, STEP to Construction Program., is looking forward to bringing the voices of 16-20 years old entering the industry and their lived experiences as they are entering the education system and pathway to construction industry. ▪ Sundus Balata (TCHC), stated this work is impressive and noted a super well organized meeting. She is happy that the Community Benefits Advisory Group is solution oriented. TCHC has a lot of experience with tracking and monitoring programs. TCHC can share their expertise of how to build monitoring systems that can target community benefits

targets. She is looking forward to build synergies, avoiding replications of work and wondering how we can collaborate to bring local inclusive community benefits.

- Mike Mattos, Mount Dennis Community Association shared Mount Dennis were involved with West Park Hospital and Eglinton Crosstown before community benefits. He has seen the benefits of agreements but also the frustrations of it not moving ahead and what the community expects and wants to have.
- William Mendes (TCHC) wants to build on momentum of the pipeline of employment to sustain work in the trades and other opportunities. The demand for employment is very high and the pathways to get paid training opportunities, there's quite a bit. But the supply of those training opportunities is hidden or low. For the people TCHC is trying to support, they are looking for those paid opportunity even if it's a 3 month opportunity, but what happens after? Expanding and questions, how do we build pipeline to support the person for a yearlong opportunity to build an employment opportunity and the employer having confidence that they are hiring someone they want to keep?
- Marc Soberano, Building Up (Social Enterprise) building off William's pipeline point but building a pool of trained individuals exposed to construction industry and interested in moving forward. Building Up sees 1,000 applications a year. His opinion is that the biggest issue isn't there's a lack of people that want these roles, but there's a ton of work that's done already that can be leveraged. There is a perceived barrier between all the pre-apprenticeship programs and there are a lot of people ready to pool. Let's not let that be a barrier. Anyone who sees that a barrier, it's a lack of communication between the people in this group.
- Chris Phibbs asked Marc, you think that pipeline is there?
- Marc Soberano replied to Chris, yes for where we are now.
- Especially with COVID, people who have been in these programs and are now looking to go to work. There's a pipeline continuing to grow.
- Chris Phibbs asked Marc, it's a matter of coordination?
- Marc Soberano replied, yes, that's what I think.

- Chris Campbell, Carpenters Union and Co-chair of TCBN. People are saying there is a shortage and people are retiring. He doesn't recall since 2015, where recruiting folks from the community wasn't a problem. Carpenters Union has a pool of apprentices ready to go. Going forward, we should be paying attention when using the term "shortage". Questions that could come up; (1) Are we talking about shortage of young people or people in the community that want the trade? (2) Are we talking about shortage of people with years of experience? If there's a committee or sub-committee created from the Community Benefits Advisory Group, Chris stated he would be able to join to assist with the ideology that there isn't enough people to join the trades.
- Chris Phibbs asked Chris will the Community Benefits Advisory Group need to corral it?
- Chris Campbell replied in his opinion, we need to corral and plan ahead of time. In his experienced, he never seen an employer request training ahead of time to prepare for the upcoming work. On the commercialized projects like Woodbine, he would like to look into if there's a perception of first year apprentices for the community. In his experience, tracking is not an issue as long as you have plans ahead of time.
- Chris Phibbs clarified that Chris was talking about a systems approached which will be constructive.
- John Cartwright, Toronto & York Region Labour Council is excited to bring learnings from colleagues from the United States of America, who have a great experience from community benefits.
- John shared what TCBN did with Metrolinx in negotiating a Professional, Admin and Technical hiring pathway, as well as trades, is the first time it has been done in a CBA in North America. Toronto has one of the highest unionization rates, and it's the most productive construction workforce in North America. We have lot of training programs and institutions.
- John shared, it doesn't matter the size of the job crew, and you would be still facing the same challenges. From his experience with other spaces, go with largest projects who have a large group of people and resources. Then you can get it right, get expertise and start building a system. Then bring it to the smaller projects.
- John finally stated, it will be a learning experience and if the Community Benefits Advisory Group can take people's experience, we can get to a place where other projects would be considered.
- Chris Phibbs asked John, what he would call a big project.

- John Cartwright replied to Chris, \$50 million, ICI and high rise residential. As long as it is clear to the bidders, then they can work with dispatchers and get trades hired.
- Ameen Binwalee, Out of the Box Social Enterprise has been working for a while at social procurement, engaging community and clients. They can contribute experience in terms of engaging with the different stakeholders from a vendor perspective.
- Patrick McManus, Ontario Sewer and Watermain Construction Association, is interested to contribute the employer perspective particularly what the last steps looks like. He acknowledges that there is a lot of great ideas being discussed. The Association is excited to bring that perspective. Specifically in terms of the difference between ICI and heavy civil construction companies. Separate models are needed for ICI, commercial and heavy infrastructure.
- Patrick continued, it's important to have a forecast in the fall on what projects will be selected, and how many in each sector. This will allow the start of streaming candidates into the right programs. A question Patrick raised was, how do we stream candidates to where the job opportunities are going to be through community benefits?
- Finally Patrick ended with, all of these points are important to get to the employment piece. There's a lot of back-end infrastructure work, in particular between the individual construction sectors. Professionally, success will look like figuring out the particular details for each sector.
- Jason Ottey, Local 183, agrees with Patrick. An important voice that can't ignored, is the employer. The work can't get done without them. Unions are critical, but they don't do hiring. Employer's voices adequately represented. ICI and civil are different, but looking at the budgets, most of the work is in the civil. Other employer stakeholders that can be invited is HVAC and Roads Building Association. It's important to use the City's voice and weight to build more community benefits.
- Chris Phibbs stated, points will be taken from employer's perspective. We understand and appreciate the need to engage employers.
- Steve Shallhorn, Labour Education Centre, agreed with Marc Soberano talking points. As significant supply grows, a concern the quality of training that people are getting, this is something that TCBN is addressing. TCBN has recently gone through process of coming up with higher level of curriculum that is being implemented. Building Up is looking at building techniques in their programs and are willing to share with others. A lot of the strategic partners on the

call are towards ICI and are integrating in the province in training for heavy civil. The goal is to adjust the curriculum to meet employer needs and growing technology

- Quoc Truong, Hammerheads, mentioned one concern he has, which is the accountability piece. City of Toronto has to do some background work, once when it comes time to start tracking equity hiring. He asks, how are we going to be tracking those apprentices? For example, once people start working, what is the progression from now and in 5 years?
- In his personal experience, he has been enrolled in many programs but there is no follow up. Quoc states, if you want to make change, tracking is very important. Community Benefits have to track people every step on the way.
- Chris Phibbs, SDFA, agreed with Quoc's talking points. This is one of the major pushes and initiatives of the community benefits. The monitoring and evaluation part of this is very important.
- Jim Vlahos, General Contractors' Association of Toronto, asks, are we coming at this for construction broadly? Or do we appreciate that there are certain subsectors that do hiring and training differently? We can think broadly at the beginning. From there it has to be more than one approach for different sectors. Construction employees, like carpenters, are often employed intermittently, sometimes with multiple employers within a year. This is especially true for smaller construction projects or those with only a limited amount of work falling within that construction trade's jurisdiction. In different sectors, when you get into a crew, it could be a crew for life. It's more group bargaining than other construction examples.
- Chris Phibbs, SDFA, – It's important to recognize there are differences among construction industry. That's one of the sticky issues to help us pars out. Is it the same for sewer water as other groups such as carpenters?
- Jim Vlahos, General Contractors' Association of Toronto, mentioned that LiUNA Local 506, they train people, work very closely with different associations and know what employers need. What is need from pre- apprenticeships is a focus on these soft skills.
- Jason Ottey (in the chat) – Forgot to mention that targets are great and as long as they are floors and not ceilings. The goal should be to exceed not strive to meet them.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ April Lim, SDFA, (in the chat) – The City of Toronto currently has hard targets (to set the floor at 5-10%) that are not being met because the back-end implementation infrastructure is not yet in place. Community Benefits Advisory Group is a critical piece to help us problem solve the implementation challenges. ▪ Merissa Preston from LiUNA Local 506, shared she was talking to David Galvin from Crosslinx and workers provided by LiUNA Local 506 exceeded double the Crosslinx hiring target on the Crosslinx job. She said she was unaware of this increase of 10% but again, floors and ceilings. Crosslink would have only had 20 apprentices, but they had 40. ▪ Rosemarie Powell, TCBN, echoes Merissa's comment. In regards to trainings, she wants to hear from TESS. TESS funds pre-apprenticeship training for their TCBN clients and it would be great to see TESS training aligning so that those who graduate have a seamless entry pass into the industry. ▪ What would be helpful to know from the City of Toronto, is what TCBN can do to work more closely to work with Government of Ontario? It be beneficial to see how their training programs and annual millions of dollars are put into the programs, to ensure participants from these programs are getting opportunities. ▪ Chris Phibbs, SDFA, stated the City of Toronto doesn't have influence over the province, but we want to explore that. Anyone from TESS wants to comment? ▪ Anna Cain, ESS, replied to Chris, as TESS moves forward and continues to work with colleagues in SDFA to pilot a process to help streamline, we will be able to leverage those programs and help graduates get on sites. That is definitely in our sights for this year.
2021 Meetings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Next meetings will be held in March, June, September and December. <p>Actions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Doodle poll will be sent to confirm March Community Benefits Advisory Group meeting. <p>Meeting invites to be sent for June, September and December dates, once finalized.</p>
Adjournment	Meeting Adjourned at 3:00 p.m.