Community Benefits Advisory Group

Meeting Minutes - November 9, 2022

1:00 - 3:00pm

Virtual Meeting, Held on WebEx

Meeting Attendees

City of Toronto	Name
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Alison Stanley (Social Policy/Rexdale CBA)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Anthony Morgan (Confronting Anti-Black Racism)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	April Lim (Community Benefits Unit)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Biljana Zuvela (Community Benefits Unit)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Courtney Ayukawa (Community Benefits Unit)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Emily Tsoa (Community Benefits Unit)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Freida Cordoba (Social Policy)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Hanifa Kassam (Poverty Reduction Strategy Office)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Matteo Colangelo (Community Benefits Unit)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Michelle Molubi (Confronting Anti-Black Racism)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Reinaldo James (Community Benefits Unit)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Sundas Balata (Community Infrastructure Unit)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Tendai Mhute (Community Benefits Unit)
Social Development, Finance and Administration (SDFA)	Zenia Wadhwani (Social Policy, Analysis and Research)
Economic Development & Culture (EDC)	Dan Rosen (Policy)
Engineering and Construction Services (ECS)	Pritish Roy
Engineering and Construction Services (ECS)	Simon Hopton
Indigenous Affairs Office (IAO)	Selina Young
Purchasing and Materials Management Division (PMMD)	Diana Levy
Purchasing and Materials Management Division (PMMD)	Kiruba Sankar
Toronto Employment & Social Services (TESS)	Colleen Dignam

Strategic Partner	Name
Out of the Box Social Enterprise	Ameen Binwalee
Parkdale Community Economic Development	Ana Teresa Portillo
Jay Dee	"AG" Abdul-Ghani Mekkaoui
Carpenters District Council of Ontario	Chris Campbell
The Career Foundation	Christina Montauti
CEE	Danielle Williams
United Way Greater Toronto	Fabio Crespin
Caribbean African Canadian Social Services (CAFCAN)	Floydeen Charles-Fridal
Gillian Mason Consultancy	Gillian Mason
Ontario Construction Secretariat	Katherine Jacobs
Context Development	Kemet Bahlibi
Humber College	Lynn Van Lieshout (on behalf of Geraldine Babcock)
LiUNA Local 506 Training Centre	Merissa Preston
Miziwe Biik Aboriginal Employment and Training	Mike Buckland
Mount Dennis Community Association	Mike Mattos

BOLT Foundation	Raly Chakarova
Toronto Community Benefits Network	Rosemarie Powell
Labour Education Centre	Steve Shallhorn
Toronto Workforce Funders Collaborative	Surabhi Jain

Meeting Regrets

City of Toronto	Name
Corporate Real Estate Management division	Lisa Barroso
Corporate Real Estate Management division	Graham Leah
CreateTO	Salima Rawji
Economic Development & Culture (EDC)	Marilyn Nickel
Economic Development & Culture (EDC)	Larissa Deneau (Policy)
Engineering and Construction Services division	Judy Tse
Housing Secretariat	Mathieu Maslard
Purchasing and Materials Management Division (PMMD)	Hillary Keirstead
Toronto Employment & Social Services (TESS)	Anna Cain
Toronto Employment & Social Services (TESS)	Mecada Mitchell-Djabatey
Toronto Community Housing Corporation (TCHC)	William Mendes
Waterfront Toronto	Michael Wolfe

Strategic Partner	Name
Diversity Institute	Alison Campbell
Centre for Connected Communities	Anne Gloger
Jane Finch Family Resource Centre	Clara Stewart Robertson
Toronto District School Board	Elvy Moro
Humber College	Geraldine Babcock
TDSB, STEP to Construction Program	Ian Da Silva
International Union Of Painters & Allied Trades DC46	Ivan Dawns
LIUNA Local 183	Jason Ottey
Indigenous Affairs Office (IAO)	Jeff D'Hondt
General Contractors Section	Jim Vlahos
Metrolinx	Judy Brooks
ACCES Employment	Manjeet Dhiman
Ontario Provincial Building Trades Council	Marc Arsenault
Building Up (Social Enterprise)	Marc Soberano
Carpenters Union Local 27	Mike Yorke
Black Business Professionals Association	Nadine Spencer
Ontario Sewer and Watermain Contractors Association	Patrick McManus
Afro Canadian Contractors Association	Stephen Callender
Toronto and York Region Labour Council	Susan McMurray

Community Benefits Advisory Group
Meeting Minutes – November 9, 2022
1:00 -3:00pm
Virtual Meeting, Held on WebEx

Item	Discussion/ Comments / Actions
Land Acknowledgment (Chair)	• Welcome and Land Acknowledgement was delivered.
Advisory Group Introductions	• Please introduce yourself (name, organization) in the WebEx chat box

Updates from Community Benefits Unit	Part A (April Lim)
	Future State CB Workforce Development Process Flow
	• There are different phases of the project lifecycle and every project and initiative is different. The project first moves into outreach planning intake, then into job readiness and training, followed by employment and finally into data tracking and reporting.
	• Members of this table should see themselves reflected at some point along the life cycle of a project, whether you are a city division agency, corporation, or employer.
	• The different components of the full toolkit will be released once it is finalized. Tools and resources can be used at multiple and various points along the project lifecycle and journey of the workforce development pathway.
	• Raly Chakarova commented that the document is great and that it's good to see the workforce intermediary posted as a critical component in making this system work. Perhaps a definition would be helpful. The question goes to the hiring targets but wondering if there are thoughts on who is hiring, who the owner of the hiring targets will be, or if they will be attached to a project and not a particular employer?
	• April said this can be taken offline for further discussion, but pointed out that each of the hiring targets are built into the City agreement that is relevant to that project.
	    ○ Example 1: If there is a procured tender agreement, then it becomes a service agreement between the City of Toronto and a service provider with terms and conditions. In other words, hiring targets are built into those service agreements.
	    ○ Example 2: If it is a city lease agreement related to a build on City owned land, those terms and conditions have the hiring targets built into the lease agreement.
	• Simon Hopton expressed a concern about the definition of hard targets mentioned. In the area of construction, there is interest in how the program develops. Think it is somewhat premature to be setting hard targets when the end users are not really understanding exactly what the program is and how they achieve it. Need to ensure that

these end users are brought into the collaborative work, are available for the appropriate training and are ready to be hired.

- Steve Shallhorn made a comment to clarify that the CB policy affects only projects that are owned by the City of Toronto and would not be applicable to developments such as the Golden Mile development. Also looking forward to hearing more about the intermediary and what the role will be and whether it will be a competitive process. There are some cautions around hard targets but must start somewhere. If the targets are coordinated with training service providers, it can work.
- Rosemarie Powell made a comment to echo what Simon has said about the need to include the contractor, the unions, and all the key stakeholders, not just in determining the targets since we have already agreed on what the targets are with the city. We have a policy at 10% minimum hard target. For those who would like to go above and beyond that we could also look at discussing what is working with those developers and to see how much more those ambitious targets can expand.
- Would like to see the environmental scan and the toolkit. In this industry, we need a clear blueprint to help understand the tools, resources, and the relationships that are in place so that the workforce development partners who are at the table can help to support them.
- One thing that is missing is that it might be good practice to use the LinkedIn and Pinterest icons.

Part B (Zenia Wadhwani)
FIFA World Cup and Community Benefits
- There were three early initial meetings with the City colleagues who are responsible for the World Cup to get a sense of what is within their parameters, and to discuss Council direction on incorporating community benefits for the World Cup. TCBN has been at one of those meetings.
- The City is currently conducting interviews to hire a Director for the FIFA Secretariat. There might be a report that will need to go to Council in March 2023.

Voluntary CB Plans
- There is interest in having a set of tools, ideas, and a framework for the private sector in terms of how they can apply to be part of this larger program, but this work has not been initiated yet. There are some staffing issues that will be resolved soon.
- Will be launching that project ideally before the end of the year.

Transit Development

	• On the transit development there are conversations on transit expansion as well with our colleagues on how to move forward. We had that conversation just in the last week or so and will update the group with more information in the New Year.

Updates from Ad Hoc Working Groups	Update reports from Ad Hoc Working Groups
	
	Working Group 1: Community Benefits Hiring, Recruitment and Retention, Matteo Colangelo
	• Matt took over for Clara Gamentore for Working Group 1. As problem solvers, this working group is made up of City staff and external strategic partners. Our purpose is to dive deep into problem solving and develop solutions that address a range of key challenges to community benefits implementation in the City of Toronto's community benefits initiatives. In terms of our objectives, we aim to explore effective ways to better coordinate recruitment strategies and efforts to reach Black, Indigenous and equity deserving communities while balancing employers' needs.
	• The hope is to identify ways to best coordinate and sustain the level of a wraparound support needed to ensure that hiring candidates are successful in securing and retaining employment, and to address the needs and ways to conduct robust labour market analysis, including labour market data.
	• When applying intelligence and forecasting to a community benefits initiative, here is what is in scope for working group 1:
	    1. To address City community benefits, implementation, challenges, focused on recruitment and systems coordination.
	    2. To inform the development of hiring pathways and determine how protocols and processes for local and social hiring will develop the partnership models. For coordinated systems approaches to local and social hiring, the aim is to inform approaches to forecast hiring needs for the City's CB initiatives and inform workforce development planning.
	• Very grateful to the working group members for their time, knowledge, and subject matter expertise in supporting the work that we have been commencing and are continuing to commence through many engagement meetings and working group meetings.
	• Deliverable 1: For the roadmap to date with deliverable 1 as the top hiring pathway. This work has been led by Courtney. This group last convened in April and has worked hard to advance the key activities within the deliverables through 10 days' work in collaboration with many stakeholders. The customized recruitment identified barriers and

	the training supports require to overcome various pain points to develop a desire for future path job seekers and to enable job readiness roles and responsibilities of partners.
	• The group worked on bringing these areas in both June and recently in October to dive deeper into these processes. The deliverables and recommended solutions prototype that have been presented within the high-level process will continue to be refined through consultations and engagement with the members.
	• Deliverable 2: is the topic of hiring forecasts and employer engagement. Since the group last convened in April 2022, there was considerable amount of research to develop an approach to forecast hiring needs for existing contracts and agreements. The goal was to determine what critical information is needed within the forecast to inform workforce development products and processes. This was brought forward to the working group in June and October.
	• Deliverable 3: the partnership models is led by Courtney. Work currently underway includes identifying and scoping key components of partnership models, and identifying and applying best practices to shape components of these models.
	Working Group 2 Community Benefits Hiring with Skilled Trades Unions, Reinaldo James & Colleen Dignam
	• Working group 2 membership has been crucial to meeting the deliverables outlined and in the development of tools and processes that will assist employers' proponents and stakeholders in achieving construction targets on community benefit projects.
	• Deliverable 1 is a labour forecasting template. As for key activities, we have been able to articulate potential underlying issues associated with understanding the scope, sequence and schedule for construction work.
	• The group has done well to develop and pilot the labour forecast template and move to deliverable 2 to collecting and tracking data on equity indicators. Some key activities associated with this deliverable is being able to review and present comments on the discussions around the purpose and limitations of collecting social, demographic and geographic aggregate data for unionized construction workers.
	• Currently moving to deliverable 3; best practices, approach, and mechanisms for reporting on construction hiring. Some key activities associated with this deliverable is developing and sharing draft polls on construction hiring implementation process. We are in the process of addressing challenges based on the delivery of construction pathway information sessions.
	• Much of the key activities of the deliverables have either been completed or in the process of currently being completed. Next steps are 3 major tasks: 1. Connecting unionized contractors with local equity deserving individuals 2. Labour forecasting and the labour forecast template 3. Construction trade implementation process map

- Looking at the labour forecasting template, various representatives from municipalities such as: Seattle, Vancouver, New York, and cities in Northern Ireland have been consulted at every phase of this development of the template. We are close to being able to prototype the forecasting template on upcoming projects.
- Currently creating a construction trade implementation process map in collaboration with all the stakeholders and this working group.
- AG Mekkauoi asked a question on whether there are any participants in this group that are from the unions as it would be great to see the relationship between the unionized contractors target employees in the equity deserving groups. This has been an ongoing challenge but will help us towards the goal.
- Reinaldo answered there are several unions represented in this group: Carpenters Unions, LiUNA Local 183, and LiUnA Local 506. What we are looking for is to work with the network of partners to ensure that we can document and validate the process.

Working Group 3 Community Benefits Monitoring and Evaluation Framework, Biljana Zuvela and Mike Buckland
- This working group represents internal partners and external stakeholders focused on developing the monitoring and evaluation framework for community benefits.
- There are 3 main objectives:
    1. To coordinate a consistent approach on data collection, analysis and reporting across the City. Unify all the data that different stakeholders are collecting and to figure out what is the most important to our processes and how to report, record, and collect that data.
    2. Looking for job seekers and employers to informed M&E (Monitoring and Evaluation) framework to ensure that measured outcomes and data collection tools are relevant and meaningful to both job seekers and to the employers.
    3. An actionable framework to systematically capture the project progress, outcomes, impacts and learnings to support continuous improvement of the program, accountability, and evidence informed decision making.
- This working group started with the development of the theory of change as our foundational document
- In the summer, the group worked on defining the purpose of the monitoring and evaluation framework, the key guiding questions, and the primary users of community benefits, workforce development, monitoring evaluation data.
- This working group also engaged in the exercise of defining the purpose and the primary users of the M&E data and then to consolidate all information in a document or summary which will outline the purpose of the City of Toronto CBF initiatives.
- There is a good framework for all subsequent monitoring evaluation design decisions and activities such as crafting performance measures or indicators, data collection, or reporting tools. The purpose of key guiding and monitoring

	questions can be more intentional and strategic and more focused on what is critical for relevant stakeholders to know rather than what might be interesting.
	• The working group agreed that the monitoring evaluation framework for the CB initiatives should be focused not only on monitoring progress towards targets embedded in each contract but also capturing emerging learnings and capacity building processes within and across the initiatives with workforce development requirements.
	• Most specifically, we need the monitoring evaluation framework to help us demonstrate the value of the city workforce development initiatives. Need to provide evidence that the workforce development efforts are resulting in the intended outcomes for job seekers, employers, and the employment system both at the level of individual initiatives.
	• Identified 3 main categories of guiding questions that we need to answer for each workforce development initiative through the monitoring and evaluation process.
	  1. Questions about achieved targets embedded in each contract mainly focused on getting job seekers.
	  2. Questions about the City's initiatives and their effectives in achieving outcomes for job seekers, employers and the system.
	  3. Questions about the implementation process, the strengths and weaknesses of the initiatives, the effectiveness of the governance operational structure
	• We will inform on the project planning and implementation and the outreach recruitment in support strategies as well as to inform the conversations about the targets' visibility and attain achievability. Need to determine and demonstrate the value of the initiatives, understand their achievements, and inform the policy or program planning, decisions, and funding.
	• Raly Chakarova made a comment to flag that a lot more work needs to be done, especially on achieving targets. It is hard to do that and if no one interested in taking those positions or are ready to be successful in those positions, then the second part is the employer's capacity. There are a lot of conversations about putting together resources and processes for employers which is in the right direction. But would flag in moving forward with this process because there needs to be a focus on support in the earlier and later years of the individuals of their careers.
	• April Lim made a comment on having active conversations with City partners on which City projects would be an ideal site in validating targets. It makes sense for the prototypes to be pilot tested in a bundle across the life cycle of a single project versus one prototype in one project to another. We are working on maximizing the coordination.
	• Zenia Wadhwani made a comment that these conversations will be investigated and probably need another kind of conversation on communications to fine tune things for next year. Need to begin to think about how we communicate this work and the toolkit.

Next Meeting	*Next meeting will be scheduled for spring 2023*
Adjournment	Meeting Adjourned at 3:00 p.m.