

Community Benefits Advisory Group Meeting Minutes

February 27th, 2024 at 10:00 am – 11:30 am

Virtual Meeting, Held on WebEx

Attendees:

<i>Name</i>	<i>City of Toronto</i>
April Lim	Community Benefits Unit (CBU)
Biljana Zuvela	Community Benefits Unit (CBU)
Colleen Dignam	Community Benefits Unit (CBU)
Courtney Ayukawa	Community Benefits Unit (CBU)
Matteo Colangelo	Community Benefits Unit (CBU)
Reinaldo James	Community Benefits Unit (CBU)
Souleik Kheyre	Community Benefits Unit (CBU)
Zenia Wadhwani	SDFA - Social Policy, Analysis & Research
Diana Levy	Social Procurement Program
Hanifa Kassam	SDFA - Poverty Reduction Office
Hillary Keirstead	Social Procurement Program
Heather Tillock	SDFA - Youth Development Unit
Sundus Balata	SDFA - Community Infrastructure Unit
<i>Name</i>	<i>Strategic Partner</i>
Agapi Gessesse	CEE Centre for Young Black Professionals
Andrew Pariser	RESCON
Anjuli Perera	Waterfront Toronto
Anshika Kushwaha	Toronto Workforce Funders Collaborative
Aytakin Mohammadi	Northcrest Developments
Cecille Chin	Metrolinx
Chris Campbell	Carpenters Union
Christina Montauti	The Career Foundation
Eunice K. Yeboah	TTC
Gillian Jaques	Dream
Isaac Fonseca	COSTI

Judy Brooks	Metrolinx
Kemet Bahlubi	Context Development
Krishna Ruchlewicz	Greater Toronto Sewer and Watermain Contractors Association
Lisa (PMO) Barroso	Corporate Real Estate Management Division
Lynn VanLieshout	Humber College
Monica Zheng	TTC
Merissa Preston	LIUNA Local 506
Mike Mattos	Mount Dennis Community Association
Raly Chakarova	Toronto and Area Road Builders Association
Rosemarie Powell	Toronto Community Benefits Network
Sabrina Musto	Buy Social Canada
Steve Shallhorn	Labour Education Centre
Susan McMurray	Toronto and York Region Labour Council
William Mendes	Toronto Community Housing

Community Benefits Advisory Group Meeting Minutes

February 27th, 2024 at 10:00 am- 11:30 am

Virtual Meeting, Held on WebEx

Item	Discussion/ Comments / Actions
Welcome & Land Acknowledgement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Land Acknowledgment delivered by Zenia Wadhwani African Ancestral Acknowledgement delivered by Courtney Ayukawa
Advisory Group Introductions	Introductions completed with attendees
Community Benefits Unit Updates (CBU)	<p>Community Benefits (CB) Toolkit and Implementation (pilot) Review (Courtney Ayukawa)</p> <p>The City of Toronto embeds community benefits clauses in City agreements to create workforce development opportunities and procurement opportunities.</p> <p>Community Benefits Framework (CBF)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Creating inclusive economic development when the City buys or builds CBF is an innovative municipal policy and program approach. City of Toronto Community Benefit Initiatives: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Social Procurement Program, Rexdale-Casino Woodbine CBA, Housing Now Initiatives, Transit Expansion Projects, Imagination Manufacturing Innovation and Technology (IMTI) Program, FIFA World Cup 2026, Waterfront TO Employment Initiative and Toronto Community Housing Projects <p>Workforce Intermediary</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Connects, convenes and coordinates key players in projects with CB requirements Supports the use of templates, tools, processes <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Labour forecasting templates, Employment service providers database, Skilled trades unions contact list, construction hiring validation process. Data tracking and reporting

- Monitoring and evaluation framework (includes outcomes / indicators / forms), Project Specific Working Group, Community benefits glossary, terms and definitions.

Status Update: CBU Workforce Intermediary & Toolkit Pilots (Courtney & Matt)

CBU is currently engaged in implementation (pilot) with various community benefit initiatives:

Housing Now

- 2 active project sites with custom CB Plans developed
- Creation and facilitation of 4-part CB Plan Workshop Serie; Labour Forecast issued for 1 site
- Planning to implement Welcome Form on 1 site in coming months

Toronto Community Housing

- Welcome Form (Construction) to be tested in Spring 2024 on 1 site

Social Procurement Program

- 15+ projects currently introduced to and or using WI supports and CB tools
- Kick-off and or quarterly meetings supported
- Fully customized “combined” PAT/Construction Labour Forecast embedded into existing processes
- PAT hiring: Early success in WI supports to identify, curate, broker relationships (Supplier and ESP)
- WI supports to connect suppliers to local hiring events

Imagination, Manufacturing Innovation and Technology – two implementation (pilot) sites

- 15+ hires, 100 connected to opportunities, 2 job fairs organized
- 1 site achieved significant gains in their Local Employment Requirements points
- Success brokering IMIT recipients/ESP relationships; Welcome Form implemented on 1 site

Challenges / Learnings on within Implementation (pilot) Projects

- Hesitation or resistance to use CB tools (e.g., labour forecast templates, data collection tools)
- Change management, onboarding and orientation to CB concepts
- Target setting – best efforts vs mandatory
- Clarifying roles (CB initiatives vs. CBU / WI)
- Time consuming nature of relationship building; excellent progress to date, high level impact

	<p>Additional details requested by CB advisory groups members for the Social Procurement Program and Housing Now initiatives. For these details, see section below titled “Additional information regarding CBU Workforce Intermediary & Toolkit Pilots”.</p> <p>CBF 2024 Reports to Council:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Rexdale CBA Annual Progress Report (2023) and 5 Year Review (2018-2023) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ April 9th Executive Committee and April 17th, 18th and 19th City Council • Community Benefits Framework Update Report <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ September 18th, ECDC and October 9th, 10th and 11th City Council • Steve Shallhorn asked how the discussion for mandatory targets verses aspirational targets are going. • April Lim commented across the city’s various community benefits initiatives, there are different approaches to target setting which some are clearer on what our mandatory measures, hard targets as part of contract requirements. There are others that are less clear and lean more towards the best efforts framing and different reasons why there’s a range of approach, the best practice approach to create mandatory hard targets. • Rosemarie Powell asked are general contractors and project owners aware that they’re participating in a public process?” (sharing their names should be transparent, public and also shared with the advisory group).
Community Benefits Name Evolution Project	<p>Community Benefits Name Evolution Project</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Partnering with Taylor Newberry Consultants (qualitative research) • Intended to mitigate “community benefits” name confusion (e.g., across different City divisions, community organizations, developers, contractors, unions, planning act, how we could evolve) • Not intended to compromise foundation of community’s hard-fought efforts • Focused is to achieve more clarity as we move forward (in reaching intended outcomes of CBF) • 83 participants on the list including members from CBAG and 46 have participated • Final report due in April 2024 • Susan McMurray commented there was discussions of strategies from her session group on how to do things differently and having better communication plans to help people understand what the name means

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Zenia Wadhvani commented the team and I had this conversation of the importance of the communications, not only in terms of the storytelling of the great work being done in this space. The advances that have been made, as more companies and organizations get involved and supporting, the clarity of what the work and, strategies going forward. • Steve Shallhorn commented in terms of name evolution, one way to distinguish between the provinces use of community benefits, and city's use of the term is to always use the 'A' word (Agreement) [Side note: The majority of City of Toronto's community benefits are not secured through CBAs. "CBAs" refer to a specific type of agreement, mostly in large-scale land use contexts, and City of Toronto only has 1 (Rexdale CBA)]
Inclusivity in Action: Gathering Socio-Demographic Information	<p>CBAG Overview and Support for Pilot Testing of the Welcome Form (Biljana)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Monitoring and Evaluation Working Group is focused on developing the Community Benefits of workforce development, Monitoring and Evaluation Framework, working group of problem solvers consisting of internal and external strategic partners. • In 2022 the Community Benefits Workforce Development was created using the theory of change as a foundational document to the development of the monitoring and evaluation framework. • In 2023 focus has been to clarify the purpose of the Community Benefits Workforce Development Monitoring and Evaluation Framework • The purpose of the New Hire Form is to capture the sociodemographic profile of new Community Benefits hires, project targets and sociodemographic questions including barriers to employment. • CBF Monitoring & Evaluation Framework <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Telling the WFD Impact Story <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Demonstrate the project results and value of City projects with CB/WFD requirements; evidence on targets and outcomes ▪ Demonstrate the progress and key learnings of CB project implementation, roles, responsibilities ○ What does Welcome Form aim to capture? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Extent City projects are achieving their set targets ▪ Socio-demographic profile of individuals hired, groups missing/underrepresented ▪ Basic characteristics of jobs new hires gain on projects ○ Overall, tell the City of Toronto's community benefits story across all CB initiatives

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Change Management: City divisions, Agencies, Project Lead Partners, Community Partners <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Purpose → Roles → Benefits → Risks → Confidentiality • Video: How to train employees to have difficult conversations www.ted.com/talks/tamekia_mizladi_smith_how_to_train_employees_to_have_difficult_conversations?sub title=en
Discussion: Welcome Form	<p>Breakout room discussions (roles, implementation, data collection and resources needed)</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. What can you do to support successful implementation? 2. What would you need from CBU team to support successful implementation? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • April Lim - Breakout room 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ It's a great form, it will get a lot of information required ○ The flip side, it is highly personal, a suggestion made was to consider removing the name from the form to provide more of a comfort level for people sharing personal details ○ Consider including the form in the tender contracts to ensure the employers and contractors are aware of their obligations to implement that as part of their on boarding sessions • Biljana Zuvela - Breakout room 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The form is great, suggesting that the city take the lead to create a very brief communication package to explain the form and provide to employment service providers and/or employers ensuring that the context is understood, the importance of the form, stress the level of confidentiality to the respondent due to the level of personal information obtained. • Courtney Ayukawa – Breakout room 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Ensuring that the person presenting the form to the workers, gives context to people when they are completing it, and potentially providing a video that can be played when the form is being administered. • Matt Colangelo – Breakout room 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Discussed the importance of the form, although some of the questions are personal ○ To be able to identify CB progression related targets

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Have a trained staff to train administer and feel comfortable talking about the information being asked and the reasons why ○ The city should collect the information being asked opposed to an employer due to the sensitivity <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Reinaldo James – Breakout room 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Use of friendly or language in the form ○ Provide more information on when the information collected will be discarded ○ Who will the information be shared with ○ A better description or elevated description on why the form is being implemented ○ A lot questions to answer
Additional information regarding CBU Workforce Intermediary & Toolkit Pilots	<p><u>Housing Now</u></p> <p>5207 Dundas St W</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● https://createto.ca/projects/bloor-kipling ● https://www.toronto.ca/news/city-of-toronto-celebrates-the-ground-breaking-of-725-new-rental-homes-on-city-land-at-5207-dundas-street-west/ <p>50 Wilson Heights Blvd</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● https://createto.ca/projects/50-wilson-heights-boulevard <p><u>Social Procurement Program</u></p> <p>GHD Limited Professional Engineering Services for Rehabilitation/Replacement of Culverts Professional Services for Humber Treatment Plant Rehabilitation and Upgrades Coordinated Toronto Water and Transportation Services Program Management Assignments (PM6B) Coordinated Toronto Water and Transportation Services Program Assignments (PM6A1) Coordinated Professional Engineering Services for Toronto Water and Transportation Services</p>

	<p><u>HATCH</u> Detailed Design, Services during construction/post construction (Midtown Relief Storm Sewer)</p> <p><u>Morrison Hershfield</u> Environmental Assessment for Basement Flooding Study Areas 52, 57, 59 Bridge Program Management Condition Assessment, Design for Interim Repair Services (Gardiner Expressway East & Lakeshore)</p> <p><u>R.V. Anderson Associates</u> Local Roads Resurfacing Program Management Coordinated Toronto Water and Transportation Services Program Management Assignments (PM6B)</p> <p><u>Jacobs</u> Fairbanks / Silverthorn</p> <p><u>Bennett Mechanical</u> Ashbridge's Bay Phase D (minor connection to liquid Train Upgrades - Highland Creek Treatment Plant)</p> <p><u>Aquicon</u> Northeast Scarborough CRC</p>
Adjourn	Next Community Benefits Advisory Group Meeting: June 5 th , 2024