

## Community Benefits Advisory Group Meeting Minutes

October 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2023 at 1:00 pm - 3:00 pm

Virtual Meeting, Held on WebEx

### Attendees

<b>Name</b>	<b>City of Toronto</b>
April Lim	Community Benefits Unit (CBU)
Biljana Zuvela	Community Benefits Unit (CBU)
Colleen Dignam	Community Benefits Unit (CBU)
Courtney Ayukawa	Community Benefits Unit (CBU)
Matteo Colangelo	Community Benefits Unit (CBU)
Reinaldo James	Community Benefits Unit (CBU)
Souleik Kheyre	Community Benefits Unit (CBU)
Nima Kia	CreateTO
Pritish Roy	Engineering and Construction Services Division
Hanifa Kassam	SDFA - Poverty Reduction Office
Zenia Wadhvani	SDFA - Social Policy, Analysis & Research
Hillary Keirstead	Purchasing and Materials Management Division
Heather Tillock	SDFA - Youth Development Unit
<b>Name</b>	<b>Strategic Partner</b>
Anjuli Perera	Waterfront Toronto
Chris Campbell	Carpenters Union
Christina Montauti	The Career Foundation
Fatima Saya	Daniels
Geraldine Babcock	Humber College
Jason Ottey	LIUNA Local 183
Kemet Bahlibi	Context Development
Merissa Preston	LIUNA Local 506
Mike Mattos	Mount Dennis Community Association
Raly Chakarova	TARBA

Rosemarie Powell	Toronto Community Benefits Network
Sabrina Musto	Buy Canada
Sean Blake	Carpenters Local 27
Susan McMurray	Toronto and York Region Labour Council
Sundus Balata	SDFA - Community Infrastructure Unit
Surabhi Jain	Toronto Workforce Funders Collaborative
Tereza Todorova (on behalf of William Mendes)	Toronto Community Housing

## Community Benefits Advisory Group Meeting Minutes

October 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2023 at 1:30 pm- 3:00 pm

Virtual Meeting, Held on WebEx

Item	Discussion/ Comments / Actions
<b>Welcome &amp; Land Acknowledgement</b>	Land Acknowledgment delivered by Colleen Dignam (TESS) African Ancestral Acknowledgement delivered by Souleik Kheyre (Community Benefits Unit)
<b>Advisory Group Introductions</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Introductions completed with attendees' names and organizations.</li> </ul>
<b>Progress Updates from City of Toronto's Community Benefits (CB) Unit</b>	<p><b>Updates on Community Benefits Pilot Projects</b> (Courtney &amp; Matt)</p> <p>The City currently has numerous Community Benefits initiatives rolling out the Workforce Intermediary Model and Community Benefits Implementation tools (CB toolkit)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Imagination, Manufacturing Innovation and Technology (IMIT) – 1 active pilot site (3 new hires in August and September reported)</li> <li>• Housing Now – 2 active pilot sites</li> <li>• Toronto Community Housing – 2 active sites</li> <li>• Social Procurement Program – active pilot sites (labour forecast being issued to multiple Contract Holders (suppliers) for future opportunities.</li> </ul> <p><b>The key take-aways from pilot/implementation projects:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A dedicated workforce intermediary person is required on every Community Benefits project.</li> <li>• Community Benefits initiatives and projects are unique, which means the workforce intermediary must adapt the approach (light touch approach vs. intensive approach) as required.</li> <li>• The roles and responsibilities of the workforce intermediary across project sites.             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Provide leadership and multi-partner coordination on achievement of CB WFD targets.</li> <li>▪ Provide CB guidance/consulting/problem solving/solutions throughout project lifecycle.</li> <li>▪ Clarify CB implementation roles/responsibilities/expectations and uphold accountability.</li> <li>▪ Customize and adapt CB Toolkit components to fit project context and needs; provide orientation and onboarding to use of CB templates, forms, data tracking reports.</li> <li>▪ Coordinate and connect various ecosystem players (City staff, contract holders and subcontractors, employment service providers, training programs)</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

- Sean Blake asked how stakeholders at table knows candidates are hired (related to construction)
- April commented that the IMIT hires were non-construction hires (hospitality retail related) in reference to IMIT.
- Rosemarie Powell asked if there will be a public reporting structure on the website where members or public can go on the City website for info on hiring for the different projects.
- April Lim commented that the monitoring and evaluation framework is intended to capture data across projects and consolidate dataset sharing the journey of the workforce development across the city projects.
- These findings and trends could also be found in reports submitted to City council.

**New Hire Form: Construction Trade & Professional, Administrative, Technical (Biljana)**

- The Monitoring and Evaluation Working Group is focused on developing the Community Benefits of workforce development and Monitoring and Evaluation Framework.
- In 2022 the Community Benefits Workforce Development was created using the theory of change as a foundational document to the development of the monitoring and evaluation framework.
- In 2023 focus has been to clarify the purpose of the Community Benefits Workforce Development Monitoring and Evaluation Framework
- The purpose of the New Hire Form is to capture the sociodemographic profile of new Community Benefits hires, project targets and sociodemographic questions including barriers to employment.
- Raly Chakarova asked if guidance in collecting the socio demographic data be provided as employers are not allowed under the human rights act.
- Biljana Zuvella commented that additional resources will be provided to ensure that employers and other roles are prepared (for questions/concerns)
- Rosemarie Powell asked if the forms can clearly stipulate if any employee were misplaced because of the new hires for Community Benefit purposes.
- Reinaldo James commented that the implementation of the forms is different from the workforce development target that the city has.
  - The targets are: headcount, individuals hired, percentage of person hours and wages.
- Rosemarie Powell asked if confirmation can be given on how long the pilot period phase will be?
- Biljana Zuvella commented that the forms will be used on the current pilot sites, requesting data on the progress within the 1<sup>st</sup> to 3<sup>rd</sup> rounds with improvements implemented as the piloting continues.
- April Lim commented that pilot/implementation testing must be facilitated in the phases and timelines of each project and include tracking the outcomes for the duration of the project and how data can be collected to ensure that the system is accurate.

	<p><b>Private Sector-Led (voluntary) Community Benefits Plans</b> (Souleik)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• In July 2022, City Council directed Social Development, Finance and Administration, Economic Development and Culture, and City Planning, “to examine any possible options for projects submitted for approval through development application processes to voluntarily include Community Benefits plans with proposed thresholds for equity hiring and social procurement to support inclusive economic development.”</li> <li>• A case study approach is being developed with early adopters who are interested in working on a voluntary basis to develop a Community Benefits plan (to include equity-based Community Benefits/hiring/social procurement commitments).</li> <li>• The City of Toronto is exploring place-based approaches to the Community Benefits implementation for the first time to better understanding the city’s position/role in this ecosystem.</li> <li>• The work plan for 2023 was developed into 3 phases: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ <b>Phase 1 (February to June 2023)</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Kick-off Interdivisional City Leads Table</li> <li>▪ External consultation</li> <li>▪ Information gathering jurisdictional scan</li> <li>▪ Options analysis</li> </ul> </li> <li>○ <b>Phase 2 (July to September 2023)</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Legal review</li> <li>▪ Meeting with potential case study partners</li> <li>▪ Develop CB plan template</li> </ul> </li> <li>○ <b>Phase 3 (October to December 2023)</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Confirmed case study pilot partners (1/3 confirmed) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Begin CB plans with case study partners</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul>
<p><b>Discussions: Defining Local Hire, Local Business, Jurisdictional Scan</b></p>	<p><b>Local Hire and Local Business</b> (Courtney)</p> <p>Jurisdictional information reviewed See presentation):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Los Angeles Community Workforce Agreement <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Tiered system with qualifying zip codes (high rates of poverty and/or unemployment). Tier 1 is within 5 miles of project site. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 30% local workers, 50% of apprentices are local, and 10% transitional (social) workers; tier 1 workers preferred.</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> <li>• Milwaukee Residents Preference Program (RPP)</li> </ul>

- Zip codes in Milwaukee and: 1. has not worked in preceding 15 days, and/or 2. worked less than 1,200 hours in the preceding 12 months, and/or 3. meets certain federal poverty guidelines.
  - 40% of hours worked on public works contracts are done by RPP certified individuals, and 25% of that 40% are from high poverty zip codes.
- New York City Community Hiring Economic Justice Plan and Project Labor Agreements (New Construction & Renovation)
  - Zip codes where at least 15% of the population lives below the federal poverty level and/or are NYC Housing Authority (affordable housing) residents.
    - 30% of all project hours.
- Seattle Priority Hire and Community Workforce Agreement
  - Economically distressed zip codes identified by: 1. People living under 200% of the federal poverty line 2. Unemployment rate 3. Those over 25 without a college degree.
    - 20% (by 2016) and 40% (by 2025) of all project hours.
- Vancouver Community Benefit Agreements Policy
  - Vancouver's City Core (neighbourhoods and adjacent communities where levels of poverty and inequality are statistically high).
    - 10% of new entry level jobs available to people in Vancouver first, specifically those who are equity-seeking.

**Discussion: Defining local hire/local business**

- Jason Ottey commented that this is helpful and flagged the following:
  - What are we trying to prioritize when we define local hire?
  - There needs to be a different treatment for hires, than businesses, when defining locality
  - I found interesting the use of identified areas of need (NIAs) or postal codes
  - I have a hard time layering onto this a "equity lens" as I am not sure we can have both (e.g., areas in need should have access to these projects but it should be layered on income base)
  - Not every area of the City would have a CB project and we have to make sure we don't tell a resident they are not eligible for opportunities because they reside in another area of the City.
- Hillary Keirstead commented that the province of Ontario is doing this work on local business.
- Rosemarie Powell asked what about a low-income threshold?
  - Employment Ontario Service Providers currently have system in place to review low-income eligibility, without the employers having to know the individual's income status.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Courtney Ayukawa clarified Neighbourhood Improvement Areas: neighbourhoods identified by City Council with high unemployment, high poverty, low high school graduation, limited post-secondary, lacking community facilities and programs, premature mortality and other equity indicators.</li> <li>• Sundus Balata why can't we have "local" being defining by radius (distance) to the project and social being the equity layering city-wide.</li> <li>• Raly Chakarova commented that with the city already having Neighbourhood Improvement Area identified, that's a strong place to start and the more specific the criteria, the harder it is to hire for employers.</li> <li>• Fatima Saya commented the New York City definition could be adapted to fit in the Toronto context (e.g, focus on low-income threshold/housing residents).</li> <li>• Fatima Saya commented: unsure about postal codes for local businesses as there must be a way of eliminating big box from the category.</li> </ul>
<b>Adjourn / Next Steps</b>	<b>Next Meeting: To be scheduled in 2024. Calendar invites and meeting details to follow.</b>