

City of Toronto
Climate Advisory Group (CAG)
Meeting #2: December 6, 2022
12:30 - 2:30 pm



Information Session: Carbon Accounting and 2023 City Budget Process
Jan 12, 2023
12:00 pm – 12:55 pm

CAG Meeting #2

Agenda Item	
1. How we'll work and make decisions together	
Discussion/Notes	Outcomes/Next Steps
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Presentation and discussion of Community Agreements• Demonstration of a Generative Decision-Making process• Community Agreements adopted• Review and discussion of CAG members' feedback on the Terms of Reference• Update on the City of Toronto News Release about the CAG	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• CAG will periodically review and update the Community Agreements• CAG will review the Community Agreements through an equity lens following Orientation #2• Make Community Agreements a practical tool to use during meetings• Staff will update the Terms of Reference based on feedback and will share with CAG members for further input and approval.• Staff will advise CAG members about future media releases in advance.

Agenda Item	
2. Update from the City on the 2020 GHG inventory Description: Presentation from City staff and Q&A Purpose: Provide an early update on the upcoming release of the 2020 GHG Inventory	
Discussion/Notes	Outcomes/Next Steps
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Presentation of high level key findings of the sector-based 2020 GHG inventory • The inventory report will be published in December 2022 • The 2020 inventory results show the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic, as pandemic-related restrictions resulted in a significant decline in transportation emissions. It is expected that emissions will normalize in the years after 2020 which will likely result in an increase in the 2021 inventory. • CAG questions and discussions focused on the methane emissions tracking methodology, including accounting for fugitive emissions, landfill monitoring and the potential of using new technology for more precise tracking (eg. drones, satellite). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The 2020 GHG inventory report is available here. CAG members with additional questions can reach out to Groundswell or City staff.

Agenda Item	
3. Carbon Accountability and Governance	
<p>Description: Presentation from Charles Hatt, Program Manager, Policy & Research, Environment & Climate Division</p> <p>Purpose: Introduce the City of Toronto's work on developing a Carbon Accountability and Governance system, including a carbon budget approach to managing corporate and community emissions.</p>	
Discussion/Notes	Outcomes/Next Steps
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Presentation introduced the science of global carbon budget and the use of carbon budgets as a governance tool • Case studies presented: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ United Kingdom: use of carbon budgets for public accountability of climate goals ◦ Oslo: world's first municipal climate budget • The purpose of Toronto's carbon budget would be to drive implementation of TransformTO Net Zero Strategy & establish Toronto as a climate governance leader through enhanced transparency and accountability. • Presentation described how a carbon budget would be used to set community-wide emissions budgets and sector-specific corporate emissions budgets. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Staff will schedule and host a voluntary follow-up session on January 12 with Charles Hatt to answer CAG questions and receive their feedback. • NOTE: The follow-up session on January 12th was held and provided a further opportunity for CAG members to learn about the purposes and principles behind carbon budgeting and the specifics proposed for Toronto. • CAG members were provided an opportunity to submit questions in advance, which staff answered during the session.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Presentation described how a carbon budget would be reported on. ● Questions for CAG discussion and feedback: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ What are the principles that should guide the design and implementation of a carbon accountability and governance system for Toronto? ○ What roles do you, your organization or your community already play when it comes to carbon accountability/governance? What roles do you think you should play? ○ How could an accountability and governance system enhance your organization or community? What would you need to make it work? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Based on the CAG's input the key purposes and principles of the carbon budgeting approach were confirmed. Further care has been taken to ensure that the carbon budget approach will result in clear, understandable information that residents can use to assess the City's progress toward net zero emissions, including the creation and distribution of communication materials such as brochures and infographics. Finally, a specific role for the CAG has been added into the process requirements under the new Climate Goals and Governance chapter proposed for addition to the Municipal Code.
Agenda Item	
6. Closing and Next Steps	
Discussion/Notes	Outcomes/Next Steps
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Orientation #2 will focus on equity ● Staff will share dates for CAG meetings in 2023

Present:

Andria Babbington
Barnabe Geis
Christian Cianfrone
Colin Guldemann
Darnel Harris
Derek May
Jack Zhou
Jeff Ranson

Joseph Ogilvie
Joyce McLean
Julius Lindsay
Kristen Evers
Lidia Ferreira
Lyn Adamson
Maria Constantinou
Marine Sanchez

Muzhi (Maggie) Chang
Neil MacNeil
Rosemarie Powell
Sarah Buchanan
Sarah Buchanan
Tinashe Kanengoni
Zamani Ra

Regrets:

Alienor Rougeot
Chris Ballard

Craig Ruttan
John Robinson

Guests/Delegates:

None

City of Toronto Staff:

Andrew Plunkett
Charles Hatt

Ashwati Michael Cecilia Fernandez
Sophie Plottel

Facilitators (Groundswell Projects):

Destiny Laldeo

Olga Semenovych Ruth Silver

Information Session (optional for CAG members)

Agenda item	
1. Carbon Accounting – follow up Q&A session from Dec 6th CAG meeting	
Description: Presentation from Charles Hatt, Program Manager, Environment and Climate Division and Q&A	
Discussion/Notes/Questions	Outcomes/Next Steps/Answers
<p>The questions and discussion addressed the following issues:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How the carbon budget process will be tied to the City's financial budget process; • The use of technical emissions modelling as part of the carbon budget process; • How the negative impact of high carbon projects (eg. highways) will be quantified when determining the carbon budget; • How the carbon budget approach will connect to the 'climate lens' approach that is currently used by the City to assess capital projects; • How the adoption of the carbon budget approach would enable the tracking of 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There will be an upcoming report to council on this. It is a critical piece, and like the best practices and leading examples we have reviewed, we will need to interface with the City's financial budget process. The more institutionalized this gets, the better data we have to feed into projections, the more involved City divisions will be in the process. • The first part of the carbon budget is quantitatively defining what a carbon budget is. The second is thinking of it as a governance tool. The plan is to utilize the council adopted carbon reduction targets and use the area under the curve as the carbon budget. • We have been looking at a model from Oslo. We have our overall climate action strategy and we know the actions that need to be taken to achieve the strategy. We will track those things needed to reduce emissions that are consistent with achieving net zero. We count

<p>financial spending and investment required to meet the net zero targets;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How the carbon budget would guide the City's investment and actions to reduce corporate and city-wide emissions; and • What process will be in place for identifying and addressing gaps in investments, especially when it comes to community emissions. 	<p>all fossil fuel reliant projects and, over time, as we approach 2030 and 2040 goals, under carbon budgeting the number and amount of capital projects that are fossil fuel reliant should be declining.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Another approach is the Edmonton example, which is a line-by-line review of the financial budget and estimation of the carbon impact of each budget line. That process is more time consuming. • The focus will be on the impact, in terms of GHG reductions, that we expect to get for what is proposed to be spent. Doing that can help identify gaps in the progress we need to make to be on track and then decision-makers can consider new or accelerated GHG reduction actions that could fill those gaps. • The carbon budget process will be for GHG reduction actions that could affect any source in the inventory, whether community or corporate. The required planning and reporting can get more granular for corporate emissions because we directly control those and need to make the necessary decisions about how to reduce those emissions. It is also a look back at how the City has done on emissions through the annual GHG inventory, and a look forward by adding up the expected impact of what we're planning to do.
--	--

Agenda item	
2. Environment and Climate Division 2023 Budget Notes Description: presentation from: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cecilia Fernandez, Manager, Policy & Research; • Marco Iacampo, Management Consultant; • Grant Kozlik, Manager, Program Administration; • Charles Hatt, Program Manager 	
Discussion/Notes/Questions	Outcomes/Next Steps/Answers
Presentation on: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the 2020 Sector-based GHG Emissions Inventory release; ○ how the scope of actions and degree of the City's influence in driving outcomes across the Corporation will impact the City's contribution to achieving Net Zero by 2040; and ○ Overview of Budget 2023 and climate-supportive investments. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • N/A