

City of Toronto
Climate Advisory Group (CAG)
Meeting #5: September 14, 2023
9:30am - 12:00pm



Agenda Item 1: Update from Co-Chairs & Working Groups

Description:

- The CAG reviewed the status of each working group and identified next steps.
- Communication and engagement group provided an update on its first meeting.
- The CAG reviewed a proposal for a new working group: Working with Other Levels of Government.

Outcomes/Next Steps

Communication & Engagement Working Group Update

- Communication & Engagement Group held its first meeting over the summer and is planning a second meeting in September.
- The group wants to ensure equity is central for discussions about communication and engagement, not an add on.
- The group is interested in exploring youth engagement and linking to the community benefits approach. They identified that engagement that starts with what residents care about and then getting to climate is a good way to engage groups that have been historically marginalized.

- The group identified several case studies to learn from, including the Clean Jobs Act in the US and Portland Clean Energy Fund.

Transportation Working Group Update

- A City of Toronto staff person has been identified to support this working group.
- CAG members interested in joining this group will develop a proposal for review by the CAG.

Working with Other Levels Of Government Working Group Update

- This will be a new working group.
- A City of Toronto staff person has been identified to support this working group.
- CAG members identified that energy is one of the issues that this group could address and noted opportunities for connecting with relevant provincial and federal government processes, such as the Powering Ontario's Growth Plan, the Ontario Provincial Climate Change Impact Assessment, and the Government of Canada Clean Electricity Regulations.
- CAG members interested in joining this group will develop a proposal for review by the CAG.

Community Waste Diversion Working Group Update

- This working group will review its proposal to broaden the scope.
- The CAG Secretariat will continue working on identifying a City of Toronto staff person to support this working group.

Climate Resilience Working Group Update

- This working group could focus on climate adaptation including public health and resilience of infrastructure.
- CAG members interested in joining this group will develop a proposal for review by the CAG.

Agenda Item 2: Existing Buildings: Buildings Performance Standards

Description: Presentation from City staff on Reports to the Executive and Infrastructure and Environment Committees and Toronto City Council, including information on the development of proposed bylaws for building emission performance standards and emissions performance reporting and upcoming stakeholder engagement.

Presentation summary

City of Toronto Environment and Climate Division presented on the work around emissions performance standards. The presentation addressed the following:

- Buildings represent the largest source of GHG emissions in Toronto today, accounting for 58 per cent of total community-wide emissions.
- Majority of emissions reduction since 1990 are a result of Ontario's phase-out of coal-fired electricity generation. Since then, emissions have not greatly increased or decreased, although it is thought that some efficiency gains have balanced against increased demand from growth.
- To realize a net zero future, annual investments between \$4-9 billion per year will be needed over the next 17 years. This includes retrofitting 476,000 homes and buildings or about 27,000 retrofits each year until 2040. Retrofits can range from operational improvements to HVAC equipment replacement to envelope retrofits.
- Emissions Performance Standards is one of nine policy actions identified in the Net Zero Existing Buildings Strategy (2021).
- The Energy and Water Reporting & Benchmarking (EWRB) was co-developed by the City of Toronto and the Province of Ontario in 2015/2016. This entails collecting building performance data in order to:
 - Develop and implement emissions performance standards;

- Target audit, retro-commissioning, roadmap planning programs and requirements;
 - Foster transparency through the public disclosure of building data; and
 - Inform the evolution of City programs and supports.
- City staff are now developing a by-law requiring all buildings in Toronto to report their energy and water use data to the City annually, starting with buildings over 600m² (6,458ft²). The by-law will eventually be expanded to apply to all buildings (reporting methods may be different).
 - The first reporting deadline is anticipated to be July 1, 2024.
 - The City is conducting public consultation with relevant stakeholders and building owners regarding this reporting requirement.
 - Emissions performance standards (EPS) set emissions limits for buildings and will require owners to improve emissions performance over time. These can be targeted for a different aspect of building including energy, gas, and water, as well as emissions and peak energy demand.
 - EPS have been implemented in Vancouver, New York City, St. Louis, Washington DC and Washington State.
 - Targets become stricter over time, driving continuous, long-term improvement in buildings and building owners who can't/choose not to comply with standards are subject to financial repercussions.
 - Toronto's Updated Long-term Financial Plan recommends to accelerate the timeline to introduce Emissions Performance Standard by-laws to 2024.
 - EPS design considerations include compliance timelines, performance metrics for different types of buildings, alternative compliance pathways and appropriate financial repercussions for non-compliance.
 - Other considerations include equity and affordability, workforce and labour engagement, and electricity grid capacity.

- Multi-unit residential and low-rise residential buildings account for 60% of the City's total emissions from buildings. The City will need to centre the voices of residents and engage them at the policy design stage.
- City staff presented case studies of applying EPS in New York City and Vancouver.
- In addition to developing Emissions Performance Standards, Environment & Climate Division is accelerating the following key by-law recommendations set out in the Strategy:
 - Emissions Performance Reporting, starting with buildings over 600 square metres and later expanding to cover all buildings.
 - Emissions performance labelling for Low-Rise Residential Building.
 - Mandatory energy and emission audits, retro-commissioning and retrofit roadmap planning for large buildings.

Outcomes/Next Steps

CAG Members discussed the following questions:

- What are the most compelling elements of the NetZero Existing Buildings Strategy?
- How may the City's emissions performance standards impact or support you/ your organization/community?

The following is a summary of the key points that came up from the discussion across all questions.

NetZero Existing Buildings Strategy and Emissions Performance Standards provide clarity and direction for stakeholders

CAG members identified that the biggest value of the Net Zero Existing Building Strategy, including emissions performance standards, is in providing a clear and coherent vision and roadmap for the industry, building owners and all stakeholders for achieving the 2040 milestones.

For the industry, policy certainty and clarity in terms of having specific targets and timeline, not only major goals, is very important. CAG members involved in the buildings sector especially underlined the importance of ensuring the standards are fixed because that enables builders to plan with a long-term horizon, including for workforce training. It will also be important to give advance notice of interim targets to building owners so that they can plan and prepare as standards are rolled out at different levels.

The Strategy and standards also signal to other levels of government that Toronto is serious about reducing emissions for buildings and invites their support and collaboration. CAG members underlined the importance of working with other levels of government, because Toronto cannot achieve its goals on its own. The Strategy positions Toronto as a leader in the country and globally, and may be a useful resource for other municipalities in developing their own net zero pathways for buildings.

Ensure the roll out of the Emissions Performance Standards includes inclusive engagement

CAG members identified an opportunity to make the process of rolling out and getting feedback on the emissions performance standards and reduction more inclusive. There is a need to better understand the potential impacts of standards on low-income communities and to provide information about the upcoming changes to communities before they come into effect. Engagement with diverse communities can also inform how these types of standards should be developed to ensure inclusion and equitable outcomes. Policies and bylaws can be evaluated against other City policies with regard to equity.

CAG members highlighted the risk of improvement and retrofit costs being passed onto tenants and suggested exploring strategies to support collective participation in implementing emissions reduction measures or other strategies to reduce barriers associated with the cost of retrofits.

Recognize, engage and support energy advisors, contractors and installers

CAG underlined the important role of energy advisors, contractors and installers in advancing emissions reductions and wanted to see these professionals recognized as climate champions. They support homeowners with decision-making about how to use the available tools for energy cost and emissions reductions and play a critical role in ensuring these tools are used correctly to maximize their impact.

It is critical to engage this workforce as part of the roll out of the emissions performance standards, to provide education on the purpose and use of different emissions reductions mechanisms, and to ensure these professionals are kept informed on an ongoing basis of the proposed bylaw and future changes. Training and capacity building for racialized and small contracts should be prioritized to enable them to participate in this growing workforce.

Engage youth of all ages

CAG members highlighted a gap in engaging youth on this issue. They encouraged the City of Toronto to increase their efforts in understanding youth perspectives and the potential impacts of the Net Zero strategy on youth, and to develop unique communication and engagement strategies for youth of diverse ages.

Many youth of a younger age are neither owners nor renters and they may not be able to see how this strategy relates to them. Around student age, many youth start facing the financial reality of the cost of living, for example utility bills. The youth demographic may also include a higher number of renters who may not be able to or have little incentive to make improvements. Communication to youth should consider opportunities to engage youth in advocating for the implementation of emissions performance standards and reduction measures to parents and caregivers or building owners.

Engage homeowners through education, support and accessible incentives

CAG provided ideas and advice on communication and education for homeowners. A key consideration is that many homeowners would have limited knowledge and understanding of emissions standards or reduction measures. One idea to address this was providing homeowners with a simple roadmap that highlights short-term “low hanging fruit” actions, eg., heat pumps, while introducing and providing education on more complex solutions available to them and their impact over the long term, eg., what can be done with the building envelope. Another idea was to provide a checklist to support decision-making that would include a diversity of considerations, such as health, cost, impact over time, etc. Overall, communication programs should try to get people excited about retrofits and make information readily available and accessible.

CAG members also underlined the importance of making existing incentives more accessible. For example, how to make heat pump incentives available to homeowners when they need to replace a heating system due to a failure in

addition to those who replace them as part of a long-term planned change. Another example provided was if a homeowner, who had recently purchased a furnace was interested in swapping it, are there incentives for them or a buyback program to support this choice.

Consider impact on specific institutions

CAG members highlighted the importance of considering the reality of institutional and jurisdictional policies and how these impact the ability of different institutions to participate in emissions reduction. For example, for the Toronto District School Board, while it serves Toronto residents, it is funded through provincial funding. Any capital project proposals need to go through the provincial government and currently there is a large backlog of capital projects. TDSB staff have tried to make the business case but retrofits so far have not been supported. TDSB staff has also explored business models for solutions that could help address some of the city's social goals, such as addressing housing needs by using underutilized land or school property or putting housing units on top of a school. These types of projects require political will to be successful.

Agenda Item 3: Public EV Charging Network Study

Description: Update on Electric Vehicle Charging Plan Outreach. Presentation from Deborah Herbert, Program Manager with the Environment and Climate Division on the Public EV Charging Network Study.

Discussion/Notes

The presentation addressed the following:

- The objectives of the study are to:
 - Identify where, when, how much, and what kind of public charging will be needed to support the City's goals for sustainable transportation and EV uptake.
 - Identify potential locations where public charging could be provided.
 - Explore the range of options for investing in and operating public charging.
 - Discuss important technical, financial, policy, and equity considerations
- The study is currently in the Public Engagement phase. Four Public Consultations will be held in each of the four Community Council Areas.
- The study includes focused research and engagement to address equity, including:
 - workshops and engagement;
 - including geographic analysis in the survey;
 - equity module in EV Charger Siting Suitability analysis – explicitly considers equity-related data; and
 - exploring solutions that ensure equitable distribution and access to public EV charging.

Outcomes/Next Steps

CAG members were invited to take and share the Public EV Charging [survey](#) and information about the upcoming [open houses](#) in Scarborough, North York, Etobicoke and Downtown Toronto.

Present:

Alienor Rougeot
Andria Babbington
Chris Ballard
Christian Cianfrone
Colin Guldimann
Darnel Harris
Derek May

Jack Zhou
Jeff Ranson
Joseph Ogilvie
John Robinson
Lyn Adamson
Maria Constantinou
Marine Sanchez

Maggie Chang
Neil MacNeil
Rosemarie Powell
Sarah Buchanan
Tinashe Kanengoni
Zamani Ra

Regrets:

Barnabe Geis
Joyce McLean
Julius Lindsay
Lanrick Bennett Jr.
Lidia Ferreira

Guests/Delegates:

Jenn Vetter for Kristen Evers

City of Toronto Staff:

Andrew Plunkett
Sophie Plottel
Cecilia Fernandez
James Nowlan

Devon Stopps
Lisa Buckley
Sean Hurley
Rebecca Mallinson

Deborah Herbert
Jamie MacDonald

Facilitators (Groundswell Projects):

Ruth Silver
Olga Semenovych