

## Community Benefits Advisory Group

Meeting Minutes- Sept 29, 2021

1:00 - 3:00pm

Virtual Meeting, Held on WebEx

### Attendees

<b>City of Toronto</b>	<b>Name</b>
CreateTO	Salima Rawji
Economic Development & Culture (EDC)	Larissa Deneau (Policy)
Economic Development & Culture (EDC)	Rebecca Condon (IMIT)
Engineering and Construction Services (ECC)	Pritish Roy
Engineering and Construction Services (ECC)	Simon Hopton
Purchasing and Materials Management Division (PMMD)	Hillary Keirstead
Purchasing and Materials Management Division (PMMD)	Kiruba Sankar
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Alison Stanley (Rexdale CBA)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Anthony Morgan (Confronting Anti-Black Racism)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	April Lim (CBF)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Biljana Zuvela (CBF)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Clara Ganemtoire (CBF)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Freida Cordoba (Social Policy)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Denise Andrea Campbell (Executive Office)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Sarah Blackstock (Social Policy)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Sean McIntyre (Poverty Reduction Strategy)
Toronto Community Housing	William Mendes
Toronto Community Housing	Sundus Balata (Don Summerville)
Toronto Employment & Social Services (TESS)	Christine Carrasco
Toronto Employment & Social Services (TESS)	Colleen Dignam
Corporate Real Estate Management division	Lisa Barroso
<b>Strategic Partner</b>	<b>Name</b>
Afro Canadian Contractors Association	Stephen Callender
Building Up (Social Enterprise)	Marc Soberano
Carpenters District Council of Ontario	Chris Campbell
Hammer Heads (Central Ontario Building Trades)	Quoc Truong
Humber College	Geraldine Babcock
Labour Education Centre	Steve Shallhorn
LiUNA Local 506 Training Centre	Merissa Preston
Mount Dennis Community Association	Mike Mattos
Ontario Sewer and Watermain Contractors Association	Patrick McManus
Out of the Box Social Enterprise	Ameen Binwalee
TDSB, STEP to Construction Program	Ian Da Silva
Toronto Community Benefits Network	Rosemarie Powell
Gillian Mason Consultancy	Gillian Mason
United Way Greater Toronto	Fabio Crespin
Carpenters Union Local 27	Mike Yorke
Toronto and York Region Labour Council	Susan McMurray

### Regrets

<b>City of Toronto</b>	<b>Name</b>
------------------------	-------------

Economic Development & Culture (EDC)	Marilyn Nickel
Economic Development & Culture (EDC)	Dan Rosen (Policy)
Housing Secretariat	Erik Hunter
Indigenous Affairs Office (IAO)	Selina Young
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Melana Roberts (CABR)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Wayne Chu (Poverty Reduction)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Hanifa Kassam (AnchorTO)
Toronto Employment & Social Services (TESS)	Anna Cain
Engineering and Construction Services division	Judy Tse
<b><i>Strategic Partner</i></b>	<b><i>Name</i></b>
Heat and Frost Insulators Local 95	Adam Melnick
Parkdale Community Economic Development	Ana Teresa Portillo
Centre for Connected Communities	Anne Gloger
Jane Finch Family Resource Centre	Clara Stewart Robertson
Dream Maker Legacy Foundation	Isaac Olowolafe
International Union Of Painters & Allied Trades DC46	Ivan Dawns
LIUNA Local 183	Jason Ottey
Indigenous Affairs Office (IAO)	Jeff D'Hondt
General Contractors Section	Jim Vlahos
Metrolinx	Judy Brooks
Ontario Construction Secretariat	Katherine Jacobs
Ironworkers Council of Ontario	Marc Arsenault
Black Business Professionals Association	Nadine Spencer
Miziwe Biik	Nancy Martin
AECON	TBD

**Community Benefits Advisory Group**

Meeting Minutes – Sept 29, 2021

1:00 -3:00pm

Virtual Meeting, Held on WebEx

Item	Discussion/ Comments / Actions
Land Acknowledgment (Chair)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Welcome and Land Acknowledgement was delivered.</li> </ul>
Adoption of minutes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Minutes from June 16, 2021 (circulated in advance)</li> </ul>
Greetings from Denise Andrea Campbell and Introductions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Executive Director, Social Development, Finance and Administration division at City of Toronto</li> <li>• New to the group Susan McMurray from Toronto and York Region Labour Council. John Cartwright retired.</li> </ul>
Community Benefits Framework Updates	<p>CBF 2021 recap and looking ahead (April Lim)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Presentation by April Lim, City of Toronto</li> <li>• CBF team recruitment job posting is now live</li> <li>• Recapped meeting on June 16<sup>th</sup></li> </ul>
Ad Hoc Working Groups	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Will be starting 3 Ad Hoc Working Groups in October and November. The fourth working group has been put on hold due to the delay in recruiting staff for the CBF team.</li> <li>• Reviewed each of the working groups:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Working Group 1 – Community Benefits Hiring, Recruitment and Retention                   <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Presented an overview of the organizations taking part in the group. Hopeful to get some Indigenous workforce development partners to represent in the group.</li> <li>▪ Focus on the group will be related to recruiting, outreaching to Indigenous, Black and equity deserving communities to connect them to the job opportunities that are being generated by the City of Toronto Community Benefits initiatives.</li> <li>▪ Will dive into journey map, supports needed by candidates, types of partnership agreements with agencies, and labour forecasting with employers.</li> </ul> </li> <li>○ Working Group 2 – Community Benefits Hiring with Skilled Trades Unions</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

Item	Discussion/ Comments / Actions
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Presented an overview of the organizations taking part in the group.</li> <li>▪ Will focus on the challenges that currently exist in connecting equity deserving communities to construction employment pathway that leads to employment in City community benefits initiatives, including labour forecasting.</li> </ul> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Steve Shallhorn asked a question, what is the difference between working group 1 and 2? Will group 1 focus on the community benefits agreement and group 2 will not?</li> <li>• Clara answered that working group 1 will look at the hiring pathways overall for both construction hiring and other opportunities such as customized recruitment for professional, administrative and technical jobs. Working group 2 will be focusing on the problem solving related to the skilled trade hiring pathway .</li> <li>• Colleen answered it is really about how to get community through the union doorway and to build on the work that is already happening with some construction unions that are providing labour to the Community Benefit Initiatives.</li> <li>• April answered when we thought about the different working groups the rationale around the different themes came from the key challenges that we are facing to implement these hiring pathways. The other issue is if we were to have one working group that was just on the whole about hiring for construction and non-construction, it would be too big a topic to cover in one group. So we wanted to have a dedicated space for the skilled trade conversation to take place. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Working Group 3 – Monitoring and Evaluation Framework <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Presented an overview of the organizations taking part in the group.</li> <li>▪ This group will focus on two key deliverables: 1. will be the workforce development theory of change, 2. will be the workforce development monitoring and evaluation framework.</li> <li>▪ Focus clearly articulating our assumptions, our theory about the workforce development work. What is our response to that problem or what are the key activities within the hiring pathways in the workforce development? And what is the result that we are expecting to see through the implementation of these activities?</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul>
Presentations	<p>CBF Journey Mapping – Emerging themes (Clara Ganemtoire)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Presenting PowerPoint presentation</li> <li>• Recapped on the Journey Mapping. From Advisory Group meeting on February 26<sup>th</sup>, the City provided an overview of the key priorities for the implementation of the Community Benefits Framework from 2021-2023. Among these priorities was to develop coordinated systems approaches to local and social hiring pathways.</li> <li>• Will look into the partnership model needed to ensure that adequate support are being provided to these job seekers.</li> </ul>

Item	Discussion/ Comments / Actions
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Recapped on the series of interviews that had taken place with the CB. We had 12 participants focusing on 2 paths: 1. Construction and 2. Customized recruitment.</li> <li>• We did not engage with participants from the Housing Now project given that there had been no hires yet.</li> <li>• Reviewed the emerging issues from interviews held back in August. Found issues such as lack of awareness of options and understanding the process. The participants also highlighted the importance of professional networks and relationships as these were essential to their success and this is where the training programs also come in.</li> <li>• Next steps on the CBF team needs to do further analysis of the data from the interviews. Also need analysis of secondary research on the CB hiring pathways in Toronto and Ontario that needs to be incorporated. Also insights and learnings from similar journey mapping that has been led, as well as the Ministry of Labour.</li> </ul> <p>City of Toronto engagement with unions to advance construction hiring for Community Benefits initiatives (Colleen Dignam)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Presenting PowerPoint presentation</li> <li>• Reviewed key issues and challenges with skilled trades. Looking at what are those pathways across all trades that the community benefits oversees. The role of these skilled trades working with contractor and sub-contractors, what are the coordination that happens and what is required.</li> <li>• Labour forecasting is a huge piece of the work. Looking at what are the actual employment opportunities to connect with recruitment with community.</li> <li>• Another key issue is access for Indigenous, Black and equity deserving communities into construction unions and to obtain membership or training in order to connect to community benefit initiatives that are requiring unionized labour. Some trades are more complex and challenging to navigate the pathways, other trades may not be as complex.</li> <li>• Another key challenge is the role of these skilled trade unions and working with their signatory contractors and subcontractors. Looking at the coordinated systems approach to hiring pathways. Some great hires have been made and success related to projects related to connecting Black, Indigenous, and equity deserving communities. There is no formalized coordinated approach.</li> <li>• Reviewed the Test Case for Union Engagement – REXDALE CBA. Will be reaching out to affiliated subcontractors and affiliated unions that have been identified to have a collaborative discussion on the actual employment opportunities and then with unions, how do we work together to connect those Indigenous, Black, and equity deserving communities to those subcontractors who are performing work on the Casino Woodbine project.</li> <li>• Proposed two discussion questions to the group.</li> <li>• Rosemarie Powell made a comment on the strength of the TCBN community-labour coalition. To have the unions on board as members and allies within the community and having community advocacy with unions, TCBN was able to</li> </ul>

Item	Discussion/ Comments / Actions
	<p>stand with the local communities and that is something needs to change and we need to do better. As unions we need to do better and recognize there is an issue. Not tolerating discrimination and have the unions to sit here with the City for the partnership and collaboration we should applaud ourselves.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Chris Campbell made a comment that he was personally frustrated with the community benefits process in getting things moving and also have a shortage in the industry and the need for people on the sites. Going directly to the community was very effective. Talking and connecting to the people and understanding the struggles was very effective.</li> <li>• Mike Mattos made a comment being involved with the community benefits and the actions for years now and one thing I noticed is that high school and college students coming out of a social enterprise training program are sometimes seen as young offenders or reformers. We have a goal with the unions and trades to meet targets and will represent the general community but the City of Toronto will say that we want to bring in these minority groups to the work on sites despite that a union or trade is now predominantly reflective of the community but now want to single out people and bring them in. I think that is going to cause a problem of resentment. If the union hires 500 apprentices and 300 of them are from the affirmative action yet would want to hire more affirmative action people how are we going to solve the problem.</li> <li>• Sarah confirmed that the issue has been raised numerous times and that there is an interest in figuring how a union can dispatch people to a site without necessarily indicating a referral from an agency. Need to find ways to collect sociodemographic data. Need to find a way to monitor and set these goals and outcomes. With our community benefits initiatives we do need to find a way to monitor them. There has been talk of the culture change to make inside unions.</li> <li>• April made a comment responding to Mike's comment on the discussion about inadvertently creating a two tiered system of hiring on City projects. The discussion with stakeholders in consultations back in 2019, many at the table made a point that people were getting further stigmatized and that is not the direction community benefits should move in. The demographic makeup of unions already representing a diverse range of backgrounds really highlights the need for disaggregated data collection at the union level. Benchmarking data is identified as being needed in order to be able to say to the union labour force this is the represented demographic breakdown. This data collection is something that would have to happen. The working groups are designed to have all of you to share and mutually benefit given all the different interests.</li> </ul>
Adjournment	Meeting Adjourned at 3:00 p.m.